
A Precious Garland

*A Commentary on [Shantideva's]
'Engaging in the Deeds of a Bodhisattva'
(Bodhisattvacharyavatara)*

by the Abbot Dragpa Gyaltsen

Translated from the Tibetan by Toh Sze Gee

*To be used exclusively for Ven. Thubten Chodron's
course at Sravasti Abbey
Please do not distribute further*

Footnotes were added by Ven Joan Nicell
based on the oral commentary by Geshe Jampa Gyatso
for the FPMT Basic Program at Istituto Lama Tzong Khapa
2006-2007

© Toh Sze Gee
2007

All rights reserved

No part of this work may be reproduced in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or by any information storage and retrieval system or technologies now known or later developed, without permission in writing from Toh Sze Gee.

A Precious Garland

A Commentary on [Shantideva's] 'Engaging in the Deeds of a Bodhisattva' (Bodhisattvacharyavatara)

by the Abbot Dragpa Gyaltsen
Translated by Toh Sze Gee

{2} Namō Manjugoshaya (Homage to Manjugosha)

*Foremost fearless lord, [Jigme Wangpo,] encompassing all [Three] Jewels, [Könchog];
Honorable lamp of the doctrine, [Tenpe Dronme,] treasury of Dharma of the [Three]
Jewels;
Ngawang Losang, the actual Three Jewels, and so forth;
I bow down to the objects of refuge incorporating the [Three] Jewels.
A castle of the twelve amazing deeds, a friend to the lotus¹,
Teachings, [Tenpa,] possessing a hundred thousand light rays of
Excellent explanations strongly pacifying the darkness of ignorance,
Homage to the great scholar, [Panchen,], God of the Day [Nyinmo Lha].
I shall embark with delight in the giving of the Dharma of a good explanation,
A garland of gems enhancing the thoughts of the commentaries that have come forth,
The supreme gem dispelling the state of deprivation of the intelligent,
Deriving from your speech, a water treasury² of nectar.*

{3} Regarding the explanation of the meaning of *Engaging in the Deeds of a Bodhisattva* composed by the Great Child of the Victors, Shantideva, there are four sections:

1. Meaning of the title
2. Translators' homage
3. Meaning of the text
4. Meaning of the conclusion

1. Meaning of the title

"Bodhi" in the Sanskrit language of India is "byang chub" in the Tibetan language [and "enlightenment" in English]. "Satva"³ is "sems dpa'" [and "mind-hero" in English]. "Charya" is "spyod pa" [and "deeds" in English]. "Avatara" is "'jug pa" [and "engaging" in English]. When joined together, we have "Engaging in the Deeds of a Bodhisattva."

The first section (Tibetan: *bam po*):

2. Translators' homage

Homage to all the buddhas and bodhisattvas.

¹ i.e., the sun

² i.e., ocean

³ Although we often see this spelt with a double "t," here it is stated with only one "t."

This is for the sake of (1) pacifying the obstacles to the translation and (2) making known that this is a commentary on the thought of all the Baskets⁴, and that moreover it is mainly a commentary on the thought of the Discourses Basket.

{4} A “section” (*bam po*) is downward-facing, that is, it counts from the beginning, whereas “chapter” (*le'u*) is upward-facing, that is, it counts what has already been enumerated⁵. These are easy to understand.

⁴ The teachings of the Buddha are sometimes subsumed into the Three Baskets (Sanskrit: *tripitaka*): Discipline Basket (*vinayapitaka*), Discourses Basket (*sutrapitaka*), and Knowledge Basket (*abhidharmapitaka*).

⁵ This means that in this tradition, the appearance of the word “section” marks the beginning of the portion of the material it is supposed to demarcate, whereas the title of a “chapter” appears at the end of the respective chapter.

3A3. Abandoning arrogance and the reason for enthusiasm in the composition

1.2 There is nothing here that has not appeared in the past
 And I have no skill in the art of rhetoric;
 Therefore, not to enact the welfare of others,
 I composed this in order to acquaint it to my mind.

1.3 For due to acquaintance with virtue,
 The force of my faith will for the time being increase because of these.
 If, however, these are seen by others
 Equal in fortune to myself, it will be meaningful.

There is nothing, not even the slightest, expressed in this treatise that has not appeared in scriptures in the past. Although there is no difference as far as the meaning is concerned, it is also not that I have skill in the art of rhetoric, such as in the conjugation of light and heavy syllables with respect to the words. Hence, I did not have the thought to compose this treatise for the sake of other persons who are able to easily realize its meaning in dependence on the scriptures.

{6} However, there is a purpose for composing this treatise. For the sake of acquainting my mind so that what I had already known previously would not degenerate and would increase, I, Shantideva composed this. It is for the sake of continuously acquainting myself with the vast virtues that have previously been embarked upon. Also setting forth these as a treatise will improve my mind. Therefore, the force of my faith, wisdom, compassion, and so forth will increase in my continuum first, for the time being, because of these being stated as a treatise, and then, if others as fortunate as myself who see this treatise, see these stated as a treatise, it will be meaningful for them just as it has been for me.

3B. Actual explanation of the stages of the path

1. Exhortation to take the essence upon the support of leisure
2. Explanation of the way to take such an essence

3B1. Exhortation to take the essence upon the support of leisure

1.4 The leisures and endowments are very hard to find.
 Since they accomplish the purposes of beings,
 If I do not accomplish benefit upon this,
 How will I acquire this in the future?

Nagarjuna [in his *Letter to a Friend (Suhrllekha)*] (stanza 63-64ab) says:

*To be born as one who adheres to wrong view,
As an animal, hungry ghost, or hell being,
In a land lacking the Victors' words, as a barbarian in some border region,
To be born as foolish or stupid,*

*Or as a long-life god are the eight
Faults that are the non-leisures.*

{7} Just as has been said, the four types of non-leisure of non-humans are (1-3) the three unfortunate rebirths as hell beings, hungry ghosts, and animals, and (4) as long-life gods, and the four types of non-leisure of humans are: (5) being born in a border region, (6) although born as a human being, being without the Victors' words, (7) having wrong views denying the existence of actions and their results, and (8) having incomplete powers, that is, having defective mental and sense powers, and being foolish and stupid. These are the eight types of non-leisure.

Asanga's *Hearers' Grounds (Sravakabhumi)* says:

*Human, born in a central land, complete powers,
Not having erred in extreme actions, faith in the sources.*

Just as it has been said, the five personal endowments are: (1-2) being born human in a central land, (3) being complete in all powers, (4) not having erred in extreme actions due to not having committed huge negativities such as the actions of immediate retribution⁷, and (5) having faith in the sources, that is, actions and their results.

[Asanga's *Hearers' Grounds (Sravakabhumi)* says:]

*The Buddha has come and taught the excellent Dharma,
The teachings remain and [people] subsequently engage in them,
Others have hearts of mercy.*

Just as has been said, the five endowments based on others are: (1-2) the Buddha has come to the world and taught the excellent Dharma, (3) the continuity of his teachings remain, (4) there are those who subsequently engage in them by way of the three – hearing, contemplation, and meditation – and the three trainings, and (5) benefactors and sponsors give religious robes and so forth.

It is very difficult to gain this precious bodily support of leisures and endowments possessing the eighteen qualities {8} because Chandrakirti says [in his *Supplement to the Middle Way (Madhyamakavatara)*] (stanza 2.7):

*For ordinary beings, those born from speech,
Those with definite character toward solitary enlightenment, and
The Conquerors' children, the cause of definite goodness and
High status is not other than ethics.*

If it has been taught that in order to obtain a special bodily support of the leisures and endowments, one must have held as the basis pure ethics accompanied by generosity and so forth, and made connection [to the next rebirth] with stainless prayers. Then, since these causes are very difficult to accomplish, a support of leisures and endowments is also difficult to gain.

⁷ The five actions of immediate retribution are: (1) killing one's father, (2) killing one's mother, (3) killing an arhat, (4) drawing blood from a buddha with evil intent, and (5) causing a schism in the Sangha.

It is just as has been said in [Nagarjuna's] *Letter to a Friend* (stanza 59):

*Since it is far more difficult to obtain a human rebirth from an animal rebirth
Than for a sea turtle's head to enter
The aperture of a yoke floating upon the great ocean,
O, Lord of Humans, make this life fruitful by practicing the excellent Dharma.*

Not only is it difficult to find, it is of great value when found, just as has been said in [Chandragomin's] *Letter to a Student (Sisyalekha)*⁸:

*The equipment that leads migrating beings on the supported path of a sugata,
The great mental power is found by humans;
That path is not gained by gods or nagas,
Nor by demigods, garudas, vidyadharas, kinnaras, and serpents.*

In order to obtain this very good support that is able to accomplish the purposes of beings – high status and definite goodness, if, due to the discrimination that I will not die and the like, I do not accomplish benefit upon this support for the next rebirth and beyond, {9} then how will I acquire them perfectly with such a good support in the future? This is because it is very difficult for us to accomplish the causes of a good migration from a state of non-leisure.

3B2. Explanation of the way to take such an essence

- A. General presentation
- B. Explanation of the meaning of the individual chapters

3B2A. General presentation

In order to initially generate the mind [aspiring] to supreme enlightenment by way of this great treatise, through contemplating well its benefits, you need to increase the force of your enthusiasm exceptionally. This is revealed by the **first** chapter. You must uphold the two minds of enlightenment by (1) confessing negativities and obscurations, the adverse conditions for the generation of the mind [of enlightenment], and (2) accumulating the two collections, the favorable conditions for the generation of the mind [of enlightenment]. Therefore, these two points are respectively taught by the **second** and **third** chapters. Having generated the mind [of enlightenment], you must rely upon conscientiousness to train in the deeds; this is indicated by the **fourth** chapter. The way to train in ethics by means of guarding mindfulness and introspection is extensively revealed by the **fifth** chapter. Then, with patience and joyous effort, the ways to train in concentration, wisdom, and so forth are respectively indicated by four, [the **sixth to the ninth**,] chapters. The **tenth** chapter indicates the way to train in the mind of giving one's body and resources as well as roots of virtue to others, and the way to train in generosity qualified by dedication. The **ninth** chapter teaches the resultant state – buddhahood.

3B2B. Explanation of the meaning of the individual chapters

- 1. Contemplating the benefits of meditating on the mind of enlightenment

⁸ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 1, page 389: *Sisyalekha*, 89

2. Having generated the two minds, the way to train in the deeds

3B2B-1. Contemplating the benefits of meditating on the mind of enlightenment

- A. Explanation of the text of the chapter {10}
- B. Indicating the title of the chapter

3B2B-1A. Explanation of the text of the chapter

- 1. Advice on abandoning negativities and accomplishing virtues
- 2. Contemplating extensively the benefits of cultivating the mind of enlightenment

3B2B-1A1. Advice on abandoning negativities and accomplishing virtues

1.5 Just as a flash of lightning brightly illuminates
 For an instant within the clouds on a dark night,
 Likewise in this world, through the might of the Buddha,
 Merit and intelligence occasionally occur for once.

1.6ab Hence virtue is perpetually feeble,
 The great power of negativities, horrible.

For example, just as forms within the clouds of a dark night are brightly illuminated for an instant by the condition of a flash of lightning, likewise through the might of perfectly complete buddhas, sometimes the intelligence thinking, “I shall create merit” for once occurs just occasionally to worldly beings; it does not happen continuously. For this reason, virtue is feeble and remains perpetually so, and the great power of the negativities that produce the bad migrations, like the darkness within the clouds, is difficult to overcome. Since it will produce great fear, having been made to understand the horrors there will be at the time, I should make effort in accomplishing virtue and abandoning negativities.

3B2B-1A2. Contemplating extensively the benefits of cultivating the mind of enlightenment

- A. Explanation of the benefits of the mind of enlightenment {11}
- B. Identification of the mind of enlightenment
- C. The reasons why these benefits will occur
- D. Praising the persons who cultivate the mind of enlightenment

3B2B-1A2A. Explanation of the benefits of the mind of enlightenment

- 1. Ability to destroy all negativities and to accomplish virtue
- 2. Obtaining a special name and significance
- 3. Explanation of the benefits through analogies

3B2B-1A2A-1. Ability to destroy all negativities and to accomplish virtue

1.6cd Except for a mind of complete enlightenment
 By what other virtue will it be overcome?

1.7 All the Lords of Subduers who have contemplated for many eons
 Have seen it to be beneficial;
 For by it the immeasurable masses of beings
 Will easily attain the supreme happiness.

1.8 Those who wish to destroy the multitudes of sufferings of existence,
 Those who wish to dispel the unhappiness of sentient beings,

And those who wish to enjoy multitudes of happiness,
Should never forsake the mind of enlightenment.

By what virtue other than the precious mind of complete enlightenment will the terrible negativities that serve only as the cause for hell rebirth, such as killing one's father and mother, killing an arhat, drawing blood from the body of a tathagata with evil intention, and causing a schism in the sangha, be overcome? This is because nothing else can overcome them. The first two lines [1.6cd] indicate that great negativities will be destroyed and that the mind of enlightenment will purify the previously accumulated causes of bad migrations and cut the continuity of future ones.

{12} After that, one stanza [1.7] teaches its benefit of being able to accomplish supreme happiness. This is because the Lords of Subduers who have contemplated and intended accomplishing benefit for sentient beings for many countless eons have seen that this very mind of enlightenment benefits all sentient beings, and that this mind [of enlightenment] is like a seed that is able to cause beings, the immeasurable sentient beings, to attain the supreme happiness easily by means of a comfortable path, without depending on the collections of great austerities such as relying on the five fires and tearing out one's hair. It is just as has been said [in 7.30cd], "Who, when they know of the mind that proceeds from joy to joy,/ Would ever lapse into despondency?"

One stanza [1.8] indicates that not only is it able to accomplish supreme happiness, it is also able to accomplish the happiness that is desired⁹. In addition, those who wish to destroy the multitudes of sufferings of [cyclic] existence in their continuum through training in the attitude of the middle scope, and wish to dispel the unhappiness of all sentient beings through training well in the attitude of the great scope, and those who wish to enjoy the multitudes of happiness of high status and definite goodness should always generate this very mind of enlightenment and should never forsake it since there is no other method superior to it.

3B2B-1A2A-2. Obtaining a special name and significance

1.9 When the mind of enlightenment is generated, in that moment
 Those wretched ones fettered in the jail of cyclic existence
 Will be called "Child of the Sugatas,"
 And will become objects of reverence by the humans and gods of the world.

{13} When the two minds of enlightenment, the wishing and engaging minds of enlightenment, are generated, immediately even those wretched ones fettered in the prison of cyclic existence through the force of karma and afflictions will be called by a special name, "Child of the Sugatas," in that very moment, and the special name and significance will become worthy of being revered by worldly beings, as well as humans and gods, with folded palms.

3B2B-1A2A-3. Explanation of the benefits through analogies

1.10 Like the supreme gold-making elixir,
 It takes the unclean body and transforms it

⁹ JN: Changed from "the happiness of the desire realm" to "the happiness that is desired" (*'dod pa'i bde ba*)

Into the priceless jewel, a Victor's body.
Therefore, firmly seize this so-called "mind of enlightenment."

- 1.11 Since the sole helmsmen of migrating beings, the limitless mind,
Has upon thorough investigation seen its preciousness,
All beings wishing to be free from the abodes of migration,
Firmly seize this precious mind of enlightenment.
- 1.12 All other virtues are like the plantain tree,
For after bearing fruit they will be exhausted.
But the tree of the mind of enlightenment will constantly bear fruit,
Whereby it is inexhaustible and flourishes more and more.
- 1.13 Like depending on a hero when greatly afraid,
Even if I may have committed very terrible negativities,
I shall be swiftly liberated in dependence upon it.
Why then do those who have the imprints not depend on it?
- 1.14 Just like the fire at the end of time,
In an instant it certainly burns up the great negativities.
Its unfathomable benefits were explained
To Sudhana by the wise Protector Maitreya.

{14} The analogy of something inferior being transformed into something supreme is indicated by one stanza [1.10]. Just as any number of taels (Tib: *srang*) of the supreme gold-making elixir, which has the aspect of gold-making elixir, is able to transmute thousands of taels of iron into gold, the two minds [of enlightenment] take this body, which is unclean from the points of view of cause and entity, and transform it into the priceless, precious, exalted body of the Victors. Therefore, taking this so-called "mind of enlightenment," seize it very firmly without degeneration, that is, you should uphold it. This condenses the meaning of the teaching taught in *Array of Stalks* on the benefits of generating the mind of enlightenment through taking as an analogy a single tael of a type of mercury called "appearing as gold" that is able to transform thousands of taels of iron into gold.

{15} Also one stanza [1.11] indicates the analogy illustrating that it is difficult to find and its benefit of great value. Those wishing to be free from the abodes of migration, all the miseries of cyclic existence, should generate well the mind of enlightenment and firmly seize this precious mind of enlightenment without letting it degenerate, because, like a skilled helmsman leading merchants to the island of jewels, the buddhas, the sole unparalleled helmsmen of migrating beings who possess the limitless mind, that is, the exalted wisdom of omniscience,¹⁰ have, upon excellent thorough investigation of what is the best method for dispelling the poverty of migrating beings, seen its preciousness and thus its rarity and that it is the method of greatest benefit.

¹⁰ JN: "the exalted wisdom knowing all aspects" has been changed to "the exalted wisdom of omniscience" (*thams cad mkhyen pa'i ye shes*)

Following this, one stanza [1.12] indicates the analogy illustrating its benefit of inexhaustible and increasing virtue. This is because all other virtues not conjoined with the mind of enlightenment, like the plantain tree, will exhaust their ability to bear fruits again after having produced fruits [once]. Like the wish-fulfilling tree, the tree of the mind of enlightenment will constantly bear fruit, whereby it is inexhaustible and flourishes more and more.

The *Teachings of Akshayamati Sutra* (*Akshayamatinirdeshasutra*) says that just as a drop of water that falls into the great ocean will not be exhausted until the end of the eon, also virtues that are fully dedicated will not be exhausted until the essence of enlightenment is reached. {16}

[Chandrakirti's] *Supplement to the Middle Way* (*Madhyamakavatara*) (stanza 1.2) says:

*Since mercy itself is accepted as the seed of this excellent harvest
Of the conquerors, as water for development, and
Like the ripening in a state of long enjoyment,
I therefore praise compassion at the beginning*

Even after having attained buddhahood, the complete enjoyment bodies enjoy perfect uncontaminated happiness, the results of compassion.

Also one stanza [1.13] teaches the benefit of being able to protect from great fears through analogy. Even though I may have committed very terrible negativities, such as harming the Three Jewels and the five actions of immediate retribution, if I depend on a powerful hero, I will be protected from great fears on the path. Likewise, in dependence on the mind of enlightenment, one will be released swiftly (Skt: *muhurta*), that is, in a *lava* instant,¹¹ from those fears of the bad migrations immediately. Therefore, why should those who have the imprints of adopting virtue and discarding negativity not rely on it? That is, they should rely on it.

Next, two lines [1.14ab] indicate its benefit of destroying negativities without difficulty. The mind [of enlightenment] possesses the ability to destroy immeasurable negativities because just as the fire at the end of time of the eon of destruction will burn up the environment up to and including the first concentration, the mind of enlightenment certainly burns up in an instant the great negativities that will cause a hell rebirth.

{17} The last two lines [1.14cd] indicate the benefits taught in the sutra. These benefits of the precious mind of enlightenment will definitely arise because the unfathomable benefits and praises of this mind were explained to be literally acceptable by the wise Protector Maitreya to the bodhisattva youthful Sudhana in the *Array of Stalks Sutra* (*Gandavyuhasutra*). It is extensively taught in the *Array of Stalks*:

O child of the lineage, the mind of enlightenment is like the seed of all the teachings of the Buddha. It is like a field since it causes the wholesome actions of all migrating beings to prosper. It is like the earth since the whole world depends on it. It is like Vaishravana, [the Lord of Wealth,] since it completely eliminates all

¹¹ For more information on these ancient units of time see stanza 3.89 of Vasubandhu's *Treasury of Knowledge* (*Abhidharmakosha*).

kinds of poverty. It is like a father since it completely protects all bodhisattvas. It is like the king of wish-fulfilling jewels since it perfectly fulfils every purpose. It is like the excellent vase since it acts to accomplish every wish. It is like a spear since it vanquishes the foe of afflictions. It is like armor since it stops improper mental attention. It is like a sword since it beheads the afflictions. It is like an axe since it fells the tree of afflictions. It is like a weapon since it guards from all kinds of attack.

3B2B-1A2B. Identification of the entity of the mind of enlightenment

1. Divisions of the entity {18}
2. Explanation of the distinction through analogy
3. Explanation of the differences in the benefits of the two minds of enlightenment, the wishing and engaging minds of enlightenment

3B2B-1A2B-1. Divisions of the entity

1.15 In brief, you should understand
 The mind of enlightenment to be of two types:
 The mind that wishes enlightenment
 And the mind that engages enlightenment.

You should understand that when the minds of enlightenment are condensed, there are two types because there is: (1) the wishing mind of enlightenment that observes unsurpassed enlightenment and the special others' welfare, and (2) the engaging mind of enlightenment that observes enlightenment and the special others' welfare.

3B2B-1A2B-2. Explanation of the distinction through analogy

1.16 As is understood by the instances
 Of desiring to go and going,
 So the wise should understand respectively
 The distinction between these two.

Even though one may be lying down, there can be an instance of mind that desires to go to some place thinking, "I shall go," which is not conjoined with the activity of going with the body. And there can be an instance of mind that thinks, "I am going to that place" at the time of being conjoined with the activity of going, such as the legs making strides. Although these two instances of mind are similar in being minds thinking, "I am going to that place," there is the distinction of being and not being conjoined with the activity of going. Therefore, likewise, the wise should understand that these two instances of wishing and engaging minds of enlightenment are posited respectively by way of whether or not they are explicitly conjoined with the activity of practicing the deeds of the six perfections.

3B2B-1A2B-3. Explanation of the differences in the benefits of the two minds of enlightenment, the wishing and engaging minds of enlightenment

- A. Explanation of the benefits of the wishing mind of enlightenment {19}
- B. Explanation of the benefits of the engaging mind of enlightenment

3B2B-1A2B-3A. Explanation of the benefits of the wishing mind of enlightenment

1.17 Although great fruits will arise in cyclic existence
 From the mind that wishes for enlightenment,

An uninterrupted flow of merit will not arise
As in the case of the engaging mind.

The *Biography of Superior Maitreya (Arya-maitreya-vimoksa)* says:

O, child of the lineage, it is like this. For example, although a diamond gem breaks, it still outshines all outstanding ornaments of gold. It does not lose its name “diamond gem,” and it still counteracts all poverty. Similarly, the diamond gem that is the mind producing omniscience, even if lacking in intensity, still outshines all the ornaments of the hearers and solitary realizers. It does not lose the name “bodhisattva” and still overcomes all the poverty of cyclic existence.

Just as has been said, the mind that wishes enlightenment will give rise to great fruits at the time of abiding in cyclic existence. However, it will not give rise to uninterrupted merit as is the case for the merit arising continuously from the engaging mind.

3B2B-1A2B-3B. Explanation of the benefits of the engaging mind of enlightenment

1.18 For one who has perfectly adopted this mind
With the thought never to turn away
For the sake of totally liberating
The infinite realms of sentient beings,

1.19 From that time onwards,
Even while asleep or lacking conscientiousness,
A force of merit equal to the sky
Will continuously ensue.

{20} From that time onwards, that is, from the time of perfectly adopting the engaging mind with the thought to not turn away from others’ welfare as long as cyclic existence exists for the sake of totally liberating the infinite realms of sentient beings from cyclic existence and placing them on the buddha ground, even when lacking conscientiousness due to sleep, intoxication, or the like, a great force of merit equal to space will continuously ensue. The wishing mind merely seeks the result of unsurpassed enlightenment, nothing more. The engaging mind is conjoined with the activities accomplishing the six perfections, the complete causes of buddhahood.

3B2B-1A2C. The reasons why these benefits will occur

1. Proof by citing scripture
2. Proof by reasoning

3B2B-1A2C-1. Proof by citing scripture

1.20 For the sake of those inclined towards the lower,
This is taught along with the correctness
By the Tathagata himself
In the *Sutra Requested by Subahu*.

That this engaging mind possesses these benefits is taught in the *Sutra Requested by Bodhisattva Subahu* along with correct reasoning by the Tathagata himself. {21} Why? This is for the sake of sentient beings inclined towards the lower [vehicle] – some indefinite in the hearers’ lineage who fear the accumulation of extensive collections and who, having turned away from the great vehicle, seek the hearers’ enlightenment. It is taught in order to reverse their minds inclined towards the lower and to place them in the great vehicle.

3B2B-1A2C-2. Proof by reasoning

- A. Correctness of obtaining benefits from the wishing mind
- B. Correctness of obtaining benefits from the engaging mind

3B2B-1A2C-2A. Correctness of obtaining benefits from the wishing mind

- 1.21 If even the thought to relieve
Sentient beings of merely a headache
Possesses the attitude to benefit
And possesses boundless merit,
- 1.22 Then what need is there to mention
The desire to dispel the boundless unhappiness of each sentient being
And to accomplish boundless good qualities
Of every single one of them?
- 1.23 Who has such an altruistic intention as this?
Do even fathers and mothers have it?
Do the gods and sages?
Does even Brahma have it?
- 1.24 If those beings have not
Even dreamt before of such an attitude
For their own welfare in their dreams,
How can they generate it for the welfare of others?
- 1.25 Such a mind of welfare of sentient beings
Does not arise even for their own sake;
An outstanding jewel of the mind,
An unprecedented wonder is born.

{22} The first two stanzas [1.21-1.22] indicate the benefits of the infinite functions of accomplishing virtue. In the past there was a captain called “Friend” who had many sons but all of them died. So after that a son was born and was given the name of a girl. He became known as “Daughter of Friend.” Through trade, he obtained a profit of eight, sixteen, thirty-two *karshapa* (an Indian currency) and so forth and honored his mother with them. His father was a head merchant who acquires jewels of the ocean. Since he too desired to go to the ocean, he requested permission from his mother but she did not allow him to go. She locked the door at night and lay down. Thinking that he would not be able to catch up with the traders, Daughter of Friend kicked his mother’s head, mounted a clever donkey, and, keeping awake, went on a journey to acquire the jewels in the ocean. The donkey, without power over its thoughts, was beaten with iron, became confused, and went on the wrong road. Riding on

and on, he passed through many cities where he was welcomed respectively by girls numbering four, eight, sixteen, thirty-two, and so forth who resembled the daughters of the gods, the results of honoring [his mother] with eight, sixteen, thirty-two karshapa and so forth. Playing and enjoying fun, [the good karmic results of] honor with four, eight, sixteen, thirty-two, and so forth were gradually exhausted and eventually he emerged at a world of hell. {23} There was an iron wheel spinning on the head of a man. His brains were drawn out, which he licked. Seeing this person undergoing such an experience, he asked, "Of what is this the fruition?" He replied, "This is the fruition of kicking my mother's head." Hearing this, he thought, "I also kicked my mother's head. Is this coming due to its fruition?" and became afraid. Immediately a wheel spun on his head and intense heat arose. When it became unbearable, he thought, "May all sentient beings' headaches similar to mine ripen only upon me." Due to generating this mind, the wheel rose into space, he was freed from the hell sufferings and returned to Jambudvīpa.

According to this story, not only are the benefits of desiring to dispel all the bodily sicknesses of all sentient beings vast, even the thought "I will dispel just the headaches of a limited number of observed sentient beings," as in the case of Daughter of Captain Friend, possesses the attitude of benefiting others and possesses boundless merit. If this is so, then what need is there to mention the infinite merit with respect to the desire to dispel the boundless unhappiness of each sentient being and the desire also to establish every single sentient being in the boundless good qualities of a buddha?

Next, one stanza [1.23] indicates that there is no altruistic mind that is superior to it. {24} What other person has such an altruistic mind accomplishing supreme happiness? Do even mothers or fathers desiring to benefit their children in the world have it? Do even the gods and sages who propound truth or even Brahma who abides by way of the four immeasurables¹² have this altruistic mind?

Then two stanzas [1.24 - 1.25] indicate that such an altruistic mind is not generated in sentient beings even for their own welfare, and praise such a precious mind. How can those very sentient beings who have not even dreamt before of such an altruistic mind for their own welfare in their dreams actually generate it for the welfare of others? That is, they have never generated it. Since it does not arise even for an instant towards other sentient beings for their welfare, any mind in the bodhisattvas that desires to attain buddhahood for the sake of accomplishing the happiness and abandoning the suffering of all sentient beings, this outstanding jewel of a mind, an unprecedented amazing wonder is born. I should also hold its birth by others as amazing and make effort in it.

3B2B-1A2C-2B. Correctness of obtaining benefits from the engaging mind

1.26 How can I fathom
 The merits of this jewel mind,
 The cause of joy of all migrating beings
 And the panacea for the suffering of sentient beings?

1.27 If merely a benevolent intention
 Excels venerating the buddhas,
 Then what need to mention striving to make

¹² Love, compassion, joy, and equanimity.

All beings without exception happy?

1.28 Although wishing to be rid of misery,
They run towards misery itself.
Although wishing to have happiness,
Like an enemy they ignorantly destroy it.

1.29 For those who are deprived of happiness
And burdened with many sorrows,
It satisfies them with all joys,
Dispels all suffering,

1.30 And clears away confusion.
Where is there a comparable virtue?
Where is there even such a friend?
Where is there merit similar to this?

{25} The first stanza [1.26] explicitly indicates the benefits. If such benefits come about in relation to the wishing mind, then the benefits of the engaging mind that is explicitly conjoined with the activity of practicing the deeds are far superior. Therefore, how can I fathom the measure of merits of such a mind that resembles a wish-fulfilling jewel, the cause of joy that causes the attainment of high status and the liberation of all migrating beings, and the medicinal panacea that destroys the sickness of suffering of all sentient beings? In other words, they are infinite, just as has been said in the *Sutra Requested by Viradatta (Viradatta-grhapati-pariprccha-sutra)*:

*If the merits of the mind of enlightenment
Were to take form,
They would fill the entire realm of space
And exceed it.*

{26} An extensive explanation has been taught in the *Compendium of Trainings* through quotations from sutras.

The second stanza [1.27] teaches the reason why such benefits arise. It is taught in the *King of Meditative Stabilizations Sutra* that merely a benevolent thought thinking, “May I become a buddha in order to protect all migrating beings” excels in merit the worshipping of as many buddhas as there are in billions of buddha fields. Then what need is there to mention the infinite merit in making effort in extensive exertion of practice accomplished for the sake of accomplishing the unsurpassed happiness of all sentient beings without exception?

The next three stanzas [1.28-1.30] indicate the dispelling of doubts with respect to how the benefits arise.

QUESTION: Sentient beings wish for happiness and do not wish for suffering. Since they make effort for that purpose, are they not skilled in regard to what is to be adopted, which is able to obtain happiness, and what is to be discarded, which is able to abandon suffering? Why would they strive for that purpose through other [means]?

RESPONSE: They definitely strive [for that purpose through other means] because, although sentient beings have a mind wishing to discard suffering, through the force of afflictions they create only the causes of suffering, whereby they run toward the very misery of endless cyclic existence and the bad migrations. This is because, even though they wish for happiness, due to being confused about their methods and being connected with ignorance, they destroy their own happiness as though it were an enemy. In this way, they are mistaken about the methods of happiness and suffering.

{27} Hence for sentient beings confused about the methods of happiness and suffering, that is, those who are deprived of happiness and possess many sufferings, [the mind of enlightenment] satisfies them with all the happiness of high status and definite goodness, severs the continuity of all suffering, and clears away the ignorance that is confused about what is to be adopted and what is to be discarded. Where is there a virtue comparable to the mind with such functions? Where is there even such a friend who accomplishes all benefit and happiness and protects from all harms? Where is there another similar marvelous merit that reveals in a non-erroneous way all the objects of what is to be adopted and what is to be discarded? There is not, therefore you should make effort in generating this precious mind of enlightenment.

3B2B-1A2D. Praising the persons who cultivate the mind of enlightenment

1. Worthy of praise due to rendering assistance even without having been asked
2. Worthy of high praise due to accomplishing all benefit
3. Worthy of praise due to being the supreme field

3B2B-1A2D-1. Worthy of praise due to rendering assistance even without having been asked

1.31 If whoever reciprocates benefit
 Is worthy of some praise,
 Then what need to mention the bodhisattva
 Who does good without its being asked of him?

If whoever reciprocates past benefit in the world is worthy of some praise, “He is a grateful man,” then what need is there to mention that the bodhisattva who does good, that is, accomplishes all benefit and happiness, induced by great compassion without its being asked of him is worthy of praise by gods and men? {28}

3B2B-1A2D-2. Worthy of high praise due to accomplishing all benefit

1.32 The world honors as virtuous
 A man who procures mediocre food and for an instant gives it
 Disrespectfully to a small number of beings,
 That satisfies them for only half a day.

1.33 What need be said then of one
 Who constantly bestows the unsurpassed bliss of the Sugatas for a long time
 Upon countless sentient beings,
 Fulfilling all their hopes?

The world honors as virtuous a man who procures inferior things, such as mediocre food, gives it for an instant, that is, for a short moment, with inferior application, disrespectfully

without reverence, to a small number of beings, such as a hundred of them, that satisfies them for only half a day, saying, “He is a great benefactor who has performed virtue.” What need be said then that one who constantly bestows with respectful application the distinguished object of giving, the unsurpassed uncontaminated bliss of the Sugatas, for a long time, until the end of cyclic existence, upon the vast field of countless sentient beings, fulfilling all their hopes of special benefit, is worthy of being honored? Therefore, those with mind should respect those beings who possess the precious mind of enlightenment in their continua. {29}

3B2B-1A2D-3. Worthy of praise due to being the supreme field

- A. Reason why it is inappropriate even to slightly deride a bodhisattva
- B. Reason why it is appropriate to cultivate faith
- C. Indicating that a bodhisattva is therefore worthy of homage and going for refuge

3B2B-1A2D-3A. Reason why it is inappropriate even to slightly deride a bodhisattva

1.34 The Buddha has said that someone who generates an evil thought
 Against such a benefactor as a Child of the Victors
 Will remain in hell for as many eons
 As there were evil thoughts.

Due to someone deprecating and wishing to harm such a final benefactor of all sentient beings as a Child of the Victors who acts to give all benefit and happiness to sentient beings, that is, if he generates or has generated an evil thought, the negativity is horrendous because *Definite Pacifying Magical Emanation Sutra* says:

Manjushri, understand that a bodhisattva who generates a mind of anger and generates a mind of deprecation towards a bodhisattva will remain in hell for that long.

Thus, the Muni taught that one will remain in hell for as many eons as there were moments of mind in which evil thoughts were generated. Therefore, you should be very careful with regard to this object.

{30} Regarding generating the power of faith, the *Seal of Entrance Sutra* says that if one generates a mind such as malice towards a bodhisattva who is inclined to the Mahayana, one generates a negativity that is countless times greater than destroying or burning stupas numbering the grains of sand of the banks of the Ganges. As proof of that it has been taught in many scriptures and their commentaries that, since buddhas are born from bodhisattvas, harming the cause of a buddha incurs a horrendous negativity.

3B2B-1A2D-3B. Reason why it is appropriate to cultivate faith

1.35ab But if one acts out of an attitude of faith,
 Its fruits will multiply far more than that.

But if a person acts out of an attitude of faith towards a bodhisattva, the fruits of that faith will multiply far more than the fruit of the negativity explained previously and one will experience special fruits for a greater number of countless eons than there are instants of the

mind of faith. Regarding the certain and the uncertain, they are just as taught in the *Seal of Entrance Sutra*.

3B2B-1A2D-3C. Indicating that a bodhisattva is therefore worthy of homage and going for refuge

1.35cd Even in adversity the Children of the Victors generate no negativity,
Instead their virtues naturally increase.

1.36 I prostrate to the body of he
In whom the sacred precious mind is born.
I seek refuge in that source of happiness
Who brings to happiness even those who harm him.

{31} Even if life-threatening circumstances occur due to an adversity, that is, something serious, that generates harm and suffering to the mind and body of the Children of the Victors, they generate no mind of negativity, such as attachment, hatred, or pride; instead their virtues naturally increase. Therefore, I prostrate respectfully with my three doors to the body of the person in whom the sacred, precious mind is born. This will be explained in the chapter on Patience.

The *Jatakamala* (*Garland of Birth Stories*) speaks of the Kalika King who cut off the limbs and secondary limbs¹³ of the bodhisattva Kshantivadin (Propounder of Patience). At that time, not only did [the bodhisattva] not generate anger, he was set in the truth. In the birth story of King Maitrabala (Power of Love), even though the five yakshas drank the blood from his body, he was eventually set in the state of an arya. Likewise, not only does a bodhisattva who has been harmed not retaliate, he brings only happiness. I seek refuge in that source of happiness.

In brief, at this time when we have obtained such a good support of freedoms and endowments, for the sake of taking its essence we should make effort day and night in the causes of high status and definite goodness. If we squander it instead, then it would be like returning empty-handed after having gone to an island of jewels. {32} We will be deprived of happiness and will not obtain a support of freedom in our future life. And if we do not obtain that, suffering will issue forth continuously.

Thus, through thinking, “There is no greater deception than this,” we should take the essence this once because Aryasura says in *Advice Like a Container of Precious Good Explanations*¹⁴:

*Those who have obtained a human life of richness
Due to virtue [collected] over countless eons,
And who then, due to confusion in this [life],
Fail to accumulate even the slightest treasury of merit,*

*Will in future lifetimes
Enter the house of unbearable sorrow.*

¹³ Examples of “secondary limbs” are the ears and the nose.

¹⁴ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 1, page 389: *Subhasita-ratna-karandaka-katha*, 16-18b.

*Like traders who go to an island of jewels
And return home empty-handed,*

*Without the karmic paths of the ten virtues
You will not obtain a human life again.
How can there be happiness without it?
Without happiness, there is only suffering.*

*Therefore, there is no greater deception than this.
There is nothing more confused than this.*

Hence the method for taking the essence is cultivating the mind of enlightenment. That is the best because just as has been said in [Bhavaviveka's] *Heart of the Middle Way* (*Madhyamajahrdayakarika*)¹⁵ :

*These bodies are without essence,
Like plantain trees and bubbles.
Who would not give them a substantial essence
By establishing them as conditions for benefiting others?*

*These bodies are a basis for sickness, old age, and death.
Those of good character possessing compassion
Make them in each moment
A basis for giving rise to happiness in others.*

*With the lamp of the holy Dharma,
Make this life of leisure
That has abandoned the eight non-freedoms fruitful
Through the deeds of a person of great capacity.*

{33} The Foremost Lama [Tsongkhapa] says [in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*]¹⁶ :

Enter the Mahayana thinking, "This body of mine, like a plantain tree and water bubble, is without essence. I shall transcend this nest of sickness, the source of the suffering of old age and so forth, with the deeds of a being of great capacity day and night; I shall make it meaningful."

Gyeltshab Thamje Khyenpa says:

*The knowledgeable who have obtained a human body of freedoms and endowments
Cultivate the two minds of enlightenment with effort,
The supreme [way] to take the essence upon the support of freedoms and endowments.
First meditate with effort on the benefits of that mind.*

¹⁵ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 1, page 391

¹⁶ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 1, page 133, chapter on *The Three Types of Persons*

3B2B-1B. Indicating the title of the chapter

The first chapter called “Explanation of the Benefits of the Mind of Enlightenment” from *Engaging in the Deeds of a Bodhisattva*.

This is easy to understand.

Chapter Two

Confessing Negativities

3B2B-2. Having generated the two minds, the way to train in the deeds

- A. Identifying the mind of enlightenment
- B. The way to train in the deeds, the six perfections

3B2B-2A. Identifying the mind of enlightenment

1. The branch of preparation: confessing negativities, the adverse conditions, by way of the complete four powers
2. Having preceded with accumulating the collections, the favorable conditions, the actual upholding of the mind [of enlightenment]

3B2B-2A1. The branch of preparation: confessing negativities, the adverse conditions, by way of the complete four powers

- A. Explanation of the text of the chapter
- B. Indicating the title of the chapter

3B2B-2A1A. Explanation of the text of the chapter

1. Making offerings
2. Paying homage
3. Going for refuge
4. Confession of negativities

3B2B-2A1A-1. Making offerings

- A. The purpose of making offerings
- B. Actual making of offerings

3B2B-2A1A-1A. The purpose of making offerings

2.1 In order to uphold that precious mind
 I make excellent offerings to the Tathagatas,
 To the sacred Dharma, the stainless jewel, and
 To the children of the buddhas, the oceans of excellent qualities.

{34} In order to uphold that precious mind from which all the virtuous collections of all sentient beings arise, to the Tathagatas; to the sacred Dharma Jewel – Mahayana true cessations which are pure by nature and without adventitious stains, and true paths which are without the stains of the appearance of true existence; and to the Sangha Jewel – the children of the buddhas, the great oceans of excellent qualities such as Lord Arya Avalokiteshvara and Manjushri, I make excellent offerings of the environment (such as auspicious offering substances, inestimable mansions, and groves), its contents (such as gold, silver, precious ornaments, cloth, and grains) and, besides these, by way of my body, my pure attitude, my three roots of virtue, and motivated by the mind of enlightenment, the preparations of making prostrations and circumambulations with my body, expressing the excellent qualities of the objects of offerings with my speech, and thinking of all their excellent qualities of abandonment and excellent qualities of realization with my mind.

3B2B-2A1A-1B. Actual making of offerings

1. Making offerings of substances owned and unowned
2. Making offering of one's body
3. Making offerings emanated by mind {35}

3B2B-2A1A-1B1. Making offerings of substances owned and unowned

- 2.2 Whatever flowers and fruits there are
 And whatever kinds of medicine,
 Whatever jewels exist in this world,
 And whatever clean, refreshing waters;
- 2.3 Jewel mountains and, likewise,
 Forest groves, quiet and joyful places,
 Heavenly trees ornamented by and bedecked with flowers,
 And trees with branches laden with good fruit;
- 2.4 Fragrances and incense of the realms of gods,
 Wish-fulfilling trees and jewel trees,
 Uncultivated harvests, and all ornaments
 That are worthy to be offered;
- 2.5 Lakes and pools adorned with lotuses
 And the beautiful cry of wild geese,
 Everything unowned
 Within the limitless spheres of space;
- 2.6 Taking these with my mind, I offer them
 To the supreme beings, the Munis, as well as their Sons;
 O holy objects of offering, Compassionate Ones,
 Think mercifully of me and accept these offerings of mine.
- 2.7 Not having merit I am destitute
 And I have no other gifts to offer.
 Thus, O Protectors, you who think of others' welfare,
 Through your power accept these for my sake.

{36} Whatever groves of flowers, such as five-colored lotuses with billions of petals, owned and unowned, that are established from the excellent qualities in one's own continent and in the billions of billion-fold world systems; whatever medicinal fruits there are, such as the three – yellow, beleric and emblic myrobalan fruits; whatever kinds of forests of medicine there are, such as camphor; whatever jewels exist in this world, such as gold, silver, white pearls, and red coral; the seven oceans of sport, the outer ocean, the lakes that exist in the places of humans, such as the great Lake Anavatapta, and whatever clean refreshing waters exist, such as the lakes and pools of white and red nectars of the lands of the gods; the jewel mountains established from the constituents of gold, silver, copper, and iron, the king of mountains, the iron fence outside the mountains of gold, the jewel mountains of Jambudvipa, such as Vindhya, and likewise, forest groves, quiet and joyful places, heavenly trees ornamented by and bedecked with various branches and flowers, trees with branches laden with ripe and heavy good fruit, fragrances and incense arisen simultaneously in the realms of gods, nagas, and so forth, wish-fulfilling trees that give rise to anything needed and wished for, trees established from various jewels, wish-fulfilling lakes, {37} bathing pools filled with nectar and

adorned with lotuses, resounding with the beautiful cry of water fowl such as wild geese, those having the aspect of self-arisen harvests uncultivated by plows, and also all ornaments that are worthy to be offered, I offer them to the Three Jewels. These three and a half stanzas [2.2-2.5ab] indicate the offering substances.

The next one and a half stanzas [2.5cd-2.6] indicate how to offer them. Taking everything unowned within the infinite and limitless spheres of space, all these with my mind, I respectfully offer them well to the objects of offering, the supreme beings, the Munis, as well as their children. O holy objects of offering, Compassionate Ones, think mercifully of me and accept these offerings of mine.

Next, one stanza [2.7] indicates the reason for offering the substances that are unowned.

QUESTION: Why is it appropriate to actually offer this and that pleasing thing, mere offerings arisen from mind?

RESPONSE: Not having accumulated extensive merit I am destitute, that is, poor in lacking desirable resources, so I have no other independent gifts to offer. Thus, O Protectors of the world, you who think of others' welfare single-mindedly, through the inconceivable force of even the impure world systems transforming into pure environments and the contents of the world, inferior food transforming into food of a hundred tastes and so forth, accept these unowned offerings for my sake, {38} just as has been said [in Maitreya's *Ornament of Clear Realizations*, (*Abhisamayalamkara*) 4.61bc and 8.16a], "The worlds of the environment are impure./ Establishing them in the purity of that" and "Unpleasant tastes appear to him as the best of tastes."

3B2B-2A1A-1B2. Making offering of one's body

2.8 Eternally I shall offer all my bodies
To the Conquerors and their children.
Please accept me, you Supreme Heroes.
Respectfully shall I be your subject.

2.9 Through being completely under your care,
I shall not fear existence and shall benefit sentient beings;
I shall perfectly transcend my previous negativities
And henceforth shall commit no more.

Eternally I shall offer in every way my bodies that are under my own control to the Conquerors and their children by discarding the mind that holds them single-pointedly as always being mine. So please accept my bodies, you Supreme Heroes. The purpose of such an offering is so that, respectfully and faithfully, I shall be your subject or servant, protector, and will obey your advice. {39}

What is the point of making such an offering? Through being completely under your care, by depending on a refuge that is free from all fear, I shall have no fear of existence, and due to being free from fear, I shall benefit sentient beings. I shall perfectly transcend the meaningless previous negativities that I have accumulated and henceforth shall commit no more even at the cost of my life.

3B2B-2A1A-1B3. Making offerings emanated by mind

- A. Commonplace offerings
- B. Unsurpassable offerings

3B2B-2A1A-1B3A. Commonplace offerings

I shall offer twelve commonplace offerings: (1) ablution, (2) garments, (3) ornaments, (4) ointments, (5) flowers, (6) incense, (7) food, (8) lights, (9) inestimable mansions, (10) parasols, (11) music, and (12) that blessed continuously into the aspect of offerings.

(1) Ablution

2.10 To very sweetly scented bathing chambers
With brilliantly sparkling crystal floors
And exquisite pillars ablaze with gems,
Having canopies above aglow with pearls,

2.11 I beseech the Tathagatas and their children
To come and bathe their bodies abundantly
From many jeweled vases filled with waters scented and enticing,
To the accompaniment of song and music.

2.12ab Let me dry their bodies with incomparable cloths,
Clean and well-anointed with scent,

{40} The first stanza [2.10] indicates the bathing chamber, the second [2.11] indicates the way of beseeching the ablution, and the last two lines [2.12ab] indicate the drying of their bodies.

When inviting them to where the ablution will take place, to the bathing chambers that are very sweetly scented due to having been sprinkled with sandalwood water and the like, with crystal floors that have been wiped to a brilliant sparkle, and exquisite pillars, beams, and the like ablaze with gems, having canopies above aglow with pearls, I beseech the Tathagatas and their children to come and bathe their bodies abundantly from many jeweled vases of gold, silver, vidurya, and crystal, well filled with perfumed waters, scented and enticing, and flowers, to the accompaniment of melodious songs such as “Just as all the Tathagatas granted ablution at the moment of the Buddha's birth, likewise, we shall grant ablution with the pure water of the gods,” and music of cymbals and so forth. Then I dry the bodies of these objects of offering with thin, incomparable cloths, clean and well anointed with scent, soft and free from knots.

(2) Garments

2.12cd And then may I present them
With fragrant well-dyed garments,

2.13a Manifold thin and soft clothes.

{41} After the washing, then may I present these objects of offerings with fragrant garments such as the upper robe, the lower robe, the seat cover dyed into orange and yellow colors, and so forth with the appropriate three great dyes and so forth. I make offerings to those with the appearance of the ordained and those with the appearance of the laity of excellent clothes of material that is thin and soft to the touch with manifold hues such as white, yellow, red, green, and blue.

(3) *Ornaments*

2.13bcd I adorn with hundreds of this and that supreme ornaments
The aryas Samantabhadra, Manjughosha,
Avalokiteshvara, and so forth.

I adorn the bodies, such as the necks, waist, hands, and feet, of the aryas Samantabhadra, Manjughosha, Avalokiteshvara, and so forth with this and that supreme ornaments, such as bracelets, anklets, and necklaces of hundreds of red corals and white pearls.

(4) *Ointments*

2.14 Like polishing pure, refined gold,
I anoint the bodies of the Lords of Subduers that blaze with light
With the choicest perfumes whose fragrance permeates
Throughout the billion worlds.

With the choicest perfumes whose fragrance permeates not only the surroundings and not just all of Jambudvīpa, but throughout the billion world systems, {42} I anoint the bodies of the Subduer Buddha Bhagavans, the enjoyment bodies and emanation bodies,

- just as said [in Maitreya's *Ornament of Clear Realization*, 8.13a], "hands and feet marked with wheels, tortoise feet," their palms and the soles of their feet are adorned with thousand-spoke golden wheels and completely even like the abdomen of a tortoise,
- just as said (8.13b), "fingers and toes joined with webs," their fingers and toes are joined with webs, like the king of geese, and yet allow rings to be worn individually on the fingers and toes,
- just as said (8.13c), "hands as well as feet smooth and tender," their hands and feet are smooth like lotus roots and are tender without wrinkles or bumpiness,
- just as said (8.13d), "seven [points] of his body elevated," the seven [points] – the four tops of their hands and feet, the top parts of their left and right shoulders, and their nape – are elevated due to being full,
- just as said (8.14a), "Long fingers and toes, broad heels, a large and upright body," the results of generosity are long fingers and toes, broad heels, a body as large as the king of mountains, and upright due to the left, right, front, and back not being depressed,
- just as said (8.14b), "Ankles not prominent, hairs pointing upward," the protrusion at their ankles is not prominent to sight, and their body hairs point upward without pointing loosely downwards,
- just as said (8.14c), "Calves like enya, long and beautiful arms," {43} their slender calves are like an enya antelope, and their arms are long and beautiful in that when the two arms are straightened they reach the knees, and at the time of sitting in the vajra posture, when extended straight, they touch the lotus seat,
- just as said (8.14d), "Penis well concealed in a sheath," their genitalia are well concealed in a sheath, like the supreme horse,¹⁷
- just as said (8.15b), "Hairs growing singly and excellently clockwise," their hairs grow straight singly and [curl] clockwise excellently,

¹⁷ For some reason, "Golden-hued skin, delicate skin," (8.15a) is not explained in this commentary.

- just as said (8.15c), “Face adorned with a treasure hair, torso like a lion’s,” their face is adorned with a treasure hair, white in color as a result of generosity, clockwise and so forth as a result of ethics, long, equal to the billion worlds, as a result of the six perfections, and when contracted curls clockwise and adorns the mid-brow, and their torso is broad like a lion’s,
- just as said (8.15d), “Tops of his shoulders rounded, broad chested,” the tops of their shoulders at the two arms are rounded, and the surface of their chest is very broad,
- just as said (8.16a), “unpleasant tastes appear to him as the best of tastes,” even inferior food appears to their tongue as the best of tastes,
- just as said (8.16b), “Body symmetrical like a banyan tree,” the two parts above and below their center and their penis, due to evenness, are symmetrical like the banyan tree,
- just as said (8.16c), “Possessing a protrusion on his crown, tongue beautiful and long,” {44} they possess a protrusion on their crown which is higher even than Brahma World¹⁸ but is not prominent when viewed, and a red and slender tongue that can cover the billion worlds,
- just as said (8.16d-8.17b), “The melodious voice of Brahma, lion-like cheeks/ Very white teeth, even teeth, well set,/ Forty complete in number,” they have the melodious speech of sixty qualities, like the voice of Brahma, cheeks that are round and broad like the cheeks of a lion, teeth that are very white and even due to being free from unevenness in length, and well set and not dispersed due to there being no gaps, and complete in number as forty,
- just as said (8.17cd), “Sapphire eyes, eyelashes like a magnificent cow’s:/ These are the thirty-two signs,” their eyes are long, the black and white parts do not mix, they are similar to the petals of a dark blue utpala flower, and their eyelashes are well aligned like a magnificent cow’s;

these are the thirty-two signs. Furthermore,

*A subduer’s nails are copper colored,
Glossy, and raised; his fingers
Rounded, well-developed, and tapered;
His veins invisible and without knots;* [8.21]

*His ankles are not prominent; his legs equal;
He proceeds like a lion, an elephant,
A swan, and a bull; his stride is
To the right, pleasing, and upright; his body is authoritative,* [8.22]

*Cleansed, well proportioned,
Clean, soft, and pure;
His signs are thoroughly complete; {45}
His body is fully developed and fine;* [8.23]

*His walk is even; his two eyes are
Clear; his flesh is tender;
His body is dauntless and developed;*

¹⁸ This refers to the first concentration of the form realm.

- His body is very firm;* [8.24]
- His limbs are thoroughly distinct;
His sight is without obscuration and clear;
His belly is round, proportionate, not curved, and
Not hanging; his navel is* [8.25]
- Deep and curls to the right;
He is thoroughly pleasant to behold;
His conduct is pure; his body is
Without moles;* [8.26]
- His hands are as soft as cotton;
The lines of his hands are clear, deep, and long;
His face is not too long;
His lips are as red as the bimba fruit;* [8.27]
- His tongue is supple, slender, and
Red; his voice is thunderous
And smooth; his canines are round,
Sharp, white, even, and* [8.28]
- Tapered; his nose is high and
Supremely clean;
His eyes, wide with thick eyelashes,
Are like lotus petals;* [8.29]
- His eyebrows are long, soft, and
Glossy, with even hairs;
His arms are long and well developed; his ears are equal and
Completely without impairment;* [8.30]
- His forehead is well defined and
Broad; his head is well formed;
His hair is as black as a bee,
Thick, soft, untangled, and* [8.31]
- Not bristly, its fragrance
Captivating the minds of beings;
He has the endless knots and auspicious signs:
These are asserted to be a buddha's excellent exemplifications.* [8.32]

{46} Just as has been said, like polishing pure refined gold, I anoint these bodies that blaze with light, that are beautified by the ornaments of the eighty exemplifications, whereby one can never be satiated by beholding them.

(5) *Flowers*

2.15 And to the highest objects of giving, the Lords of Subduers,
I offer all enchanting, sweet smelling flowers,
Such as mandara, lotus, and utpala,
And beautiful, well-arranged garlands.

And to the highest objects of giving, the Lords of Subduers, I offer all enchanting, sweet smelling collections of flowers that grow on mountains, plains, and so forth, such as stalks of mandara, lotus, and utpala flowers that exist in the lands of humans and gods, scattered loosely, and also beautiful, well-arranged flower garlands.

(6) *Incense*

2.16ab I also offer clouds of incense
Whose pervasive sweet aroma steals away the mind.

[Shantideva's] *Compendium of Trainings (Siksamuccaya)* says:

*Common incense and exceptional incense,
Light rays that arrange the incense radiate out,
Having laid out various incense everywhere,
I offer them to the great beings, the Victors and their children.*

{47} Just as has been said, I also offer clouds of incense whose sweet aroma of akarū and so forth pervades the ten directions and steals away the mind.

(7) *Food*

2.16cd I offer to them the delicacies of the gods
With a variety of foods and drinks too.

I offer to them, that is, the Victors and their children, the delicacies of the gods with foods and drinks of various colors, smells, and tastes, such as divine food with a hundred tastes composed of the three sweets (sugar, molasses, and honey) and three whites (yogurt, milk, and butter) too.

(8) *Lights*

2.17ab I also offer them jeweled lamps
Arranged on golden lotus buds.

The Great Omniscient Pandit [Cho-gi-gyel-tshen in his *Offering to the Guru*] (stanza 27) says:

*The sun, moon, dazzling jewels, scores of lamps,
Frolicking light rays dispel the darkness of the billion worlds.*

Just as has been said, I also offer them the light rays of jewels that dispel the darkness of the billion worlds, and the sun, the moon, and scores of stars that dispel the darkness of the four continents of the billion worlds, with masses of light rays from the lamps of blazing light

arranged within, that is, set out in, vessels of golden lotus buds, and from each of the sides of the eight-sided jewel, King of Lords.

(9) Inestimable mansions

2.17cd Upon ground anointed with incense,
 I scatter loose, pleasing flowers.

2.18 To those who have the nature of compassion
 I offer inestimable palaces resounding with melodious praises,
 Beautified by and blazing with hanging ornaments of gems of pearls
 That adorn the infinite space.

{48} *Tantra Purifying Unfortunate Rebirths* says:

*On seats of lions possessing the four fearlessnesses
That have arisen from the strength of boundless merit and so forth,
Bedding of divine substance, attractive and beautiful,
A round palace devoid of the angles and corners of the afflictions,*

*A square inestimable mansion of excellent qualities,
Supramundane, square, and double-storied,
Nature of clear light, moon seat of bodhichitta,
I offer to the Victors and their children.*

Just as has been said, I offer multitudes of seats, that is, seats [supported by] lions, seats of lotus, sun, and moon, within inestimable mansions that are double storied and have many storeys, square outside and round inside, scattered with many pleasing varieties of loose flowers upon a ground that is established from the jewels that exist in the lands of god and humans, anointed with incense, well laid out with diversity in heights high and low, in shapes square and round, and so forth, inestimable palaces adorned with many ornaments such as canopies, draperies, parasols, and so forth, resounding with pleasing melodious praises by god and human singers and hosts of offering goddesses, {49} and, in addition, beautified by and blazing with hanging strands of many gems such as pearls, beautifying the infinite, that is, boundless, space above, and also all ornaments of the space above, whatsoever exist, I offer to those who have the nature of compassion.

(10) Parasols

2.19 Eternally shall I offer to the Lords of Subduers
 Jeweled parasols with golden handles
 And pleasing ornaments embellishing the rims,
 Standing upright, their shapes beautiful to behold.

Eternally shall I offer to the Lords of Subduers parasols adorned with pleasing types of ornaments that are adorned with many jewels, with golden handles that are fashioned from various jewels, standing pitched and upright, their shapes and colors beautiful to behold. They are not other than what is meant in the *Charya Tantra*, which says:

*Beautiful jeweled parasols with golden handles,
Supreme victory banners that are victorious over the discordant maras,
Projecting streamers that move the teachings in the ten directions,
Captivating tassels of flags covering all directions,*

*Yak-tail [fans] with gem handles dispelling torment,
Shining canopies embellished with jewels,
I offer to the Victors as well as their children,
Please accept them with compassion for the sake of migrating beings.*

(11) Music

2.20 Besides those, may collections of offerings
Resounding with sweet pleasing music,
Clouds that appease the suffering of sentient beings,
Remain individually.

{50} Besides those that were offered earlier, may offering substances, masses of clouds that bestow happiness to each and everyone – such as clouds of Dharma resounding with the infinite and sweet pleasing music of large drums, lutes, flutes, conches, and so forth that dispel the suffering of sentient beings by them merely hearing it and satisfies or appeases them with happiness; a shower of food, clothing, and so forth that rains upon impoverished and deprived sentient beings such as the hungry ghosts; clouds that let fall cooling rain and radiate rays of sunlight upon the beings of the hot and cold hells respectively; clouds that bestow all needed resources upon migrating beings such as humans; a rain of nectar that dispels the gods' suffering of death and transmigration, their falling down [into the lower realms,] and the like, and destroys their death – remain and arise individually.

(12) That blessed continuously into the aspect of offerings

2.21 May a rain of flowers and gems
Descend continuously
Upon all the holy Dharma Jewels,
And upon the reliquaries¹⁹ and holy images.

{51} May a great rain of offerings of flowers, gems, and the like descend continuously until the end of cyclic existence upon all the Dharma Jewels included within the twelve branches of scriptures²⁰ and true cessations and true paths, and upon the supports of the exalted mind, the reliquaries that hold the essence of relics, the paintings and statues of holy images, and so forth.

3B2B-2A1A-1B3B. Unsurpassable offerings

2.22 In the same way as Manjughosha and so forth
Have made offerings to the Victors,

¹⁹ “Mchod rten” literally means “support of offerings.”

²⁰ These are: the set of discourses, the set of melodious descriptions, the set of prophecies, the set of verses, the set of purposeful expressions, the set of background accounts, the set of expressions of realizations, the set of legends, the set of birth stories, the set of the very extensive, the set of marvels, and the set that settles.

Similarly do I bestow gifts upon the Tathagatas,
The Protectors, as well as their children.

In the same way as the bodhisattvas who have attained power, Manjughosha, Samantabhadra, and so forth, have emanated offering substances filling space just as wished and made offerings to the Victors, similarly do I bestow gifts upon the Tathagatas, the protectors of gods and humans, as well as their children. It is just as has been said [in the *Compendium of Trainings*]:

*Common flowers and exceptional flowers,
Light rays that array the flowers radiate out,
Having laid out various flowers everywhere,
I offer them to the great beings, the Victors and their children.*

3B2B-2A1A-2. Paying homage

- A. Praising with speech
- B. Bowing with body

3B2B-2A1A-2A. Praising with speech

2.23 I eulogize the oceans of excellent qualities
With oceans of branches of melodious praise;
May these clouds of pleasant eulogy
Certainly arise always to them everywhere.

{52} I eulogize the oceans of excellent qualities, such as wisdom, mercy and power, with oceans of branches of melodious praise by way of expressing their infinite excellent qualities. “Melodious” refers to speech, “branches” is taught in the *Stages of the Path to Enlightenment* to refer to its cause, and “oceans” denotes plurality; it is explained that, having imagined countless heads in each body and countless tongues in each head, one praises them. Furthermore, may these infinite clouds of pleasant eulogy certainly arise always to these hosts of superior beings everywhere.

3B2B-2A1A-2B. Bowing with body

- 1. Paying homage to the Three Jewels
- 2. Paying homage to the basis for generating the mind of enlightenment
- 3. Paying homage to the abbots, masters, and so forth

3B2B-2A1A-2B1. Paying homage to the Three Jewels

2.24 With bodies as numerous
As all the atoms within the field,
I bow with my body to all buddhas of the three times,
The Dharma, and the supreme community.

{53} I pay homage by emanating bodies as numerous as all the atoms within the buddha fields and bowing to all the complete buddha bhagavans who have come and will come in the three times, the holy Dharma of scriptures and realizations, and the holy supreme community, as well as the bodhisattvas who are superior beings.

3B2B-2A1A-2B2. Paying homage to the basis for generating the mind of enlightenment

2.25ab I pay homage to the basis of the mind of enlightenment,
To all supports of offering,

The basis of the mind of enlightenment is just as said in the citations below. [Aryasura's] *Compendium of the Perfections (Paramitasamasa)* (6.67)²¹ says:

*Why would anyone who is in the Victor's lineage and
Who accomplishes the welfare of the world
Not generate compassion for those stumbling with their eyes of wisdom closed,
And strive constantly with joyous effort to clear away such confusion?*

Teachings of Akshayamati Sutra (Akshayamatinirdeshasutra) says:

Venerable Sharatvatiputra, furthermore, the great compassion of the bodhisattvas is inexhaustible. Why? Because it is a prerequisite. Venerable Sharatvatiputra, for example, the inhalation and exhalation of breath is the prerequisite of the life power. Likewise, the great compassion of the bodhisattvas is the prerequisite that perfectly accomplishes the Mahayana.

I pay homage to compassion, its cause (recognizing sentient beings as one's mothers, recalling their kindness, wishing to repay that kindness, affectionate love), and its result (exceptional resolve)²², the Mahayana Basket of teachings of the Teacher, and to the supports of offerings, such as the persons who acted as conditions for generating the mind of enlightenment, the places where it was generated, and the images of the buddhas and so forth.

3B2B-2A1A-2B3. Paying homage to the abbots, masters, and so forth

2.25cd To all abbots and masters
And to all the [holders of] supreme conduct.

{54} I pay homage to all abbots who give the intermediate ordination and full ordination, to the masters give the lay vows, the novice vows, and so forth, to the reading and resident masters,²³ and to all the holders of supreme conduct who are learning the paths of the three vehicles.

3B2B-2A1A-3. Going for refuge

2.26 Until the essence of enlightenment,
I go for refuge to the Buddhas.

²¹ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 255.

²² Note that this passage alludes to the six causes in the Sevenfold Cause and Effect Instructions for generating the mind of enlightenment, which are: (1) recognizing sentient beings as one's mothers, (2) recalling their kindness, (3) wishing to repay that kindness, (4) affectionate love, (5) **compassion**, and (6) exceptional resolve.

²³ JN: "I pay homage to all abbots who are ordained and fully-ordained, the masters who are holders of lay vows, the novice monks and nuns, and so forth, the recitation and residence masters" changed to "I pay homage to all abbots who give the intermediate ordination and full ordination, to the masters give the lay vows, the novice vows, and so forth, to the reading and residence masters"

Likewise, I go for refuge to the Dharma,
And to the assembly of bodhisattvas.

Taking as objects of observation the Mahayana Three Jewels that have already been accomplished in others' continua and the Three Jewels that will arise in my own continuum, from now until the essence of unsurpassed enlightenment, that is, until I actualize the truth body at the tree of enlightenment, I go for refuge to the Buddhas, and, likewise, I go for refuge to the Mahayana Dharma Jewel, and to the assembly of bodhisattvas, the arya bodhisattvas. {55} I accept the already accomplished teacher who teaches the path to buddhahood and the actual refuge as the Dharma Jewel that is to be attained in one's own continuum, and take the already accomplished Mahayana superior beings as companions for accomplishing refuge.

In addition, when explained extensively, there are four sections:

- A. The causes in dependence on which one goes for refuge
- B. In dependence on those [causes], the objects to which one goes for refuge
- C. By that extent, the way in which one goes for refuge
- D. Having gone for refuge, the stages of training

3B2B-2A1A-3A. The causes in dependence on which one goes for refuge

As explained before, "Just as a flash of lightning on a dark, cloudy night..." (1.5), our wholesome virtuous karma is feeble and poor, and our unwholesome karma very much stronger, whereby, inferring from that cause, the destination of our future lives will be none other than one of the three unfortunate realms. And if we are reborn there, there will be prolonged intense suffering that is difficult to bear. Thinking thus, we will be afraid and terrified. This fear and the belief in the Three Jewels that they have the power to protect us from it are the causes of going for refuge because Dorje Dzinpa Konchog Gyeltshen says:

*My fear of the unfortunate rebirths and
Belief in the Three Jewels' power to protect us from it
Are the causes of going for refuge. From these two, burning
And fervent, going for refuge will likewise arise.*

3B2B-2A1A-3B. In dependence on those [causes], the objects to which one goes for refuge

The objects to which one goes for refuge are only the deities and the Three Jewels as said in [Chandrakirti's] *Seventy Stanzas on Going for Refuge (Trisarana-gamana-saptati)*:

*Buddha, Dharma, and Sangha
Are the refuges of those who desire liberation.*

{56} The reason why they are worthy objects of refuge is that the Buddha Bhagavan himself is free from all fears, skilled in the methods for liberating others from all fears, engages with great compassion for all without bias, and enacts the welfare of all regardless of whether or not they have benefited him. Hence, since he is a worthy object of refuge, the Dharma that is taught by him and the Sangha who accomplishes that [Dharma] are also worthy objects of refuge because Dorje Dzinpa Konchog Gyeltshen's *Stages of the Path* says:

*He himself is free from all fears, skilled in liberating others,
Possesses mercy for all and expects no repayment;
Buddha is a worthy object of refuge, whereby the Dharma taught by him
And the Sangha are also worthy objects of refuge.*

3B2B-2A1A-3C. By that extent, the way in which one goes for refuge

1. Understanding the excellent qualities of the Three Jewels
2. Understanding their distinctions
3. Commitments
4. Going for refuge without propounding another

3B2B-2A1A-3C1. Understanding the excellent qualities of the Three Jewels

The Buddha Bhagavan possesses supreme qualities of body, speech, mind, and activities. Thinking that the Buddha who possesses infinite excellent qualities arises from the force of the Dharma, one will respect the Dharma. And the Sangha are those who are not distracted from that Dharma. Thus, understand the excellent qualities of the Three Jewels.

3B2B-2A1A-3C2. Understanding their distinctions

{57} The Sangha are the accomplishees, the Dharma is what is to be accomplished, and the Buddha is the result of accomplishing the Dharma. Thus understand their distinctions. When summarized, there are six: defining characteristics, activities, belief, accomplishment, recollection, and increase in merit. You should understand them from [Tsongkhapa's] *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*.

3B2B-2A1A-3C3. Commitments

Hold the Buddha as the teacher who teaches refuge to oneself, hold the Dharma as the actual refuge, and accept and hold the Sangha as companions for accomplishing that refuge.

3B2B-2A1A-3C4. Going for refuge without propounding another

Having understood the qualities of Buddhist and non-Buddhist teachers, their teachings, their trainees, and so forth, one-pointedly hold only the Three Jewels as refuge. Do not take the teachers of the Forders²⁴ and the like as another refuge and hold two [refuges].

Thus, Dorje Dzinpa Konchog Gyeltshen's *Stages of the Path* says:

*Buddha, supreme body, speech, mind, and activities;
Holy Dharma is that which abandons faults, accomplishes excellent qualities;
Sangha, not distracted from that;
Understand the excellent qualities of the Three Jewels.*

*The Sangha are the accomplishees, the Dharma is what is to be accomplished,
And the Buddha is the result of accomplishing the Dharma;
Understand the distinctions of the Three Jewels.*

²⁴ "Forders" (Tibetan: *mu stegs pa*, Sanskrit *tirtika*) is another name for non-Buddhists. Professor Jeffrey Hopkins points out in his *Cutting Through Appearances The Practice and Theory of Buddhism* (Snow Lion Publications, Ithaca, New York USA, 1989) p. 170 that "They call themselves 'Forders' because, from their own viewpoint, they have a ford to the end, i.e., to liberation."

Hold and accept that the Buddha is the teacher of refuge, the Dharma the actual refuge,

And the Sangha the companions for accomplishing refuge.

Having understood the qualities of Buddhist and non-Buddhist {58}

Teachers, teachings, and those training in them,

Hold only the Three Jewels as refuge.

Do not propound another.

By means of these four, go for refuge.

3B2B-2A1A-3D. Having gone for refuge, the stages of training

1. Individual trainings
2. Shared trainings

3B2B-2A1A-3D1. Individual trainings

- A. Proscriptive trainings
- B. Prescriptive trainings

3B2B-2A1A-3D1A. Proscriptive trainings

The three proscriptive trainings are just as said in Dorje Dzinpa Konchog Gyeltshen's *Stages of the Path*:

*Not holding worldly gods, nagas, and local guardians as refuge,
Abandoning harm to others,
Abandoning accordance with those who do not possess belief
In the Three Jewels and who deprecate them.*

3B2B-2A1A-3D1B. Prescriptive trainings

The three prescriptive trainings are just as said in Dorje Dzinpa Konchog Gyeltshen's *Stages of the Path*:

*Holding even images of mediocre material and faulty craftsmanship
As fields of reverence, as though they are actual buddhas,
Respecting even one letter as though it is the actual Dharma,
Regarding even a patch of robes as the actual Sangha.*

3B2B-2A1A-3D2. Shared trainings

Venerable Tamche Khyenpa Konchog Tenpe Dronme's *Teachings on Refuge: Lamp that Clarifies the Good Path of Benefit and Happiness* says:

From among the six shared trainings, the **first** is to repeatedly bring to mind the distinctions of going for refuge and familiarize with the complete defining characteristics of going for refuge. {59} The **second** is to make offerings with the choicest parts of what you eat or drink. When the recollection of all of those as the kindness of the Three Jewels occurs, then you will [realize] the purpose of making offerings to the Three Jewels from any good position (*bzang sa*). The **third** is, when seeing the excellent qualities and the kindness of the Three Jewels, out of

compassion to try one's best in the methods for causing other sentient beings to also come under their protection. The **fourth** is to rely on the Three Jewels regardless of whatever activities you do and whatever needs you see, and to make offerings to the Three Jewels in accordance with them. Since it is inappropriate to rely in anyway on Bon²⁵ and the like, which are discordant with them, you should place your confidence in the Three Jewels at all times.

Someone proclaimed that a Dharma practitioner taking medicine contradicts the trainings of going for refuge. This is a case of misunderstanding the essential point because it is incorrect to think, for example, that one is helped by medicine without being helped by the Three Jewels. If medicine is not to be consumed at all, then it would follow that it would be inappropriate for fully-ordained monks to even consume food, since all foods are also included within the four medicines. The way of relying upon medicine is also taught in the *Basis of Medicine Scripture*, whereby through understanding that even medicine is part of the compassion and exalted activities of the buddhas, relying upon it is appropriate. This is taught in Jamgon Pandit's *Illuminating the Thought of the Muni*.

{60} The **fifth** is to contemplate the benefits explained above and go for refuge six times in the day and night. The **sixth** is to not give up going for refuge even at the cost of one's life because the *Sutra Perfectly Possessing Ethics* says, "Losing one's life and dying is easy, but degenerating and destroying one's ethics is not like that. Why? Losing one's life and dying will exhaust the life of this very rebirth, but due to degenerating and destroying one's ethics, one will be separated from the lineage, abandon happiness, and experience great downfalls for millions of rebirths." Just as has been said, since I will inevitably be separated from my body, life, and resources, if I give up the Three Jewels for their sake, then suffering will arise continuously in all lifetimes. Thus, make the promise, "No matter what happens, I will not give up refuge." You should not say words of giving up refuge even for the sake of a mere laugh, just as in the biography of the king of Li. Not only should you not say words of giving up refuge just verbally, if you train in requesting the Three Jewels' attention (?) at the time of joy and pain in all activities, then, when dying, recollection of the Three Jewels will definitely arise, and, if it arises, one will certainly not fall into the bad rebirths. In addition, due to the ripened effects and the results congruent with the cause, you will not be separated from the Three Jewels in all future lives and, due to coming under their protection, all excellent collections will spontaneously arise.

{61} Hence the benefits of going for refuge are just as they have been said by Dorje Dzinpa Konchog Gyeltshen:

*Due to going for refuge, you will be included among Buddhists,²⁶
You will become a support for generating all vows,
All negative actions accumulated in the past will be restrained and exhausted,
The merit of going for refuge cannot be fathomed by mind,*

²⁵ Bon is the ancient religion practiced in Tibet before Buddhism spread there.

²⁶ JN: "you will be set to attain buddhahood" changed to "you will be included among Buddhists"

*You will not fall into the lower rebirths, and will not be harmed by human and non-human obstacles,
Whatever you think will be accomplished,
And you will quickly attain enlightenment.
Contemplating these eight benefits, go for refuge three times [each] in the day and night.*

3B2B-2A1A-4. Confession of negativities by way of the complete four powers

- A. Power of repudiation
- B. Power of reliance
- C. Power of utilizing the antidote
- D. Power of turning away from misdeeds

3B2B-2A1A-4A. Power of repudiation

- 1. Examining the way in which negativities are committed and generating regret
- 2. Due to fear of dying without purifying negativities, generate regret
- 3. Contemplating extensively the mode of negativities, cultivate regret
- 4. Contemplating how one will fear due to negativities

3B2B-2A1A-4A1. Examining the way in which negativities are committed and generating regret

- A. Requesting the objects of confession for attention
- B. How to perform the general confession of negativities committed
- C. How to confess negativities accumulated in relation to special objects
- D. How to contemplate the undesirable results and confess with regret

3B2B-2A1A-4A1A. Requesting the objects of confession for attention

2.27 With folded hands I request
 The complete buddhas and bodhisattvas
 Who possess great compassion
 And reside in all directions.

{62} To the complete buddhas and bodhisattvas who possess great compassion and reside in the ten directions, that is, in the fields and realms of the ten directions (north, south, east, west, the four intermediate directions, above, and below), with folded hands I request to confess the negativities committed in the past by way of regret as though I had ingested poison.

3B2B-2A1A-4A1B. How to perform the general confession of negativities committed

2.28 Since beginningless cyclic existence,
 In this life and in others,
 Unknowingly, I committed negativities
 And caused them to be done.

2.29 Overwhelmed by the mistakes of ignorance
 I rejoiced in what was committed,
 But now seeing these mistakes,
 From my heart I confess them to the Protectors.

Since I have been circling in beginningless cyclic existence, that is, in this life and in others, unknowingly or due to the force of confusion regarding ripening effects, I have committed negativities myself and caused them to be done by others, and overwhelmed by the mistakes of the ignorance that is confused about actions and their effects, I rejoiced in negativities committed by others. But now, seeing whatever mistakes that were committed by way of body: (1) killing, (2) stealing, and (3) sexual misconduct; by way of speech: (4) lying, (5) divisive speech, (6) harsh speech, and (7) idle talk; and by way of mind: (8) covetousness towards others' wealth, (9) harmful intent towards others, and (10) wrong view regarding actions and their results, {63} from my heart with regret I confess them to the Protectors, that is, I do not conceal and do not hide them.

3B2B-2A1A-4A1C. How to confess negativities accumulated in relation to special objects

2.30 Whatever harmful acts of body, speech, and mind
 I have done by means of afflictions,
 Towards the Three Jewels,
 My parents, my spiritual masters, and others;

Whatever harmful acts of body, speech, and mind, I, one having mistakes, have done by means of their causes – the afflictions that are the three poisons – towards the Three Jewels who are of great power by way of their excellent qualities, my parents who are of great kindness, my spiritual masters who are the field of merit, and others, I confess all these mistakes, such as the actions of immediate retribution, endangering the bodies of my spiritual masters, not heeding their advice, and disturbing their minds.

3B2B-2A1A-4A1D. How to contemplate the undesirable results and confess with regret

2.31 All the terrible negativities
 Done by me, a wrongdoer,
 Who have the created faults of a multitude of misdeeds,
 I admit to the Guides.

{64} All the negativities that are terrible since they will produce great suffering, such as the killing done by me, a wrongdoer, due to possessing the created faults of a multitude of misdeeds, such as attachment, the causes that will issue forth the results of hell and so forth, I admit to the Guides.

3B2B-2A1A-4A2. Due to fear of dying without purifying negativities, generate regret

2.32 I may die
 Before my negativities have been purified;
 Please protect me in such a way
 As will swiftly and surely free me from them.

2.33 The untrustworthy Lord of Death
 Without waiting, whether or not something has been done;
 Whether one is sick or otherwise,
 Suddenly comes; do not be complacent about life.

If I do not confess my negativities immediately, I may die together with negativities before they have been purified. If I die and am reborn in the unfortunate rebirths, then how should I act? Please protect me in a way that will swiftly and surely free me from these negativities.

QUESTION: Until I have purified my negativities, what need is there for quick protection since I have not died?

RESPONSE: The untrustworthy Lord of Death does not wait even a moment whether or not the purification of negativities has been done, and whether a person is sick or otherwise. Even before one's lifespan has been completed, one can die suddenly, therefore one should not be complacent even if one does not die today; but should quickly purify one's negativities since it is not appropriate to be complacent. {65}

[Aryasura's] *Garland of Birth Stories (Jatakamala)* says²⁷ :

*Alas, afflicted worldly ones,
I would not be joyful at unstable states.
Even this glorious white water lily²⁸
Will become just a memory.*

*It is amazing that beings are fearless,
Such migrating beings in cyclic existence
Delightedly act unworried
Though the Lord of Death blocks every path.*

*As you have the powerful, unstoppable, and dangerous enemies
Of sickness, aging, and death,
You surely will go to a dreadful place in the next life.
I wonder what thoughtful person would delight in this?*

And:

*Between the two, tomorrow and the next life,
Which will come first is uncertain.
Therefore, do not make effort in the means for tomorrow;
It is right to make effort for the welfare of the next life.*

Just as has been said, you must discard the laziness of procrastination and make effort in quickly confessing your negativities.

3B2B-2A1A-4A3. Contemplating extensively the mode of negativities, cultivate regret

- A. Generating regret for having committed negativities for the sake of friends, body, and resources due to not knowing that they are untrustworthy
- B. Analogy that one will become a mere memory at death
- C. How to generate regret for having committed negativities for their sake since they are untrustworthy
- D. Generating regret for having committed negativities due to not realizing that the time of one's death is uncertain

²⁷ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 1, page 392: 32.7-9

²⁸ *kumuda*

3B2B-2A1A-4A3A. Generating regret for having committed negativities for the sake of friends, body, and resources due to not knowing that they are untrustworthy

2.34 Leaving all behind, I must depart alone.
Through not having understood this
I committed various kinds of negativities
For the sake of my friends and foes.

2.35 Even my foes will become nothing.
My friends will also become nothing.
I too will become nothing.
Likewise all will become nothing.

{66} Leaving all – friends and relatives such as my parents, siblings, acquaintances, and kin, and resources such as food, clothing, and wealth, and not only these, but also the flesh, bones, and the like together with which I was born – behind, I must depart alone to the next rebirth. Through not having understood this, I committed various kinds of negativities with body, speech, and mind for the sake of guarding my friends and destroying my foes. Hence I generate regret.

It is incorrect to commit negativities for their sake because even my foes will immediately become nothing, my friends will also become nothing, I too will become nothing, and likewise all – friends and relatives and resources – will become nothing. Since it is inappropriate to have even the slightest trust, due to having committed negativities out of attachment and aversion for their sake I must confess the negativities committed by way of my three doors and make effort at accomplishing virtue.

[Maticitra's] *Letter to Kaniska (Maharajakaniskalekha)* says²⁹:

*Due to your past karma
Fruition is issued forth.
You are connected with new karma
And led by the Lord of Death,*

*Except for virtue and sin,
All migrating beings are turned back
And nothing will follow you.
Know this and act well.*

3B2B-2A1A-4A3B. Contemplating how one will fear due to negativities

2.36 Just like an experience in a dream,
Whatever things I enjoy
Will become a memory.
Whatever has passed will not be seen.

²⁹ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 1, page 392.

{67} For example, if one experiences the perfect happiness and joy of gods and humans in a dream, when one wakes up after dreaming for a hundred years and so forth, it is merely a memory. Likewise, whatever past things I adhered to as happiness and enjoyed, all will finally become a mere memory at the time of death, and whatever has passed will also not be seen. Hence, if I accomplish only the Dharma, I will not be afraid at the time of death.

[Aryasura's] *Garland of Birth Stories* says³⁰ :

*However, I cannot recall anything I have done
That would make me regretful,
And I have made myself accustomed to wholesome actions.
Why should anyone who abides in the Dharma fear death?*

[Aryadeva's] *Four Hundred Stanzas (Catuh Sataka)* says³¹ :

*Those who think with certainty,
"I will die,"
Completely abandon fear. Therefore,
How can they fear even the Lord of Death?*

3B2B-2A1A-4A3C. How to generate regret for having committed negativities for their sake since they are untrustworthy

2.37 Even within this brief life
Many friends and foes have passed away,
But whatever terrible negativities I committed for them
Remains before me.

{68} Furthermore, even within this brief life many previous friends and foes have passed away. I have experienced this and this is established. But whatever terrible fruition of the negativities I committed for their sake remains before me, that is, ahead of me in future lives, and I must experience it alone. Just as has been said, "If this pain cannot be taken by others, what use are obstacle-making friends?"(8.32cd), thus I should remember again and again the negativities I have meaninglessly committed for their sake.

3B2B-2A1A-4A3D. Generating regret for having committed negativities due to not realizing that the time of one's death is uncertain

2.38 Thereby, through not having realized
That I will suddenly vanish,
I committed many negativities
Through ignorance, attachment, and hatred.

Thereby, through not having realized that I will, without certainty, suddenly vanish since this life is short, I committed much negativity through the force of the three poisons – ignorance, attachment, and hatred. Since I will be projected into the unfortunate rebirths due to my

³⁰ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 1, page 391: 31.62

³¹ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 1, page 391: 1.25

negativities, contemplating how death is certain, the time of death uncertain, and nothing except the Dharma will help at the time of death, and thinking about the drawbacks of the unfortunate rebirths, I should generate regret for my negativities. {69}

It is just as has been said by Bodhisattva Togme Sangpo [in *Thirty-Seven Practices of a Bodhisattva* (stanza 8)]:

*The Muni said that the very unbearable sufferings in the unfortunate rebirths
Are the results of negative karma.
Therefore, even at the cost of one's own life,
To never commit any negative karma is a practice of a bodhisattva.*

And [Nagarjuna's] *Letter to a Friend (Suhrllekha)* (stanza 88) says:

*The seeds of these results of non-virtue are
Faulty behaviors of body, speech, and mind.
Right now you must exert yourself in
Not committing it even in the slightest.*

3B2B-2A1A-4A4. Contemplating how one will fear due to negativities

- A. Fear since there is no lengthening to this life and one will die with negativities
- B. Fear at the need to experience suffering in this very life
- C. The reason for great fear arising
- D. How one will be tormented by suffering in future lives

3B2B-2A1A-4A4A. Fear since there is no lengthening to this life and one will die with negativities

2.39 Remaining neither day nor night,
 This life is always slipping by
 And never lengthening.
 Why will death not come to one like me?

Since whatever we do, walking, moving around, lying down, or sitting,³² without remaining even for an instant day and night, this life is always slipping by, that is, being lost, and never lengthening even in the slightest, like a pond whose water source has been cut, why will death certainly not come to one like me? Since death is certain and the time of death is uncertain, make effort to purify negativities before one dies. {70}

It is just as has been said in the *Extensive Sport Sutra (Lalita-vistara-sutra)*:

*The three existences are impermanent like an autumn cloud.
The birth and death of migrating beings is like watching a dance.
The passage of the life of migrating beings is like lightning in the sky;
It runs swiftly, like a waterfall running down the mountain.*

³² JN: The words "whatever we do, walking, moving around, lying down, or sitting" were missing from the translation.

[Chandrakirti's] *Commentary on the 'Four Hundred Stanzas' (Catuh-viparyaya-parihara-katha)* says³³:

*Hero of humans, beginning from the first night
Of entering a womb in this world,
One proceeds daily, without delay,
Into the presence of the Lord of Death.*

Bodhisattva Togme Sangpo [in his *Thirty-Seven Practices of a Bodhisattva* (stanza 9ab)] says:

*The happiness of the three existences, like dew drops on blades of grass,
Bears the property of disintegrating rapidly.*

3B2B-2A1A-4A4B. Fear at the need to experience suffering in this very life

2.40 While I am lying in bed,
Although surrounded by my friends and relatives,
The feeling of life being severed
Will be experienced by me alone.

2.41 When seized by Yama's messengers,
What benefit will friends and relatives afford?
My merit alone shall protect me then,
But upon that I have never relied.

2.42 O Protectors! I, so unconscientious,
Unaware of such terror as this,
Performed many negativities
For the sake of this impermanent life.

{71} If I have not created merit, while lying in bed at the time of death, although surrounded by those of great affection, my friends and relatives, the suffering feeling of life being severed will be experienced by me alone.

Not only will my fears not be eliminated, when seized by Yama's messengers of terrifying form, what benefit will friends and relatives, such as my parents and wife, afford? Only the Dharma will protect me. At the point of death, my merit of going for refuge, guarding ethics, and the like shall be the supreme protection alone, but upon that I have never relied or accomplished in my continuum.

Therefore, crying out "Protectors!" to the gurus and the objects of refuge, I, not having properly relied upon mindfulness and introspection, influenced by lack of conscientiousness in my three doors, unaware of such terror as the results of my negativities, the sufferings of heat and cold, hunger and thirst, being boiled, and so forth, performed many negativities for the sake of life that is not permanent even for an instant.

It is just as has been said in Bodhisattva Togme Sangpo's [*Thirty-Seven Practices of a Bodhisattva* (stanza 4)]:

³³ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 1, page 391: 1.25

*Old friends with long association get separated;
Material wealth amassed with much hardship remains behind.
The guesthouse-like body is left behind by the guest-like consciousness;
Relinquishing this life is a practice of a bodhisattva.*

{72} Shri Jagan-mitrananda's [Candra-rajalekha]³⁴ says:

*Divine one, no matter what fortune you have gained,
When you depart to another rebirth,
As though conquered by an enemy in the desert,
You are alone without children or queen,*

*Without clothing, without servants,
Without kingdom, and without palace.³⁵
Though you have limitless power and armies,
You will not see or hear them.*

*Eventually not even one being or thing
Will follow you in an everlasting way.
In brief, if you lack even a name at that time,
What need is there to speak about anything else?*

3B2B-2A1A-4A4C. The reason for great fear arising

2.43 One who is being led today to the spot where his limbs will be mutilated
Will be petrified.
With dry mouth, sunken eyes, and so forth
His entire appearance is transfigured.

2.44 What need to mention the tremendous despair
When stricken with the disease of terror,
Being clasped by the frightful physical forms
Of the messengers of Yama?

Someone who is being led today or at that time to the spot where his limbs, such as hands, legs, and eyes, will be mutilated by an executioner for punishment under the law of the king and so forth will be petrified or terrified. With dry mouth, pale complexion, sunken eyes, and so forth, his entire expression appears transfigured. What need to mention the tremendous despair when stricken with the disease of terror, without freedom for liberation, being clasped by frightful physical forms holding various killing weapons, with bloodshot eyes and hair streaming upwards, the appearance of the fearsome messengers of Yama Dharmaraja of unequal fortune and different lineage from me? {73}

³⁴ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 1, page 392.

³⁵ This line is missing in the Tibetan text and is taken from *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 1, page 158.

The Collection of Indicative Verses (*Udana-varga*) says³⁶ :

*If you fear suffering,
And do not enjoy it,
Do not commit negative actions
Either openly or secretly.*

*Whether you have committed negative actions
Or are committing them,
You will not escape suffering
Even if you try to run away.*

And:

*The childish, who have little wisdom,
Act as enemies to themselves;
Through this, they perform great negativities,
The results of which will be torturous.*

*You were good not to engage in such actions
That give rise to torment,
Whose fruition you endure one by one,
Weeping, your face covered with tears.*

*You were good to engage in such actions
That do not give rise to torment,
Whose fruitions you endure one by one,
Joyfully and with mental happiness.*

And:

*Although negative actions will not necessarily
Cut you right away like a weapon,
Migrations taken through negative actions
Will be evident in your future lives.*

{74} Recalling again and again what is taught in the scriptures and in this text, generate regret from your heart for the negativities you have committed.

3B2B-2A1A-4A4D. How one will be tormented by suffering in future lives

2.45 “Who can afford me good protection
From this terror?”
With terrified, bulging eyes agape
I shall search the four directions for refuge.

³⁶ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 1, page 399.

2.46 Then seeing no refuge in the four directions
I shall become enveloped in gloom.
If there should be no refuge there,
At that time what shall I do?

“Which being can afford me good protection from this terror at the time when I have been reborn in the hell realms and behold the hell guardians?” With terrified, bulging veins, and eyes agape, I shall search the four directions for refuge. Then, seeing no refuge in the four directions even though I look now, I shall become enveloped in gloom. Hence from now on, I should go for refuge to the Three Jewels. So, if there should be no refuge, who will protect me from fear there in that location of the hells? At that time what shall I do? Therefore, I shall make effort in the causes of being free from fear from now on.

3B2B-2A1A-4B. Power of reliance

1. Relying on the refuge of the Three Jewels from now on
2. Relying on the bodhisattvas who have the power of prayers
3. Having gone for refuge, practicing in accordance with their words

3B2B-2A1A-4B1. Relying on the refuge of the Three Jewels from now on

2.47 Therefore from today onwards I go for refuge
To the Victors, the protectors of migrating beings,
Who strove for the purpose of protecting migrating beings
And with great power eradicate all fear.

2.48 Likewise, I perfectly go for refuge
To the Dharma they have realized,
Which clears away the fears of cyclic existence,
And also to the assembly of bodhisattvas.

{75} When born in the unfortunate rebirths, I cannot find a refuge even when I search for one, therefore quickly, that is, from today onwards, I go for refuge to the Victors, the protectors of migrating beings, who strive for the purpose of protecting all connecting migrating beings and who have marvelous strength to protect from fear, whereby they are able to eradicate all fear with great power.

Likewise, I perfectly go for refuge to the Dharma Jewel, the Dharma of the Victors that they have realized, which when relied upon clears away the fears of cyclic existence, and also to the assembly of bodhisattvas who have attained the state of the aryas. So accept them as companions for accomplishing the path.

It is just as has been said by Bodhisattva Togme Sangpo [in *Thirty-Seven Practices of a Bodhisattva* (stanza 7)]:

*The worldly gods who are themselves imprisoned in cyclic existence –
How can they protect anyone else?
Hence, to go for refuge to the Three Jewels,
Refuge in whom is infallible, is a practice of a bodhisattva.*

3B2B-2A1A-4B2. Relying on the bodhisattvas who have the power of prayers

- 2.49 I, terrified,
Offer myself to Samantabhadra.
To Manjughosha also
I offer my body.
- 2.50 To the Protector Avalokiteshvara
Who unmistakably acts with compassion,
I utter a mournful cry,
“Please protect this wrongdoer!”
- 2.51 In my search for refuge
I cry from my heart
To Akashagarba, Ksitigarbha,
And all the Compassionate Protectors.
- 2.52 And I go for refuge to Vajrapani,
Upon the sight of whom all hateful beings,
Such as the messengers of Yama,
Flee in terror to the four directions.

{76} I, terrified of the unfortunate rebirths, offer myself to the Victor’s Child who has the power of prayers, Samantabhadra, saying “Please protect me from the fear of the unfortunate rebirths.” To Manjughosha also, without merely being urged by others, I offer my body along with a mind of faith. To the Protector of the Three Worlds, Avalokiteshvara, who unmistakably acts with compassion to enact the welfare of others spontaneously and continuously, due to being tormented by fear that is very difficult to bear, I utter a mournful cry, “Please protect this wrongdoer!”

{77} Likewise, in my search for refuge, I cry from my heart to all the Compassionate Protectors of all migrating beings due to their marvelous great compassion, such as the arya bodhisattvas Akashagarba, Ksitigarbha, Maitreya, and Sarvanivaranaviskambini, “Please protect me from the fears of cyclic existence!” And I go for refuge to Vajrapani, upon the sight of whom all hateful beings, such as the messengers of Yama and the hell guardians, flee in terror to the four directions.

3B2B-2A1A-4B3. Having gone for refuge, practicing in accordance with their words

- 2.53 Previously I transgressed your words,
But now upon seeing this great fear
I go to you for refuge.
By doing so, please swiftly clear away this fear.

Having previously transgressed your advice, I committed negativities and failed to create virtue, but now upon seeing this great fear of endless cyclic existence and the unfortunate rebirths, I go to you for refuge. By accomplishing what is to be adopted and what is to be abandoned in accordance with your words, please may this fear be swiftly cleared away. {78}

In this way, the benefits of going for refuge are enormous because [Aryasura's] *Compendium of the Perfections (Paramitasamasa)* says³⁷ :

*If the merit of going for refuge were to take form,
Even these billion worlds would be too small a vessel.
How can a cupped hand measure
A great ocean, the storehouse of water?*

And:

*Those who go for refuge to the Buddha
Will not go to the unfortunate rebirths;
Abandoning human bodies,
They will obtain bodies of gods.*

And such is also taught with respect to the Dharma and Sangha.

3B2B-2A1A-4C. Power of utilizing the antidote

1. The reason why one should make effort at purifying negativities
2. The reason why one should make effort quickly

3B2B-2A1A-4C1. The reason why one should make effort at purifying negativities

- A. Indicating the need to purify negativities quickly by the analogy of a disease
- B. Indicating the need to purify by the analogy of the precipice

3B2B-2A1A-4C1A. Indicating the need to purify negativities quickly by the analogy of a disease

2.54 *If I need to comply with a doctor's advice
When frightened by an ordinary illness,
Then what need to mention that it is so when perpetually diseased
By the hundreds of faults of attachment and so forth?*

2.55 *If all the people dwelling in Jambudvipa
Can be crushed by just one of these,
And if no other medicine to cure them
Is to be found in all the directions,*

2.56 *Then the intention not to act in accordance
With the words that can uproot every misery
Of the All-Knowing Physician
Is extremely bewildered and an object of scorn.*

{79} If I need to make effort by way of many methods to comply with a doctor's advice, the treatment, due to fearing death when frightened by an ordinary illness that is a disturbance in the wind or bile, then what need to mention that it is appropriate for us to rely on the antidotes in accordance with the words of the Victors, the supreme doctors who reveal the

³⁷ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 1, page 395.

method to dispel it, when perpetually diseased by the source of many hundreds of faults, the great chronic diseases of the three poisons, attachment and so forth, since beginningless time?

Furthermore, if all the people dwelling in Jambudvīpa can be crushed in hell by just one of these, such as anger towards a bodhisattva, and if no medicine other than the speech of the Teacher, such as the method to cultivate the path that is the medicinal antidote to cure these great harmful diseases, is to be found in all the directions, then it is very rare since it is hard to find. Thus it is taught that the diseases of the three poisons, from among all diseases, have the greatest drawbacks, and that the medicine to destroy them is none other than the Three Jewels and is very rare.

Then for those stricken by the three poisons, the virulent diseases of the three afflictions, to be intent upon the causes of endless cyclic existence and the unfortunate rebirths while not acting in accordance with the words that can uproot every misery of the afflictions of the All-Knowing Physician, who has the ability to dispel them, is an object of scorn, “How extremely bewildered.” Thus, having gone for refuge to the Teacher from one’s heart, there is no other method besides properly practicing the teachings of the Teacher. {80}

It is just as it has been said by the Foremost Omniscient [Tsongkhapa]:

*I, who wish to enter the supreme path
Of one gone to the possession of the ten powers,
Have degenerated the eye of awareness that views the meaning of the modes of
abidance,
Am deprived of the riches of renunciation and the mind of enlightenment.³⁸*

*I am continuously harmed by the foes of the powerful afflictions and
Have fallen into the chasm of the deep canyon of the conception of self.
If you let your great mercy dissipate
For such a pathetic object,*

*In what other than you, Protector of great mercy for the inferior ones,
Will I be held in refuge?*

3B2B-2A1A-4C1B. Indicating the need to purify by the analogy of the precipice

2.57 If I need to be conscientious
Near a small, ordinary precipice,
Then how much more so near the precipices of long duration
That drop for thousands of yojanas?

{81} If, due to fear of falling from a small, ordinary precipice such as a mountain or rockface where one will injure one’s limbs if one were to fall into it, I need to be conscientious near it, then how much more so must I be conscientious near the precipices of long duration such as Reviving Hell, Black-line Hell, Mass Destruction Hell, Wailing Hell, Loud Wailing Hell, Hot Hell, Intensely Hot Hell, and Unceasing Torment³⁹ that drop for 32,000 yojanas and so forth,

³⁸ JN: This has been changed from the original translation.

³⁹ These are the eight hot hells.

as characterized by many thousands of yojanas⁴⁰? It is just as said in the verses from the *Stages of the Path to Enlightenment*:

*From here, below, at 32,000 yojanas, is the Reviving Hell.
From there, each separated by 40,000 yojanas,
Are the other seven;
That is the way of formation of their locations.*

3B2B-2A1A-4C2. The reason why one should make effort quickly

2.58 It is inappropriate to stay happily
Thinking, “Today alone I shall not die,”
For inevitably the time will come
When I shall go out of existence.

2.59 Who will grant me fearlessness?
How can I be surely freed from this?
If I shall inevitably go out of existence,
How can I remain in mental happiness?

If you think, “Although I must make effort in the antidotes, I shall do so next month or next year,” then you should make effort right from today onwards. It is inappropriate to stay happily, due to laziness not making effort in the antidotes, thinking, “Today alone I shall not die,” for there is no guarantee that I will not die today, whereby inevitably the time when I shall die and go out of existence will probably come tomorrow. Hence, without being lazy, I shall make effort right from today onwards.

[Maticitra’s] *Letter to Kaniska (Maharajakaniskalekha)* says⁴¹:

*It is not good for people to say,
“I’ll put it off until tomorrow and do this today.”
A tomorrow when you go out of existence
Will inevitably come.*

{82} OPINION: So, since being afraid of death does not help, there is no need to be afraid.
RESPONSE: Having seen and heard that all others will die, and being afraid that I will fall into the unfortunate rebirths upon death, if I say, “I do not need to be afraid of death and negativities,” which holy being will grant me fearlessness? Since there is no such bestower, if I do not make effort in the antidotes, how can I be surely freed from negativities and this death? Since I will not be freed, if I shall inevitably die and go out of existence why do I not make effort in the antidotes to the negativities? Since it is inappropriate for me to remain in mental happiness through the force of laziness, I must make effort at cultivating the path.

Regarding this power of utilizing the antidote, there are six. Among them, the power of relying on recitations is to recite special dharani mantras such as the Hundred-Syllable Mantra

⁴⁰ One yojana is about 7 kilometers.

⁴¹ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 1, page 392.

and the dharani of Ushnishavijaya. If you recite these by way of the three pure vows that you have committed yourself to, then there will be enormous power in purifying negativities because the *Tantra Requested by Subahu* says⁴² :

*The flames from fires that spread in forests of straw
Are out of control, burning up all the thickets;
Likewise, the winds of ethics fan the fires of recitation
And the flames of great joyous effort burn up negativities.*

*Just as when the sun's rays upset snow,
It melts in the unbearable brilliance,
So too are the snows of negativities exhausted
When upset by the beams of recitation of the sun of ethics.*

*Lighting a butter lamp in a dark gloom
Clears away the darkness without exception;
Likewise, the darkness of negativities accumulated for thousands of lifetimes
Is quickly dispelled by the butter lamp of recitation.*

3B2B-2A1A-4D. Power of turning away from misdeeds

1. Out of regret for negativities, henceforth refraining from them
2. Confessing negativities committed in the past
3. Requesting attention and making the commitment to turn away from misdeeds

3B2B-2A1A-4D1. Out of regret for the negativities, henceforth refraining from them

2.60 What remains with me now
 From the past experiences that have gone?
 Through my adherence to them
 I have gone against my spiritual masters' advice.

2.61 Leaving behind this life
 And likewise my friends and relatives,
 If all alone I must go elsewhere
 How appropriate are friends and enemies?

2.62 "How can I be surely freed
 From non-virtue, the source of suffering?"
 Continually night and day
 Should I only consider this.

{83} In the past I experienced the wonders of cyclic existence – as wheel-turning kings who ruled the four continents, as the Sun and the Moon⁴³ whose light dispelled the darkness of the four continents, and also the resources in the Mansion of Victory in the Thirty-three⁴⁴.

⁴² Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 1, page 399.

⁴³ In this context, the sun and the moon are sentient beings.

⁴⁴ This is the second of the six god realms of the desire realm.

Untrustworthy, they are gone. Reborn as a hungry ghost without any food, or as an animal in pitch darkness such that I could not see my own hand when it was outstretched or bent, what enjoyments bearing essence remained with me now? Not the slightest whatsoever. Thus, through my adherence and attachment to them, I have gone against my spiritual masters' advice and committed very grave negativities, therefore I generate regret.

{84} Leaving behind this life, my body lacking essence, and likewise my friends and relatives, if all alone, powerlessly, I must go to some uncertain enemy territory, how appropriate are friends and enemies? Since they are not helpful in the slightest, I should not be attached to them, and since the suffering of the hells and so forth arise from non-virtues such as killing, continually night and day I should only consider the results of virtue and non-virtue, thinking, "How can I be surely freed from non-virtue, the source of suffering?"

It is just as has been said in the *Collection of Indicative Verses (Udana-varga)*⁴⁵ :

*A person with negative conduct,
Who has committed negativities and not created merit,
Who has deviated from the Dharma and heard non-Dharma,
Will fear death, like a weak boat breaking apart in a great river.*

*A person who has created merit and has not committed negativities,
And who has practiced the Dharma of the holy ones' system,
Will never fear death,
Like a sturdy boat crossing to the other shore.*

3B2B-2A1A-4D2. Confessing negativities committed in the past

2.63 Through unknowing and ignorance,
Whatever I have committed,
Be it a natural misdeed
Or a stipulated negativity,

2.64 I confess all of them directly
In the presence of the Protectors
With folded hands, prostrating again and again,
My mind terrified by suffering.

{85} Through confusion regarding actions and their effects, and unknowing along with ignorance, whatever bad deeds I have committed with my body, speech, and mind, (1) be it a natural misdeed, one that abides in the class of negativities regardless of whether it is performed by a person who has the support of stipulations or not, or (2) a stipulated negativity that abides thus in relation to one who has the support of stipulations from among the five sets of downfalls of a fully-ordained monk, the thirty-six contraventions of a novice monk, and so forth, I confess all of them directly in the presence of the Guru-Protectors, together with the buddhas and their children, the bodhisattvas of the ten grounds, the

⁴⁵ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 1, page 400: 28.39-40

assembly of arya hearers and solitary realizers, with folded hands, prostrating, not just once, but again and again, for months, years, and eons, my mind terrified by suffering.

3B2B-2A1A-4D3. Requesting attention and making the commitment to turn away from misdeeds

2.65 I request the Guides
To please accept my negativities as being mistakes.
Since they are not good,
I shall not do them again.

Due to such reasons, I request the Guides to please accept the negativities I have committed as being mistakes. Since these negativities that I have committed are not good, I shall never ever do them again even at the cost of my life, or henceforth, I shall put a stop to them and shall refrain from them. {86}

Therefore, if you make effort in confession in which the four powers are complete, you will be able to purify even powerful non-virtuous actions such as the five actions of immediate retribution without exception because Haribhadra's *Extensive Commentary on the Perfection of Wisdom Sutra in Eight Thousand Stanzas (Abhisamayalamkaraloka)*⁴⁶ says:

Thus, if you are near to the antidote class, they have the property of diminishing. It is possible to totally eliminate them with powerful antidotes. This, for example, is like dirt on gold. Because it is reasonable to say, "All such things as obstructions with regard to the excellent Dharma have the property explained above," you will eliminate the source of downfalls that are due to a mind of arrogance.

You should understand that statements such as, "Any karma at all, even in a hundred eons...", are qualified by, "If you have not cultivated the antidote class." Otherwise, there would be contradictions with reasoning and contradictions with many sutras sets.

You can also understand that the Buddha's teaching "Those that you will definitely experience" is also explained thus. Understand that the Buddha's teaching "those you will not definitely experience" refers to effects that occur only sometimes, even though you may not have cultivated the antidote class.

Thus even though you may purify a negativity, there is an enormous difference between that and not being defiled by negativity right from the very start because the *Sutra Gathering All the Threads (Sarva-vaidalya-samgraha-sutra)* says⁴⁷:

[The youthful Manjushri] asked, "O Bhagavan, if someone under the influence of a negative companion were to do such a thing as abandon the Dharma, how, Bhagavan, would this person be freed from that in this lifetime?"

The Bhagavan replied to youthful Manjushri, "Manjushri, if you were to confess your misdeed as a misdeed three times a day for seven years, you would clear it away. Subsequent to this, you would attain the level of tolerance in ten eons, at the least."

⁴⁶ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 1, page 399: n. 439

⁴⁷ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 1, page 400.

It is taught that even though the negativity may be purified, no matter how quickly, one will need ten eons to attain forbearance. Therefore, since the generation of realizations of the path will take very much longer, you must make effort to not be defiled by negativity right from the very start.

And if you are defiled by negativity, you must quickly make effort in the methods for confession because Gyeltshab Thamje Khyenpa says:

*Those afflicted by the mistakes of attachment, jealousy, and arrogance
Do not generate the supreme mind.
Therefore, confess from the depths to the Protectors
The mistakes of body, speech, and mind you have committed.*

3B2B-2A1B. Indicating the title of the chapter

The Second Chapter on Confessing Negativities from *Engaging in the Deeds of a Bodhisattva*.

This is easy to understand.

Chapter Three

Completely Upholding the Mind of Enlightenment

3B2B-2A2. The actual upholding of the mind of enlightenment

- A. Explanation of the text of the chapter
- B. Indicating the title of the chapter

3B2B-2A2A. Explanation of the text of the chapter

- 1. Preparation
- 2. Actual
- 3. Conclusion

3B2B-2A2A-1. Preparation

- A. Rejoicing in virtue
- B. Urging the turning of the wheel of Dharma
- C. Requesting not to enter nirvana
- D. Dedicating virtue
- E. How to train in the intention to give one's body, resources, and roots of virtue prior to the branch of generosity

3B2B-2A2A-1A. Rejoicing in virtue

- 3.1 With joy I rejoice
 In the virtue that relieves the suffering of unfortunate rebirths
 Of all sentient beings
 And in the abiding in happiness of those subject to suffering.
- 3.2 I rejoice in that accumulation of virtue
 That is the cause for enlightenment,
 I rejoice in the definite liberation of embodied creatures
 From the suffering of cyclic existence.
- 3.3 I rejoice in the enlightenment of the Protectors
 And also in the grounds of their children.
- 3.4 With joy I rejoice
 In the ocean of virtue of generating the mind of enlightenment
 That causes all sentient beings happiness,
 As well as in the deeds that benefit sentient beings.

{88} With an attitude of joy I rejoice, “How wonderful it is like this” in the virtue that is the cause for relieving the suffering of the unfortunate rebirths of all sentient beings abiding in cyclic existence and for attaining special high status, and I rejoice in its results, the abiding in the happiness of high status of those subject to suffering.

Not only that, I rejoice also in that accumulation of virtue and so forth, the partial concordance with liberation,⁴⁸ that is the cause for the enlightenment of hearers and solitary realizers. I rejoice too in its result, the attainment of nirvana due to the definite liberation of embodied creatures from the suffering of cyclic existence.

⁴⁸ “Partial concordance with liberation” refers to the path of accumulation.

Furthermore, I rejoice in the complete enlightenment of the Protectors of other migrating beings and also in the ten grounds of their children.

I also cultivate clear faith that is concomitant with mental happiness and rejoice with joy in their causes, the deeds that benefit sentient beings, by way of connection to the ocean-like virtue of generating the mind of supreme enlightenment for the sake of causing all sentient beings happiness.

3B2B-2A2A-1B. Urging the turning of the wheel of Dharma

3.5 With folded hands I beseech
 The buddhas of all directions
 To shine the lamp of Dharma
 For all bewildered in the darkness of suffering.

{89} If the benefit of beseeching a single buddha to turn the wheel of Dharma is equal to the merit of Great Brahma, the Lord of Saha billion world systems, then the benefit of beseeching countless buddhas to turn the wheel of Dharma is beyond measure. Thus, with the behavior of folded hands, respectfully I beseech the buddhas of all directions, who have recently attained buddhahood and are abiding without teaching the Dharma, for the purpose of shining the lamp of the Dharma of scriptures and realizations that illuminates the path of liberation for all bewildered in the darkness of suffering and the ignorance of sentient beings.

3B2B-2A2A-1C. Requesting not to enter nirvana

3.6 With folded hands I beseech
 The Victors who wish to enter nirvana
 Not to leave migrating beings in blindness
 And to remain for countless eons.

All the eons during which the buddhas do not come to the world, or having come, do not abide for long are known as “dark eons,” and since all migrating beings lack the eye of intelligence understanding what is to be adopted and what is to be discarded, they are as though blind. Thus, with folded hands I beseech the Victors who wish to enter nirvana in order to depart to other lands without staying for a long time in the realms of the world, not to leave migrating beings in blindness and to remain for countless eons, that is, I beseech them not to leave these migrating beings in the blindness of intelligence due to their ignorance, and to abide for countless eons for the sake of dispelling the darkness of ignorance. {90}

3B2B-2A2A-1D. Dedicating virtue

3.7 Thus by the virtue accumulated
 Through all that I have done,
 May all the suffering of all sentient beings
 Be dispelled.

3.8 May I be the doctor and the medicine
 And may I be the nurse
 For all sick migrating beings in the world
 Until their sicknesses are healed.

- 3.9 May a rain of food and drink descend
 To clear away the suffering of thirst and hunger,
 And during the eon of famine
 May I myself turn into food and drink.
- 3.10 May I become an inexhaustible treasure
 For those who are poor and destitute.
 May I turn into various articles of all necessities
 And abide close before them.

Thus by whatever roots of virtue I have accumulated through all that I have done, from making offerings up to making the request [not to enter nirvana], may all the suffering of all sentient beings be dispelled. Through the force of dedication in general and of these virtues in particular, may I be the doctor, the medicine, and the nurse for sick migrating beings until they are free from the sicknesses or the sicknesses are healed.

Furthermore, may a rain of food and drink descend to clear away the suffering of thirst and hunger and the variety of food and drinks be able to dispel all the harms of hunger and thirst. {91} During the intermediate eon of famine, from among the three intermediate eons⁴⁹, may I myself turn into food and drink for these sentient beings and be able to pacify their hunger and thirst.

Furthermore, may I become an inexhaustible treasure of resources for those who are poor and destitute of things. May I turn into various articles of all necessities, whatever is desired, and abide close before them without them having to make any effort and exertion to achieve these things.

3B2B-2A2A-1E. How to train in the intention to give one's body, resources, and roots of virtue prior to the branch of generosity

1. Training in the attitude of giving one's roots of virtue
2. Wishing the roots of virtue to be causes that are not wasted
3. Wishing the roots of virtue to be causes of resources

3B2B-2A2A-1E1. Training in the attitude of giving one's roots of virtue

- 3.11 Without any sense of loss
 I shall give my body and resources,
 As well as all my virtues of the three times,
 For the sake of accomplishing the welfare of all sentient beings.
- 3.12 By giving all, I shall transcend sorrow
 And my mind will accomplish nirvana.
 All will be given similarly;
 It is best that I give to all sentient beings.

⁴⁹ As explained in stanza 3.99cd of Vasubandhu's *Treasury of Knowledge (Abhidharmakosha)*, the intermediate eons come to an end due to weapons, disease and famine.

- 3.13 Having already given this body as what makes them happy
 For the pleasure of all embodied beings,
 Depending on what pleases them,
 Constantly killing, abusing, or beating it,
- 3.14 Although they may play with my body
 And make it a basis of jest and blame,
 Because I have already given this body of mine to them
 Why do I act with concern?
- 3.15ab I shall make it do whatever action
 That will not cause any harm.

{92} The way of giving is as follows. Without any attitude of a sense of loss I shall give up body and resources, such as food and clothes, as well as all my roots of virtues included in the basis that is related to the three times. The purpose is for the sake of accomplishing the temporal and final welfare of all sentient beings.

Giving in such a way is appropriate, that is, it is appropriate to give my body, resources, and roots of virtues for the welfare of others because, by giving all like this, I will be able to transcend sorrow, and my mind will desire to accomplish non-abiding nirvana⁵⁰. With the understanding that by giving to all without attachment I will attain nirvana, all will be given similarly, that is, alike in being given, it is best that I give to all sentient beings. This is because it is appropriate to give to them since sentient beings are the best field of generosity, and because I will attain buddhahood due to it.

QUESTION: Having given my body, what shall I do?

RESPONSE: Having already given this body of mine as what makes them happy, that is, as whatever they desire, for the pleasure of all embodied beings, depending on what pleases them – sentient beings constantly killing, abusing with words, physically beating this body – since at the time of killing, abusing, burning my body, and the like, I have already stopped generating the miserliness of attachment to my body and the hatred that is belligerent towards others, {93} from now onwards, although they may play with my body or make it a cause of the basis of harm, jest, and blame, because I have already given this body of mine to all sentient beings, why do I act with concern, such as appropriating the food and wealth of others, quarrelling with them, and so forth? Since I have already given it up without concern, may they do whatever pleases them.

May I make this body do whatever of the ten virtuous paths of action, even the small ones, by way of hundreds of thousands of austerities that will benefit and will not harm all – self and others – in this and future lives.

3B2B-2A2A-1E2. Wishing the roots of virtue to be causes that are not wasted

- 3.15cd When anyone encounters me
 May it never be meaningless for him.

⁵⁰ “Non-abiding nirvana” refers to buddhahood, since it abides neither in samsara nor in solitary peace.

3.16 If in those who encounter me
A faithful or an angry mind arises,
May that eternally become the cause
For fulfilling all their aims.

3.17 May all who say bad things to me
Or cause me any other harm,
And those who mock and insult me,
Have the fortune to become enlightened.

When any sentient being encounters me, may it never be the cause of something meaningless and undesirable arising for him. This is wishing that it becomes the cause of only benefit for others.

Furthermore, if in those who encounter me a faithful or an angry mind arises, in dependence on that very mind, may it eternally become the cause for fulfilling all these beings' temporal and final aims. This is the attitude wishing that it becomes a cause that is not wasted. {94}

May all – any being who says bad things to me, such as tells lies and speaks harshly, or causes me any other harm by physically killing me or, likewise, who secretly mocks and insults me, that is, who proclaims nasty things about me – have the fortune to attain great enlightenment. This is wishing that the connection becomes a cause that is not wasted.

3B2B-2A2A-1E3. Wishing the roots of virtue to be causes of resources

- A. Wishing them to be causes of all necessities for oneself and others
- B. Wishing extensive time and function
- C. Wishing continuous place and time

3B2B-2A2A-1E3A. Wishing them to be causes of all necessities for oneself and others

3.18 May I be a protector for those without one,
A helmsman for travelers, and
A ship, a boat, and a bridge
For all who wish to cross.

3.19 May I be an island for those who seek one
And a lamp for those desiring one.
May I be a bed for all who desire one
And a slave for all who want an embodied slave.⁵¹

3.20 May I be a wish-fulfilling jewel, a good vase,
Knowledge- mantras that accomplish, and great medicine.
May I become a wish-fulfilling tree
And a wish-fulfilling cow for embodied beings.

May I be a protector for those without one, a helmsman for travelers in all rebirths, and a ship, a boat, and a bridge for all who wish to cross rivers. May I be an island for those who

⁵¹ This stanza appears to have five lines in the Tibetan.

seek an island of dry land, a lamp for those desiring one, a bed for all who desire one, and a slave for all who want an embodied slave. {95} May I be a wish-fulfilling jewel; a good vase that gives rise to whatever is desired, such as food; knowledge mantras accomplishing actions of pacification, increase, and so forth; the great medicine of taking-the-essence (Tibetan: *chu-len*) that dispels all diseases; a wish-fulfilling tree that gives rise to whatever is needed, such as food and clothing; and a wish-fulfilling cow that fulfills whatever is desired by embodied beings. You should wish so again and again.

3B2B-2A2A-1E3B. Wishing extensive time and function

3.21 Just like the great elements, such as earth,
 And like space,
 May I always be many varieties of bases of sustenance
 For the boundless sentient beings.

Just like the four great elements, such as earth, that perform the activities of sentient beings, and like space, may I always be the bases of sustenance in many ways for the boundless sentient beings. This is just as has been taught in the *Piles of Jewels (Ratnakuta)* that bodhisattvas enact the welfare of sentient beings like the five elements⁵².

3B2B-2A2A-1E3C. Wishing continuous place and time

3.22 Likewise, until all attain nirvana,
 May I also be the source of sustenance
 For all the realms of sentient beings
 That reach unto the ends of space.

{96} Likewise until all attain nirvana in all types of infinite doors, may I, by way of only benefiting sentient beings, also be a source of sustenance for all the realms of sentient beings that reach unto the ends of space. You should train your mind by repeatedly contemplating so.

All the excellent qualities of abandonment and realization, the deeds, and the activities of the buddhas arise in dependence on only sentient beings. [Nagarjuna's] *Commentary on the Mind of Enlightenment (Bodhicitta-vivaraṇa)* says:⁵³

*The desirable and undesirable results –
A life in the happy or unfortunate realms in this world –
Arise through the benefit and harm
You do to living beings.
If you attain unsurpassed buddhahood
In dependence on sentient beings,
Why be at all amazed that nothing in these three migrations,
The resources of gods or humans*

Relied upon by Brahma, Indra, Rudra,

⁵² These are the earth, water, fire, wind, and space elements.

⁵³ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 258.

*And the worldly protectors
Are not also brought about by
Just helping living beings?
All of the many sufferings
Sentient beings experience
As animals, hungry ghosts, and hell beings
Come from harming living beings.*

*The sufferings of hunger,
Thirst, violence, and torture
Are the results of harming sentient beings.*

And:

*With effort abandon like a poison
Your lack of affection for sentient beings.*

*Hearers do not attain excellent enlightenment
Because of lacking affection. {97}
By not forsaking living beings,
Perfect buddhas attain enlightenment.*

*Once bodhisattvas ascertain the effects
Arising from helping and not helping,
How can they remain even for a moment
Attached to their own welfare?*

And:

*The fruit of enlightenment solely for others' welfare
Grows from the sprout of the mind of enlightenment
That has a root of firm compassion.
This is what the Victors' Children cultivate.*

*One who stabilizes this through familiarization,
Though initially terrified by the sufferings of others,
Later gives up even the bliss of concentration
And enters the Hell of Relentless Torment.*

*This is amazing! This is praiseworthy!
This is the superior way of excellent beings.*

The way to cultivate such a precious mind of enlightenment is as follows. First go for refuge, generate the mind of enlightenment, and meditate on the four immeasurables. Visualize that on your crown, upon a variegated lotus and moon disc, is Buddha Shakyamuni who is inseparable from your kind root guru. The color of his body is that of a golden mountain,

transparent and clear like the light rays of the dawning sun. He has one face and two arms. His right hand presses the earth and his left is in the mudra of meditative equipoise, holding an alms bowl filled with nectar. He beautifully wears the three orange-colored Dharma robes. He has a peaceful expression and wears a smile on his face. {98} Adorned by the thirty-two good signs and the eighty exemplifications, he sits in the vajra posture amidst a circle of light. His forehead is marked with OM, his throat AH, and his heart HUM. Below that is a moon disc, at the center of which is a golden syllable A encircled by the mantra garland OM MUNI MUNI MAHA MUNIYE SVAHA, radiating golden light. Light rays radiate from the HUM and A at his heart and invite Guru Lord of Subduers from his natural abode surrounded by the assembly of gurus, meditational deities, buddhas, bodhisattvas, and Dharma protectors and guardians. JAH HUM BAM HOH. Absorbing at the guru's crown, he becomes the nature encompassing all the objects of refuge.

Then offer the Seven Limbs:

*To the nature of exalted compassion, the Guru Lord of Subduers,
Respectfully I pay homage with my body, speech, and mind.
I make all offerings without exception, those actually laid out and those mentally
emanated.
I confess all my negativities and downfalls accumulated since beginningless time.
I rejoice in all the roots of virtue of ordinary beings and aryas.
I urge you to turn the wheel of Dharma for migrating beings.
I request you to stay eternally without entering nirvana.
I dedicate all these virtues to the welfare of migrating beings.*

*To the Guru Lord of Subduers encompassing all the objects of refuge, I make requests.
(3x)*

*Please grant your blessings so that my mind will become the Dharma;
Please grant your blessings so that the Dharma will become the path;
Please grant your blessings so that obstacles will not arise on the path;
Please grant your blessings so that all types of erroneous minds will cease; {99}
Please grant your blessings so that the special non-erroneous realizations will be
generated in my continuum;
Please grant your blessings so that love, compassion, and the precious mind of
enlightenment will be generated in my continuum;
Please grant your blessings so that I will quickly attain the state of Guru Lord of
Subduers for the sake of mother sentient beings.*

Due to these requests, streams of nectar and light rays arise from the exalted body of the guru-deity and enter the body and mind of others and yourself. Contemplate that hence, due to being free from all outer and inner adverse conditions, all the excellent qualities of the good collections increase and are enhanced. Thus, from the state of imagining the Guru Lord of Subduers abiding vividly on your crown, contemplate in this manner.

Contemplate: I have attained such a good support of the freedoms and endowments, which is difficult to attain. I am being taken care of by a guru who is a fully qualified spiritual

friend. If I do not accomplish the Dharma at this time when I have self-power over the accomplishment of the Dharma, when will I?

This time I must not make a wrong choice between drinking the nectar of the land of the gods and drinking the blazing molten metal of hell. Also, I will not stay forever in this life. Definitely death will come but the time of death is uncertain. At that time, my body, resources, friends, retinue, and so forth will not follow me even in the least. {100} Like a body and its shadow, I will go accompanied by the wholesome and unwholesome karma that I have accumulated. Then I will take rebirth. Even with regards to taking rebirth, I do not have self-power. I will take rebirth through the force of karma and afflictions. No matter which of the six types of abode I take rebirth in, besides only abodes of suffering, companions of suffering, and resources of suffering, there is no fully-qualified happiness at all. Therefore, even the good things of Brahma, Indra, and the wheel-turning kings are no different from a cesspool. No matter what, I will attain the state of liberation from these [abodes]. From among the liberations, I shall accomplish the supreme liberation of buddhahood.

I have experienced intense sufferings continuously in this great ocean of suffering of cyclic existence. This is because, neglecting others, this negative mind of self-cherishing, holding the sharp weapon of negative conditioning, scorns virtue and [commits] negativities, and cuts the root of life of high status and liberation. It steals all mundane and supramundane excellent qualities and renders one destitute and empty-handed. In brief, it separates one from happiness in this and future lives and causes all suffering to descend like rain. Therefore if I allow myself to come under the power of this enemy that is the negative mind, I am not a human being. Now, even at the cost of my life and body becoming a thousand portions, I will not allow myself to come under the power of this negative mind.

Hence, I should ignore myself and cherish others because cherishing others is the root of all happiness and goodness. {101} Therefore, also the temporal happiness of high status, attractive appearance, freedom from sicknesses, a long life, great resources, and so forth arise in dependence on other sentient beings because, by cherishing other sentient beings, I will practice patience, abandon hitting them, abandon killing them, and give them my resources without any sense of loss, whereby those excellent qualities will arise.

The attainment of supreme liberation, buddhahood, also depends on other sentient beings. This is because, in dependence on cherishing other sentient beings, I will generate the love that desires to accomplish happiness for them and the great compassion that desires to dispel their suffering. In dependence on that, the mind of enlightenment will arise, and, in dependence on that, the accumulation of the two collections, such as the deeds of the six perfections, and the purification of the two obscurations will arise. In dependence on that, I will attain buddhahood. Even the excellent qualities of the buddha ground, great exalted compassion, and the uninterrupted exalted activities exist by relying upon sentient beings.

In brief, all the excellent qualities of the causes and results of the buddhas are generated in dependence on cherishing other sentient beings. Therefore, taking this as my heart practice, I shall ignore myself and cherish others. I shall produce the fervent mind, thinking, "I will not give up this promise even if my body and life were to turn to ashes."

Hence, transforming my body, resources, and roots of virtue into resources and so forth that are like wish-fulfilling jewels, I shall give them entirely to each hell sentient being, whereby those sentient beings attain a magnificent jewel-like human body that is a support for accomplishing the Dharma. Contemplate that they find perfect dwellings, resources, and companions, and, having come under the care of a virtuous friend, accomplish the Dharma

and generate the fully-qualified mind of enlightenment in their continua. They train in the deeds of the six perfections and, completing the two collections, attain buddhahood, coming to possess the happiness of the truth body in their mental continua.

Likewise, transforming my body, resources, and roots of virtue into bodies, resources, and so forth that are like wish-fulfilling jewels, I shall give them entirely to each sentient being, from the hungry ghosts through the gods, whereby those sentient beings attain a magnificent jewel-like human body that is a support for accomplishing the Dharma. Contemplate that they find perfect dwellings, resources, and companions, and, having come under the care of a virtuous friend, accomplish the Dharma and generate the fully-qualified mind of enlightenment in their continua. They train in the deeds of the six perfections and, completing the two collections, attain buddhahood, coming to possess the happiness of the truth body in their mental continua.

Likewise, transforming my body, resources, and roots of virtue into bodies and so forth that are like wish-fulfilling jewels, I offer them entirely to the hearers, solitary realizers, and bodhisattvas, whereby those sentient beings attain a magnificent jewel-like human body that is a support for accomplishing the Dharma. {103} Contemplate that these transform into conducive conditions for them to accomplish a buddha's enlightenment in that lifetime, and they attain buddhahood, coming to possess the happiness of the truth body in their mental continua.

Likewise, transforming my body, resources, and roots of virtue into bodies, resources, and so forth that are like wish-fulfilling jewels, I offer them to the completely perfect buddhas and the gurus. Contemplate that these transform into sublime offerings and become delightful, whereby they are pleased with uncontaminated great bliss.

In addition, by giving the environmental world, the abodes of sentient beings, to sentient beings, all the abodes, such as the hot and cold hells, become a ground of vaidurya with checkered patterns like that of a chess board in gold, and ornamented with parks of trees and flowers, springs, waterfalls and so forth. They come to possess sublime enjoyments such as jewel mansions, divine clothing, and nectar food. Contemplate that when these beings accomplish the Dharma, they become conducive conditions and articles of offering to the gurus and buddhas.

In addition, this body of mine transforms into jewel mansions along with many resources of divine food, clothing, and so forth, and, hooking humans and non-humans who harm me with the mind of enlightenment there, I contemplate how they have been my mothers and nurtured me with kindness, and generate heartfelt compassion. Furthermore I have pursued the karmic debts of eating their flesh, drinking their blood, gnawing their bones, wearing their hide, beating them, and so forth. I contemplate from the heart that, since I have taken them for granted, they have been very kind.

{104} To repay their kindness, may I give them all my body, resources, and roots of virtue. May those who desire mansions be granted mansions just as they desire; those who desire clothes, clothes; those who desire food, food, and so forth. Especially, may they be given and granted whatever they desire; those who desire flesh be granted flesh; those who desire blood, blood; those who desire bones and hide, bones and hide, and so forth. Contemplate that if they [wish to consume it] a long time from now, then may it be raw, and if they [wish to consume it] soon, may it be cooked. Think that, by giving all plentifully, when they are free from suffering along with its causes, they come to possess the happiness of the truth body in their mental continua. Meditate on love in such a manner.

The way to train in compassion by means of taking is as follows. Contemplate that the sufferings that will be experienced in your future lives and in the later part of today onwards, together with their causes, are gathered into the support of this present body, converge upon your self-cherishing and ripen upon it. Then, the various sufferings of all the hell sentient beings and their causes, actions and afflictions, are gathered in a black mass at the core of your heart like iron drawn to a magnet or shaven hair, ripen upon your self-cherishing, and become consumed. Think that those sentient beings become free from suffering along with its causes. {105}

Then contemplate that all hungry ghost sentient beings become free from suffering along with their causes. Then contemplate that all animal sentient beings become free from suffering along with their causes. Then contemplate that all human sentient beings become free from suffering along with their causes. Then contemplate that all demi-god sentient beings become free from suffering along with their causes. Then contemplate that all god sentient beings become free from suffering along with their causes.

Similarly, the objects to be abandoned in the mental continua of the hearers, solitary realizers, and bodhisattvas, subtle sufferings along with their causes, and all the impurities of the environmental world are also gathered in a black mass at the core of your heart like iron drawn to a magnet or shaven hair, ripen upon your self-cherishing, and become consumed. Think that they become free from all the impurities of the environmental world.

When, by repeatedly contemplating in this manner, you gain slight familiarity, you should mount the two visualizations of giving and taking upon your exhalation and inhalation. When exhaling, give your body, resources, and roots of virtue to others just as explained above, and, when inhaling, take the sufferings of others along with their causes upon your self-cherishing just as explained above. {106}

Even though you may take the responsibility of dispelling the suffering of others and accomplishing their benefit and happiness through accustoming yourself for a long time with love and compassion in this manner, you lack the ability to actually accomplish this. Hearers, solitary realizers, and the like also do not have the vast exalted activities for others' welfare. Thus, who has such a perfect ability? The Guru Lord of Subduers abiding on my crown has it. Even seeing, hearing, thinking about, or touching his exalted body, light rays, and a mere sign⁵⁴ has the ability to place one on the paths of ripening and freedom. Generate vividly a fervent aspiration that thinks, "No matter what, I will attain the state of a Guru Lord of Subduers for the sake of all sentient beings. Until I attain buddhahood, I will not give up this promise that thinks of attaining such a state even at the cost of my life." Taking this as the heart of your spiritual practice, make effort in it to the best of your ability.

3B2B-2A2A-2. Actual

3.23 Just as the previous Sugatas
 Generated the mind of enlightenment,
 And just as they dwelt according to the stages
 In the trainings of a bodhisattva;

3.24 Likewise for the benefit of migrating beings,
 I shall generate the mind of enlightenment,

⁵⁴ This refers to any of the 32 signs of a buddha's body.

And likewise I shall
Learn the trainings according to the stages.

Recite three times:

Just as the previous Sugatas, at the time of generating the mind of enlightenment, generated the wishing mind aspiring towards supreme enlightenment before the Victors and their children, {107} and just as, having generated the engaging mind of enlightenment for the sake of upholding the bodhisattva vows, these sattvas learnt and dwelt in the trainings of a bodhisattva according to the stages of training, likewise for the temporal and final benefit of all migrating beings, Master, regardless of whether I actually have or do not have the pure engaging vows, having invited the Victors and their children before me, that is, requested them to preside, I too shall generate the wishing mind of enlightenment, and likewise I shall adopt the engaging mind and learn the trainings that are taken according to the stages.

If there is no master present, you should imagine repeating after the Victors and their children. The meaning of “learn [the trainings] according to the stages” [v.3.24d] is just as has been taught: (1) to not perform the giving of the body and so forth with an impure attitude, and that there will be a misdeed if one does, and (2) to perform it at the time when there is no misdeed, and that there will be the attainment of a great accumulation.

3B2B-2A2A-3. Conclusion

- A. Cultivating joy oneself
- B. Causing others to generate joy

3B2B-2A2A-3A. Cultivating joy oneself

- 1. Accomplishing one's own purpose
- 2. Accomplishing others' purpose

3B2B-2A2A-3A1. Accomplishing one's own purpose

3.25 Those intelligent ones have concluded lucidly seizing
 The mind of enlightenment in this way,
 But, in order to increase it,
 They should highly praise it in the following manner:

3.26 Now my life is fruitful.
 I have attained a good human existence,
 Today I have been born in the buddha lineage.
 I have become a child of the Buddha.

3.27 Now whatever happens,
 I will act to not sully
 This flawless, holy buddha lineage,
 Initiating actions concordant with this lineage.

3.28 Just like a blind man
 Discovering a jewel in a heap of rubbish,
 Likewise by some coincidence
 This mind of enlightenment has been born within me.

{108} Those intelligent bodhisattvas with lucid joy and faith have firmly seized the two minds of enlightenment in this way and have concluded engaging in the methods for not degenerating and for increasing it. But in order to practice it increasingly, they should also generate enthusiasm and highly praise it in the following manner:

Now, having generated the mind of enlightenment and taken the vows, my life has become fruitful. I have attained a good human existence, and made my leisures and endowments meaningful. Today I have been born in the buddha lineage and have become a bodhisattva. I have become a child of the Buddha.

If you wonder, “Is the wish, ‘When will I become a child of the Buddha?’ and cultivating joy, thinking, ‘I have become a child of the Buddha’ sufficient?” then think, “Now, whatever happens, I will make effort in the method to not sully my continuum with infractions and downfalls that contradict the wishing and engaging trainings, this buddha lineage which is holy (since it is flawless at the beginning, in the middle, and at the end, and ornamented only with excellent qualities), initiating actions with my three doors concordant with this lineage of the Father, the Buddha.” {109}

When the wishing and engaging trainings are condensed into stanzas, it is as follows:

The trainings for the wishing and engaging minds of enlightenment are as follows.

The eight trainings for the wishing mind of enlightenment are these:

The four methods for not degenerating and for increasing the mind of enlightenment in this life are:

First, recalling the benefits of the mind of enlightenment,

Second, generating the mind of enlightenment six times in the day and night,

Third, not mentally abandoning sentient beings, and

Fourth, accumulating the collections of merit and exalted wisdom.

The four causes for not separating from the mind of enlightenment in all rebirths are:

First, not deceiving one's abbot, acharya, and the objects worthy of offerings,

Second, not causing someone who has created virtue to generate regret,

Third, not finding fault with those who have entered the Mahayana, and

Fourth, abandoning the dissimulation and deceit that lacks exceptional resolve.

These are the eight trainings that abandon the four black dharmas.

Having taken the engaging bodhisattva vows, the eighteen root downfalls are:

(1) praising oneself and belittling others,

(2) not giving Dharma or wealth out of miserliness,

(3) not listening to [another's] explanations and striking him,

(4) abandoning the Mahayana Dharma and teaching the counterfeit.
These four appear in [Chandragomin's] Twenty Verses on the Bodhisattva Vows.
The thirteen that appear in the Sky Essence Sutra (Akashagarbhasutra) are:

- (1) Appropriating the property of the Three Jewels and (2) abandoning the holy Dharma,
- (3) appropriating orange-colored [robes] and (4) committing an action of immediate retribution make four;
- (5) holding a wrong view and (6) destroying a city make six;
- (7) generating the mind of the Hinayana and (8) turning away from the Mahayana make eight;
- (9) abandoning individual liberation and (10) propounding the Hinayana make ten; {110}
- (11) telling a lie claiming to be a person with sublime qualities, and (12) wrong livelihood make twelve; and
- (13) formulating a bad rule makes thirteen.

One alone appears in the Sutra of Skillful Means:

Mentally abandoning sentient beings, and discarding the wishing mind of enlightenment.

In order for the eighteen defeats of the bodhisattva vows to occur,
The four binding factors must be complete for sixteen of them,
And for two of them, generating a wrong view and discarding the wishing mind of enlightenment,

The [four binding factors] need not be complete and they occur merely by being committed.

Disregarding the disadvantages and not reversing the desire to perform it make two,
Being happy and pleased, and lacking shame and embarrassment make four.
The complete great binding factors constitute an actual root downfall.

If the binding factor of disregarding the disadvantages is complete,
Even though the other three are absent, it is called a "middling lapse."
Without it, even if the other three are present, it is called a "small lapse."
The forty-six infractions are as follows:

- (1) Not making offerings [with the] three [doors] to the Three Jewels,
 - (2) following a mind of desire,
 - (3) not being respectful to one's elders,
 - (4) not answering questions,
 - (5) not accepting to be a guest,
 - (6) not accepting gold and so forth, and
 - (7) not giving the Dharma to those who desire it;
- these seven are the discordant class of **generosity**.

(8) Ignoring and despising those who are immoral,
(9) not training for the sake of others' faith,
(10) doing little for the welfare of sentient beings,
(11) if one has compassion and mercy, there is no non-virtue,

(12) willingly engaging in wrong livelihood,
(13) laughing loudly and so forth in a boisterous manner,
(14) intending to proceed in cyclic existence alone,
(15) not abandoning disrepute, and

(16) not correcting afflictions although one has [the ability];
these are the discordant class of **ethics**. {110}

(17) Responding to abuse with abuse,
(18) ignoring those who are angry,

(19) rejecting another's confession, and
(20) following a mind of anger;
these four are the discordant class of **patience**.
(21) Gathering a retinue out of a desire for gain and honor,

(22) not eliminating laziness and so forth, and
(23) relying on meaningless talk out of attachment;
these are the discordant class of **joyous effort**.
(24) Not seeking meditative stabilization,

(25) not abandoning the obstructions to concentration, and
(26) viewing the taste of concentration as a good quality;
these three are the discordant class of **concentration**.
(27) Abandoning the hearers' vehicle,

(28) striving in that even though one has one's own way,
(29) striving in non-Buddhist treatises, which are not one's object of effort,
(30) having strived, also favoring them,
(31) abandoning the Mahayana,

(32) praising oneself and belittling others,
(33) not proceeding for the sake of the Dharma, and
(34) deprecating it and relying on the letters;
these eight are the discordant class of **wisdom**.

(35) Not being a friend to one in need,
(36) abandoning activities to heal the sick,
(37) not eliminating suffering,
(38) not teaching what is correct to the non-conscientious,

(39) not benefiting in return for that done,
(40) not dispelling others' sorrow,
(41) not giving wealth to those who desire it,
(42) not enacting the welfare of one's retinue,

(43) not conforming with others' minds,
(44) not speaking in praise of good qualities,
(45) not subjugating in accordance with conditions,
(46) not using one's magical powers to intimidate and so forth;

*these twelve are the discordant class of the rules
that are divisions of the six perfections
in general or the welfare of sentient beings. {112}
There is no fault for a virtuous mind*

*possessing compassion and [acting] out of mercy.
There are two sets of forty-six infractions
by way of having acted and not having acted intentionally.*

By not being polluted by such root downfalls and infractions, I will not be sullied.

Just like someone without sight (who does not find even food and drink due to being poor and destitute, and who doubts the road due to being blind in both eyes) who accidentally discovers a jewel, the King of Lords, in a heap of unclean rubbish, likewise by some coincidence or the mere slightest possibility this precious mind of enlightenment has been born within me; this is definitely [due to] the power of Guru Spiritual Friend and the buddhas.

3B2B-2A2A-3A2. Accomplishing others' purpose

- A. Ability to dispel the suffering of sentient beings
- B. Ability to dispel the obscurations, the cause of [suffering]
- C. Ability to accomplish all benefit and happiness

3B2B-2A2A-3A2A. Ability to dispel the suffering of sentient beings

- 3.29 This is also the supreme ambrosia
 That overcomes the lord of death of migrating beings.
 This is also the inexhaustible treasure
 That eliminates all poverty of migrating beings.
- 3.30 This is the supreme medicine
 That quells the disease of migrating beings too.
 It is the tree of rest for migrating beings
 Wandering and weary on the path of conditioned existence.
- 3.31ab It is the universal platform that leads all migrating beings
 To freedom from the bad migrations.

This is also the supreme ambrosia that overcomes the Lord of Death of migrating beings, who will die without self-power, because it places them in the ground that is free from aging and death. {113} This mind of enlightenment is also the inexhaustible treasure that eliminates all the poverty of migrating beings since it bestows inexhaustible resources of necessities and Dharma upon all migrating beings.

Besides that, this very mind of enlightenment is the supreme medicine that quells all the diseases of the three poisons that produce all the sufferings of migrating beings too, because, by being separated from it, external medicines such as those that treat heat and cold [ailments], and in addition, also inner medicines that are the other medicines of the holy Dharma, will not be able to totally eradicate the disease of the three poisons.

Furthermore, it is also a tree bestowing coolness, a place of rest from suffering for all migrating beings who are wandering in the cities of the six types of paths of conditioned existence, and who are weary, that is, tormented by various sufferings. This very mind of enlightenment is also the universal platform, that is, the bridge, that leads all migrating beings to freedom from the bad migrations.

3B2B-2A2A-3A2B. Ability to dispel the obscurations, the cause of [suffering]

3.31cd It is the dawning moon of the mind
That dispels the torment of afflictions of migrating beings.

3.32ab It is the great sun that annihilates
The cataracts of ignorance of migrating beings.

This mind of enlightenment is the dawning moon of the mind that dispels the torment of the heat of the afflictions of migrating beings because it is able to destroy all **afflictive obscurations**. If you generate the mind of enlightenment of benefit to others, {114} then the ethics that refrains from faulty behavior, which abandons the ten non-virtues, such as killing others out of hatred, liking others' wealth due to miserliness, committing sexual misconduct with another's spouse due to attachment, is taught to be like the dawning moon. [Chandrakirti's] *Supplement to the Middle Way (Madhyamakavatara)* (stanza 1.17) says:

*Thus remaining high in the mind of the child of the Victor,
Its light achieving beauty for this excellent support,
This joy triumphs, like the water crystal moon,
By completely eliminating all dense darkness.*

It is also the dawning great sun that annihilates from the root the cataracts of the **knowledge obscurations** of the non-afflictive ignorance of migrating beings because the wisdom realizing emptiness that is connected to the vast collection of merit (such as, motivated by the mind of enlightenment, the generosity that gives away all one's body, resources, and roots of virtue; the ethics of the three vows; the patience that definitely thinks about the Dharma; the joyous effort that is not weary with regard to infinite austerities; the concentration that is free from the faults of laxity and excitement) extinguishes the seeds of the knowledge obscurations. The Foremost Lama [Tsongkhapa] says [in his *Three Principal Aspects of the Path*]:

If you do not have the wisdom realizing the mode of abidance,

*Even though you have familiarized with renunciation
As well as the mind of enlightenment, the root of cyclic existence cannot be cut.
Therefore make effort at the method for realizing dependent-arising.*

3B2B-2A2A-3A2C. Ability to accomplish all benefit and happiness

3.32cd It is the quintessential butter
From the churning of the milk of the holy Dharma.

3.33 For all those guests who are migrating beings journeying on the path of cyclic
existence
Who wish to utilize the resources of happiness,
This will place the great travelers of sentient beings
In supreme happiness and satisfy them.

{115} This mind of enlightenment is the quintessential butter that possesses the taste and potency to generate all the essence of benefit and happiness from the excellent churning of the great ocean of milk of the holy Dharma teachings with the wooden churn of the wisdoms of hearing and contemplation; therefore, you should make effort in it.

For the Three Jewels, the guests who pacify existence, and the Protectors, the guests of excellent qualities, [the mind of enlightenment] is the best of pleasing offerings. For the six types [of migrating beings], the guests of compassion; the spirits, interferers, and so forth, the guests of karmic debts and so forth; and the guests who are the migrating beings wandering in cyclic existence; who journey on the path of existence and wish to utilize the resources of the happiness of humans and gods, the mind of enlightenment places them in the supreme method for accomplishing happiness, that is, it satisfies the great guests who are sentient beings, because it easily bestows all the temporal happiness of the high status of humans and gods, and the final definite goodness of buddhahood.⁵⁵

3B2B-2A2A-3B. Causing others to generate joy

3.34 Today in the presence of all the Protectors
I invite the migrating beings to be guests
In happiness until they attain the state of Sugata.
May gods, anti-gods, and so forth be joyful.

{116} Today in the presence of all the Protectors along with the Children of the Victors, I invite all migrating sentient beings to be guests who will be contented by enjoyment, satisfied in the state of Sugata, which is complete in final benefit and happiness, and, until they attain that, satisfied in the happiness of humans and gods. From then onwards, may the migrating beings, gods, anti-gods, serpent spirits, and so forth, be joyful. Thus, cause others to cultivate joy.

Just as explained in this treatise prior to the generation of the two minds of unsurpassed enlightenment, (1) having done the preliminaries of purifying negativities and obscurations, the adverse conditions, and accumulating the collections, the favorable conditions, and then (2) understanding that generating the mind of enlightenment is the supreme way to take the

⁵⁵ JN: This section has been changed from the original translation.

essence of the support of leisures and endowments, you should make effort with great exertion. Gyeltshab Thamche Khyenpa says:

*The knowledgeable who have obtained a human body of freedoms and endowments
Should make effort in generating the two minds of enlightenment,
The essential meaning of all the Victors' teachings,
The sole path traversed by the ten million Children of the Victors.*

3B2B-2A2B. Indicating the title of the chapter

The Third Chapter on Completely Upholding the Mind of Enlightenment from *Engaging in the Deeds of a Bodhisattva*.

This is easy to understand.

Chapter Four

Teachings on Conscientiousness

3B2B-2B. The way to train in the deeds, the six perfections

1. The way to cultivate conscientiousness, the branch of not degenerating the deeds
2. Extensive explanation on how to guard ethics through mindfulness and introspection {117}
3. Explanation on how to train in the four remaining perfections
4. Extensive explanation on how to train in generosity by way of the branch of dedication

3B2B-2B1. The way to cultivate conscientiousness, the branch of not degenerating the deeds

- A. Explanation of the text of the chapter
- B. Title of the chapter

3B2B-2B1A. Explanation of the text of the chapter

1. Briefly indicating the way to cultivate conscientiousness
2. Extensive explanation
3. Summary

3B2B-2B1A-1. Briefly indicating the way to cultivate conscientiousness

4.1 Having firmly upheld the mind of enlightenment in this way,
 A Victors' Child should always make effort
 To not transgress the trainings
 Without ever wavering.

Having firmly upheld the two minds of enlightenment in the way explained above, a Victors' Child, a bodhisattva, should always make effort to guard them without degeneration by having the conscientiousness to not transgress the trainings of the six perfections and the four means of gathering disciples without his mind ever wavering even for an instant.

3B2B-2B1A-2. Extensive explanation

- A. Cultivating conscientiousness in regard to the mind of enlightenment
- B. Cultivating conscientiousness in regard to the trainings

3B2B-2B1A-2A. Cultivating conscientiousness in regard to the mind of enlightenment

1. The reason why it is inappropriate to discard the mind of enlightenment
2. The drawbacks of discarding the mind of enlightenment

3B2B-2B1A-2A1. The reason why it is inappropriate to discard the mind of enlightenment

4.2 In the case of a reckless undertaking
 Or one not well examined,
 Although a promise may have been made,
 It is reasonable to examine, "Shall I do it or leave it?"

4.3 But how can I ever withdraw
 From what has been examined by the great wisdom
 Of the buddhas and their children,
 And has been examined and examined by myself?

In the case of an activity that has been recklessly undertaken without examining its faults and qualities, or an activity that was done with a little analysis but without having examined it

well, although a promise may have been made at the beginning, it is reasonable to later examine, "Shall I do it or leave it?" and then to proceed. Just as has been taught in the *Sutra Requested by Subahu*, the buddhas and their children, such as Maitreya, with great wisdom examined the mind in the *Array of Stalks Sutra (Gandavyuhasutra)* and so forth, praised it by way of its benefits, and taught that it is inappropriate to discard it. And I myself have previously examined with many reasons the need to definitely adopt it by way of contemplating its benefits, and have adopted it after having examined it well. How can I ever withdraw from it? Until I attain enlightenment, I should guard it without degeneration.

3B2B-2B1A-2A2. The drawbacks of discarding the mind of enlightenment

- A. The drawback of going to the bad migrations
- B. [The drawback of] degenerating from others' welfare
- C. [The drawback of] delaying the attainment of the grounds

3B2B-2B1A-2A2A. The drawback of going to the bad migrations

- 4.4 If, having made such a promise,
I do not accomplish it through action,
Then by deceiving all those sentient beings
What kind of rebirth will I take?
- 4.5 If it has been taught
That he who does not give away
The smallest thing he mentally thought to give
Will become a hungry ghost,
- 4.6 Then if I should deceive all migrating beings
After having from my heart invited them
To unsurpassable happiness,
What kind of happy migration will I go to?
- 4.7 Only the Omniscient Ones can discern
The inconceivable manner of the action of
Those who give up the mind of enlightenment
But still are liberated.

{119} If, having made such a promise to place all sentient beings in the buddha ground, I do not accomplish it through the action of the practice of the applications, then by deceiving all those sentient beings, what kind of rebirth will I take? It will be none other than the bad migrations. The proof is as follows. The *Close Placement of Mindfulness* says:

If, having intended the slightest, one does not give, one will be born in the migration of the hungry ghosts. If one does not carry out one's promise, one will become migrating being who is a hell sentient being.

And the *Sutra Discriminating Migrating Beings* says:

If someone makes a promise, "I will mentally give

*Rice and vegetables,
And likewise roots and fruits,”
But does not give them out of avarice,
He will experience the world of the hungry ghosts
And terrible suffering.*

If it has been taught that not giving away the smallest thing, such as a morsel of food, that one mentally once thought to give is the cause of becoming a hungry ghost, then if, after having from my heart invited all sentient beings to unsurpassable happiness and the temporal happiness of humans and gods respectfully, loud and clear, without merely being words, I should withdraw and deceive all migrating beings, what kind of happy migration will I go to? I will not. {120}

The abandonment of [an assertion that there is] a contradiction is as follows.

OBJECTION: Once upon a time Arya Shariputra generated the mind of enlightenment. When he was practicing the deeds, due to a mara (demon), he took his right hand and cut it off, but due to giving it with his left hand, the demon expressed wicked words,⁵⁶ whereby he was crestfallen and gave up the mind of enlightenment, and it is taught that he later became a foe-destroyer. This is a contradiction.

RESPONSE: Only the Omniscient Ones can discern the manner of the action, inconceivable to ordinary beings, of those who give up the mind of enlightenment but are liberated, such as Arya Shariputra; others are not able to conceive it. Even they will enter the Mahayana upon being urged by the buddhas later on because *White Lotus of the Excellent Doctrine Sutra* (*Saddharmapundarikasutra*) says:

*In the future, Shariputra, you too
Will arise as a Victor Tathagata;
You will be the Victor called “Lotus Light.”*

3B2B-2B1A-2A2B. [The drawback of] degenerating from others' welfare

- 4.8 This, for a bodhisattva,
Is the heaviest of downfalls.
If it were to occur, the welfare of
All sentient beings would be weakened.
- 4.9 Should others for even a single instant
Hinder or obstruct his merit,
By weakening the welfare of sentient beings
There will be no end to their unfortunate rebirths.
- 4.10 If I shall degenerate
By destroying the happiness of even one sentient being,
Then what need is there to mention destroying the happiness
Of all embodied beings vast as space without exception?

⁵⁶ JN: Parts of this phrase have been changed from the original translation.

{121} This degeneration of the mind of enlightenment, for a bodhisattva, is the heaviest of the root downfalls. If such a downfall were to occur, the welfare of all sentient beings would be weakened due to the degeneration of the thought of others' welfare because the support of the deeds has degenerated.

It is just as has been said in [Asanga's] *Mahayana Compendium (Mahayana-samgraha)*:

*Even though you may practice the ten virtuous paths of actions for tens of millions of eons,
If you generate the desire for the state of a solitary realizer foe-destroyer,
Then a fault in ethics has occurred and it is a degeneration in ethics.
Due to the defeat in the mind of enlightenment, it is very heavy.*

It is taught that if someone possessing the bodhisattva vows were to give up the wishing mind, he would incur a root downfall; if someone who has not taken the vows were to degenerate that mind, he would commit a negativity much heavier than a pratimoksha (individual liberation) defeat. It indicates that he who has a heavy downfall due to degenerating the mind of enlightenment degenerates others' welfare. It is taught that if one obstructs others' virtue, then this is similar [to degenerating the mind of enlightenment] and one will go to the unfortunate rebirths; should others for even a single instant hinder or obstruct the merit, that is, the virtue, of this bodhisattva by weakening the ability of that bodhisattva to accomplish the welfare of sentient beings and hindering it, there will be no end to the number of times they will take rebirth in the unfortunate migrations. {122}

The *Definite Pacifying Magical Emanation Sutra* says:

Since it is taught that, compared to someone who steals the possessions of all the sentient beings in Jambudvīpa and kills them, obstructing the virtue of a bodhisattva of giving some food and drink to an animal is a negativity that is countless times greater, you should be cautious regarding it because you do not know where a bodhisattva is, and you are very close to this misdeed occurring.

[Dharmakīrti's] *Commentary on [Dignaga's] 'Compendium of Valid Cognition' (Pramāṇavartikā-kārikā)* says:

*A non-engaging and non-existent valid cognizer
Has a non-engaged result.*

A sutra cited in that context says:

I or persons equal to me gauge people, but others should not gauge [people]. [If they do so,] there will definitely be degeneration.

Drubchen Kelden Gyatso said:

*You do not know where the bodhisattvas abide;
Hermit, do not deride all that you see and hear.*

Dorje Dzinpa Konchog Gyeltshen's *Stages of the Path* says:

*Since it is taught that, compared to imprisoning the sentient beings
Of the ten directions out of anger,
Getting angry at a bodhisattva and not looking at him
Produces a negativity countless times [greater],
The bodhisattvas are a very powerful field of non-virtue.
Compared to gouging out the eyes of sentient beings of the ten directions and then
restoring their eyes later
And releasing those sentient beings mentioned earlier from imprisonment and placing
them in the happiness of wheel-turning kings or Brahma, {123}
Wishing to behold with faith a bodhisattva who has belief in the Mahayana,
beholding him, and praising him
Produces merit countless times [greater].*

Therefore, since, with regards to the field of virtue and non-virtue, the bodhisattvas are very powerful, it is very important to abandon irreverence towards bodhisattvas and instead generate faith in them. The reason for the infinite negativities in those activities explained above is that if I will degenerate from high status by destroying even one sentient being' happiness of staying alive, then what need is there to mention that I will be reborn in the bad migrations by destroying and annihilating the cause of unsurpassed happiness of all embodied beings vast as space without exception?

3B2B-2B1A-2A2C. [The drawback of] delaying the attainment of the grounds

4.11 Thus if those who have the force of a downfall
 And the force of the mind of enlightenment
 Were to stay revolving within cyclic existence,
 For a long time they would be hindered from attaining the grounds.

Thus if those who have the force of a downfall of giving up the mind of enlightenment as explained above and have the force of the mind of enlightenment once again were to stay revolving within cyclic existence, they would have to be reborn in the unfortunate rebirths and high status in turn through the force of karma and afflictions, whereby for a long time they would be hindered from attaining the grounds such as Very Joyous⁵⁷. Therefore, you should make effort at not degenerating the mind of enlightenment even at the cost of your life. {124}

3B2B-2B1A-2B. Cultivating conscientiousness in regard to the trainings

1. Being conscientiousness in regard to abandoning misdeeds
2. Being conscientiousness in regard to cultivating virtue
3. Being conscientiousness in regard to abandoning the afflictions

⁵⁷ This is the first of the ten bodhisattva grounds.

3B2B-2B1A-2B1. Being conscientiousness in regard to abandoning misdeeds

- 4.12 Therefore just as I have promised
 I shall respectfully accomplish it.
 If from now on I do not strive
 I shall descend from lower to lower states.
- 4.13 Although countless buddhas have passed by
 To benefit all sentient beings,
 Yet I was not an object of their care
 Because of my own misdeeds.
- 4.14 If I still act like this,
 Again and again I will likewise experience
 Bad migrations, sickness, bondage,
 Mutilation, and laceration.
- 4.15 If the arising of a tathagata,
 Faith, the attainment of a human body,
 And my being fit to cultivate virtue are rare,
 When will they be obtained again?
- 4.16 I am free from sickness like the sun⁵⁸,
 Fed and free from harm,
 But life is momentary and deceptive;
 The body is like an object on loan for but a *lava*⁵⁹.
- 4.17 With such behavior of mine
 I will not obtain even a human body.
 If this human form is not attained,
 There will be solely negativity and no virtue.
- 4.18 If, even when I have the good fortune of virtuous conduct,
 I do not create virtue,
 Then what shall I do when all confused
 By the suffering of the unfortunate rebirths?
- 4.19 If I do not create virtues
 But readily amass negativities,
 Then for hundreds of millions of eons
 I shall not even hear the term “good migration.”
- 4.20 For this very reason, the Bhagavan said
 That just as in the case of a turtle inserting its neck

⁵⁸ JN: “Day” changed to “sun” to accord with Geshe Jampa Gyatso’s commentary.

⁵⁹ A unit of time that lasts 1.6 minutes.

Into a yoke adrift upon the vast ocean,
It is very hard to attain the human state.

{125} Therefore, just as I have promised, I will respectfully accomplish even the tiniest training in order to accomplish buddhahood for the sake of sentient beings. If, after having generated the mind of enlightenment and taken the vows, from now on I do not strive in the trainings, I shall descend from lower to lower states or be reborn in the bad migrations due to the force of the downfalls.

OPINION: There is no fault since I will be protected by the buddhas and their children.

RESPONSE: Although countless buddhas have passed by to benefit all sentient beings, yet I was not an object of care of the Protectors because of my own misdeeds of degenerating the mind of enlightenment and the trainings. It is just as has been said in [Maitreya's] *Ornament of Clear Realizations*, (*Abhisamayalamkara*, stanza 8.10):

*Just as an impotent seed does not grow
Even though the king of gods sends down rain,
Those without fortune do not experience the excellent
Even though the buddhas arise.*

OPINION: There is no fault since I will come under their protection later on.

RESPONSE: If I still act as before without conscientiousness, again and again I will not be an object of their care and will have to likewise continuously experience suffering, that is, I will have to stay in the bad migrations, and I will experience infinite sufferings such as sickness and bondage even when I am reborn in the good migrations, or suffering such as sickness, being bound by iron chains, hand and legs being mutilated by swords, and lacerated by saws in the bad migrations. {126}

OPINION: But I will make effort when I obtain the leisures and endowments in the future.

RESPONSE: If, like the *udamvara* flower, the arising of a tathagata in the world, faith in the Buddha's teachings of the Three Baskets and so forth, the attainment of a human body, and, even when attained, my being fit to be a support to cultivate virtue (such as having been born in a central land, having complete powers, and not having erred in extreme actions), and having such personal endowments and endowments based on others are rare, when will these leisures and endowments for training in the two minds of enlightenment be obtained again? They will be hard to find.

OPINION: Since this body that I have obtained lacks adverse conditions and possesses conducive conditions, I will make effort later on.

RESPONSE: It is not appropriate to be unhurried. A human body free from the adverse condition of sickness is similar to the sun, therefore, it is "like the sun" or, alternatively, "the sun which is without sickness,"⁶⁰ that is, in times such as nowadays, it has conducive conditions such as clothes and food, and is free from the adverse conditions of damage and harm by human and non-humans, but life disintegrates quickly, staying not even for a moment, whereby it is deceptive; the body is like an object on loan for but a *lava*, that is, just

⁶⁰ JN: "Day" changed to "sun" to accord with Geshe Jampa Gyatso's commentary.

this once, thereby it lacks self-power. Hence, it is not appropriate to be unhurried; I should make effort right now.

It is not appropriate to be unhurried, thinking, “Obtaining this support of leisures and endowments continuously, I will practice then.” With such behavior as mine, committing non-virtues and not creating virtues, I will not even obtain a human body in the future, and if this human form is not attained, that is, if I am reborn in the bad migrations, there will be solely negativity and not the slightest virtue. Hence, a good migration will be hard to find. {127}

If even when I have the good fortune of virtuous conduct I do not accomplish virtue with effort, then what shall I do when, reborn in the bad migrations, I am tormented by the suffering of constant seeking and confused about the objects that are to be adopted and to be abandoned? Since I will not be able to do even the slightest, I should make effort at this time when I have obtained the leisures and endowments.

It will be hard to obtain the leisures and endowments in the future because if I do not create virtues, but readily amass negativities with my three doors, then for hundreds of millions of eons I will not even hear the term “good migration.” It is hard to gain a good migration from a bad migration. For this very reason, it is just as has been said by the Bhagavan in the *Scripture Perfectly Possessed*:

The Bhagavan said, “Bhikshus, suppose this great earth is a great ocean and on it is a yoke with a hole, which is shifted by the winds and moved here and there. There is a blind turtle that comes to the surface every hundred years. Bhikshus, what do you think? Is it easy for the turtle to insert its neck into the hole of the yoke on the great ocean?” The bhikshus said, “Bhagavan, it is not so.” The Bhagavan said, “Bhikshus, likewise it is very hard to attain the human state.” {128}

For this very reason that I shall not even hear the term “good migration” if I do not create virtues but amass negativities, the Bhagavan said that, just as it is very hard for a turtle that comes to the surface every hundred years to insert its neck into a yoke with a single hole adrift upon the vast ocean, that is, shifted here and there on the great ocean, likewise it is also very hard to attain the human state.

Hence, at this time when I have obtained the leisures and endowments, I must make effort at virtue because the Foremost Lama [Tsongkhapa] says [in his *Small Stages of the Path/ Song of Experience*]:

*This body of leisure, more outstanding than a wish-fulfilling jewel,
Is found but once and difficult to find.
It disintegrates easily, like lightning in the sky.
Having reflected in this way, realize that all worldly activities
Are like winnowed chaff,
And take its essence all day and night.*

3B2B-2B1A-2B2. Being conscientiousness in regard to cultivating virtue

4.21 If even by the negativity committed for an instant
One will abide in Relentless Torment for eons,

Then because of the negativities I have accumulated in beginningless cyclic existence,

What need to mention my not going to a good migration?

4.22 Through experiencing merely that
I shall not be liberated,
Because while experiencing that in such a way
Other negativities will be strongly produced.

4.23 If, having found such leisure,
I do not familiarize with virtue,
There can be no deception other than this;
There can be no confusion other than this.

4.24 If, having understood this,
Out of confusion I am indolent afterwards,
When it is time to die
Tremendous grief will rear its head.

4.25 If my body burns for a long time
In the fires of hell which are difficult to bear,
Inevitably my mind will be tormented
By the blazing fires of unbearable remorse.

4.26 Having found by some coincidence
This beneficial state that is so hard to find,
If now while having knowledge
I am once again led into the hells,

4.27 Then, as though I were confused by mantra,
This mind will be reduced to nothing.
Even I do not know what confused me;
What is there inside me?

{129} If even due to the negativity committed for an instant, such as anger towards a bodhisattva, one will abide in Relentless Torment⁶¹ for eons, then because of the negativities accumulated from beginningless cyclic existence that exist in my continuum without having been destroyed by their antidotes, what need to mention my not going to a good migration? Thus, I should make effort at purifying my negativities by means of the four powers.

OPINION: Having exhausted the results of having committed actions of negativity, one will be reborn in a good migration. Therefore, it is not difficult to be liberated from the bad migrations.

RESPONSE: A person who has exhausted just one of them through experiencing merely the result of a previously committed action shall not be liberated from the bad migrations

⁶¹ This is the worst of the eight hot hells.

because, while experiencing the suffering that is the result of a previous action in such a manner, other negativities that will generate severe suffering will immediately be strongly produced and accumulated. And one should strive to stop the causes of the bad migrations because, upon a support of a bad migration, virtue is weak and one continually accumulates negativities. {130}

Therefore, if having found such leisure that is difficult to find, and, when found, is very meaningful, I do not make effort and familiarize with the virtues that are the causes of high status and liberation, there can be no method for deceiving myself other than this; there can be no confusion with regards to what is to be adopted and what is to be discarded other than this.

If, having understood the need to make effort at virtue and to abandon negativity, out of confusion I am indolent afterwards regarding the mind of enlightenment, training in the deeds, and so forth, knowing that I will go to a bad migration, when it is time to die tremendous grief will rear its head. Therefore, I should make effort through striving hard.

If, due to misdeeds such as degenerating the mind of enlightenment, I am born in hell and my body is burnt for a long time by the fires of hell which are difficult to bear, inevitably my mind will be tormented by the blazing fires of unbearable remorse. Thus, I should make effort at not becoming sullied by infractions and downfalls.

Since the leisures and endowments are so hard to find, and when found, are very meaningful, having found by some coincidence this beneficial state or support, if now, while having the wisdom knowing what benefits and what harms me, I am once again led into abodes of the hells, then as though confused by knowledge mantras, this mind that accomplishes benefit in me will be reduced to nothing. I should contemplate in this way.

QUESTION: What made me confused? {131}

RESPONSE: Even I do not know the cause that confused and deceived me; what is the cause of confusion inside me? It is definitely there.

Even should you come under the influence of laziness, you should quickly dispel it and contemplate like that [explained above].

3B2B-2B1A-2B3. Being conscientiousness in regard to abandoning the afflictions

- A. Contemplating the drawbacks of the afflictions
- B. Incorrectness of being weary at austerities in abandoning the afflictions
- C. Cultivating enthusiasm about one's ability to abandon the afflictions if one abandons them with effort

3B2B-2B1A-2B3A. Contemplating the drawbacks of the afflictions

4.28 Since enemies such as hatred and craving
 Have neither arms nor legs,
 And are neither courageous nor clever,
 How have I been used like a slave by them?

4.29 While they dwell within my mind,
 At their pleasure they cause me harm,
 Yet I patiently endure them without any anger.
 This is an inappropriate state and patience is a contemptible state.

- 4.30 Should even all the gods and anti-gods
Rise up against me as my enemies,
They cannot lead me to nor place me in
The fires of Relentless Torment.
- 4.31 But this foe, the powerful afflictions,
In an instant can cast me there,
Which when met will cause not even the ashes
Of Mount Meru to remain.
- 4.32 All other enemies are incapable
Of such a length of time
As can my afflictions,
The long-time enemy with neither beginning nor end.
- 4.33 If I agreeably honor and rely upon [others],
All will enact benefit and happiness,
But if I rely upon these afflictions
In return I will be harmed by suffering.
- 4.34 While in cyclic existence how can I be joyful and unafraid
If in my heart I certainly prepare a place
For this incessant enemy of long duration,
The sole cause for the increase of collections of harms?
- 4.35 How shall I ever have happiness
If in a net of attachment within my mind
There dwell the guardians of the prison of cyclic existence
Who become the slayers who kill me in hell and so forth?
- 4.36 Therefore as long as this enemy is not overcome with certainty before my
very eyes,
I shall never give up exerting myself against it.
Self-important people who become angry even at slight short-lived harm
Will not go to sleep until it is overcome.

{132} Since enemies such as the hatred and craving included within the root and secondary afflictions have neither arms nor legs, do not wield weapons in their hands, and so forth, and are neither courageous in having great endeavor nor clever in having skillful means, how have I been powerlessly used like a slave by these afflictions?

While dwelling within my mind, at their pleasure they cause me harm such as the suffering of the hells, yet I patiently endure them without any anger. This is an inappropriate state; being patient is a very contemptible state. Therefore, I should regard the afflictions as enemies and strive to stop them. Furthermore, you must know the definitions, divisions, causes, functions, and so forth of the afflictions as they appear in the *Manifest Knowledge (Abhidharma)*

treatises, and make effort mainly at meditating on their drawbacks. It is just as has been said in {133} [Maitreya's] *Ornament of Mahayana Sutras*, (*Mahayanasutralamkara*)⁶²:

*Afflictions destroy you, destroy sentient beings, and destroy your ethics.
You are ruined, teachers rebuke you, and furthermore you will be reborn in a
leisureless state.*

And Acharya Aryasura also taught about the drawbacks of attachment to the five objects of desire⁶³:

*The five – deer, elephant, butterfly, fish,
And bee – are overcome [by the five objects of desire].
If one of them can overcome [you], what need to mention five?*

Should even all the gods and anti-gods rise up in unison against me as my enemies, if I do not succumb to the afflictions, even they cannot lead me to nor place me in the fires of Relentless Torment. But this foe, the powerful afflictions in my continuum, in an instant can cast me into the fires of Relentless Torment which, when met, cause not even the ashes of Mount Meru to remain. Hence, I should strive in destroying the enemy that is the afflictions.

Besides those drawbacks, all other worldly enemies are incapable of harming me for such a length of time as can the afflictions, my long-time enemy that is the afflictions, which remains and harms with neither beginning nor end.

By cultivating the antidotes to the afflictions for just a single session, nothing is going to happen, therefore I should strive, like a flowing river, in destroying the enemy that is the afflictions.

In regards to other worldly enemies, if I agreeably honor them and rely upon food and so forth, all of them will act as companions of benefit and happiness toward me, {134} but if I rely upon and accord with the enemy that is the afflictions, they will grow in strength and in return I will be harmed by suffering. Thus, striving to destroy them is the method for my happiness.

Therefore, while in cyclic existence how can I be joyful and unafraid if in my heart I certainly prepare a place for and depend on this incessant enemy of long duration since beginningless time, the unsurpassed sole cause for the increase of all collections of harms, such as suffering? There will be no occasion for happiness, so I should strive to destroy the afflictions.

The afflictions will not allow me to transcend cyclic existence. How will I ever have the opportunity for happiness if in a net of attachment, that is, improper conceptions, within my mind there dwell the afflictions that transform into the guardians of the prison of cyclic existence, hell dungeons and the like, and become slayers who also kill me in the bad migrations and in high status? There will be no occasion for physical and mental happiness.

All that is undesirable is produced by the afflictions. Therefore, as long as this terrible enemy of mine is not overcome with certainty before my very eyes, I shall make effort never to give up exerting myself in the antidotes to the afflictions against this enemy even for an

⁶² Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 1, page 403: n. 519

⁶³ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 1, page 350, cites a similar verse by Vasubandhu.

instant. If self-important people of great resentment who become angry even at harsh words that are slight short-lived harm in the world strive, without going to sleep, until their enemy is overcome, I should strive to destroy the afflictions. {135}

3B2B-2B1A-2B3B. Incorrectness of being weary at austerities in abandoning the afflictions

- 4.37 If at the time of a violent battle,
 Vigorously desiring to conquer those afflicted ones who are naturally subject to
 suffering through death,
 Men, disregarding the pain of being pierced by spears and arrows,
 Do not withdraw until the goal is accomplished,
- 4.38 Then what need to mention that I should not despair and be indolent,
 Even if I am caused many hundreds of sufferings,
 When now I strive to definitely overcome my natural enemies
 That are the constant cause of all suffering?
- 4.39 If even scars inflicted by meaningless enemies
 Are worn upon the body like ornaments,
 Then why is suffering a cause of harm to me
 Who impeccably strive to fulfill the great purpose?
- 4.40 If fishermen, outcastes, farmers, and so forth,
 Thinking merely of their own livelihood,
 Endure the harms of heat and cold,
 Why do I not endure them for the sake of the happiness of migrating beings?
- 4.41 When I promised to liberate migrating beings
 Dwelling in the ten directions as far as the ends of space
 From their afflictions,
 I myself was not yet freed from the afflictions.
- 4.42 Thus unaware of even my own capacity,
 Was it not somewhat crazy to have spoken like that?
 Since this is the case I should never withdraw
 From vanquishing the afflictions.
- 4.43 I shall adhere to this and,
 Resenting them, I shall meet them in battle!
 But afflictions such as these types
 Destroy afflictions and are not included.
- 4.44 I would rather be burned and killed,
 And even have my head cut off,
 Than to ever bow down
 To the enemy that is the afflictions in any way.

{136} If at the time of being embroiled in a violent battle on the battlefield, vigorously desiring to conquer the opponents, those objects of compassion, sentient beings who have afflictions, that is, possess afflictions, who are naturally, that is, on their own accord, subject to suffering through death, even if they are not killed by ordinary enemies, men, disregarding the pain of being pierced by weapons such as spears and arrows, do not withdraw or escape until the goal of conquering the opponents is accomplished, then what need to mention that, without being despaired and indolent, I should not give up striving until the enemy that is the afflictions is subdued, even if I am caused many hundreds of sufferings, such as heat, cold, hunger, and thirst, when now I strive in austerities desiring to definitely only overcome my natural enemies that are the constant cause of all suffering and who act as foes upon their mere production?

[Aryasura's] *Garland of Birth Stories (Jatakamala)* says:

*Discouragement does not help one become free from deprivation.
Therefore, if your mind is uplifted by courage,
You have in your hand the accomplishment of all goals.*

{137} If even scars inflicted for small purposes by meaningless enemies in the world are worn upon the body like ornaments, stating, "This came about at that time," and cause satisfaction, then why is the suffering of austerities a cause of harm to me at the time when I impeccably strive to fulfill the great purpose of complete buddhahood?

Since there is only benefit, it is right to rely upon it. If fishermen who make their living by killing fish, outcastes, that is, the inferior castes, butchers, farmers who make their living by farming, and so forth, thinking merely of their own livelihood, endure the harms of heat and cold and so forth, why does someone such as myself not endure austerities for the sake of accomplishing all the happiness of migrating beings without exception? I should endure them.

When I generated the mind and promised to liberate all migrating beings dwelling in the ten directions as far as the ends of space from their afflictions, I myself was not yet freed from afflictions. Let alone others' purpose, I was not able to complete even my own purpose. Thus unaware of even my own capacity which is under the power by afflictions, was it not somewhat crazy to have said that I will free all others from afflictions? It is not crazy. Since I am bound to cyclic existence, I am unable to complete others' purpose, {138} therefore I should strive to destroy the afflictions. I should never withdraw in thought and application from vanquishing the afflictions since it is the case that they deserve to be abandoned.

I shall adhere to this antidote to the afflictions, that is, rely upon it, purposely. And resenting the afflictions I shall meet them in battle and destroy them!

OBJECTION: Since attachment towards the antidote, aversion toward the object of abandonment, and resentment toward the object of abandonment are afflictions, they are to be abandoned.

RESPONSE: Adherence to the antidote and resentment toward the object of abandonment seem like afflictions, but afflictions such as these types destroy afflictions and are not included in the objects of abandonment since they are the antidotal class that destroys the afflictions.

QUESTION: In order to abandon the afflictions, is it not excellent that infinite multitudes of suffering follow the afflictions?

RESPONSE: I would rather just give up the body of this life through being burned in fire and killed, and even have my head cut off, than to ever bow down to the enemy that is the afflictions in any way. Since they produce the great suffering of the hells and so forth, and interfere with the attainment of my desired goals; I shall not come under their power. If I come under their power, the Three Jewels will not be able to protect me because the *King of Meditative Stabilization Sutra (Samadhirajasutra)*⁶⁴ says:

*When people have malice towards each other,
Learning and ethics cannot protect them,
Concentration does not protect them, nor can living in solitude;
Generosity does not protect them, nor does offering to the buddhas.*

3B2B-2B1A-2B3C. Cultivating enthusiasm regarding one's ability to abandon the afflictions if one abandons them with effort {139}

4.45 Ordinary enemies when expelled from one country
Simply settle down in another and embrace it,
And when their capability is recovered they then return;
But the way of this enemy, my afflictions, is different.

4.46 Afflictions, afflictions! When abandoned by the eye of wisdom
And dispelled from my mind, where will you go?
Where will you dwell and return to harm me?
Although this is so, weak-minded, I have been reduced to making no effort.

4.47 If these afflictions do not abide within objects,
Not in the collection of sense powers, between the two nor elsewhere,
Then where do they abide and how do they harm all migrating beings?
They are like an illusion. Thus I should dispel the fear within my heart and strive
for the sake of wisdom.
For no meaning, why am I harmed in hell and so forth?

OPINION: Although afflictions may be expelled once, like worldly enemies they gain capability and once again harm. So it is right to act accordingly, [that is, just as one would deal with worldly enemies].

RESPONSE: It is not similar. Ordinary worldly enemies when expelled once from one country simply settle down in another and embrace it, and, when their capability is recovered and they gain strength, they then return to seek revenge. But the way of this enemy, my afflictions, is different because when they are expelled from the root, they do not abide elsewhere and it is impossible for them to gain capability and return.

If the afflictions are expelled from the root, because they do not have the support for abiding since afflictions arise from an erroneous root, when the eye of wisdom realizing emptiness that makes effort in abandoning the seeds abandons them and you are dispelled

⁶⁴ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 1, page 398: n. 411

from my mind, where will you go? On what support will you dwell, gain capability, and return to harm me? This is because it is impossible for you to harm me because it is just as has been said in [Chandrakirti's] *Supplement to the Middle Way (Madhyamakavatara)* (stanza 6.120):

*Having seen with his mind that afflictions and faults all arise
From the view of the transitory collection without exception,
And realized that its object is the self,
The yogi then refutes the self.*

And [Dharmakirti's] *Commentary on [Dignaga's] 'Compendium of Valid Cognition' (Pramanavarttikakarika)* says:

*Also because the view of the transitory collection
Is uprooted.*

Although this is so, I, weak-minded, have been reduced to making no effort in uprooting it once, due to which it is causing me harm.

OPINION: Since the afflictions are produced from their own causes and established inherently, I will not be able to abandon even one of them.

RESPONSE: These afflictions do not abide inherently within objects, such as forms, because, if that were the case, then it would [absurdly] follow that even foe-destroyers would generate afflictions upon seeing forms and so forth. They also do not abide in the collection of sense powers, such as the eyes, because afflictions are not observed when one is thinking about the meaning of the mode of reality, although the eyes are present. If they also do not abide between the two nor elsewhere, then where do those that were uprooted once and established inherently abide, and how do they harm all migrating beings? {141} This is because they do not abide anywhere. Although empty of being established inherently, these afflictions appear to be established inherently, like an illusion. Thus I should dispel the fear within my heart that thinks, "I will not be able to abandon them from the root since they are established inherently," and rely on striving for the sake of abandoning the afflictions by generating the wisdom realizing emptiness. But, while I have the ability, why am I made to be harmed in the bad migrations, hell and so forth, for no meaning? It should not be so. The past [masters] have also explained that if the seeds are eradicated, then [the afflictions] will not abide in those abodes.

3B2B-2B1A-3. Summary

4.48 Therefore, having thought about this,
 I should make effort for the sake of accomplishing the trainings explained.
 If the doctor's instructions are ignored,
 How will a patient in need of treatment be cured by the medicines?

Therefore, having thought about the above explanation in many ways, I should make effort in cultivating conscientiousness for the sake of accomplishing the mind of enlightenment and the trainings explained above just as taught by the Teacher. For example, if the doctor's instructions are ignored, how will a patient definitely in need of treatment be cured by the

medicines? He will not be cured. Thus I should make effort in abandoning the afflictions according to the teachings of the Teacher, the Great Doctor, {142} because it is just as has been said in the *King of Meditative Stabilization Sutra (Samadhirajasutra)*⁶⁵ :

*I have explained this very good teaching.
Yet if you, having heard it, do not practice correctly,
Then just like a sick person holding on to a bag of medicine,
Your illness cannot be cured.*

Furthermore, when all the infinite trainings of the Victors' Children are condensed, they are definite in number as the six perfections because, when training in the conduct of the Victors' Children for many eons,

- the excellent resources that are utilized are accomplished through **generosity**,
- the excellent body with which one utilizes [the resources] is accomplished through **ethics**,
- the excellent retinue together with whom one utilizes [the resources] is accomplished through **patience**,
- the fulfillment of whatever aims of action that one may initiate is accomplished through **joyous effort**, and
- those excellences not becoming the conditions for afflictions and the non-erroneous engagement in the objects to be adopted and to be discarded is accomplished through **concentration** and **wisdom**.

Hence, from the point of view of achieving high status, [the trainings] are definite in number as the six perfections because the Venerable Maitreya says [in *Ornament of Mahayana Sutras, (Mahayanasutralamkara)*]⁶⁶ :

*High status possessed of excellent resources and body,
Excellent retinue and undertakings,
Never going under the power of the afflictions,
And being non-erroneous in activities.*

In order to accomplish the two purposes of self and others with such a special support [of high status mentioned above], the first three perfections -

- **generosity** that benefits through giving Dharma and necessities at the beginning,
- **ethics** that abandons harm to others, and
- **patience** that accepts harm by others -

accomplish the welfare of others, {143} and one's purpose is the attainment of the happiness of liberation through the force of **wisdom**. Since this will not come about in a distracted mind, you must attain the physical serviceability that abides just as desired on the object of observation through **concentration**. Since that will not be produced in someone lazy, you must make **joyous effort** that is not slack, all day and night. With respect to accomplishing

⁶⁵ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 1, page 383: n. 82

⁶⁶ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 3, page 262: n. 177

the two purposes, [the trainings] are definite as the six perfections because [Maitreya's Ornament of Mahayana Sutras, (Mahayanasutralamkara)]⁶⁷ says:

*Those who strongly strive for the purpose of sentient beings
Enact it through giving, non-harm, and patience;
And fulfill their own purpose in all ways
Through abidance and liberation, together with their basis.*

Also, because of:

- dispelling deprivation through **generosity** at the beginning,
 - then, **non-harmfulness** through not harming any sentient being,
 - **patience** towards harm done to oneself,
 - **joyous effort** of non-weariness through helping others,
 - causing [others'] mental aspiration through magical emanations and so forth in dependence on **concentration**, and,
 - when they have become suitable vessels, explaining the Dharma in dependence on **wisdom**, and liberating them through cutting through their doubts,
- [the trainings] are definite as the six perfections because [Maitreya's Ornament of Mahayana Sutras, (Mahayanasutralamkara)]⁶⁸ says:

*Through eliminating others' deprivation, not harming them,
Being patient with their harm, not being weary with acting,
Delighting them, and speaking well to them,
Others' purpose is self-purpose.*

Thus:

- due to not being attached to finding resources and not seeking those that are not found, you disregard resources,
- due to being able to guard the trainings, you adopt ethics and respect them, {144}
- due to enduring the suffering that arises in dependence on sentient beings and non-sentient-beings, you are not weary,
- due to enthusiasm in applying yourself to any kind of virtuous activity, you do not weary of it, and
- you cultivate the non-conceptual yoga of calm-abiding and special insight.

These six condense the entire Mahayana that progresses through them. These are also accomplished gradually by the six perfections and you do not need many apart from them because [Maitreya's Ornament of Mahayana Sutras, (Mahayanasutralamkara)]⁶⁹ says:

*The entire Mahayana is exhausted in
Not delighting in resources,
Respect, not being weary towards the two,*

⁶⁷ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 3, page 263: n. 178

⁶⁸ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 3, page 263: n. 180

⁶⁹ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 3, page 263: n. 181

And non-conceptual yoga.

The method for not being attached to resources that are objects already obtained is **generosity**.

The method for restraining distraction that strives for the sake of obtaining objects not yet obtained is **ethics**.

The method for not giving up on sentient beings is **patience**.

The method for increasing virtue is **joyous effort**.

The method for purifying obstructions is the last two perfections – **concentration** and **wisdom**.

This is because [Maitreya's *Ornament of Mahayana Sutras*, (*Mahayanasutralamkara*)]⁷⁰ says:

*Not being attached to objects is a path;
Another is restraining distraction to obtain them;
Not giving up on beings, increasing [virtues],
And purifying obstructions are the others.*

Moreover, the entity of the training in ethics is **ethics**. If you have the **generosity** that disregards resources, by perfectly adopting that, it is a collection of ethics. Although that is adopted, due to **patience** that does not return scolding and so forth, by guarding that, it is the retinue of [ethics]. **Concentration** is the training in mind, and **wisdom** the training in wisdom. Since **joyous effort** is included in all three trainings, [the trainings] are definite as the six perfections {145} because it is just as has been said [in Maitreya's *Ornament of Mahayana Sutras*, (*Mahayana-sutralamkara*)]⁷¹:

*The Victors perfectly explained the six perfections
In terms of the three trainings:
That is the first three,
Aspects of the last two are two,
One is included in all three.*

And the Foremost Tamche Khyenpa [Tsongkhapa] says [in his *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*]⁷²:

Therefore, with such an excellent support, abide in the vehicle that fully completes such purposes of self and others. Know that, by possessing so many types of methods, what fully completes and condenses the support that accomplishes the trainings, the purposes, the Mahayana, the methods, and the trainings is just the six perfections themselves. You should contemplate until you gain great certainty that they are the summation of all the essential points of a bodhisattva's practice.

⁷⁰ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 3, page 263: n. 182

⁷¹ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 3, page 263: n. 183

⁷² *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 109, chapter on *Training in the Mahayana: Precepts and Perfections*

With conscientiousness of the three – body, speech, and mind – you should strive diligently in the practice of the six perfections, the great summation that condenses all the deeds of the Victors' Children, because Gyeltshab Tamche Khyenpa says:

*Freedom from being sullied by misdeeds and
The non-degeneration and increase of virtue
Are contingent upon the definite cultivation of conscientiousness.
Thus the wise should always have conscientiousness.*

3B2B-2B1B. Title of the chapter

The Fourth Chapter on Teachings on Conscientiousness from *Engaging in the Deeds of a Bodhisattva*.

This is easy to understand.

Chapter Five

Guarding Introspection

3B2B-2B2. Extensive explanation on how to guard ethics through mindfulness and introspection {146}

- A. Explanation of the text of the chapter
- B. Title of the chapter

3B2B-2B2A. Explanation of the text of the chapter

- 1. Extensive explanation on how to practice
- 2. Concluding that one must practice the meaning without letting it be mere words

3B2B-2B2A-1. Extensive explanation on how to practice

- A. The method for guarding the trainings is guarding the mind
- B. The method for guarding the mind is guarding mindfulness and introspection
- C. How to train in the deed of guarding the mind through mindfulness and introspection
- D. Branch of perfecting the trainings

3B2B-2B2A-1A. The method for guarding the trainings is guarding the mind

- 1. Through guarding the mind all will be guarded
- 2. The reason that [through guarding the mind all will be guarded]
- 3. Making effort in guarding the mind

3B2B-2B2A-1A1. Through guarding the mind all will be guarded

- 5.1 Those who wish to guard their trainings
 Should very tightly guard their mind.
 Those who do not guard their mind
 Are unable to guard their trainings.

- 5.2 In this [world,] unsubdued and crazed elephants
 Do not cause such harms
 As the harms of Relentless Torment
 Caused by the unleashed elephant of my mind.

- 5.3 But if the elephant of my mind is tightly bound
 Through all by the rope of mindfulness,
 All fears will cease to exist
 And all virtues will come into my hand.

- 5.4 Tigers, lions, elephants, bears,
 Snakes, and all my enemies,
 The guardians who are hell beings,
 Evil spirits and likewise cannibals,

- 5.5 Will all be bound
 By binding this mind alone,
 And will all be subdued
 By subduing this mind alone.

{147} Those who wish to guard their trainings, such as generosity, without degeneration should very tightly guard their minds from moving to erroneous objects because those who do not guard their minds from distractions are unable to guard their trainings at all.

In this [world], ordinary unsubdued and crazed elephants do not cause such harms as the harms of Relentless Torment caused by the elephant of my mind unleashed towards erroneous objects. Thus, I should make effort to guard my mind. But if the elephant of my mind is tightly bound to a virtuous object of observation through all three doors by the rope of mindfulness, all fears of this life will cease to exist and all virtues of the stages of the path of the three types of beings will come into my hand. Therefore, I should make effort at never degenerating mindfulness towards a virtuous object of observation and tie my mind to a virtuous object of observation.

The harms of tigers, lions, elephants, bears, snakes, all human enemies, and, in the future lives, the guardians who are hell beings, evil spirits who harm by knowledge mantras, dakinis and likewise cannibals – all those fears – will be as though bound by way of countering the cause of fear with the rope of mindfulness that binds this mind alone to a virtuous object of observation, whereby there will not be even the slightest harm. Jen-nga-wa, through only his meditation on love, caused all the deer to come before him, the cat of the Victors' Child Togme Sangpo did not consume meat, the animals within the fence of Langri Tangpa did not harm each other, and Milarepa taught Dharma to deer and dogs, whereby their minds were subdued.

And it is just as has been said in the *Sutra on the Vows of Individual Liberation (Pratimoksha-sutra)*:

*Even poisonous snakes and the great black nagas do not harm
Those with ethics. What need to mention others?*

Since all of them will be subdued through subduing the engagement in faulty behavior of this mind alone by means of mindfulness and introspection, I should make effort to subdue the mind because [Bhavaviveka's] *Heart of the Middle Way (Madhyamakahrdayakarika)*⁷³ says:

*The erring elephant of your mind
Is securely bound by the rope of mindfulness
To the sturdy pillar of the object of meditation
And is gradually controlled with the iron hook of wisdom.*

3B2B-2B2A-1A2. The reason that [through guarding the mind all will be guarded]

- A. Misdeeds are contingent upon the mind
- B. Excellent qualities are contingent upon the mind

3B2B-2B2A-1A2A. Misdeeds are contingent upon the mind

5.6 The perfect speech itself indicated,
“Thus all fears
As well as all boundless suffering
Originate from the mind.”

⁷³ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 3, page 398, n. 95

- 5.7 Who intentionally created
The weapons of hell beings?
Who created the burning iron ground?
From what did all those hosts of women ensue?
- 5.8 The Muni taught that all such things
Are the negative mind.
Hence, within the three worlds
There is nothing to fear other than my own mind.

{149} The fears and sufferings that will happen to me are created by my mind because the non-erroneous perfect speech with respect to all objects of knowledge states, “Thus all fears as well as all boundless suffering of this and future lives originate from just my negative mind.” It is just as has been indicated by the Muni himself in the *Cloud of Jewels Sutra* (*Ratna-megha-sutra*):

If the mind itself is controlled, then all will be controlled.

And:

Virtuous and non-virtuous actions are accumulated by the mind.

And:

Mind is the forerunner of all phenomena. If you fully understand the mind, you will fully understand all phenomena. Due to perfectly gathering phenomena, all phenomena rely on the mind.

And the *Samvara Tantra* says:

There is no buddha and no sentient being
Outside the jewel mind.
The basis⁷⁴ of consciousness
And the external do not exist in the slightest.
Pacified in the supreme dharmadhatu,
This is called the jewel mind.

And the *Avatamsaka-sutra* says:

The mind is like a painter; {150}
The mind creates the aggregates.
All the diversities in this world
Are drawn by the mind.

⁷⁴ JN: Changed from “problem” to “basis” to accord with Geshe Jampa Gyatso’s commentary.

Hence, if the suffering of the hell beings and so forth did not arise from the experiencer's past negative mind, then what other creator would intentionally create the weapons, such as the spears and swords, of the hell beings? This is because there is no Ishvara and so forth, or any other intentional creator. Who created those blazing burning iron grounds? From what causes did all those hosts of women who cause one to climb up and down the shalmali⁷⁵ [trees] ensue? This is because there is no other creator.

It is not correct that they arise causelessly because the Muni taught, in the *Excellent Doctrine of the Close Placement of Mindfulness* and the like, that all such things arise from the mind of one who has committed negativities. "The hosts of women" is an impure example. The *Close Placement of Mindfulness* says:

*The mind is the inner enemy, the great enemy;
There is no enemy other than it.*

So all misdeeds are contingent upon the mind. Hence within all the three worlds there is nothing at all to fear other than the deeds of my mind.

3B2B-2B2A-1A2B. Excellent qualities are contingent upon the mind

- 5.9 If the perfection of generosity
 Were the alleviation of migrating beings' poverty,
 Then since there are still starving migrating beings,
 In what manner did the previous Protectors perfect it?
- 5.10 The perfection of generosity is taught to be
 The mind intending to give all things,
 As well as its result, to all beings;
 Hence it is simply the mind. {151}
- 5.11 Where will the fish and so forth be driven
 So that they will not be killed?
 Hence, the attainment of the intention of abandonment
 Is explained to be the perfection of ethics.
- 5.12 Unruly sentient beings are like space;
 All of them cannot possibly be overcome.
 But if I overcome the mind of anger alone,
 This will be equivalent to vanquishing all those foes.
- 5.13 Where could I possibly find enough leather
 With which to cover the surface of the earth?
 Having leather on just the soles of my shoes
 Is equivalent to covering the earth with it.

⁷⁵ sword-leaved trees

- 5.14 Likewise it is not possible for me
To counteract things externally;
But should I counteract this mind of mine,
What is the need for counteracting others?
- 5.15 Although the result of generating a clear mind
Is Brahma and so forth,
The results along with body and speech will be
Weak in conduct, therefore it is not like that.
- 5.16 The Knower of Reality taught
That even if recitation and hardships
Are practiced for long periods of time,
They will be meaningless if the mind is distracted elsewhere.
- 5.17 Even those who wish to obtain happiness and overcome suffering
Will wander with no aim
If they do not comprehend the secret of the mind –
The principal Dharma.

If the completion of the perfection of **generosity** were the perfection of generosity through the alleviation of all migrating beings' poverty, then since there are still starving migrating beings, in what manner did the previous Protector Buddhas perfect the perfection of generosity? It would [follow that] they did not complete it. {152} Thus, its completion is taught to be the perfection of generosity by way of the mind that wishes to give all bodies, resources, roots of virtue, and things, as well as the merit, the result of giving, to all beings. Hence, generosity is simply contingent on the mind.

The completion of the perfection of **ethics** does not need to depend on the exhaustion of sentient beings who are objects of killing. Who is able to drive all those deer, fish, and so forth to some other place where they will not be killed by anyone? No one is able to drive them [to such a place]. Hence, the attainment of perfect familiarization with the intention to abandon the thought of harming, the thought of stealing, and so forth is explained to be completion of the perfection of ethics.

QUESTION: According to the sutras, what is the perfection of ethics?

RESPONSE: It is explained to be “the intention to abandon harm to others.”

Furthermore, if I overcome the mind of anger alone this will be equivalent to vanquishing all those external foes. However, this does not need to depend on exterminating the observed objects of anger in that, because unruly sentient beings are as infinite as space, all of them cannot possibly be totally overcome. Hence, **patience** also is contingent upon the mind. {153}

For example, where could I possibly find enough leather with which to cover the surface of the earth for the purpose of preventing my feet from being harmed by thorns and so forth? Therefore, in order not to be harmed by thorns and the like, covering my feet with leather on just the soles of my shoes is equivalent to covering the entire surface of the earth. Just as in the example, it is not possible for me to externally counteract harmful things outside, but should this mind of mine observe those objects and counteract the arising of anger, due to

familiarization with that, patience will be completed. Then, what will be the need for me to counteract other objects of anger? I will not be able to counteract them and there will be no need to do so.

The fulfillment of familiarization with **joyous effort** is also contingent upon the mind because, although the result of slightly generating a clear mind enthusiastic about cultivating the meditative absorption of the first concentration and the like, which is included within meditative absorption, is rebirth in the abodes of Brahma and so forth, if the mind is not associated with power the results of the mind along with the body and speech will be weak in energy and inferior in conduct, whereby one will not be able to be thus reborn in the first concentration and so forth. Thus, the [fulfillment of familiarization with joyous effort] is contingent upon a powerful mind.

The completion of the perfection of **concentration** is also contingent upon a mind that is free from laxity and excitement and is conjoined with mental attention that is clear and weary⁷⁶ because the Knower of Reality, the Buddha, taught that even if the recitation of dharani mantras and {154} hardships such as abiding in fasting are practiced for long periods of time, if the mind is distracted elsewhere they will be meaningless since they will not yield the desired result. A sutra says:

Bhikshus, hardships, recitations, and so forth in which the mind is distracted to the desirable will have no results.

Wisdom is also contingent upon the mind because even those who wish to obtain unsurpassed happiness and overcome the sufferings of cyclic existence will wander blithely, without any aim wishing for them, if they do not comprehend this truth of the ultimate secret of the mind since no person teaches the principal Dharma or the supreme meaning to inappropriate vessels.

3B2B-2B2A-1A3. Making effort in guarding the mind

5.18 This being so,
 I shall hold and guard my mind well.
 Except for the mode of conduct of guarding the mind,
 What use are many other modes of conduct?

5.19 Just as I would be attentive and conscientious of a wound
 When amidst an unruly, freed crowd,
 So I should always guard the wounds of my mind
 When dwelling among negative people.

5.20 If I am conscientious of a wound
 Through fear of the small suffering of a wound,
 Then why do I not guard the wounds of my mind
 Through fear of being crushed by the mountains of Mass Destruction?

⁷⁶ JN: Changed from “clear and tireless mental attention” to accord with Geshe Jampa Gyatso’s commentary.

5.21 Should I behave in such a way,
 Then whether among negative people
 Or even in the midst of women,
 The steady effort of restraint will not decline.

5.22 It is better to be without gain,
 Honor, body, and sustenance,
 And it is better to let other virtues degenerate,
 Rather than ever to let the mind degenerate.

{155} The abandoning of misdeeds and accomplishing of excellent qualities are contingent upon the mind. This being so, I shall hold my mind well with mindfulness and introspection and guard it without degeneration. Except for the mode of conduct of guarding the mind, what use are many other modes of conduct, such as recitation, in which the mind is not guarded? They are without purpose.

Just as people who have wounds on their bodies would be attentive and conscientious of their wounds when amidst an excited crowd that is not bound by conscientiousness but is unruly as though they were freed in a place of conscientiousness due to people such as spiritual teachers, so likewise, due to dwelling among negative people who act as conditions for generating afflictions, I must always guard the wounds of my mind. This is because if I do not guard them, those conditions will sever the life of high status and liberation.

If I should be conscientious of a wound through fear of a small suffering, a bodily wound, then why do I not guard the wounds of my mind, such as negativities and downfalls, through fear of the suffering of being crushed by the mountains of Mass Destruction Hell and so forth if my mind degenerates? Contemplating the great drawbacks of not guarding them, I should guard them. {156}

Should I continuously dwell in such conduct that prevents afflictions, then whether among negative angry people or even in the midst of lustful women, the steady mind of restraint striving in the individual liberation, bodhisattva, and tantra vows will not decline.

It is better to be without gain such as food and clothes, honor such as being prostrated to, and sustenance such as food that serves as a condition for my life and body remaining, and it is better to let other virtues separated from guarding the mind degenerate, rather than to ever let the Mahayana mind degenerate. This is because in general all pure and impure environments and their inhabitants arise through the power of the mind.

[Chandrakirti's] *Supplement to the Middle Way (Madhyamakavatara)* (stanzas 6.89-90ab) says:

*The mind itself establishes all the variety
Of the world of sentient beings and the world of their environment.
It is said all migrating beings without exception are born from karma.
If mind is rejected, karma too cannot exist.*

*Suppose form were to exist, but it has
No creator that is like the mind.*

It is just as it has been said by Chandrakirti, “Although forms that are established as external objects exist, they are not the creator of the environment and its inhabitants like the mind nor do they have the ability to accumulate wholesome and unwholesome karma.”⁷⁷ Hence, the Buddha taught that all phenomena are just the essence of mind.” So all the endowments of the environment and the inhabitants of the buddha ground are also established through the power of the mind of enlightenment.

3B2B-2B2A-1B. The method for guarding the mind is guarding mindfulness and introspection

1. Brief indication {157}
2. Extensive explanation

3B2B-2B2A-1B1. Brief indication

5.23 To you who wish to guard your minds,
 I thus fold my hands [and urge you],
 “*At the cost of your life, guard
 Mindfulness and introspection!*”

If you are separated from mindfulness and introspection, you will not be able to guard your mind. Therefore, to you who wish to guard your minds without letting them come under the influence of afflictions, I, Shantideva, thus fold my hands and urge you, “*At the cost of your life, guard without degeneration the mindfulness that does not forget the virtuous object of observation and the introspection that realizes whether the states of the three doors are virtue or non-virtue!*” It is just as has been said in [Nagarjuna’s] *Letter to a Friend* (stanza 54):

*O Lord, the Sugata taught that mindfulness of the body is
The sole path to be traversed.
Pay attention and guard it.
Due to mindfulness degenerating, all qualities will be destroyed.*

3B2B-2B2A-1B2. Extensive explanation

- A. Drawbacks of lacking introspection
- B. Guarding mindfulness as the method for guarding introspection

3B2B-2B2A-1B2A. Drawbacks of lacking introspection

5.24 People who are disturbed by sickness
 Lack strength in all actions.
 Likewise, the minds disturbed by confusion
 Lack strength in all actions.

5.25 Whatever has been heard, contemplated, and meditated
 By those whose minds lack introspection,
 Just like water in a leaking vase,
 Will not remain in mindfulness.

⁷⁷ JN: Changed slightly from the original translation.

- 5.26 Even those who have plenty of hearing,
Faith, and diligent endeavor
Will become sullied by a downfall
Due to the fault of lacking introspection.
- 5.27 The thieves of non-introspection,
In following upon the degeneration of mindfulness,
Will steal even the merits I have firmly gathered
[So that] I shall then proceed to lower realms.
- 5.28 This host of thieves of the afflictions
Will search for a good opportunity and occasion.
Having found it, they will steal my virtue
And destroy even life in a good migration.

{158} People who are disturbed by sickness lack strength in all actions such as farming. Likewise the minds that lack introspection and are disturbed by confusion with respect to what is to be adopted and what is to be discarded lack strength in all virtuous actions.

If introspection is missing, wisdom will not become excellent (1) because, for those whose minds lack introspection, even through they once had the wisdoms of hearing, contemplation, and meditation, they will degenerate, just like, for example, water in a leaking vase drips away without remaining, and (2) because, due to the degeneration of introspection, in future they will not remain in mindfulness, and their wisdom will degenerate.

Not only that, even those who have plenty of hearing, faith in the Dharma, and diligent endeavor in virtuous application will become sullied by downfalls due to the fault of lacking introspection with respect to the objects that are to be adopted and discarded. Hence, I should make effort in guarding introspection, the method for such not to happen, {159} because the thieves who are the afflictions in those who lack introspection, in following upon the degeneration of mindfulness that forgets the virtuous object of observation, will steal even the wealth of merit I have firmly gathered previously so that, as though traveling in poverty, I shall then proceed to lower realms due to being deprived of virtues.

If I do not guard introspection, this host of thieves of afflictions will search for a good occasion or time, wondering, “Can I find the opportunity to steal the wealth of virtue?” And having found it, they will steal my virtue and destroy even its result, life in a good migration and liberation. Therefore, contemplating the drawbacks of lacking introspection, I should make effort in guarding the introspection that realizes, “How are the states of my three doors?”

3B2B-2B2A-1B2B. Guarding mindfulness as the method for guarding introspection

- 5.29 Therefore, I shall never let mindfulness depart
From the doorway of my mind.
If it goes, I should recall the harms of the lower realms
And closely place it there.
- 5.30 Through the company of gurus,
Through the subsequent teachings of abbots, and through fear,

Mindfulness will easily be generated
In fortunate people who act respectfully.

- 5.31 “I am always dwelling in the presence
Of all those buddhas and bodhisattvas
Who are endowed
With unimpeded vision in all.”
- 5.32 By thinking in this way,
I shall likewise obtain possession of shame, respect, and fear.
Also through doing this,
Recollection of the Buddha will repeatedly occur.
- 5.33 When mindfulness abides for the purpose
Of guarding against [afflictions] from the doorway of the mind,
Then introspection will come about
And even that which had gone will return.

{160} Without introspection, there will be many misdeeds. Therefore, for the sake of guarding introspection, I shall admit into the house of my mind the mindfulness that does not forget the virtuous object of observation and never lets it depart from the doorway of my mind. If mindfulness degenerates, that is, if it goes away, I should recall the harms of the lower realms and immediately closely place it in the house of my mind.

The method for guarding mindfulness is as follows. Through the company of abbots, masters, beings who share pure behavior and so forth, and gurus, through the instructions and subsequent teachings that are taught by the abbots, and through knowing shame and the fear of being derided by others, the mindfulness that does not forget the virtuous object of observation will very easily be generated in fortunate people who respect the trainings.

I should be skilled in protecting mindfulness in whichever of the three – hearing, contemplation, and meditation – I do, and furthermore, thinking in this way, “I am always dwelling without obstruction in the presence of all those buddhas and bodhisattvas who are endowed with unimpeded vision regarding all objects of knowledge in all places at all times,” I shall likewise obtain possession of the shame that takes oneself as the reason, respect for the Teacher and the Dharma, and fear of the fruition [in unfortunate rebirths]. {161} Also through contemplating like this, recollection of the excellent qualities of the Buddha, as well as the Dharma and the Sangha, will repeatedly occur in that person, whereby mindfulness of the Three Jewels will easily be generated. And due to that mindfulness, when mindfulness abides for the purpose of guarding against afflictions from the doorway of the mind, then introspection (that examines the proper and improper states and exactly knows that) will come about and even that which had once degenerated and is gone will return.

Hence, whether or not I am skilled in accomplishment and practice is contingent upon how I protect mindfulness and introspection. So I should be skilled in doing that because it is just as has been said by the Great Jamgon Lama Tsongkhapa [in his *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*]⁷⁸ :

⁷⁸ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 1, page 133, chapter on *The Three Types of Persons*

Train in the four collections of causes for easily generating the path of calm abiding and special insight. Guard the door of the sense powers as follows. In dependence on objects and the sense powers, the six primary consciousnesses are generated. After that, the mental consciousness generates attachment towards the six attractive objects and aversion towards the six unattractive objects. Guard it such that [attachment and aversion] are not generated from them. Introspective behavior is just as has been said in [Shantideva's] *Engaging in the Deeds of a Bodhisattva* (*Bodhisattvacharyavatara*, 5.108):

*The defining characteristic of guarding introspection
In brief is only this:
To examine again and again
The states of body and mind.*

When engaging in the activities of the body and so forth, you should act having understood what is proper and what is improper. {162} Regarding a suitable amount of food, one avoids eating too much or too little food and eats just the amount that will not harm virtuous activities. Also, having meditated on the drawbacks of craving for food, you should recall the teaching that one should eat thinking, "This shall not be afflictive and shall benefit the giver. Now I gather the microorganisms in my body with [the generosity of] material things. In the future I will gather them with the [generosity of] the Dharma," and "I shall accomplish the welfare of all sentient beings." [Nagarjuna's] *Letter to a Friend* (stanza 38) says:

*Food should be relied upon properly, as though it were
Medicine, without attachment or hatred;
Not for conceit, arrogance, or
Robustness, but only to sustain the body.*

To strive in the yoga of not sleeping and what you should do when going to bed is as follows. [Nagarjuna's] *Letter to a Friend* (stanza 39) says:

*Sensible ones! Occupy yourselves the entire day and
Also the first and last parts of the night.
Without the time of sleep becoming wasted,
Sleep with mindfulness between them.*

Since the entire daytime and the first and last parts of nighttime are indicated to be the actual session and the session breaks, [whether] moving or abiding, you should make them meaningful by completely purifying your mind of the five obstructions⁷⁹. Since the conduct of sleep is a session break, you should not let it become meaningless. Regarding the behavior of the body, with the night divided into three parts, during the middle part, lie on your right side and place your left leg upon your right and sleep like a lion.

⁷⁹ These are (1) excitement and regret, (2) sleep and lethargy, and (3) harmful intent, (4) aspiration for the attributes of the desire realm, and (5) doubt.

As for mindfulness, recall the virtuous activities that were predominantly familiarized with in the day, and until you fall asleep, follow it and rely upon it. {163} Due to that, when you are asleep, you will be able to maintain the training in virtue, such as meditative stabilization, just as when you were awake. As for introspection, when relying on mindfulness, if any affliction should arise, having understood that, abandon it without assenting to it. As for the discrimination for waking up, make the motivation thinking, “I shall wake up at just this [time].” These procedures during the session breaks should be applied to whatever objects of observation and aspects⁸⁰ you are training in.

3B2B-2B2A-1C. How to train in the deed of guarding the mind through mindfulness and introspection

1. How to train in the ethics of restraint
2. How to train in the ethics of gathering virtuous qualities
3. How to train in the ethics of enacting the welfare of sentient beings

3B2B-2B2A-1C1. How to train in the ethics of restraint

- A. Making effort in pure behavior of the three doors
- B. Guarding against degeneration

3B2B-2B2A-1C1A. Making effort in pure behavior of the three doors

- 5.34 When, at the beginning,
 Having known that such a mind is with fault,
 At such a time, like a piece of wood,
 I should remain being able to rely [upon the antidote].
- 5.35 Never should I look around
 Distractedly for no purpose.
 With a resolute mind
 I should always keep my eyes cast downwards.
- 5.36 But in order to relax the gaze
 For a short while I should look around.
 If someone appears in my field of vision
 I should look at him and say, “It’s good that you have come.” {164}
- 5.37 To check if there is any danger on the path and so forth
 I should look again and again in the four directions.
 To rest, I should turn my head around
 And then look behind me.
- 5.38 Having examined both ahead and behind,
 I should proceed to either come or go.
 Being aware of the necessity
 I should act like this in all situations.

⁸⁰ JN: Changed from “objective aspects.”

- 5.39 Having prepared for an action with the thought,
“My body will remain in such a way,”
Then periodically I should look to see
“How is the body abiding?”
- 5.40 With utmost effort I should check
To see that the crazed elephant of my mind
Is not wandering off but is bound
To the great pillar of thinking about the Dharma.
- .41 I who strive by all means for meditative stabilization
Should not wander off even for a moment.
Thinking, “What is this mind of mine doing?”
I should investigate my mind.
- 5.42 But if I am unable to do this when involved in fear or
Celebrations and the like, then I should relax.
Thus it has been taught that at times of giving,
You may be indifferent to ethics.
- 5.43 I should undertake whatever deed I have intended to do
And think of doing nothing other than it.
With my mind focused upon that,
I should set about for the time being to accomplish it.
- 5.44 By acting in this way, all will be done well,
Otherwise neither will be done.
There will thus be no increase
In the secondary affliction of non-introspection.

{165} [Nagarjuna’s] *Letter to a Friend* (stanza 29) says:

*Knower of the World! Gain and loss
Fame and disrepute, the pleasant and the unpleasant,
Praise and blame; be indifferent to these eight worldly concerns
And not let them be objects of your mind.*

When, at the beginning, having understood just as was said above that “This mind of such a motivation is with the faults of the three types- white, black, and variegated - of the eight worldly concerns, and it is faultless,” at such a time, if the motivation is faulty, through mental mindfulness, unmovable by misdeed, like a piece of wood, I should remain being able to rely upon the antidote.

As for the behavior of looking with my eyes, never should I look around distractedly for no purpose because the mind will degenerate. With a mind resolute towards a virtuous object of observation, when looking I should always keep my eyes cast downwards for just the measurement of a yoke. But in order to restore the [bodily] constituents and to relax the gaze

when tired, for a short while I should lift my eyes and look around. By my looking like that, if someone appears in my field of vision and comes before me, I should look at him with a smile and say, "It's good that you have come."

Furthermore, at the time of traveling, to check if there is any danger on the path and so forth, I should look again and again in the four directions. And to rest, I should turn my head around when going and then look at the things and so forth behind me. Having examined both ahead and behind to see if there is a precipice and so forth, I should proceed to either come or go. {166} Thus, being aware of the necessity to benefit others in all situations of engaging in activities of body and speech, I should enact activities belonging to the class of virtue. Wherever I may abide, having prepared for an action with the thought, "My body will remain in such a way," then periodically I should look to see, "How is the body abiding?"

I should make effort in behavior without misdeeds and with utmost effort I should thus check to see that the unsubdued crazed elephant of my mind is not wandering off but is bound to the great pillar of thinking about the Dharma, which I have committed myself to do one-[pointedly].

I who strive by all means for the meditative stabilization that is undistracted from virtuous qualities should not wander off to anything other than that even for a moment. Thinking, "What is this mind of mine doing - something proper or improper?" I should investigate my mind again and again in this manner.

But if I am unable to do subtle activities of body and mind due to being involved in fear of harm to my life, celebrations of offerings to the Three Jewels and the like, or purposes of sentient beings that are far greater than [investigating my mind], then I should relax because the *Teachings of Akshayamati Sutra (Akshayamatiniirdeshasutra)* says, "Thus at the time of giving, withdraw ethics and act indifferently," teaching that at times of giving when you are unable to perform both simultaneously and giving is the main training, you may be indifferent to the inability to accomplish subtle ethics. {167} This means that you must complete [the trainings] sequentially by being skilled in the order of the path.

QUESTION: Since ethics is superior to generosity, how should one be indifferent about it?

RESPONSE: At the beginning of any deed that needs to be learnt in a definite order, I should undertake whatever I have intended to do and think of doing nothing other than it. With my mind focused upon the generosity that I have initiated at the beginning, I should set about for the time being to accomplish it. By acting in this way to train in the path sequentially, all will be done well, otherwise by reversing the order neither the former nor the latter will be fulfilled. If you know thus the order of the path, there will be no increase in the secondary affliction of non-introspection that does not know the order. Therefore, you should be skilled in the order of the path.

3B2B-2B2A-1C1B. Guarding against degeneration

5.45 If I engage in a variety
 Of senseless talk
 Or in many kinds of spectacular shows,
 I should abandon attachment towards them.

5.46 If for no reason I dig the earth,
 Cut grass, draw patterns in the earth, and the like,
 Then, recalling the advice of the Sugatas,

I should immediately stop out of fear.

- 5.47 Whenever I have the desire
To move or to say something,
First of all I should examine my mind
And then, with steadiness, act in the proper way.
- 5.48 Whenever there is attachment in my mind
And whenever there is the desire to be angry,
I should not do anything nor say anything,
But remain like a piece of wood.
- 5.49 Whenever I have excitement, the wish to verbally belittle others, {168}
Pride and arrogance;
When I have the thought to describe the faults of others,
Cunningness and the thought to deceive others;
- 5.50 Whenever I am eager for praise
Or have the desire to blame others;
Whenever I have the wish to scold and quarrel;
At such times I should remain like a piece of wood.
- 5.51 Whenever I desire material gain, honor, or fame;
Whenever I seek servants or a retinue,
And when in my mind I wish to be served;
At these times I should remain like a piece of wood.
- 5.52 Whenever I have the mind wishing to neglect the welfare of others
And to pursue my own welfare,
And wish to say something,
At these times I should remain like a piece of wood.
- 5.53 Whenever impatience, laziness, fear,
And likewise shamelessness or the talking of nonsense,
And thoughts of partiality arise,
At these times too I should remain like a piece of wood.
- 5.54 Having in this way examined his mind for afflictions
And for thoughts that strive for meaningless things,
The hero should hold his mind steady
By means of the antidotes.
- 5.55 Being very resolute and faithful,
Steady, respectful, polite,
With a sense of shame, fear, and pacification,
I should strive to make others happy.

- 5.56 I should not be disheartened by the whims
Of the childish who are in discord with one another;
I should be merciful, thinking, “This mind of theirs
Is due to the generation of afflictions.”
- 5.57 Having control over that which is actually not misdeeds
In myself and other sentient beings,
I should always hold my mind
Like an emanation without an I.
- 5.58 By thinking again and again that
After a long time I have obtained the supreme leisures,
Thus I should hold my mind
As utterly unshakeable as Mount Meru.

{169} I should not engage in a variety of senseless talk, such as talk about the king, thieves, and robbers, or in many kinds of spectacular shows such as song and dance. If I do engage in them for some purpose or for others, I should abandon attachment to them.

If even someone who is not a fully-ordained monk digs the earth, cuts grass, draws patterns in the earth, and the like for no reason, then, recalling the advice of the Sugatas, he should immediately stop out of fear of their drawbacks.

Whenever I have the desire to move my body or to say something, again first of all I should examine my mind and then, without coming under the influence of afflictions, act with steadiness in the proper way according to the procedures.

Whenever there is attachment in my mind and whenever there is the desire to get angry, I should not do any bodily action nor say anything verbally, but be able to rely upon the antidote and remain like a piece of wood.

Whenever I have the excitement that is exhilarated about objects, the wish to verbally belittle others through jest, a puffed-up pride and arrogance on account of my youthfulness and so forth; when I have the thought to describe the faults of others, cunningness, that is, a calculating disposition due to discontentment, and the thought to deceive others with deceit and dissimulation; {170} whenever I am eager for praise by means of a description of my excellent qualities, or have the desire to blame others through criticism; whenever I have the wish to scold by deprecation and dispute and quarrel, at such times I should remain like a piece of wood without wavering from being able to be self-sufficient with regards to the antidote, just as has been said in *Exhortation to Wholehearted Resolve (Adhyasaya-samcodana-sutra)*⁸¹:

*Those dwelling in the forest, desiring excellent qualities,
Should not scrutinize others' faults.
They should not think,
“I am superior; I am the best” –*

⁸¹ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 1, page 395, n. 337

*Such arrogance is the root of all negligence.
Do not deride inferior monks,
Or you will not achieve liberation for an eon.
This is the order in this teaching.*

Whenever I desire material gain such as wealth; honor, such as a seat, a monk's cushion cover, and so forth; the fame of a good reputation; whenever I desire to seek servants or a retinue; and when in my mind I wish for service, such as the application of oil, massage, and the like, at these times I should remain like a piece of wood.⁸²

Whenever I have the mind wishing to neglect the welfare of others and to pursue my own welfare, and there is the mind that wishes to say something, at these times, being able to rely upon the antidote, I should remain like a piece of wood.

Whenever anger and impatience at suffering and the like, fear of accomplishing virtue and so forth due to the force of laziness that is unenthusiastic about virtue, and {171} likewise shameless impudence due to being daringly thick-skinned out of unruliness, or talk of irrelevant nonsense, and thoughts of partiality grasping to friends and so forth arise, at these times too, through application, being able to rely upon the antidote, I should remain like a piece of wood.

Having in this way examined my mind for afflictions and thoughts that strive for meaningless things, without engaging in negative activities I should hold my mind steady through antidotes that are like powerful heroes.

Having thus guarded the trainings of the body against degeneration, if I guard my mind in this way, being very resolute due to abandoning doubt and wrong consciousnesses regarding the objects of training, faithful due to having conviction and clear and wishing faith regarding the Three Jewels and the objects of training, steady in thought and action, respectful, polite in bowing to all, with a sense of shame due to shying away from misdeeds on account of oneself, fear of the fruition by contemplating the drawbacks, and having pacified sense powers, I should strive to make others, the objects of purpose, happy.

I should not be disheartened by contradictions in the whims of behavior of the childish who are in discord with each other, such that when one benefits someone, another generates anger. Rather; I should be merciful, thinking, "This mind of theirs arises powerlessly due to the generation of afflictions. May they be free from afflictions," and not come under the influence of the afflictions myself. {172} [Maitreya's] *Ornament of Mahayana Sutras* (*Mahayanasutralamkara*):

*Due to the mind always committing misdeeds powerlessly,
The intelligent do not hold beings as faulty.*

[Aryadeva's] *Four Hundred Stanzas* (*Catuh Sataka*) says⁸³:

*Just as a doctor does not fight with
Patients who are possessed by spirits even though they are angry;
So the Muni sees the afflictions,*

⁸² JN: Changed to accord with Geshe Jampa Gyatso's commentary, but it needs to be verified.

⁸³ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 266, n. 258

Not the persons who are involved with the afflictions.

Maitreya Prayer says:

*The buddhas do not pray
For the stains of the mind;
They have exalted love for sentient beings.*

Jamgon [Lama Tsongkhapa] says⁸⁴:

*Towards those with continuous thoughts to harm
My body, life, and resources, and
Who speak unpleasantly to me,
May I have exceptional mother-like love for them.*

*By my generating the pure exceptional resolve in my continuum,
The mind of enlightenment that cultivates cherishing others,
Without a long time passing,
May the state of unsurpassed enlightenment be bestowed.*

Engaging in virtuous qualities that are without natural nor stipulated misdeeds, the purpose of which is to be empowered over myself not degenerating and benefiting other sentient beings, I should always hold my mind steady by means of being conjoined with the wisdom realizing emptiness, without pride⁸⁵ and arrogance, as though creating illusions and emanations. By thinking again and again, “After a long time I have attained the supreme leisures with great hardship,” that I have attained the leisures and endowments that are of great value and are hard to find, I should hold my mind steady, as utterly unshakeable as Mount Meru as explained above, thinking, “I shall accomplish the great purpose no matter what,” {173} because it is just as has been said in [Nagarjuna’s] *Precious Garland* (*Rajaparikatharatnavali*) (stanza 2.74cd-75ab):

*If you and the world wish to attain
Unsurpassed enlightenment,
Its roots are the mind of enlightenment,
Firm like the King of Mountains.*

3B2B-2B2A-1C2. How to train in the ethics of gathering virtuous qualities

- A. Abandoning a cause for not training in ethics – attachment to the body
- B. Being skilled in accomplishing virtue

3B2B-2B2A-1C2A. Abandoning a cause for not training in ethics – attachment to the body

5.59 If, mind, you are not made unhappy
 When this body is dragged here and there and

⁸⁴ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 1, page 133, chapter on *The Three Types of Persons*

⁸⁵ The word for ‘pride’ in Tibetan is literally “I-king.”

Taken away by vultures attached to flesh,
Then why do you advise so now?

- 5.60 Holding this body as “mine”,
Why, mind, do you guard it so?
Since you and it are separate,
What use can it be to you?
- 5.61 Why, confused mind,
Do you not hold onto a clean, wooden form?
Just what is the point of guarding
This rotting machine that is a collection of filth?
- 5.62 First of all, mentally separate
The layers of skin,
And then with the scalpel of wisdom
Also separate the flesh from the skeletal frame.
- 5.63 And, having split open even the bones,
Look right down into the marrow.
While examining this ask yourself,
“Where is its essence?”
- 5.64 If, even when searching with such effort
You see no essence,
Then why with so much attachment
Are you still guarding this body now?
- 5.65 What use is this body to you
If its filth is unfit for you to eat,
If its blood is not fit to drink
And if its intestines are not fit to be sucked?
- 5.66 At second best it is only fit to be guarded
In order to feed the foxes and vultures.
This body of a human being
Should only be put to work.
- 5.67 Even though you guard it thus,
Then what will you do
When it is stolen by the merciless Lord of Death
And given to the birds and dogs?
- 5.68 If servants are not given clothing and so forth
When they are unable to be put to work,
Then why do you nourish it in health

When, even though caring for the body, it goes elsewhere?

5.69 Now having paid my body its wages,
I shall make it enact my welfare.
I shall not give it anything
If it is not beneficial.

5.70 I should conceive of my body as a boat,
A mere support for coming and going,
And in order to accomplish the welfare of sentient beings
Transform it into a wish-fulfilling body.

{174} If, mind, you are not made unhappy when this body upon death is dragged here and there and taken elsewhere by many vultures attached to flesh, then why do you advise or speak so now saying, “Do not undergo hardship for the sake of Dharma” out of attachment for the body? It is inappropriate to be attached to it.

Therefore, holding this body as “mine”, why, mind, do you guard it so with cherishing? This is because many undesirables will be generated out of your attachment to it.

OPINION: Because it is necessary to me.

RESPONSE: Since you and this body are separate, you will also quickly discard this body, therefore of what use can it be to you? It is inappropriate to hold it as “self.” {175}

Furthermore, due to having held it as “self” for a long time in the past, why, mind that has confused that which is selfless as being self, holding the filth to be self, do you not hold onto a clean, wooden form, thinking “I?” Just what is the point of guarding this putrid rotting machine that has gathered thirty-two unclean substances that is a collection of filth?

If you divide the body into parts and examine them, [you will find] not the slightest trustworthy essence because, first of all, if you were to mentally separate the layers of skin from the others parts of the body, [you will find] not the slightest trustworthy essence, and then you should examine that there is no essence also by separating the flesh from the skeletal frame with the scalpel of wisdom. And having split open even the bones into parts, look right down into the marrow. While examining this with wisdom ask yourself, “Where is the essence that can withstand analysis in this body?” [You will find] not the slightest trustworthy essence.

If, even when searching for the essence with such effort you see no essence, then why with so much attachment and adherence are you still guarding this body now? Excessive adherence is inappropriate.

OBJECTION: But a little adherence to this body is appropriate. {176}

RESPONSE: Attachment to the body is inappropriate. The body is a heap of filth. What use is this body to you if its filth is unfit for you to eat, if its blood is not fit to drink, and, likewise, if its intestines are not fit to be sucked? Of what use is this body as something suitable to be utilized by me?

If I guard it, at second best, that is, for one reason, this body is only fit to be guarded in order to feed the foxes and vultures. Also this body is utterly purposeless by way of its own entity. However, this body of a human being, which has attained the complete leisuress and endowments, should only be put to work in virtuous actions.

Even though you guard it thus without accomplishing the desired goal, then what will you do when it is stolen by the merciless Lord of Death, rendered lifeless, and given to the birds and dogs? There is not the slightest you will be able to do so as to not separate from it.

For example, if servants are not given clothing and so forth by the master when they are unable to do their chores, whereby they are punished, then why do you nourish the body in health when, even though you nourish and care for it with effort, it goes elsewhere without your control? It is inappropriate.

I should conceive of my body as a boat for crossing to the other shore of the ocean of cyclic existence, a mere support for coming and going, for the purpose of this body, making effort in virtue, and in order to accomplish the welfare of sentient beings, I shall transform it into a resultant complete buddha body, like a wish-fulfilling jewel.

3B2B-2B2A-1C2B. Being skilled in accomplishing virtue

5.71 Now, while I have freedom,
 I should always present a smiling face
 And cease to frown and look black-faced;
 I should be a friend of migrating beings and be straightforward.

5.72 I should desist from inconsiderately and noisily
 Moving chairs around and so forth,
 As well as from violently opening doors;
 I should always delight in humility.

5.73 The stork, the cat, and the thief,
 By ambushing and moving silently,
 Are able to accomplish what they desire to do;
 I should always behave in this way.

5.74 With respect I should gratefully accept
 Unsought for words that are of benefit
 And that wisely advise and admonish me.
 At all times I should be the pupil of everyone.

5.75 I should say, "Virtuously said,"
 To all those who speak well,
 And, if I see someone creating merit,
 I should praise him and be well pleased.

5.76 I should discreetly talk about the good qualities
 And repeat those recounted.
 If my own good qualities are spoken about,
 I should just know and be aware that I have them.

5.77 All initiatives are a source of joy
 That would be rare even if it could be bought with money.
 Therefore, the excellent qualities causing others [joy]

Causes the enjoyment of the happiness of joy.

- 5.78 I shall suffer no losses in this life
And in future lives shall find great happiness.
But misdeeds will make me unhappy and bring suffering,
And in future lives I shall find great suffering.
- 5.79 When talking I should speak from my heart and on what is related.
Making the meaning clear and the speech pleasing.
I should abandon attachment or hatred,
And speak in gentle tones appropriately.
- 5.80 When beholding someone with my eyes,
Thinking, “I shall attain buddhahood
By depending upon this being,”
I should look at him candidly with love.
- 5.81 Always being motivated by affection
Or being motivated by the antidotes,
In the fields of excellent qualities, benefit, and suffering,
Great virtues will come about.
- 5.82 I should always perform actions
Endowed with skill and joy⁸⁶.
In all actions
I should not depend upon anyone else.
- 5.83 The perfections such as generosity
Are progressively more exalted,
But for a little I should not forsake something greater.
Principally I should consider the welfare of others.

{178} Now, while I have freedom in my body and mind, I should always present a smiling face to others and cease, that is, stop, scowling while frowning and looking black-faced. I should be an affectionate virtuous friend of migrating beings and, when talking, speak affably and be straightforward, that is, be honest and truthful.

I should desist from inconsiderately and noisily moving things such as chairs around without checking because that will harm others, as well as from violently, that is, forcefully, opening doors in order to harm sentient beings who are living inside temples and rooms. Whether moving or abiding, I should always behave humbly, that is, harmlessly. {179}

As examples of accomplishing one’s purpose through such gentle behavior, the stork, the cat, and the thief, by ambushing and moving silently, are able to accomplish exactly what they desire to do; those with the modes of conduct of bodhisattvas should always behave in this way.

⁸⁶ “Joy” seems to be a scribing error, and should be “faith” instead.

With respect I should gratefully accept unsought for words that are of benefit and that wisely advise and admonish me to application in virtue. At all times, without pride, I should be the pupil of good advice given to me.

I should say, “Virtuously said,” to all those who speak words of truth well, and if I see someone creating merit such as making offerings to the Three Jewels, by explicitly praising him, I should be well pleased and delighted.

When actually speaking, if the conditions for soft words arise, I should discreetly talk about the good qualities and should hide my own good qualities. The Great Jowo [Atisha] said:

*Hide your own good qualities and
Describe the good qualities of others.*

When others recount the good qualities of the spiritual teachers and friends of others, those who are my junior in terms of training and so forth, I should express words of agreement, saying, “It is so.” If others speak about my own good qualities, without getting puffed-up, I should examine whether or not I have the good qualities mentioned with that intention. If I do, I should just know and be aware that I have them, but not be conceited. {180}

All initiatives or activities of the three doors of bodhisattvas are a source of joy for others, so that joy of others would be rare even if it could be bought with money. Therefore, the excellent qualities causing others joy causes others to enjoy the happiness of joy without jealousy in this life. And due to causing others joy I shall suffer utterly no loss or decline of resources and so forth in this life, and in future lives shall find great happiness. But, otherwise, the misdeeds of being angry at the excellent qualities of others will make me unhappy in this life and bring suffering to my body, and in future lives I shall find great suffering too.

When talking to others, I should speak what is trustworthy from my heart and on what relates to the former and latter and so forth. Making it affable through making the meaning easily comprehensible and clear, whereby it is pleasing, I should abandon the motivation of attachment or hatred and speak in gentle tones, appropriate in time and in quantity, just as has been taught in the *Sutra on the Ten Grounds (Dashibhumisutra)*.

When beholding some sentient being with my eyes, thinking, “I shall attain buddhahood by depending upon these sentient beings,” just as one who is miserable due to thirst⁸⁷ is refreshed by drinking cold water, I should look at him with a candid attitude and love. {181} I should always perform virtue and act while motivated by affection, that is, out of fervent aspiration, and, being motivated by the antidotes that are the discordant classes of callousness, through giving to the supreme fields – the field of possessing excellent qualities such as the Three Jewels, the field of benefit such as one’s parents, and the field of those with suffering such as the poor and destitute, great virtues will come about. Hence, you should make effort in it, for [Nagarjuna’s] *Letter to a Friend* (stanza 42) says:

*The five types of great virtues and non-virtues are
Actions that arise constantly, with a strong adherence, without antidote,
From (the basis of benefit or) the basis of foremost excellent qualities.
Strive in the practice of virtue.*

⁸⁷ JN: Changed from “meditation” to “thirst” in accordance with Geshe Jampa Gyatso’s commentary.

I should always perform virtuous actions endowed with skill (in what is to be adopted and what is to be discarded, and what is to be engaged in and what is to be turned away from of the thoroughly afflicted class and completely pure class), and faith in virtue. In all virtuous actions I should not depend upon any assistant such as making only others do them. The perfections such as generosity through wisdom are progressively more exalted and I should practice them increasingly, but for a little purpose and virtue, such as generosity and ethics, I should not forsake something greater, but should make effort in the great. This teaches implicitly that if I am unable to do both simultaneously, and have to choose between them, then I should forsake the smaller one for the sake of guarding the greater.

QUESTION: How are the smaller and the greater posited? {182}

RESPONSE: In the case of, for instance, my own welfare and others' welfare of this life, if one will suffer due to the other being enacted, then principally I should consider the welfare of others by giving up my own welfare.

3B2B-2B2A-1C3. How to train in the ethics of enacting the welfare of sentient beings

- A. Being diligent in others' welfare
- B. Practice of gathering others without being tainted by misdeeds
- C. Training in subsequently guarding the minds of sentient beings and in behaving without being tainted by misdeeds

3B2B-2B2A-1C3A. Being diligent in others' welfare

5.84 When these are well understood,
 I should always strive for the welfare of others.
 The Far-Seeing Compassionate Ones have allowed
 Those that were forbidden.

When I have understood well the objects to be adopted and discarded by a bodhisattva just as they have been explained above, I should always strive for the welfare of others.

QUESTION: Since I must accomplish various activities for the welfare of others, I myself will become tainted by misdeeds.

RESPONSE: Although the compassionate buddhas, who directly see even hidden objects that are far away, forbade hearers who mainly enact their own welfare to do the seven non-virtues of body and speech and the like, they allowed bodhisattvas to do them when the occasion arises. Not only will no misdeed be committed, there will be extensive accumulation because *The Sutra of Great Secret Skillful Means* speaks of Captain Mahakaruna who killed an evil person whereby his [time in] cyclic existence was reduced by many eons, and there is the account of the son of a brahmin, Star, who, having observed chastity for thousands of years, gave it up out of compassion in order to keep a woman alive, thereby completing the accumulations. [183]

Alternatively, these should be explained to bodhisattvas who have been given permission to do the seven non-virtues of body and speech, such as killing and so forth, by the compassionate buddhas who directly see events even tens of millions of eons far. The distinction between what is allowed and what is forbidden is clear in the *Explanation on the Chapter of Ethics* in [Asanga's] *Bodhisattva Grounds*.

3B2B-2B2A-1C3B. Practice of gathering others without being tainted by misdeeds

- 5.85 I should divide my food amongst those who have fallen into error,
Those without protection, and those abiding in modes of conduct,
And eat merely what is suitable for myself.
Except for the three robes I may give away all.
- 5.86 This body that is for practicing the sublime Dharma
Should not be harmed for only slight benefit.
If I behave in this way,
The wishes of all beings will be quickly fulfilled.
- 5.87 Those whose attitude of compassion is impure
Should not give their body away.
No matter what, both in this and future lives,
They should give it as causes for fulfilling the great purpose.
- 5.88 The Dharma should not be explained to those who lack respect,
To those who wrap cloth around their heads although they are not ill,
To those holding umbrellas, sticks, or weapons, and
To those with covered heads.
- 5.89 The vast and profound should not be taught to lesser beings
Nor to a woman unaccompanied by a man.
Out of respect for the Dharmas of lesser and supreme beings as equal,
I should utilize all.
- 5.90 I should not connect the Dharma of a lesser being
To one who is a vessel for the vast Dharma.
I should not forsake the conduct,
Nor deceive by means of sutras or mantras.

[184] When utilizing food, I should divide my food into portions amongst animals and hungry ghosts who have fallen into error, sick people without protection and the like, and those abiding in modes of conduct who share pure behavior, and eat merely what is suitable for myself without committing any misdeed based on food. I myself “should understand the measure for all” just as has been taught. It is just as has been said by Dorje Dzinpa Konchog Gyeltshen:

*Thinking, “Due to food, excrement and urine similar to vomit are increased,
Friendships degenerate, there is dissatisfaction and battles fought.
I shall proceed to the unfortunate rebirths by accumulating negativities because of
food,”
With the attitude to benefit my sponsors
And the microorganisms in my body,
I shall eat merely so as not to harm this body of virtue.*

Except for the three robes – a fully-ordained monk’s shawl and upper and lower robes – I may give away all if I have other possessions. If I have possessions in excess of the three robes, I should give them away, but if I have no more than one set, then I should not give it away because that will serve as an obstacle to pure behavior (i.e., chastity). This body of mine that is the support for practicing the sublime Dharma (which will accomplish the extensive purposes of self and others if I were to guard it) should not be harmed for only slight benefit to others. Rather, I should guard it like a wound. If I behave in this way, in dependence on the leisures and endowments, the wishes of all beings will be quickly fulfilled by means of the three trainings. [185]

It is just as has been said in [Aryadeva’s] *Four Hundred Stanzas* (*Catuh Sataka*, stanza 2.26):

*Although the body is seen like a foe,
Nevertheless it should be protected.
By long sustaining a disciplined [body],
Great merit will be created.*

And its commentary says:

*Just like protecting a thief to whom
One’s purpose is inseparably bound,
Likewise, the skillful ones [protect] the body
Because it will enhance ethics and so forth.*

Although a bodhisattva gives his body and so forth to sentient beings from the depths of his heart, nevertheless those who will become disheartened at the hardship of others begging for the flesh of their body and will generate regret afterwards and the like should not give this body away due to applying an impure attitude of compassion cherishing others more than themselves, because, just as has been taught in a sutra citation in the *Compendium of Trainings*, untimely giving is an action of the maras. Instead, when there will be the completion of great accumulations while being free from the interferences to generosity such as miserliness from one’s side, and in the absence of misdeeds, then no matter what, both in this and future lives, they should give up their life as causes for fulfilling the great purpose.

Since the great beings, the bodhisattvas, give the flesh of their own bodies to others, their vast inner excellent qualities which do not appear [externally to others] can be inferred in dependence on that [giving]. The bliss that is generated merely by hearing the sound “May you give me your body” cannot be produced even by the bliss of hearers and solitary realizers abiding in the absorption of cessation. And through inference from the sicknesses afflicting one’s body, one should quickly strive to dispel the suffering of others. [186]

It is just as has been said by Chandrakirti [in his *Supplement to the Middle Way* (*Madhyamakavatara*)] (stanzas 1.9cd, 1.14-1.15):

*His devotion to donating his flesh
Is the cause for inferring what is not suitable to appear.*

And:

*If the bliss of the Able Ones absorbed in peace
Cannot compare with the bliss of a Child of the Victors
Who hears and thinks of the word "Give!"
Then what need is there to mention about his giving everything?*

*Through cutting and giving his body and his own suffering,
He sees for himself
Others' suffering in hell and so on,
And quickly strives to relieve them with joyous effort.*

Furthermore, the Dharma should not be explained to those who lack respect, and to those with attributes of behavior that are as taught in the *Vinaya Scripture*:

*The five types, head covered and so forth;
The six, stick-in-hand and so forth;
The five, one with hair-knot and so forth;
The five, riding on an elephant and so forth;*

The Dharma should not be explained to those holding in their hands umbrellas, sticks, or weapons, and to those with heads covered with cloth although they are not ill. The vast and profound should not be taught to beings of lesser attitude who are not suitable vessels, nor to a woman unaccompanied by a man. [187]

If you discriminate between the Dharmas of the lesser and supreme beings, such as [saying that] the Hinayana and Mahayana Dharmas are good or bad, correct or incorrect, are or are not the method for attaining buddhahood, and so forth, then this is taught to be abandoning the Dharma. Therefore, out of respect for all of them as equal, I should utilize and practice all.

The way to explain and listen to the Dharma and how to honor the propounder of the Dharma is just as has been said by Dorje Dzinpa Konchog Gyeltshen:

*Compared to a lay person giving inestimable possessions,
An ordained person's generosity of one stanza
Is taught to be more meritorious and so forth.
Contemplate the benefits of pure generosity of Dharma.*

*When the Bhagavan taught the Mother of the Victors⁸⁸,
He himself arranged a seat and so forth.
Likewise, teach out of respect for the Dharma.
Thinking about the kindness and excellent qualities, generate respect.*

And:

Wash, adorn cleanly, don clean clothes,

⁸⁸ "Mother of the Victors" refers to the Perfection of Wisdom Sutras.

Place a teaching throne in a clean location,
Cleanse it while reciting the dharani for annihilating the maras.
Explain with examples, reasons, and scripture.
You should not explain without request.
Even when requested, examine whether he is a vessel.
When you know that someone is a vessel,
It is appropriate to explain even though he does not request.
At the conclusion, dedicate with The Extraordinary Aspirations of
Samantabhadra⁸⁹ and so forth.
If one explains and listens like that,
One will obtain boundless benefits.
Otherwise, due to being accompanied by afflictions,
The intelligent ones will make effort in methods [188]
For forsaking the paths of listening and explanation.

Kshitigarbha Sutra says:

With single-pointed faith and respect, listen to the Dharma;
Neither deride nor deprecate it.
Make offerings to the propounder of the Dharma;
Generate the discrimination of him as being like the Buddha.

I should not connect the Dharma of a lesser being (as in the case of leading one to the path of the hearers) to one of the Mahayana lineage who is a vessel for the vast Dharma because I will incur a downfall. I should not forsake the conduct of the ethics of restraint, nor deceive others by means of sutras or mantras even though they are suitable vessels, saying, “By just reading this sutra and mantra you will be purified.”

3B2B-2B2A-1C3C. Training in subsequently guarding the minds of sentient beings and in behaving without being tainted by misdeeds

- 5.91 When I spit or throw away a tooth-stick,
 I should cover it up.
 Also it is deplorable to urinate and so forth
 In water or on land that is utilized.
- 5.92 When eating I should not fill my mouth,
 Eat noisily or with my mouth wide open.
 I should not sit with my legs outstretched
 Nor rub my hands together.
- 5.93 I should not sit on mounts, upon beds,
 Nor in the same room together with the women of others.
 Having observed and inquired about
 What causes non-faith in the world, I should abandon it.

⁸⁹ This prayer is also known as *The King of Prayers*.

- 5.94 I should not give directions with one finger,
But instead indicate the way
Respectfully with also
All of my right arm.
- 5.95 Nor should I wildly wave my arms about;
Instead I should make my point
By uttering sounds with mild gestures and a snap of fingers.
Otherwise I shall lose control.
- 5.96 Just as the Protector lay down to pass away
So should I lie in the desired direction,
And first of all with introspection
Make up my mind to quickly rise.
- 5.97 From among the limitless deeds
Of a bodhisattva that have been taught,
I should certainly practice as much
Of this conduct that trains the mind.

[189] Even ordained bodhisattvas must guard the conduct taught in the common Vinaya Basket except on occasions when permission is granted. Since lay bodhisattvas also need to guard against negative activities that cause others to generate non-faith, when I spit or throw away a tooth-stick for cleaning my mouth, I should cover it up with earth. Also it is deplorable to urinate, defecate, discard mucus and snot, and so forth in water or on land that is utilized in common.

When eating I should not fill my mouth with food, eat noisily with chomping sounds or with my mouth wide open. When sitting on a throne and the like I should not sit with my two legs outstretched on the ground nor simultaneously rub my two hands together. There is no misdeed in rubbing them in sequence. [190] I should not sit on mounts such as horses, upon beds, nor in the same room together with the women of others. Even lay bodhisattvas should not stay together with others' women who are not their relatives. In brief, having observed directly and inquired about what I am ignorant of in that place and at that time regarding what behavior causes non-faith in the world, I should abandon it.

At the time of giving directions to others, I should not give directions with one finger of my left hand because this will make me an object of derision. But instead I should indicate the way respectfully with my right arm in the upward direction with all my fingers also fully outstretched.

Nor should I wildly wave my arms about vigorously for no purpose, for that is brazen. Instead I should make my point by uttering sounds with mild gestures, a snap of fingers, and the like because otherwise I shall lose control by being too loud and so forth.

In just the way the Protector laid down when he showed the manner of passing away, when going to sleep I should lay my head in the desired direction, lie on my right side, place my left leg upon my right, place my head on my right hand, and cover myself well with my Dharma robes. At the time of sleeping, I shall first of all make up my mind, "I shall quickly rise with

the discrimination of illumination by relying upon mindfulness and introspection on a virtuous object of observation.” I should sleep, thinking, “I shall make effort in virtue through developing the body with sleep. ” [191]

Such is taught in the sutras and the commentaries explaining their intention:

From among the limitless divisions of deeds of a bodhisattva such as generosity that have been taught, if I lack the ability to accomplish all of them, then only at the beginning I should practice as much of all the conduct as I am able to due to ascertaining the above explanation of the conduct training the mind.

In addition, the **ethics of restraint from faulty behavior** refers to the ten abandonments in which one abandons the ten non-virtues when the motivation is taken into account, and which, in terms of entity, refers to the ethics that abandon the seven of body and speech. The **ethics of gathering virtuous qualities** refers to observing the virtues of the six perfections and so forth, then generating those that have not been generated, not degenerating those that have been generated, and increasing them more and more. The **ethics of enacting the welfare of sentient beings** refers to correctly accomplishing without misdeeds the welfare of sentient beings in this and future lives by means of ethics.

The way to keep such ethics purely is that you must see the drawbacks of not guarding ethics and the benefits of guarding it. The benefits of guarding it are just as have been taught in [Aryasura’s] *Compendium of the Perfections (Paramitasamasa)*⁹⁰ :

*If you cannot achieve your own welfare with degenerate ethics,
Where will you get strength for the welfare of others?
Therefore, those who strive for the welfare of others
Should not relax their devotion to this.*

And:

*Ethics is the path of special attainment, [192]
Achieves equality with those of compassionate nature,
And has the marvelous nature of pure exalted wisdom.
Free of flaws, it is called the best of ornaments.*

*It is a pleasant fragrance throughout the three realms,
The smearing of which is not prohibited for ordained ones.
Even if those with concordant attire have ethics,
They will be exalted among human beings.*

In dependence on this, your continuum will progress higher and higher, your training will parallel those of the great bodhisattvas of compassionate nature, you will attain the pure exalted wisdom that abandons all seeds of faulty conduct, and, although other ornaments are not beautiful on those who are too young or too old, the ornament of ethics is the best of ornaments that produces joy in all, regardless of whether it is the old, the young, or the

⁹⁰ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 265, n. 228 & 233.

middle-aged who possess it. Other pleasant fragrances are partial in direction in that they spread in the direction of the wind but not to directions where the wind does not blow. However, the fragrance of the reputation of ethics goes to all directions.

Although the smearing of ointments of sandalwood and so forth to dispel the torment of heat is prohibited for ordained ones, the smearing to protect from the torment of heat of the afflictions is not prohibited for ordained ones and in fact is accordant with them. It is similar for those possessing just the signs of being ordained. Those having the gem of ethics are taught to tower above others.

[Aryasura's *Compendium of the Perfections (Paramitasamasa)*]⁹¹ says:

*Even without speaking or undertaking hardship
You gather immediate necessities and service.
Without threat the entire world bows to you;
You obtain power effortlessly and without toil. [193]*

*You will arise in the class about which it is improper to talk casually.
Also all the persons who you did not know previously,
Who have neither benefited nor helped you,
Bow to you, a being possessing ethics.*

*Excellent beings revere the dust blessed by your feet,
Touching their heads to it; deities and humans pay homage to it,
Place it on the crowns of their heads, and carry away what they can get.*

You should contemplate just as it has been taught.

From among these three [types of ethics], the principal one is the ethics of restraint from faulty behavior that abandons the ten non-virtues. Therefore, you must repeatedly give rise to the mind of restraint in which the motivation does not waver even slightly from it. [Aryasura's] *Compendium of the Perfections (Paramitasamasa)*⁹² says:

*Do not let these ten paths of action degenerate;
They are the path to the happiness of high status and liberation.
By abiding in them, the attribute of contemplation
Wherein you think of benefiting migrating beings will come to fruition.*

*Correctly restrain your speech, body, and mind;
The Victors taught, "This, in brief, is ethics."
This is the basis gathering all ethics without exception,
So train in them.*

In brief, having taken that as the basis, training again and again in the mind of restraint that learns whatever trainings of ethics one has committed oneself to and the like, is the practice of ethics.

⁹¹ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 265, n. 234.

⁹² Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 265, n. 241.

Action possessing the six perfections refers to the following. Abiding in ethics yourself and placing others in ethics is **generosity**. [194] Restraining yourself from the mental application of the hearers and solitary realizers at that time is **ethics**. There is interest and **patience** towards the doctrine of the Omniscient Ones as well as patience regarding condemnation from others. There is **joyous effort** that generates aspiration for the sake of enhancing [ethics] more and more. There is **concentration** that dedicates to complete enlightenment the virtue from the single-pointed mind unmixed with the Hinayana. There is **wisdom** that knows that (1) the objects to be guarded against, the ten non-virtues, (2) that which guards, the ethics of the ten virtues, and (3) the bodhisattva guarding them, are like illusions. This completes the six perfections.

Each of the perfections of the bodhisattvas is complete in the six excellences as follows. The **excellent support** refers to being based upon the mind of enlightenment. **Excellent exalted wisdom** refers to being conjoined with the wisdom realizing emptiness. **Excellent object of observation** refers to observing all sentient beings. **Excellent inexhaustibility** refers to inexhaustible virtue until the end of cyclic existence. **Excellent goal** refers to engaging for the sake of unsurpassed enlightenment. **Excellent dedication** refers to dedicating as causes of others' welfare and unsurpassed enlightenment. [Maitreya's] *Discrimination of the Middle and the Extremes (Madhyantavibhaga)* says:

*Extensive, long-lasting,
Goal and inexhaustibility...*

Although twelve excellences are taught there, they can be subsumed into the six excellences.

3B2B-2B2A-1D. Branch of perfecting the trainings/ Method for perfecting the trainings

- 5.98 Three times by day and three times by night
I should recite *The Sutra of the Three Heaps*;
By relying upon the Victors and the mind of enlightenment
My remaining downfalls will be purified.
- 5.99 Whatever I do on any occasion, [195]
Whether in terms of myself or others,
I should make effort and learn
Whatever training has been taught for that occasion.
- 5.100 There is no such thing as something
That is not learned by the Victors' Children.
Thus if I am skilled in abiding in this way
Nothing will be non-meritorious.
- 5.101 Directly or indirectly, I should not do anything
Other than the welfare of sentient beings.
Solely for the welfare of sentient beings
I should dedicate all towards enlightenment.

- 5.102 Never, even at the cost of my life,
Should I forsake a spiritual friend
Skilled in the meanings of the Mahayana
[Who abides in] the supreme modes of conduct of a bodhisattva.
- 5.103 I should train in devoting myself to my spiritual master
In the manner taught in *The Biography of Shrisambhava*.
This and other trainings spoken by the Buddha,
I should understand through reading the sutras.
- 5.104 I should read the sutras
Because it is in them that the practices appear.
To begin with, I should look at
The Sutra of Akashagarba.
- 5.105 I should definitely look at
Compendium of Trainings again and again
Because what is to be constantly practiced
Is clearly and extensively shown there.
- 5.106 Alternatively I should sometimes look at
The condensed *Compendium of Sutras*.
Also, I should make an effort to look at
The second composed by Arya Nagarjuna.
- 5.107 I should do whatever
Is not forbidden in those [works].
I should impeccably practice whatever training I see
In order to guard the minds of worldly people.

[196] QUESTION: What should be done if one were to become tainted by misdeeds even though one makes effort in the trainings?

RESPONSE: If I were to become tainted by a root downfall, then I should confess the negativity and restore the vow just as has been taught in the *Compendium of Trainings* (*Siksamuccaya*): “Abiding before Arya Akashagarba [as though in a] dream, you should confess it.” If small and middling lapses, the forty-six infractions, and, in addition, those misdeeds taught in the *Compendium of Trainings* occur, then three times by day and three times by night I should recite *The Sutra of the Three Heaps*, the method for confessing negativities, accumulating merit, and rendering virtue inexhaustible and increasing it. By relying upon going for refuge to the Victors, the Three Jewels, and the mind of enlightenment, my remaining downfalls will be purified by means of the complete four powers.

Whatever I do with my three doors on any occasion, whether in terms of myself or others, I should make effort and learn whatever training has been taught by the Victors for that occasion without becoming tainted by misdeeds.

There is no such thing as an object of knowledge that is not learned by the Victors' Children. Thus I should not generate non-faith since, if I am skilled in abiding in this way, learning all objects, then nothing will be non-meritorious.

Furthermore, whatever the welfare of sentient beings is directly or indirectly, I should not do anything other than the welfare of sentient beings. Solely for the welfare of sentient beings should I dedicate all virtues towards enlightenment. [197]

Never, even at the cost of my life, should I forsake a Mahayana spiritual friend skilled in all meanings of the Mahayana, who abides in the vows of the supreme modes of conduct of a bodhisattva. I should train in devoting myself to my spiritual master in the manner extensively taught in *The Biography of the Youth Shrisambhava* in the *Array of Stalks Sutra (Gandavyuhasutra)*: "Son of the lineage, bodhisattvas perfectly held by spiritual masters will not fall into the bad migrations..."

Furthermore, I should understand the objects to be trained in, this treatise and other trainings spoken by the Buddha, through reading the Mahayana sutras. I should read the sutras because it is in them that the extensive teachings of the trainings appear. In particular, to begin with, those who have taken the engaging vows should look at *The Sutra of Akashagarba*. I should definitely look at the *Compendium of Trainings* again and again because what is to be constantly practiced is clearly and extensively shown there by means of the twelve, the three [sets of] the four - giving, guarding, purifying, and increasing - of the body, resources, and roots of virtue. Alternatively, if I am not able to do that, I should sometimes look a little at the condensed *Compendium of Sutras (Sutrasamucchaya)* composed by Acharya [Shantideva] himself. I should make an effort also to look at the works of the second *Compendium of Sutras* composed by Arya Nagarjuna. [198]

I should abandon whatever is forbidden in the sutras and treatises and do whatever is not forbidden in them. The purpose is so that I should impeccably practice and learn whatever training of the bodhisattvas I see in order to guard the minds of worldly people and to abandon non-faith.

3B2B-2B2A-2. Concluding that one must practice the meaning without letting it be mere words

5.108 The defining characteristic of introspection

In brief is only this:

To examine again and again

The states of my body and mind.

5.109 Thus I shall put these into action with my body,

For what can be achieved by merely expressing words?

Will sick people be benefited

Merely by reading the medical texts?

The defining characteristic of guarding introspection without degeneration in brief is only this: to examine again and again the states of my body, speech, and mind with the wisdom knowing exactly whether they contravene the trainings or not, how they are unspecified, or how they have not come under the influence of afflictions. Furthermore, it is just as has been said in the *Sutra Requested by the Naga King Sagara*:

Lord of Nagas, one Dharma of the bodhisattvas perfectly eliminates rebirths where one perversely falls into the bad migrations, the unfortunate rebirths. What is that unique Dharma? It is as follows: realizing individually the Dharma of virtue, thinking, “How am I? How do I pass and dwell in the days and nights?”

Having understood thus, I shall put these into action through practice, applying them with my body, for what purpose can be achieved by merely expressing words that accumulate many synonyms in the absence of practice? [199] Nothing at all will be achieved. It is just as in the case of, for example, will sick people be benefited merely by reading the medical texts? They will not be benefited.

In short, the excellent qualities of the three types of ethics are just as have been said by the Foremost Lama [Tsongkhapa]:

*Ethics is the water that washes away the stains of faulty conduct,
Moonlight dispelling the torment of the heat of the afflictions, and
Magnificent like Mount Meru amidst all beings,
Through whose power there are no negativities and all migrating beings bow.
Having understood thus, excellent beings guard
Perfectly undertaken ethics like their eyes.*

And [his *Foundation of All Good Qualities*] says:

*Induced by that immaculate thought,
Please bless me to take the pratimoksha,
The root of the doctrine, as the essential practice
With great mindfulness, introspection, and conscientiousness.*

And Gyeltshab Thamche Khyenpa says:

*Beings who take the essence of practice
To be the stages of the path of the three types of beings
Rely upon guarding mindfulness and introspection,
Thereby you should always be skilled in those ways.*

3B2B-2B2B. Title of the chapter

The Fifth Chapter on Guarding Introspection from *Engaging in the Deeds of a Bodhisattva*.

This is easy to understand.

Chapter Six

Relying on Patience

3B2B-2B3. Explanation on how to train in the remaining four perfections

- A. How to train in patience
- B. How to train in joyous effort
- C. How to train in concentration
- D. How to train in wisdom

3B2B-2B3A. How to train in patience

1. Text of the chapter
2. Title of the chapter [200]

3B2B-2B3A-1. Text of the chapter

3B2B-2B3A-1A. Abandoning the hindrances to generating and abiding in the antidotes, and being diligent in cultivating patience

3B2B-2B3A-1B. Taking to mind the method for accomplishing patience

3B2B-2B3A-1A. Abandoning the hindrances to generating and abiding in the antidotes, and being diligent in cultivating patience

- 3B2B-2B3A-1A1. The drawbacks of anger⁹³
- 3B2B-2B3A-1A2. The benefits of patience

3B2B-2B3A-1A1. The drawbacks of anger

- 6.1 Whatever wholesome deeds,
 Such as generosity and making offerings to the sugatas,
 Have been amassed over thousands of eons,
 Will all be destroyed by anger.
- 6.2 There is no negativity like hatred,
 And no fortitude like patience.
 Thus I should cultivate patience
 Persistently through various ways.
- 6.3 My mind will not experience peace
 If it holds painful thoughts of hatred.
 I shall find no joy or happiness;
 Unable to sleep, I shall feel unsettled.
- 6.4 A master who has hatred
 Is in danger of being killed
 Even by those who for their wealth and honor
 Depend upon his kindness.
- 6.5 By it, friends and relatives are disheartened;
 Though drawn by his generosity they will not rely upon him.

⁹³ In this translation, the root affliction *khong khro* (usually translated as “anger”) and the secondary affliction *khro ba* (sometimes translated as “belligerence”) are both liberally rendered as “anger.”

In brief, there is nobody
Who dwells comfortably with anger.

6.6ab The enemy, anger,
 Creates sufferings such as those.

The final hindrance to generating and abiding in the virtuous qualities is anger. Therefore, I should strive to stop it by contemplating its drawbacks. Whatever virtues arise from generosity as well as from wholesome deeds, such as making offerings to the sugatas and the like, making offerings to the Three Jewels, meditation and ethics, that have been amassed over a hundred thousand eons will all be destroyed from the root by a fit of anger observing a bodhisattva. [201] Not only that, the sutra cited in [Shantideva's] *Compendium of Trainings (Sikṣasamuccaya)* teaches that a bhikṣu who prostrates to a stupa containing a tathagata's hair and nails with an attitude of faith will obtain the virtue to reign as a wheel-turning king for as many times as the number of particles covered by his prostrated body down to the golden wheel, [at the base of the world system,] multiplied by a thousand, and that that virtue will be destroyed by injuring a [companion] sharing pure behavior.

It is taught that the object of anger to which the anger that severs the roots of virtue accumulated over a hundred thousand eons is directed must be a bodhisattva. Hence, if one generates a mind of anger towards a bodhisattva, then there will be great drawbacks: the roots of virtue of a hundred thousand eons will be destroyed, one's body will be ugly in all rebirths, one will be deprived of wisdom that discriminates between what is to be adopted and what is to be discarded, one will be thrown into bad migrations as offerings by other rebirths⁹⁴ and so forth.

Due to patience there will be the excellent qualities that are opposite to those drawbacks, such as having a beautiful form, being cherished and treasured by holy beings, developing the wisdom that discriminates between what is to be adopted and what is to be discarded, enjoying the happiness of humans and gods in future lives, and quickly attaining the state of the sugatas. Even if not only the flesh and skin of the body, but also the bones and marrow of the great holy aryas are cut off, not just once, but over months and years, tael by tael, their patience for the cutter grows exceptionally. [202]

[Chandrakīrti's] *Supplement to the Middle Way (Madhyamakavatara)* (stanzas 3.6-8) says:

*Because, due to anger towards the Victors' Children,
Virtues arising from generosity and ethics
Accumulated over hundreds of eons are instantly destroyed,
There is no other negativity greater than non-patience.*

*Making you ugly, leading you to the unwholesome,
And depriving you of discrimination between right and wrong,
Non-patience quickly throws you down to a bad migration.
Patience brings excellent qualities opposite to those already explained.*

⁹⁴ The meaning in the Tibetan text is unclear here.

*Through patience, you will be beautiful, and
Dear to holy beings; skilled in knowing
What is right and wrong; and thereafter,
Be reborn as a god or human. Negativities will be consumed.*

And (verse 3.2):

*Even if someone, disturbed over nothing,
Were to have the flesh and bones cut from his body
For a long time, tael by tael,
His patience for the cutter would grow exceptionally.*

Furthermore, the *Extensive Commentary of the Vinaya* in [the section on] the correct dwelling place and [Bhavaviveka's] *Blaze of Reasoning* (*Madhyamakahrdayavrttitarkajvala*) teach that hatred severs vows and roots of virtue. With respect to hindering the generation of the path and destroying virtue, there is no negativity like hatred, and with respect to destroying the torment of the heat of the afflictions, there is no fortitude like patience. Thus I should cultivate patience persistently through various ways and methods.

My mind will not experience the joy of pacification of suffering if it holds painful thoughts of hatred that produce violent suffering. [203] I shall find no mental joy or bodily happiness; unable to sleep, I shall feel unsettled such that my mind cannot rest at ease.

A master who has hatred is in danger of being killed even by those angry ones who for their wealth and honor depend upon his kindness, that is, his care and assistance. Due to it, his friends and relatives are disillusioned and disheartened; though drawn by his generosity they will not rely upon him with joy. Hence, I should make effort to abandon it.

In brief, there is no one who dwells comfortably with anger because the enemy that is anger is the perfect cause that increases suffering in this and future lives, there being the drawbacks such as those explained above.

3B2B-2B3A-1A2. The benefits of patience

6.6cd But whoever assiduously overcomes it
 Creates happiness in this and other lives.

But whatever person, having contemplated well the drawbacks of anger, assiduously overcomes it creates the cause for only happiness in this and other lives. Therefore I should make effort in abandoning anger. It is just as it has been said by the Great Jamgon Lama Tsongkhapa [in his *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*]⁹⁵ :

If you rely on having a continuity of patience, then, since your mental joy will not deteriorate, you will be happy in this life and all lives too, bad migrations in future lives will be stopped, and you will be bestowed special good rebirths and eventually definite goodness. Thus there is happiness in all, this and future lives. [204]

⁹⁵ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 154, chapter on *The Perfection of Patience*

3B2B-2B3A-1B. Taking to mind the method for accomplishing patience

1. Stopping the cause of anger
2. Meditating on the benefits of patience

3B2B-2B3A-1B1. Stopping the cause of anger

- A. Having contemplated the drawbacks of the entities of the cause, actually making effort in the method for counteracting it
- B. Having investigated in detail the cause of generating anger, making effort in the method for abandoning it

3B2B-2B3A-1B1A. Having contemplated the drawbacks of the entities of the cause, actually making effort in the method for counteracting it

6.7 Having found its fuel of mental unhappiness
 In the doing of what I do not wish for
 And in the hindering of what I wish for,
 Hatred develops and then destroys me.

6.8 Therefore I should totally destroy
 The fuel of this enemy;
 This enemy has no other function
 Than that of causing me harm.

6.9 Whatever befalls me,
 I shall not disturb my mental joy.
 Having been made unhappy, I shall not accomplish what I wish for
 And my virtues will decline.

6.10 Why be unhappy about something
 If it can be remedied?
 And what is the use of being unhappy about something
 If it cannot be remedied?

QUESTION: How does anger produce suffering?

RESPONSE: Since the mental unhappiness that arises from the doing of what I do not wish for and the hindering of the accomplishment of what I wish for (with respect to the I and mine that is qualified by my eye, my nose, and so forth) is the fuel for increasing hatred, having found its fuel of mental unhappiness, the corpus of hatred develops in strength and then destroys me in this and future lives. Therefore I should totally destroy mental unhappiness, the fuel of this hatred, my enemy. This enemy of mine, hatred, has no other function than that of causing me harm in this way. [205] Hence, I should make effort in destroying this principal enemy.

QUESTION: How do I abandon mental unhappiness?

RESPONSE: Having contemplated the benefits of willingly accepting suffering, I should think well, "Whatever befalls me I shall not disturb my mental joy." Since mental happiness is the antidote to mental unhappiness, having been made unhappy at some undesirable occurrence, I shall not accomplish the goals I wish for and the virtues that issue forth the results I wish for will decline, whereby all sufferings will be produced.

Why be unhappy about an object that produced mental unhappiness if it can be remedied? This is because by immediately remedying it, the mental unhappiness will vanish. And what is the use of being unhappy about something if it cannot be remedied? Just like being unhappy at space for being devoid of obstruction, there is no use.

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B. Having investigated in detail the cause of generating anger, making effort in the method for abandoning it

1. General indication of the objects that give rise to anger
2. Stopping anger at the undesirable created
3. Stopping anger at hindrances to one's desires

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-1. General indication of the objects that give rise to anger

6.11 For myself and for my friends
I do not want suffering, contempt,
Harsh words, and unpleasant talk;
But for my enemies it is the opposite.

For myself and for my friends I do not want the four: (1) suffering feelings, (2) contempt, that is, not obtaining gain, (3) hurtful harsh words to our face, [206] and (4) unpleasant talk describing our notoriety behind our backs, whereas I want their four opposites. On the other hand, what I want and do not want for my enemies are the opposite. In brief, there are eight worldly concerns.

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2. Stopping anger at the undesirable created

- A. Stopping anger at misdeeds committed against oneself
- B. Stopping anger at misdeeds committed against one's friends
- C. Stopping anger at good done towards one's enemies

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2A. Stopping anger at misdeeds committed against oneself

1. Being patient at the suffering that is produced
2. Being patient at contempt and so forth that are caused

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2A1. Being patient at the suffering that is produced

- A. Cultivating the patience of willingly accepting suffering
- B. Cultivating the patience of definitely thinking about the Dharma
- C. Cultivating the patience of being indifferent to harm

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2A1A. Cultivating the patience of willingly accepting suffering

6.12 The causes of happiness occasionally occur,
Whereas the causes for suffering are very many.
Without suffering there is no definite emergence.
Therefore, mind, you should stand firm.

6.13 If the followers of Durga and the people of Karnata
Endure the feelings of burns, cuts, and the like meaninglessly,
Then for the sake of liberation,
Why have I no courage?

6.14 There is nothing whatsoever
That is not made easier through acquaintance.

So through becoming acquainted with small harms,
I will become patient with great harms.

- 6.15 Who has not seen this to be so with meaningless sufferings,
Such as the feelings of
[Harms from] snakes, insects, hunger, and thirst
And of rashes?
- 6.16 I should not be impatient [207]
With heat and cold, wind and rain, and so forth, and
Sickness, bondage, beatings, and so forth;
For if I am, the harm will increase.
- 6.17 Some when they see their own blood
Become especially brave and steady,
But some when they see the blood of others
Become unconscious and faint.
- 6.18 These come from the states of the mind
Being either steady or timid.
Therefore I should disregard harms
And be unaffected by suffering.
- 6.19 Even when those who are skilled are suffering,
Their minds remain very lucid and undefiled.
When war is waged against the afflictions
Much harm is caused at the time of battle.
- 6.20 The victorious heroes are those
Who, having disregarded all suffering,
Vanquish the foes of hatred and so forth;
The rest slay corpses.
- 6.21 Furthermore, suffering has good qualities:
Through being disheartened with it, arrogance is dispelled,
Compassion arises for those in cyclic existence,
Negativities are shunned, and joy is found in virtue.

The causes of happiness in cyclic existence occur only occasionally, whereas the causes for suffering are very many, whereby the nature of cyclic existence does not pass beyond that. Hence it is reasonable to think of cyclic existence as being the nature of suffering. Without thinking about the suffering of cyclic existence, there is no mind of definite emergence from cyclic existence. Therefore, mind, you should stand firm, it is appropriate to be patient with suffering.

If (1) the followers of Durga, those faithful towards the Goddess Uma who turns away and diminishes the austerities of Ishvara, for the sake of pleasing her, endure suffering feelings of

fasting for one or three days on the ninth day of the middle autumn month and of burning their bodies with fire, cutting them with weapons, and the like, [208] and (2) people such as those of Karnata and so forth, a place in the south [of India], for the sake of competing in strength with each other, endure suffering feelings of cutting their bodies, hands, legs, head, eyes, and so forth meaninglessly, then for the sake of the great purpose of liberating all sentient beings from suffering, why have I no courage to experience suffering? I should bear it without fear.

If I acquaint myself with patience, I will be able to bear suffering too. Since the mode of apprehension of the mind has its root in being acquainted with everything, there is no phenomenon of mind whatsoever that is not made easier through acquaintance. So through willingly accepting small harms, such as heat and cold and harsh speech from others, and cultivating patience, may I come to know patience with even great harms such as the fires of hell.

This is because the *Meeting of Father and Son Sutra* (*Pitaputra-samagamana-sutra*) extensively explains:

The Bhagavan has the meditative stabilization called “All Phenomena Going to Bliss.” Due to obtaining this meditative stabilization, a bodhisattva will experience only blissful feelings in all things that he observes. He will not experience suffering feelings...

...Even though he is harmed by harmers who are hell sentient beings, he will abide in the discrimination of bliss.⁹⁶

And [Lama Tsongkhapa’s] *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*⁹⁷ says:

[209] After you have held the armor-like attitude to willingly accept suffering, you gradually blend it with suffering, starting with small sufferings. When you do this, your strength to accept suffering will grow.

OPINION: Patience through acquainting with small harms has no ability.

RESPONSE: Who has not directly seen that in the case of totally meaningless sufferings, such as the feelings of harms from snakes, insects, hunger, and thirst, and with skin diseases and rashes, they are easy to bear when acquainted with and difficult when unacquainted with? Hence I should acquaint myself with patience.

Therefore, I should not be impatient, that is, have little forbearance, with heat and cold, wind and rain, and so forth, and sickness, bondage with ropes, beatings with sticks, and so forth; for if I act thus towards small harms, then the harm will increase tremendously and my patience will decrease.

Furthermore, some brave beings, when they see the spot where their own blood is oozing out due to having been pierced by others’ weapons, generate hatred and become especially brave and steady, but some timid ones, when they see the blood on the weapons of others, become unconscious and faint. Hence these differences stem not from a single external object

⁹⁶ JN: This phrase has been changed from the original translation.

⁹⁷ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 176, chapter on *The Perfection of Patience*

being powerful or weak, nor from the body being hard or soft; these come from the state of mind being either steady or timid. Therefore, I should make effort in the patience that willingly accepts suffering.

It is just as it has been said by the Foremost Lama [Tsongkhapa in his *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*]⁹⁸:

[210] If you initially develop a significant degree of courage, even great suffering can become helpful. It is just like the case of warriors entering a battle and using the sight of their own blood as a cause to generate courage. If right from the start you belittle yourself, saying, “I have never heard of such a thing, and even if I had heard of it, I could never do something like that,” then even a small suffering becomes a cause for you to turn away from the path. It is just like the case of some coward who sees others’ blood and, fainting, falls unconscious.

Therefore, may I make my mind stable, disregard harms that happen to me, and be unaffected by suffering.

Even when those who are skilled in cultivating the Mahayana path have suffering feelings, acting patiently, their minds remain very lucid and undefiled by anger. When war is waged between the afflictions, such as anger, which are the objects of abandonment, and their antidotes, much harm of suffering is caused at the time of battle. If worldly beings who disregard the suffering of being pierced by weapons and kill their enemies are referred to as heroes, then those who, having disregarded all suffering of body and mind, vanquish the foes that are the afflictions, hatred and so forth, are called “victorious heroes over the afflictions.” Since the killing of beings who will die on their own accord even if they are not killed is similar to piercing weapons into corpses and slaying them, the rest do not deserve to be called “heroes.”

Furthermore, meditating on suffering is a vital and essential practice [211] because the good qualities of contemplating the drawbacks of suffering are: (1) through oneself coming under the power of suffering and becoming disheartened with it, pride and the arrogance of haughtiness are dispelled; (2) when seeing that others are under the power of suffering, compassion arises for those in cyclic existence, thinking, “May they be free from it”; (3) seeing that sufferings are the results of non-virtue, negativities are shunned since one does not wish for suffering; and (4) while not wishing for suffering but wishing for happiness, seeing that it is the result of virtue, joy is found in virtue.

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2A1B. Cultivating the patience of definitely thinking about the Dharma

1. Extensive explanation
2. Summary

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2A1B-1. Extensive explanation

- A. Since anger, the one having anger, and so forth are contingent upon their causes, they lack self-power
- B. Refuting that causes that have self-power exist
- C. The need to counteract anger

⁹⁸ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 176, chapter on *The Perfection of Patience*

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2A1B-1A. Since anger, the one having anger, and so forth are contingent upon their causes, they lack self-power

- 6.22 As I do not become angry
At great sources of suffering such as bile disease,
Then why be angry at those with mind?
They too are provoked by conditions.
- 6.23 For example, although they are not wished for,
These sicknesses arise;
Likewise, although they are not wished for,
These afflictions forcibly arise.
- 6.24 Without thinking, "I shall be angry,"
People become angry with no resistance,
And without thinking, "I shall produce,"
Likewise anger itself is produced.
- 6.25 All misdeeds there are
And all the various kinds of negativities
Arise though the force of conditions;
They do not have self-power.
- 6.26 These conditions that assemble together
Have no intention, "I shall produce,"
And neither does that produced by them
Have the intention, "I will be produced."

[212] OPINION: It is appropriate to get angry due to being harmed by someone else.

RESPONSE: It is inappropriate because, as I do not become angry at great sources of suffering due to imbalance disturbances such as bile disease, then why do I become angry at beings with mind?

OBJECTION: I do not become angry since bile disease and the like arise lacking self-power due to conditions.

RESPONSE: Then it follows that it is inappropriate to become angry at people because all those people who have afflictions also lack self-power due to being provoked by the condition of afflictions. For example, although they are not wished for, these sicknesses arise due to conditions being complete. Likewise, although people do not wish for hatred, these afflictions forcibly arise due to causes such as mental unhappiness. Therefore, if one is to get angry, one should get angry at the afflictions; it is inappropriate to get angry at people.

OBJECTION: Since the other party intends to inflict harm, this is not similar to the case of the afflictions.

RESPONSE: Without anger thinking, "I shall be produced by the causes," people in whom the conditions are complete become angry freely, and likewise, without thinking, "I shall produce afflictions," anger itself is produced. There is no self-power. Alternatively, it is

explained that the first half [of the production] is [due to] the persons, and the other half [due to] the conditions of the afflictions.

Furthermore, all the misdeeds of afflictions that there are and all the various kinds of negativities motivated by them arise though the force of conditions, whereby they do not have self-power. [213] Hence, just as it is inappropriate to get angry at water for flowing downwards, I should stop getting angry by contemplating these reasons. Therefore, these conditions generating suffering, such as afflictions, that assemble together have no intention, “I shall produce this suffering,” and neither does that suffering produced by them have the intention, “I will be produced by that.” Thus it is inappropriate to generate anger by taking as the reason “the other party, the afflictions, intend to inflict harm.”

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2A1B-1B. Refuting that causes that have self-power exist

- 6.27 That which is asserted as the “Principal”
 And that which is imputed as the “Self,”
 Do not arise after having purposefully thought,
 “I shall arise.”
- 6.28 If they are not produced and non-existent,
 What is asserted to be produced at that time?
 Since it would always be distracted to its objects,
 It follows that it will never cease.
- 6.29 If the Self were permanent
 It would obviously be devoid of activity, just like space.
 So even if it were to meet with other conditions
 What could the unchanging do?
- 6.30 Even if, when acted upon, it remains as before,
 Then what did activity do to it?
 If it is said, “This is the activity of that,”
 How could the two ever be related?
- 6.31 Hence all are governed by others,
 And through the power of that, they have no power.
 Having understood in this way, I shall not become angry
 At all things that are like emanations.

It follows that (1) the Principal who possess the five characteristics with the three – activity, darkness, and lightness – in balance, (2) [214] the assertion, “Harms and so forth gathered by the transformations of [the Principal] are produced with self-power,” and (3) that which is imputed to the being of knowledge and cognition as “Self” and imputed to be the utilizer of objects with self-power⁹⁹, are inappropriate because the natures of the Self and the Principal do not arise with self-power after having purposefully thought, “I shall arise for the sake of

⁹⁹ These are assertions of the non-Buddhist Samkhyas.

producing with self-power the experience of objects and transformations.” That which is unable to perform activity is similar to the horns of a rabbit.

It follows that, at that time of producing the result, whatever result that is asserted to be produced from the Principal is inappropriate because that Principal itself is unproduced. There is pervasion because that which, being unproduced itself, does not produce a result is pervaded by being non-existent. Furthermore, it follows that it is not that the being who is a knower and cognizer¹⁰⁰ will never cease in having time to not utilize the objects because, since any thing asserted to be a permanent thing that utilizes objects will always be distracted to its objects, a time when it is not apprehending objects will not be possible.

Also, the Naiyayikas assert a self that has form and is a permanent thing and assert that it produces harm and so forth. If the Self were a permanent thing, it follows that it would obviously and clearly be devoid of the activity to produce results, just like un-compounded space.

OPINION: However, even though its entity is permanent, it produces results upon meeting with conditions.

RESPONSE: The permanent cannot possibly meet with conditions, and even if it were to meet with other conditions such as exertion, what can the conditions do to it? It follows that not the slightest can be done because that Self is unchanging. [215] It follows that there is pervasion because even at the time of being benefited by conditions, the Self does not pass beyond the previous nature of the time when it has not produced the result, and if it does not pass beyond that, then what did the benefit do to the Self? It did not make the slightest difference.

OPINION: Although there is no benefit done in entity, benefit is done in another sense.

RESPONSE: It follows that this is also incorrect because saying, “Acting to produce a result of that Self is this benefit in another sense,” it will be related to the Self, and the Self has no causal relationship with anything.

Therefore, all activities that produce results are governed by others and even those conditions arise through the power of their respective former reason. Hence, having no power to either give rise or not give rise to the result, they are like illusions or emanations. Having understood in this way that all things perform activities while being empty of being inherently established, I shall not become angry at all things that are like emanations. So I should train in realizing the dependent-arising lacking inherent existence that destroys the seeds of the afflictions.

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2A1B-1C. The need to counteract anger

6.32 OPINION: What will counteract it?

Counteraction would also be inappropriate.

RESPONSE: In dependence upon it the continuity of suffering will be severed; It is not inappropriate.

OPINION: If there is not even an atom of inherent establishment, what antidote will counteract the object of abandonment? Since action and agent are not feasible, counteraction would also be inappropriate. [216]

¹⁰⁰ JN: “being of knowledge and cognition” changed to “being who is a knower and cognizer”

RESPONSE: The antidote and the object of abandonment (the wrong conception apprehending the two truths as contradictory that does not know how to posit action and agent with respect to objects that are empty of inherent existence) are empty of inherent establishment. It follows that this is not inappropriate because it is asserted that, in dependence upon the realization that the object of abandonment and the antidote are empty of inherent establishment, all afflictions such as anger will be extinguished. And due to that extinguishment, the continuity of suffering will be severed.

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2A1B-2. Summary

- 6.33 So when seeing an enemy or even a friend
 Doing something incorrect,
 By thinking, “It arises from such conditions,”
 I shall remain in a happy frame of mind.
- 6.34 If things were established with one’s freedom,
 Then since no one wishes to suffer,
 Suffering would not occur
 To any embodied creature.

So when seeing an enemy or even a friend incorrectly causing harm, by thinking, “It arises from conditions of such afflictions lacking self-power in this person, I shall prevent anger, remain in a happy frame of mind without my mental happiness declining, and be patient.”

If results were established with one’s freedom without coming under the power of other conditions, that is, through one’s wishes with self-power, then since no sentient being wishes to suffer, suffering would not occur to any embodied creature. It is just as has been said in [Tsongkhapa’s] *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*¹⁰¹:

If sentient beings had self-power, then they would never suffer [217] because they do not want that suffering, and they would also have power over that.

Hence, anger due to seeing suffering occurring is inappropriate since people lack self-power. You should turn your back on the afflictions.

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2A1C. Cultivating the patience of being indifferent to harm

1. Taking to mind the method of compassion
2. Stopping the cause of anger
3. Contemplating one’s misdeeds when the undesirable arises

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2A1C-1. Taking to mind the method of compassion

- 6.35 Through lacking conscientiousness
 People even harm themselves with thorns and other things,
 And for the sake of obtaining women and the like
 They become obsessed and starve themselves.
- 6.36 And there are some who harm themselves
 By hanging themselves, leaping from cliffs,

¹⁰¹ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 162, chapter on *The Perfection of Patience*

Eating poison and incompatible food,
And unmeritorious deeds.

6.37 If, when under the influence of afflictions,
People will even kill their treasured selves,
How can they not cause harm
To the bodies of others?

6.38 Even if I virtually cannot develop compassion for such people
Who through the arising of afflictions
Set out to kill me and so forth,
The last thing I should do is to become angry with them.

Those people who act to harm others under the influence of afflictions even harm themselves in this and future lives under the influence of afflictions by committing negativities, the causes of bad migrations. Some roll on thorns and jump into precipices for the sake of liberation, and [218] some, for the sake of obtaining women, wealth, and the like, become obsessed, starve themselves out of anger, and so forth. And there are some who harm themselves out of afflictions through hanging themselves, leaping from cliffs, eating poison and incompatible food and performing unmeritorious deeds. How can it be appropriate to get angry on account of others harming me? It is inappropriate.

If, when under the influence of afflictions, people will even kill their treasured and cherished selves, how can they not cause harm to the bodies of others? By holding the position that harm is unsuitable, I should not get angry. The Foremost Tamche Khyenpa [Tsongkhapa] says [in his *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*]¹⁰²:

You should stop your anger by also thinking, “When these people are moved by violent afflictions, they hang themselves, jump into precipices, harm themselves with thorns, weapons, and so forth, and starve themselves and so forth. If they do this to even their greatly cherished and dear selves, what need is there to mention that they will harm others?”

Hence it is fitting of me to be compassionate to such people who through the arising of afflictions as explained above, set out to harm others, kill me, and so forth. And even if I virtually cannot develop compassion for them, the last thing I should do is to become angry with them, for anger is very inappropriate.

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2A1C-2. Stopping the cause of anger

6.39 Even if it were the nature of the childish
To cause harm to other beings,
It would be inappropriate to be angry with them,
For this would be like begrudging fire for having the nature to burn.

6.40 And even if the fault were incidental [219]
In sentient beings of definite nature,

¹⁰² *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 162, chapter on *The Perfection of Patience*

It would be inappropriate to be angry,
For this would be like begrudging space for allowing smoke to rise in it.

- 6.41 If I become angry with the wielder,
Although I am directly harmed by the stick and so forth,
Then since he too is incited by hatred,
I should be angry with the two or with the hatred.

Even if it were the nature of the childish who do not understand what is to be adopted and what is to be discarded, or those who even though they understand these still have strong afflictions, to cause harm to other beings, it would be inappropriate to be angry with them, for this would be like begrudging fire for having the nature to burn and getting angry at it. And even if the fault of harming others were incidental in sentient beings of clever and definite nature, it would be inappropriate to be angry with the harmer, just as it would be inappropriate to begrudge space for allowing smoke to incidentally rise in it and to get angry¹⁰³.

It is just as has been said by the Foremost Tamche Khyenpa [Tsongkhapa in his *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*]¹⁰⁴:

[You will see that anger] is inappropriate when you examine whether [the harm] is incidental or natural. You should stop your anger, thinking, “The fault of doing harm to others is either in or not in the nature of sentient beings. Thus, if it is in their nature, it is inappropriate to get angry, just as it is inappropriate to get angry at fire for being hot and burning. However, if it is incidental, it is also inappropriate to be angry, just as when smoke and the like appear in the sky, it is inappropriate to be angry at the sky on account of the faults of smoke and so forth.”

OPINION: It is appropriate to be angry due to harm by others. [220]

RESPONSE: If I were to become angry with the direct harmer, then since I am directly harmed by the stick, weapon, and so forth, then it is appropriate to be angry with them. But they did not act to harm in self-power because they are wielded by a being. Therefore if I become angry at the wielder, then since he too is incited by hatred without self-power, if I get angry at the two, or at something at all, then I should be angry at the hatred.

It is just as has been said by the Foremost Tamche Khyenpa [Tsongkhapa in his *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*]¹⁰⁵:

[You will see that anger] is inappropriate when you examine whether [the harm] is direct or indirect. If you are angry with the harmer that directly inflicts the harm, then you will have to be angry at the stick and so forth, just as you are at the person. If you are angry at the harmer who indirectly inflicts harm, then, just as

¹⁰³ *skam pa* (which means “dry”) is emended to read *khro ba* in accordance with p. 358 of Thubten Chokyi Dragma’s commentary.

¹⁰⁴ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 162, chapter on *The Perfection of Patience*

¹⁰⁵ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 163, chapter on *The Perfection of Patience*

the stick and so forth is incited by the person, so the person is incited by hatred to do the harm. Therefore, you have to get angry at the hatred.

And:

Hence, if you do not get angry at the stick, then it is inappropriate also to get angry with the wielder; if you get angry with the wielder, then it is appropriate also to get angry at the hatred. Not holding it to be like this signifies that the mind has gone on an unreasonable pathway, therefore induce ascertainment that all forms of the reasoning are parallel and guide your mind towards not getting angry at the person in the same way that you do not get angry at the stick. Furthermore, you should understand that you should not differentiate the stick and the one who wields the stick by whether or not they have a harmful intent through the reasoning refuting self-power taught earlier.

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2A1C-3. Contemplating one's misdeeds when the undesirable arises

A. Actual meaning

B. Rejecting objections

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2A1C-3A. Actual meaning

- 6.42 Previously I caused similar harm
 To sentient beings.
 Therefore it is right for this harm to occur [221]
 To me who is the agent of harm to sentient beings.
- 6.43 Both the weapon and my body
 Are causes of my suffering.
 Since he gave rise to the weapon and I to the body,
 With whom should I be angry?
- 6.44 If in blind attachment I cling
 To this suffering abscess of a human form
 That cannot bear to be touched,
 With whom should I be angry when it is hurt?
- 6.45 The childish do not wish to suffer,
 And are greatly attached to its causes,
 Thus they are harmed by their own misdeeds;
 Why should they begrudge others?
- 6.46 For example, just like the guardians of hell
 And the forest of sword leaves,
 So this is produced by my actions;
 At what should I be angry?
- 6.47 Having been instigated by my own actions,
 Those who cause me harm come into being.

If due to this they should proceed to sentient beings' hell
Am I not destroying them?

6.48 By taking them as objects
I purify much negativity through patience.
But in dependence upon me they will proceed
To hell suffering for a long time.

6.49 So since I am causing harm to them
And they are benefiting me,
Why, unruly mind, do you become angry
Erroneously?

I should be patient, thinking, "Previously, that is, in my past life and so forth, I caused sentient beings harm similar to what has occurred to me. Therefore, it is right for the arising of such harm to now occur to me who is the agent of harm to sentient beings." [Tsongkhapa's] *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*¹⁰⁶ says [222]:

[You will see that anger] is inappropriate when you examine the cause that impelled the harmer. Since the experience of suffering inflicted by the harmer does not occur causelessly or from discordant causes, it occurs from concordant causes, that is, from your own past non-virtuous actions. Therefore, harmers are powerlessly impelled to do harm by the power of your karma. Therefore, blame yourself, thinking, "This is my fault, and it is inappropriate for me to get angry at others," and stop anger in every form.

Furthermore, it is inappropriate to get angry also on account of this reason because both the other party's weapon and my body are causes of my suffering. Since that person thus gave rise to the weapon and I to the body, if both cause my suffering, with whom should I be angry? It is inappropriate to get angry only with the other party. I must contemplate just as has been taught in *Instructions on the Path, Sacred Words of Manjushri*:

Furthermore, when water above falls down as rain, neither passes beyond being wet and moistening. Likewise, since both my body and the weapon are causes of suffering, what can be more fitting than them afflicting pain?

If I cling to this body that is like a suffering abscess of a human form that cannot bear to be touched even slightly and so forth, and I hold on to it with my eye of intelligence blinded by ignorance, I should think, "Since even a thorn can destroy it, with whom should I be angry when it is hurt? It is my own fault."

The childish do not wish to suffer, and are greatly attached to and crave the causes of suffering, such as killing. [223] Thus, projected by their own misdeeds, they are harmed as a consequence, so why should they begrudge others? [My suffering] is caused only by my misdeeds. For example, just as the inflicting of suffering upon me by the guardians of hell and

¹⁰⁶ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 163, chapter on *The Perfection of Patience*

the forest of sword leaves is not done purposely by others and I do not get angry at them since they are produced by my actions, so since likewise the harm in this life is produced by my actions, at what should I be angry? Since [the suffering is caused by] only my misdeeds, henceforth I should make effort at abandoning the causes of suffering.

Furthermore, having been instigated by my own past non-virtuous actions, other persons who cause me harm in this life come into being. I cry out to my mind, "If due to this harm to me these persons should proceed to sentient beings' hell, am I not destroying these persons? I destroyed them."

Moreover, by taking these persons as objects of observation of patience, I purify much negativity through cultivating patience. But in dependence upon me these persons will proceed to hell where suffering will last for a long time. So, since I am causing harm to these enemies and they are benefiting me, why, unruly mind, do you erroneously cultivate anger at what causes benefit and become angry? You should be joyful instead.

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2A1C-3B. Rejecting objections

6.50 If I have the excellent quality of thought,
 I will not go to hell. [224]
 If I am protecting myself,
 How will they accrue [merit] here?

6.51 Nevertheless, should I return the harm
 It will not protect them either.
 By doing so my conduct will deteriorate
 And hence this fortitude will be destroyed.

OPINION: With others' negativities acting as a condition, even I will go to hell.

RESPONSE: If I have patience, that is, the excellent quality thinking, "This benefits me," then I will not go to hell and I will purify my negativities.

OBJECTION: Since the other party is exhausting the results of my negativity and benefiting me, he too will not go to hell.

RESPONSE: If I am protecting myself from negativity through cultivating patience towards the harmers, how will those persons accrue merit here? For, without creating virtuous actions, they caused only harm.

OPINION: If the harmers caused benefit [by harming me], then it is appropriate also for me to return the harm.

RESPONSE: Nevertheless, should I return the harm it will not protect the harmers either. By doing so my conduct of commitment to cultivate the four qualities of trainees-in-virtue¹⁰⁷, love, and compassion will deteriorate and hence even the supreme fortitude of patience will be destroyed.

- when other get angry at us, to not get angry at them,
- when others beat us, to not beat them,

¹⁰⁷ Even when derided, do not deride in return. Even when someone gets angry at one, do not get angry in return. Even when hit, do not hit back. Even when one's faults are exposed, do not expose others' faults.

- when others deride us, to not deride them,
- when others point out our faults, to not point out their faults.

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2A2. Being patient at contempt and so forth that are caused

- A. Contempt, reproach,¹⁰⁸ and the like do not harm my body
- B. Inappropriateness of me getting angry with persons related to anger
- C. Inappropriateness of getting angry due to hindrances to gain
- D. Inappropriateness of getting angry due to others' lack of faith in me [225]

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2A2A. Contempt, reproach, and the like do not harm my body

6.52 Since my mind is not physical
 In no way can anyone destroy it.
 Through it strongly adhering to my body,
 My body is harmed by suffering.

6.53 Since contempt, harsh speech,
 And unpleasant words
 Do not cause any harm to my body,
 Why, mind, do you become so angry?

If I were to guard my mind, since my mind is not physical, then in no way can anything, harsh speech, weapons, and so forth, destroy it.

OPINION: Through conceptualization strongly adhering to my body, my body is harmed by suffering, whereby I get angry.

RESPONSE: Since contempt, harsh speech, and unpleasant words directed at me by others do not cause even the slightest harm to my body, why, mind, do you become so angry?

The Foremost Lama [Tsongkhapa] says [in his *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*]¹⁰⁹:

Stop your mental unhappiness by thinking, “Since the mind is not physical, it cannot be directly harmed by others. If the mind were to be indirectly harmed due to the body being directly harmed, then since the body cannot be harmed by contempt, harsh speech, and unpleasant words, these can harm neither body nor mind, so I should be happy.” When you prevent [mental unhappiness], you will not generate hatred.

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2A2B. Inappropriateness of me getting angry with persons related to anger

6.54 If others' disliking me
 Will not devour me
 Either in this or in another life,
 Why do I not want it?

¹⁰⁸ *Slong* in the Tibetan seems to be a scribing error, and is emended to read *smod* instead.

¹⁰⁹ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 168, chapter on *The Perfection of Patience*

[226] If others' disliking me will not harm and devour me either in this or in another life, why do I not want it and instead act to establish the cause of meaningless suffering? Not wanting it is inappropriate. Thus the Foremost Lama [Tsongkhapa] says [in his *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*]¹¹⁰:

OBJECTION: When someone has contempt and so forth for me, other people will not like me, so I am unhappy about it.

RESPONSE: This would have some truth if others' dislike were to harm you. However, since their dislike does nothing to you, give up your unhappiness.

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2A2C. Inappropriateness of getting angry due to hindrances to gain

- 6.55 Because it will hinder my gain,
 I do not want this.
 I shall discard my gains here
 And my negativities will remain securely.
- 6.56 Thus it is better that I die today
 Than live a long time through wrong livelihood.
 Even if I should live a long time,
 There will be the very suffering of death.
- 6.57 Suppose someone should awaken from a dream
 In which he experienced one hundred years of happiness,
 And suppose another should awaken from a dream
 In which he experienced just a short while of happiness,
- 6.58 For both of these people who have awakened
 That happiness will never return.
 Similarly, whether my life has been long or short,
 At the time of death it will be finished like that.
- 6.59 Although I may acquire abundant gain
 And enjoy happiness for a long time,
 I shall go forth naked and empty-handed,
 Just like having been robbed.
- 6.60 OPINION: If I were to live due to gain,
 Then I shall exhaust negativities and [increase] merit.
 RESPONSE: If I were to get angry on account of gain,
 Will not my merit be consumed and negativities created?
- 6.61 If my very life were to degenerate
 For the sake of that,
 Then what will be the use of the life

¹¹⁰ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 168, chapter on *The Perfection of Patience*

Of one who commits only negativities?

[227] OPINION: Because contempt, reproach, and the like will hinder my gain, I do not want these three, contempt and so forth¹¹¹.

RESPONSE: I shall quickly discard my gains in this life for whose purpose I have cultivated anger and my negativities of anger alone will remain securely in my continuum. So it is better not to accomplish gain; anger is inappropriate.

Thus it is better that I die today without gain than live a long time in dependence on wrong livelihood in which I acquire gain while getting angry at others. Even if someone such as I should live a long time, eventually all will be discarded and there will be no escape from the very suffering of death.

For example, suppose someone should awaken from a dream in which he dreamt of experiencing one hundred years of happiness, and suppose another should awaken from a dream in which he dreamt of experiencing just a short while of happiness. For both of these people at the time of having awakened, that happiness will never return. Similarly, whether I enjoy happiness in a long life or a short life, at the time of death both will become merely objects of memory and be finished like that, hence craving for gain is inappropriate.

The Foremost Tamche Khyenpa [Tsongkhapa in his *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*]¹¹² says:

OBJECTION: Indeed I am not harmed by their dislike, but in dependence on it I may be hindered in acquiring gain, so I shall get angry at those who have contempt for me, reproach me, or say unpleasant words to me.

RESPONSE: Even if you acquire gain, you must leave it behind here. [228] At the time of death, it is the same whether you have enjoyed happiness for the past hundred years or enjoyed it for merely one year, for both are nothing but mere objects of memory and at that time there is no difference of happiness or suffering. For example, the experience of happiness for one hundred years and the experience of a bit of happiness in a dream do not differ in happiness or unhappiness at the time of waking. If, contemplating in this way, you turn away from attachment to gain and honor, you will not become unhappy with contempt, unpleasant words, and the like. Since you have no interest in being special in the eyes of others, your mental happiness will not be turned away even if that is not accomplished.

Furthermore, although I may acquire abundant gain and enjoy happiness for a long time, at the time of death I must go forth naked (since I will be without clothing) and will be empty-handed (since I will be without wealth), just as though I had been robbed.

OPINION: If I were to live for a long time due to gain, then I shall accomplish gain for the sake of exhausting negativities through the four powers and increasing merit.

¹¹¹ The three are: contempt, reproach, and unpleasant words.

¹¹² *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 169, chapter on *The Perfection of Patience*

RESPONSE: If I were to get angry on account of gain, will not my merit accumulated over many eons be consumed and negativities created? If that is so, and if my very life, that is, if I myself, were to degenerate for the sake of that purpose, then what would be the use of the life of one who commits only negativities? It would be purposeless.

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2A2D. Inappropriateness of getting angry due to others' lack of faith in me

6.62 Since sentient beings will be weakened,
 I shall be angry with those who say unpleasant things.
 Why are you not likewise angry
 With those who say unpleasant things to other people? [229]

6.63 If you are patient with this lack of faith
 Because it is related to others' non-faith,
 Then why are you not patient with unpleasant words
 Since they are related to the arising of afflictions?

OBJECTION: Although anger at those who hinder my gain is inappropriate, if someone were to say unpleasant things to me, since the faith of sentient beings who have faith in me will be weakened, I shall be angry with those who say unpleasant things to me.

RESPONSE: If you get angry with those who cause others' virtues to degenerate, then why are you not likewise angry with those who say unpleasant things to other people because that too causes the virtue of faith in others to degenerate? If, without anger, you are patient with the utterance of unpleasant things to other people and the lack of faith in others because the object of observation – the non-faith in other sentient beings – is related to other people, then why, mind, are you not patient with unpleasant words said to yourself? It follows that patience is appropriate since they are related to the arising of afflictions of others.

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2B. Stopping anger at misdeeds committed against one's friends

1. Stopping anger through the patience that definitely thinks about the Dharma
2. Stopping anger through the patience that is indifferent to harm

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2B1. Stopping anger through the patience that definitely thinks about the Dharma

6.64 Should others talk frivolously about or even destroy
 Holy images, reliquaries, and the sacred Dharma,
 My hatred is inappropriate,
 For the buddhas and so forth can never be harmed.

6.65 I should counteract anger towards those
 Who harm my spiritual masters, relatives and so forth, and friends,
 By seeing, as in the manner shown before,
 That they arise from conditions.

[230] OPINION: Anger at harm to oneself is inappropriate, but there is no misdeed in getting angry at harm to the Three Jewels.

RESPONSE: Should others verbally talk frivolously about, criticize, or even physically destroy holy images of the buddhas, reliquaries of great enlightenment, and so forth, and the sacred Dharma, my hatred is inappropriate, for the Three Jewels, the buddhas and so forth, can

never be harmed and I should be merciful since the harmers are objects of compassion. It means that [anger] will not arise from the condition of a painful mind due to mental unhappiness with respect to the Three Jewels.

Further, anger is inappropriate when I see others harming my spiritual masters who teach me the Dharma, relatives of my time, and so forth, and friends; I should counteract anger by seeing, as in the manner shown before, that they, incited by past inappropriate actions committed by my relatives and so forth, arise from conditions of past karma.

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2B2. Stopping anger through the patience that is indifferent to harm

A. Inappropriateness of anger at only those with mind and contemplating one's own misdeeds

B. Contemplating the benefits of patience

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2B2A. Inappropriateness of anger at only those with mind and contemplating one's own misdeeds

6.66 If embodied creatures are harmed
By both those with mind and those without mind,
Why single out and begrudge only those with mind?
Therefore I should be patient with harm.

6.67 Should one person do harm out of confusion
And another is confused and gets angry,
Then who would be without fault?
And who would be at fault? [231]

6.68 Why did I previously commit those actions
Because of which others now cause harm?
If all are related to my actions
Why should I begrudge them?

6.69 Having seen thus, no matter what,
I should strive in this way for what is meritorious,
That all will have
Loving thoughts towards each other.

If embodied creatures such as my relatives are alike in being harmed by both those with mind such as enemies and those without mind such as weapons, why only observe and single out those with mind, begrudge them, and be aggressive toward them? It is inappropriate. Therefore, through patience with harm to my relatives, I shall destroy [anger].

The reason why anger is inappropriate is as follows. Should one person do harm such as killing out of confusion regarding karma and its results, and another is confused about the drawbacks of anger and gets angry, then, of the two, who would be without fault? And who would be at fault? Since both are similar in having fault, getting angry in response to harm is inappropriate.

Why did I previously commit those actions because of which others now cause harm? If all harms that occur to me needlessly arise through being related to my bad actions, why should I begrudge the other party?

Having seen thus that all harms and sufferings arise from karma, no matter what I should strive in this way for what is meritorious, such as compassion, thinking, "If only there will be

a time when all sentient beings have loving thoughts towards each other! I shall make it so.”
[232]

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2B2B. Contemplating the benefits of patience

- 6.70 For example, if a fire in one house
Has moved into another house,
It is right to remove and get rid of straw and such things
That the fire will spread to.
- 6.71 Likewise when my mind is attached to something
And the fire of hatred spreads,
I should immediately get rid of it
For fear of my merit being burned.
- 6.72 Is it not excellent if a man condemned to death
Is released after having his hand cut off?
Is it not excellent if I am spared from hell
By way of human suffering?
- 6.73 If I cannot endure
Even just this suffering of the present,
Then why do I not refrain from getting angry,
The cause of suffering in hell?
- 6.74 For the sake of my desires
I experienced thousands [of eons] in hell,
But I enacted the purpose
Of neither others nor myself.
- 6.75 But now since great purpose will be established
From harm which is not as much,
I should be solely joyful
Towards such suffering that dispels the harms of migrating beings.

For example, if a fire that is burning one house has moved into another house, and will burn up the house along with its valuables by spreading to straw, wood, and such things, then it is right to remove and get rid of the straw and such things for the sake of protecting the house along with its valuables. Attachment [to the straw and such things] is inappropriate.

Likewise, when my mind is attached to something, such as my relatives, and the fire of hatred spreads due to the condition of their being harmed, [233] I should immediately get rid of the basis of attachment for fear of my virtuous merit being burned. Attachment is inappropriate.

[Aryasura's] *Garland of Birth Stories (Jatakamala)* says:

*If hatred is present in the mind, like fire
It will strongly burn up what will benefit oneself and others.*

Hence, those beings who shun negativities
Should abandon negativities by depending on their antidotes.

OPINION: If I am separated from my friends and relatives, then I will experience suffering.

RESPONSE: Is it not excellent if a man condemned to death is released after having his hand cut off? It is excellent. Likewise, is it not excellent if I am spared the sufferings of hell by way of merely human suffering, hunger and thirst? It is appropriate to avert great suffering by willingly accepting small ones. It is just as has been said in [Lama Tsongkhapa's] *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*¹¹³:

Contemplate the benefit of dispelling immeasurable suffering as follows. Reflect well on the differences between short-term and long-term suffering, thinking, "A man who is to be executed is overjoyed when he is freed from execution after having merely his fingers cut off. Likewise, how excellent it would be if similarly, by means of this slight suffering of human hardship, I could permanently dispel the suffering of endless cyclic existence in general and in particular the suffering of the bad migrations such as the hells." If you do this well, you will produce the courage of fearlessness with respect to hardships.

OPINION: I cannot endure just this suffering of the present. [234]

RESPONSE: If I cannot endure even just this suffering of the present, such as hunger and thirst, and being slightly pierced by weapons, then thus why do I not make effort at refraining from getting angry, the cause of suffering in hell? It is just as has been said by the Foremost Lama [Tsongkhapa in his *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*]¹¹⁴:

[You will see that] anger is inappropriate when you examine the subject. It is contradictory if you get angry with a harmer due to not bearing the suffering because, by not bearing the slight suffering in the present, you are eagerly creating the cause of boundless suffering in the bad migrations. Therefore, induce a sense of embarrassment, thinking, "I am very stupid," and make effort not to lose your temper.

For the sake of my desires of craving for erroneous objects in the past, I engaged in negative actions and experienced thousands of eons of suffering in hell, such as being burnt, but I enacted the purpose of neither myself nor others even slightly. But now, since this hardship at the time of accomplishing others' welfare will establish great purpose in dependence on harm which is not as much, I should be solely joyful by willingly accepting the suffering of hardship that dispels all the harms of migrating beings.

The Foremost Tamche Khyenpa [Tsongkhapa] says [in his *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*]¹¹⁵:

¹¹³ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 175, chapter on *The Perfection of Patience*

¹¹⁴ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 164, chapter on *The Perfection of Patience*

¹¹⁵ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 175, chapter on *The Perfection of Patience*

Therefore, having reflected on how you have previously created only hardship that accomplished neither your own nor others' welfare, uplift your mind, thinking, "Why do I not now bear a suffering that achieves great purpose? Thus, although I am suffering, excellently I have found something like this to do." [235] Moreover, develop fearlessness towards hardship, thinking how you were misled by bad teachers to negative meaningless paths whereon you endured austerities such as leaping on a trident and relying upon the five fires, and how for the sake of inferior mundane purposes you made yourself endure many sufferings in farming, business, war, and the like.

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2C. Stopping anger at good done towards one's enemies

1. Abandoning intolerance toward the enemy being praised and accomplishing reputation
2. Abandoning intolerance toward the enemy accomplishing happiness
3. Abandoning intolerance toward the enemy accomplishing gain

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2C1. Abandoning intolerance toward the enemy being praised and accomplishing reputation

- 6.76 Should others find joyous happiness
 By praising someone having excellent qualities,
 Why, mind, do you not praise him too
 And be joyful?
- 6.77 That joyous happiness of yours
 Is a source of joy without misdeed,
 Permitted by those having excellent qualities
 And is also a supreme means for gathering others.
- 6.78 Furthermore, it is said that others will be happy in this way.
 If you do not want this happiness,
 Then you should stop giving wages and the like.
 Thus you would be adversely affected both in this and future lives.
- 6.79 When people describe my own good qualities
 I want others to be happy too,
 But when they describe the good qualities of others
 I do not even wish them to be happy.

[236] Should other people find mental joyous happiness by praising my enemy, saying, "You have excellent qualities," why, mind of mine, do you not praise the enemy too and be joyful just like those people?

Hence, this joyous happiness of yours toward others' excellent qualities is a source of future joy without misdeed, is permitted and praised by the Victors and their children having excellent qualities, and is also a supreme means for gathering other disciples.

Furthermore, it is said, "By praising others, others who are objects of praise will also be happy in this way." If you do not want this happiness through praising others, then you must stop giving wages to your servants and the like since they will be happy. Thus, because of stopping that, you would be adversely affected both in this and future lives, since in this life your servants will not work and in future lives you will not experience happiness.

When people describe my own good qualities I want others, those who praise me, to have mental happiness too, but I do not wish even those who describe the good qualities of others to be happy. This is inappropriate and contradictory, whereby just as I wish others joy due to I myself being praised, likewise I should be joyful [due to] others being praised.

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2C2. Abandoning intolerance toward the enemy accomplishing happiness

6.80 Having generated the mind of enlightenment
 Through wishing all sentient beings to be happy,
 Why do you become angry
 If sentient beings find happiness themselves?

[237] Having generated the mind of enlightenment through wishing to place all sentient beings in unsurpassed happiness, you made the commitment to train in the deeds. Then why do you now become angry due to sentient beings finding just a little happiness themselves and fulfilling their desires? You should be joyful.

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-2C3. Abandoning intolerance toward the enemy accomplishing gain

6.81 If I wish for all sentient beings to become
 Buddhas worshipped by the three worlds,
 They why am I tormented
 Due to seeing them receiving just vile gain and honor?

6.82 If relatives for whom you are caring
 And to whom you practice giving
 Are able to find their own livelihood,
 Would you not be happy, rather than angry?

6.83 What [kind of person] wishes enlightenment for migrating beings
 If he does not wish for them to have even this?
 And where is there a mind of enlightenment
 In him who becomes angry at the wealth of others?

6.84 Whether he obtains it from him
 Or whether it remains in the benefactor's house,
 In either case you shall get nothing.
 What is the use whether he is given something or not?

6.85 So why do I throw away my good qualities,
 Merit and faith?
 Tell me, why am I not angry
 For not holding what will be gain?

6.86 Not only do you not have any sorrow
 For having committed negativities,
 Do you wish to compete with others
 Who have created merit?

If I made the commitment and promised, “I wish for all sentient beings to become buddhas who are objects worshipped by the three worlds,” then why am I tormented due to seeing these sentient beings receiving just vile gain and honor? My own desires are being partially fulfilled. [238] If relatives for whom you are caring and to whom you must practice giving are able to find their livelihood without you having to give them things, would you not be happy, rather than angry? You should be happy.

What kind of person wishes for sentient beings to attain enlightenment if he does not wish for migrating beings to have even the meager possessions of food, clothing, and the like? And where is there a mind of enlightenment that wishes to place all migrating beings in enlightenment in him who becomes angry at the trivial wealth of others? Since my mind of enlightenment will degenerate, with effort I must abandon jealousy towards the gain and honor of others.

Whether the enemy obtains food, clothing, and the like from a benefactor or whether it remains in the benefactor’s house, in either case it is the same, you shall get nothing. What is the use of jealousy whether he is given something or not? It is inappropriate.

If I am angry at the gain of others and wish gain for myself, then, since the causes for the arising of gain are my excellent qualities, such as merit, conduct [causing] faith in householders or morality, and hearing [of the Dharma], so why, through anger, do I throw them away? Tell me, why am I not angry with myself for not holding the cause¹¹⁶ that will find me gain and for destroying it?

Not only do you not have any sorrow for having committed past negativities, the cause for not finding gain, do you wish to compete with others who have created merit previously and to be jealous while lacking tolerance? Doing so is inappropriate.

[239] The second section (Tibetan: *bam bo*):

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-3. Stopping anger at hindrances to one's desires

A. Inappropriateness of intolerance towards hindrances to harm occurring to the enemy

B. Inappropriateness of intolerance towards hindrances to oneself and one's side being benefited

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-3A. Inappropriateness of intolerance towards hindrances to harm occurring to the enemy

6.87 Even if your enemy is not joyful,
What is there for you to be joyful about?
Your mind merely wishing
Did not cause him to be harmed.

6.88 Even if his suffering is established due to your wish,
What is there for you to be joyful about?
OPINION: I shall be satisfied.
RESPONSE: How could there be anything more ravaging than that?

6.89 Having been held by this unbearable and sharp hook
Cast by the fisherman of the afflictions,
It is certain that I shall be cooked
In the pots of sentient beings’ hell by the hell guardians.

¹¹⁶ *Kyu* is emended to read *rgyu* in accordance with p. 382 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

OPINION: I shall be happy if harm were to occur to my enemy, and I shall be angry at hindrances to it.

RESPONSE: Even if your enemy is not joyful and is unhappy, what is there for you to be joyful about? For you are not benefited and you are harmed. Your mind merely wishing, “If only harm were to occur to my enemy,” did not cause him to be harmed. Since your desired aim was not even slightly fulfilled, anger is inappropriate.

Even if the suffering of the other party is established due to your wishing, “May my enemy be ruined,” what is there for you to be joyful about? For there is not the slightest benefit.

OPINION: If harm occurs to my enemy, since my wishes are fulfilled, I shall be satisfied. [240]

RESPONSE: How could there be anything more ravaging than generating that violent harmful intent? For you will proceed to the bad migrations.

For example, fishermen catch fish with iron hooks and then cook them. Likewise, I shall definitely be caught by this unbearable and sharp iron hook of the negative action of violent harmful intent cast by the fisherman of the affliction hatred. Having been held by it, it is certain that I shall be put into the pots or cauldrons of sentient beings’ hell by the hell guardians and then cooked. The Great Jamgon Lama Tsongkhapa says [in his *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*]¹¹⁷:

Just your negative thought that delights in your enemies’ misfortunes and thinks, “If only they were destroyed,” does not harm your enemy; they lead only to your own suffering. Even if such a negative thought were to harm them, you should stop it in every way, reflecting on the drawback that it would ravage yourself and others.

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-3B. Inappropriateness of intolerance towards hindrances to oneself and one’s side being benefited

1. Inappropriateness of intolerance towards hindrances to worldly concerns
2. Inappropriateness of intolerance towards hindrances to merit

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-3B1. Inappropriateness of intolerance towards hindrances to worldly concerns

- A. Inappropriateness of intolerance towards hindrances to one’s praises and reputation
- B. Contemplating the benefits

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-3B1A. Inappropriateness of intolerance towards hindrances to one’s praises and reputation

6.90 The honor of praise and fame
 Will turn into neither merit nor life;
 It will turn into neither strength nor freedom from sickness for me,
 And also will not transform into physical happiness.

6.91 If I were to understand my welfare,
 What is there in them that is my welfare?
 If I desire just mental happiness,
 Then I should devote myself to gambling and so forth, and also drinking.

¹¹⁷ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 171, chapter on *The Perfection of Patience*

- 6.92 If for the sake of fame [241]
I lose my wealth or get myself killed,
What can mere words do then?
Once I am dead, to whom will they give pleasure?
- 6.93 When their sandcastles collapse,
Children howl in despair;
Likewise when my praise and reputation decline
My mind becomes like a child.
- 6.94 Since short-lived sounds are without mind,
They cannot possibly think of praising me.
It makes others happy,
That fame is counted as a cause of joy.
- 6.95 Whether this praise is directed at myself or someone else
How shall I be benefited by others' joy?
Since that joy is theirs alone
I shall not obtain even a part of it.
- 6.96 If I am happy due to his happiness,
Then I must act similarly towards all.
And if this were so then why am I unhappy
When others are happy due to joy?
- 6.97 Therefore the happiness that arises
From thinking, "I am being praised,"
Is thus incorrect;
It is only the behavior of the childish.

OPINION: If my praise and fame are hindered, I shall be unhappy.

RESPONSE: The honor of explicit praise and hidden fame will turn into neither merit nor life from among the five objects¹¹⁸ desired by beings. It will turn into neither the cause for developing my strength nor the cause for freedom from sickness, and also will not transform into physical happiness.

Hence, if I were to understand how to analyze what will become my welfare and what will not, then what is there in praise and fame that is my welfare? There is not the slightest in them. [242] If my desired aim is just mental happiness, then I must devote myself to gambling, singing, dancing, others' women, and so forth, and also drinking.

Thus, not only are they just meaningless, but also if for the sake of the fame of magnanimity I give my wealth exhaustively, or out of the desire for fame as a hero I engage in

¹¹⁸ *Brijod pa* (which means "expression") is emended to read *dnngos bo* in accordance with p. 385 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa's commentary.

battle and get myself killed, then what can mere words of praise and fame do then? Once I am dead, to whom will praise and fame give pleasure? I should reflect on this well.

For example, when their sandcastles collapse, children howl in despair; likewise when my praise and reputation decline, out of unhappiness my mind becomes like a child. It is just as has been said in [Tsongkhapa's] *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*¹¹⁹ :

When others praise you and spread your fame, it serves neither of two purposes: for this life it does not bring you long life, freedom from sickness, and the like, and for future lives it does not produce the attainment of merit and so forth. Therefore, do not be attached to fame and praise, but reproach yourself by thinking, "My unhappiness when they decline is no different from when small children cry upon the collapse of their sandcastles, which lack any of the requisites of a dwelling."

Furthermore, if I am happy due to praise directed at me, then I should not be happy at short-lived sounds of praise. Since they are without mind and cannot possibly think, "We should praise him," being happy at them is inappropriate.

[OBJECTION:] But when I am praised, it makes others, the ones making the praise, happy. [243]

[RESPONSE:] If that joy of those making the fame and praise is counted as a cause of my joy, then whether this praise is directed at myself or someone else how shall I be benefited by the joy of others who make the praise? For, since that joy in others' continua is a mind of theirs alone, I shall not obtain even a part of it.

If because of the happiness of the one who makes the praises, I am happy due to the happiness of another, then I must act similarly towards all beings in being happy due to their joy. And if this were necessarily so, then why am I unhappy when, due to the joy of others, that is, of those who praise my enemies, others are happy? I must be mentally happy.

Therefore, if I analyze the happiness that arises in my continuum from thinking, "I am being praised by others," then, since it lacks even the slightest essence, such mere praise is thus incorrect as a cause of joy. This joy is only the behavior of the childish.

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-3B1B. Contemplating the benefits

- 6.98 Praise and the like distract me
And also destroy my disillusionment.
I start to envy those who have excellent qualities
And success is destroyed.
- 6.99 Therefore, are not those who are closely involved
In destroying my praise and the like
Also engaged in protecting me
From falling into the unfortunate realms?

¹¹⁹ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 167, chapter on *The Perfection of Patience*

6.100 I who seek freedom
Do not need to be bound by material gain and honor.
So why should I be angry
With those who free me from this bondage?

6.101 Why should I be angry
At the very doors that do not let me in,
Which are like buddhas bestowing blessings
To those who wish to enter the chamber of suffering?

[244] I should not get angry with those who destroy my praise and fame because gaining praise, fame, and the like distract me from the objects of virtue, whereby they also destroy my disillusionment with respect to cyclic existence. I start to envy others who have excellent qualities, and my virtues and the success of others are destroyed. Hence [praise, fame, and the like] are the sources of all misdeeds. The Foremost Great Being [Tsongkhapa] says [in his *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*]¹²⁰:

Develop disheartenment for [praise and the like], thinking, “Praise and the like distract my mind with the meaningless, destroy my disillusionment with cyclic existence, make me jealous of those who have excellent qualities, and cause my virtuous activities to degenerate.”

Therefore, are not those persons who are closely involved in destroying my praise, fame, and the like also engaged in protecting me from falling into the unfortunate realms? Why do I get angry with them? Furthermore, I who seek freedom from cyclic existence do not need to be bound through being chained to cyclic existence by material gain and honor. So why should I be angry with those who act as hindrances to them and free me from this bondage? I should be happy.

Also, why should I be angry at the very doors that do not let me into the chamber of suffering, which are like buddhas bestowing blessings on those who wish to enter the chamber of suffering? Since they are my great friends, I should be happy. [245]

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-3B2. Inappropriateness of intolerance towards hindrances to merit

- A. Thinking of them as not being hindrances
- B. Thinking of them as objects to be respected

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-3B2A. Thinking of them as not being hindrances

6.102 Saying, “This hinders my merit,”
With him too it is incorrect to be angry.
If there is no fortitude similar to patience
Should I not abide in that?

6.103 If by my own fault
I am not patient with this,
Then it is only I myself hindering

¹²⁰ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 167, chapter on *The Perfection of Patience*

Involvement in the cause of merit.

- 6.104 If without it something does not occur
And if with it, it does come to be,
Then since this would be the cause of it,
How can I call it “a hindrance”?
- 6.105 A beggar who came at the time
Was not a hindrance to generosity,
And I cannot say that those who give ordination
Are hindrances to becoming ordained.

It is inappropriate to get angry at hindrances to worldly things, but if I were to get angry, saying, “This enemy hinders my merit of generosity, ethics, and so forth,” then with him too it is incorrect to be angry. When seeking merit, if there is no other fortitude similar and equal to the cultivation of patience¹²¹ when seeking merit, should I not abide in that patience? It is very correct to abide in it. If by my own fault of strong anger I am not patient with this enemy, if I get angry at this involvement in the cause of merit of being patient with this enemy, then it is only I myself who am hindering merit, not the other party. [246]

Not only that, if without the harmer, the merit of patience does not occur, and if with the enemy who is the harmer, the merit of patience does come to be, then since this very enemy would be the cause that definitely accompanies that merit, how can I call him “a hindrance”? It is incorrect that the cause of benefit is a hindrance.

It is just as, for example, a beggar, who came at the time when I had something and was keen to give it away, was not a hindrance to generosity, and I cannot say that the abbot and acharya who give ordination to those who wish to be ordained are hindrances to becoming ordained.

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-3B2B. Thinking of them as objects to be respected

1. Since they cause excellent qualities to be produced, they should be respected
2. They should be respected due to faith in the Teacher

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-3B2B-1. Since they cause excellent qualities to be produced, they should be respected

- 6.106 There are indeed beggars in this world,
But rare are those who inflict harm;
If I have not harmed others
Few beings will cause me harm.
- 6.107 Therefore, just like a treasure appearing in my house
Idly without me accomplishing it,
I should be happy at the enemy
For he assists me in my deeds of enlightenment.

¹²¹ *Khro ba bzod pa* is emended to read *bzod pa sgom pa* in accordance with p. 390 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa's commentary.

- 6.108 Because I am able to practice this,
He is worthy of being the very first to be given
The fruit of my patience,
For in this way he is the cause of it.
- 6.109 OBJECTION: Why should this enemy be venerated,
Since he has no intention for me to practice patience?
RESPONSE: Then why venerate the sacred Dharma
That is a fit cause for practice?
- 6.110 OBJECTION: Since he intends to cause me harm,
He is not to be venerated. [247]
RESPONSE: If, like a doctor, someone strives to benefit me,
Then how can I practice patience?
- 6.111 Thus since patience is produced
In dependence upon a very hateful mind,
He is a cause of patience,
Whereby he is worthy of veneration just like the sacred Dharma.
- 6.112 Therefore the Muni taught
The field of sentient beings and the so-called “field of Victors.”
Many who have pleased them
Have thereby reached perfection.
- 6.113 A buddha’s qualities are accomplished
From sentient beings and the Victors alike,
So what kind of system is it that
I do not respect sentient beings in the same way I respect the Victors?
- 6.114 They are not similar in the excellent qualities of their intentions
But in the results.
Sentient beings also have excellent qualities
And they are therefore equal.
- 6.115 Whatever veneration of one with a loving mind
Is the greatness of sentient beings.
Whatever merit of faith in the buddhas
Is the greatness of buddhas.
- 6.116 Therefore, they are asserted to be equal
In the share they have in establishing a buddha’s qualities.
They are not equal with the buddhas
Who are boundless oceans of excellence.

- 6.117 Even if the three realms were offered
For the sake of venerating
Some person in whom a mere share of the good qualities
Of the unique Assembly of Supreme Excellent Qualities appears, it would be little.
- 6.118 Thus since sentient beings have a share
In giving rise to the supreme qualities of the buddhas,
It is correct to venerate sentient beings
Due to similarity through just these.

[248] From among the fields of generosity, the field of patience is rare, therefore I should be joyful at it. There are indeed beggars that are the field of generosity in this world, but rare is the field of patience who inflicts harm. Why? If I have not harmed others, few beings will cause me harm. The field of patience is rare, therefore, just like a treasure appearing in my house idly without me accomplishing it, with the attitude of acknowledging the enemy as my support, I should be happy for he assists me in my deeds of enlightenment in cultivating my patience.

Because I am able to practice this patience in dependence on this enemy, both are included in the cause of patience. Hence this harmer is worthy of being the very first to be given and dedicated enlightenment, the fruit of my patience, for in this way the enemy is the powerful cause of patience that accomplishes my enlightenment.

OBJECTION: Since this enemy has no intention thinking, “You should practice patience in your continuum,” why should this enemy be venerated?

RESPONSE: Then why venerate the sacred Dharma Jewel that is a fit cause for practicing virtue? It follows that it is not an object of veneration because it has no intention thinking, “I shall produce virtue.”

OBJECTION: That is not the same for, since the enemy intends to cause me harm, he is not to be venerated.

RESPONSE: If, like a doctor, someone strives to benefit me, whereby he is not an object of patience, then how can I practice the patience of being indifferent to harm? Therefore, I should be joyful at the harmers. [249]

Patience will not be completed in dependence on a mind of benefit. Thus since patience is produced in dependence upon a harmer through a very hateful mind, that very harmer is the cause of patience, whereby he is worthy of veneration just like the sacred Dharma even though a mind of benefit is absent. I must respect sentient beings. Therefore, the *Sutra Perfectly Condensing Dharma* says, “The field of sentient beings is the field of buddhas. You will obtain the qualities of the buddhas from the field of buddhas; you should not practice wrongly in it...” The Muni taught that the field of sentient beings in which extensive seeds of virtue are sown and the so-called “field of Victors” are alike to the Teacher in being fields where merit is accumulated. I should respect all sentient beings because many people who have faith in and have pleased the buddhas and sentient beings have thereby reached the perfection of the two purposes. Hence the result of a buddha’s qualities such as the [ten]

powers¹²² are accomplished from the two fields of sentient beings and the Victors alike, so what kind of system is this, saying, “I do not respect sentient beings in the same way I respect the Victors”? For it is incorrect.

OBJECTION: Also, although sentient beings are a field of merit, since they are not similar [to the buddhas] in excellent qualities, they are not worthy of reverence like the buddhas. [250]

RESPONSE: There is no fault. I do not posit the excellent qualities of the intentions of the two of them to be equal; they are similar in acting as the causes of the result buddhahood. So I should similarly respect sentient beings. Since they also have the excellent qualities for the attainment of buddhahood, they are therefore equal in being fields.

Whatever veneration of one with a loving mind towards all sentient beings, which is explained to be of infinite merit, is the greatness of sentient beings, the objects of love. Whatever merit of faith in the buddhas is the greatness of buddhas, the objects of faith. Therefore the faith in both is equal in the share of causes they have in establishing a buddha's qualities, whereby they are asserted to be equal in being objects towards which faith is suitable. They are not equal from the point of view of excellent qualities of intention because they are not at all equal in excellent qualities with the buddhas who are boundless oceans of excellence which are vast and hard to fathom.

Although they are not equal in excellent qualities, even if all the things in the three realms were offered for the sake of venerating some person in whom a mere share of the good qualities of the unique buddhas, who are an Assembly of Supreme Excellent Qualities, an unparalleled great aggregate of merit appears, it would be little. If that is the case, then what need is there to mention others?

In summary, although their excellent qualities are not similar to those of the buddhas, since sentient beings have a share of the causes in giving rise to their supreme excellent qualities, it is correct to respectfully venerate sentient beings as though they are buddhas due to their similarity through just these [reasons]. [251]

3B2B-2B3A-1B1B-3B2B-2. They should be respected due to faith in the Teacher

6.119 Furthermore, what way is there to repay
 Those without dissimulation who are a friend
 And grant immeasurable benefit,
 Other than by pleasing sentient beings?

6.120 Because benefiting them will repay
 Those who give up their holy bodies and enter Relentless Torment,
 Therefore even if they cause me great harm

¹²² According to Je-tsun Cho-kyi Gyel-tsen's *Ocean of Sport: Commentary on the Ornament of Clear Realization*, the ten powers are: (1) the power of the exalted knower of sources and non-sources, (2) the power of the exalted knower of fruition of actions, (3) the power of the exalted knower of the variety of interests, (4) the power of the exalted knower of the many realms of the world, (5) the power of the exalted knower of superior and inferior faculties, (6) the power of the exalted knower of paths that proceed everywhere, (7) the power of the exalted knower of the thoroughly afflicted and the completely pure, (8) the power of the exalted knower recollecting previous states, (9) the power of the exalted knower of the varieties of death, transmigration and rebirth, and (10) the power of knowing the exhaustion of contaminations. See Professor Jeffrey Hopkins's *Meditation on Emptiness* (Wisdom Publications, 1996) page 208-210 for a slightly different listing.

I shall behave impeccably in all.

- 6.121 Because those who are my Lords, for the time being
Disregard even their own bodies,
Then why does the confused I
Act proud and not behave with the attributes of a servant towards them?
- 6.122 Because of their happiness the Munis will be pleased.
But if they are harmed they will be displeased.
By making them happy I shall delight the Munis,
And by harming them I shall harm the Munis.
- 6.123 Just as anything desirable would give my mind no pleasure
If my body was ablaze with fire,
Likewise when sentient beings are harmed
There is no way for the Great Compassionate Ones to be pleased.
- 6.124 Due to having harmed migrating beings,
I have displeased the Great Compassionate Ones.
Therefore today I confess individually all my negativities.
I request your forgiveness, Munis, for this displeasure I have caused.
- 6.125 From now on, in order to delight the Tathagatas, [252]
I shall be subdued and be a servant to the world.
Although many beings may kick and smash my head or kill me,
I shall not retaliate and may I delight the Protectors of the World.
- 6.126 There is no doubt that those with the nature of compassion
Regard all these migrating beings as themselves.
These very ones seen in the entities of sentient beings are the Protectors
themselves;
Why then do I not respect them?

The reason why I should respect sentient beings is as follows. Furthermore, what other way is there to repay the kindness of the buddhas who, without dissimulation and unpretending, induced by great compassion are friends of all migrating beings and grant immeasurable benefit through application, other than by pleasing sentient beings? There is no other offering that pleases the buddhas who have become supreme through enacting the welfare of sentient beings.

Benefiting sentient beings will repay the Munis who give up their holy bodies and enter even Relentless Torment because of the welfare of sentient beings. Therefore, even if these sentient beings cause me great harm, not only will I not get angry at them, I shall behave impeccably to benefit them in all ways and to accomplish every happiness. I shall make effort to practice that.

Furthermore, because the buddhas, who are my Lords, for the time being disregard even their own bodies for the sake of sentient beings, [253] then why does the I, which is confused

about sentient beings who enact the welfare of sentient beings, act proudly with a puffed-up mind and not behave with the attributes of a servant who accomplishes anything there is to be done? I should abandon pride and respect them.

Because of the happiness of sentient beings the Munis will be pleased. But if they are harmed they will be displeased. By making them happy through benefiting them, I shall delight all the Lord Munis through the supreme offering, and by harming sentient beings I shall harm the Munis. This is because, just as any desirable marvel such as food would give my mind no pleasure if my body was ablaze with fire, likewise when sentient beings are harmed, there is no way for the Great Compassionate Ones to be pleased.

Due to having harmed migrating beings, I have displeased the Great Compassionate Ones. Therefore from today onwards, without hiding them, I confess individually all my negativities that have displeased the Great Compassionate Ones due to having previously harmed migrating beings. I request all of you to forgive me for the displeasure I have caused in having harmed sentient beings.

From now on, in order to delight the Tathagatas I shall subdue harm, be a servant to the world, and make such a commitment. In the case of the word “subdued,” [in v. 6.125], this refers to “making a commitment to be a servant to the world through stable endeavor.” [254] Although many beings may kick and smash my head or kill me, I shall not retaliate and by willingly accepting it, may I delight the holy minds of the Protectors of the World.

There is no doubt that the buddhas with the nature of compassion regard all these migrating beings as themselves by way of familiarization with equalizing and exchanging self and others, whereby these very ones seen in the entities of sentient beings are those Protectors of mine themselves. Why then do I not respect them since respecting them will bestow buddhahood? I should respect them.

3B2B-2B3A-1B2. [Meditating on] The benefits of patience

- A. Brief indication of the benefits and explaining them with examples
- B. Condensing and indicating the enumeration of benefits

3B2B-2B3A-1B2A. Brief indication of the benefits and explaining them with examples

- 6.127 It delights the tathagatas
 And perfectly accomplishes my own purpose as well.
 It dispels the suffering of the world.
 Therefore I should always practice it.
- 6.128 For example, should even some of the king’s men
 Cause harm to many people,
 Farsighted men would not retaliate
 Even if they were able to.
- 6.129 For they are not alone;
 The might of the king is their might.
 Likewise I should not underestimate
 Weak harmers.
- 6.130 For the guardians of hell and the Compassionate Ones
 Are their army.

Just as subjects behave towards a fierce king,
I should please sentient beings.

6.131 Even if such a king were to become angry, [255]
Could he cause the harm of hell,
Which is what I would have to experience
By displeasing sentient beings?

6.132 And even if such a king were to be pleased,
He could not possibly grant me buddhahood,
Which is what I would obtain
By pleasing sentient beings.

Being patient towards harm caused by sentient beings and respecting them is the supreme method for delighting the tathagatas and, since it completes the collections in my own continuum, it perfectly accomplishes my own purpose as well. The supreme method for enacting others' purpose is just this. That which dispels the suffering of all worldly beings is also just this. It fulfils the two purposes. Therefore I should always practice just this cultivation of the three types of patience.

For example, should even some of the men in the king's retinue cause harm to many people, farsighted men who consider future pros and cons would not retaliate against those retinue members even if they were able to. For the ability of the harmers is not the ability of the retinue members alone; the might of the king is their might. Likewise I should not underestimate a few weak harmers. For, with respect to the fruition of such, due to displeasing them, the guardians of hell and the Victors who are the Compassionate Ones along with their children are their army. [256]

So just as subjects would shun a fierce king, I should please sentient beings. Even if such a king were to become angry, could he cause the harm of hell, which is what I would have to experience by displeasing sentient beings? He could not cause it. And even if such a king were to be pleased, the king could not possibly grant me buddhahood, the result I would obtain by pleasing sentient beings.

3B2B-2B3A-1B2B. Condensing and indicating the enumeration of benefits

6.133 Let alone my future attainment of buddhahood,
Which comes from pleasing sentient beings,
Why do I not see that there will be great glory,
Fame, and happiness in this very life?

6.134 While in cyclic existence patience causes
Beauty, freedom from sickness, and fame.
Because of these I shall live for a very long time
And win the prosperous pleasures of the wheel-turning kings.

By contemplating the benefits of my future attainment of buddhahood, the result that comes from pleasing sentient beings, I should respect sentient beings and cultivate patience. Let alone that, I should also cultivate patience from the point of view of the temporal results of

this and future lives. Why do I not see that due to cultivating patience there will be the great glory of extensive excellences, fame of renown, bliss and happiness in this very life of seen phenomena? Hence, I should make effort in pleasing sentient beings.

While circling in cyclic existence patience causes beautiful form, excellent retinue, and the like, freedom from sickness as well as great fame. Because of these I shall live for a very long time and win the prosperous and extensive pleasures of the wheel-turning kings.

[257] It is just as has been said in [Aryasura's] *Garland of Birth Stories (Jatakamala)*:

*The armor of the holy beings is patience.
It destroys even the arrows of the bad words of negative beings,¹²³
Transforming them mostly into flowers of praise for excellent qualities.
It will become that which has fame as its branches.*

*Patience destroys the discordant classes of the Dharma.
Patience causes the attainment of the bliss of complete liberation.
If one makes strong effort, patience will bring benefit.
Is there anyone who does not [want to be] patient?*

Also, it says:

*Patience is the supreme ornament for the Able Ones.
It guards the excellent qualities and teaches the wise.
How beautiful is the ornament of patience!
Understand that light rays for the face, earrings for the ears,*

*And diadems of various dazzling precious objects
Are thus not beautiful as ornaments;
It is inappropriate to always rely upon them. Cast out impatience.
You should guard the patience that benefits.*

In brief, as a method for not being trampled upon even for a moment by the tongues of fire of anger, always surround the pleasure grove where wholesomeness is well enacted with the moat of the three types of patience,¹²⁴ and do not open even slightly the door of anger. You should put effort into making your attainment of the pleasures and endowments meaningful.

[258] Thus, Gyeltshab Thamche Khyenpa says:

*Even if you were to cultivate virtues such as generosity for eons,
Tongues of fire of anger can destroy them.
Thus, generate the might of patience again and again;
Do not open up the slightest opportunity for anger.*

¹²³ JN: Changed from the original translation to correspond with Geshe-la's commentary.

¹²⁴ JN: Changed from the original translation.

3B2B-2B3A-2. Title of the chapter

The Sixth Chapter on Relying on Patience from *Engaging in the Deeds of a Bodhisattva*.

This is easy to understand.

Chapter Seven

Teachings on Joyous Effort

3B2B-2B3B. How to train in joyous effort

1. Explanation of the text of the chapter
2. Title of the chapter

3B2B-2B3B-1. Explanation of the text of the chapter

- A. Exhortation that one must undertake joyous effort
- B. How to make such joyous effort

3B2B-2B3B-1A. Exhortation that one must undertake joyous effort

7.1 With patience I should undertake joyous effort;
 Enlightenment will dwell in those who strive.
 Just as there is no movement without wind,
 So merit does not occur without joyous effort.

7.2a What is enthusiasm? It is enthusiasm about virtue.

With patience towards hardships and others' harm in the way explained above, if I wish to quickly attain enlightenment, I must undertake joyous effort; enlightenment will dwell in those who strive in the deeds of the perfections. Just as a butter lamp and the like will not move without wind, so the accumulation of merit and exalted wisdom also does not occur without joyous effort. Therefore I should make effort since unsurpassed enlightenment is contingent upon joyous effort. It is just as has been said in [Chandrakirti's] *Supplement to the Middle Way (Madhyamakavatara)* (stanza 4.1ab):

*All excellent qualities without exception accompany joyous effort;
It is the cause of the two collections of merit and intelligence.*

[259] Its identification is as follows.

QUESTION: Since enthusiasm in regards to the afflictions is laziness, what is joyous effort?

RESPONSE: It is enthusiasm about virtuous objects of observation because the sole lamp of the three grounds, [Lama Tsongkhapa's] *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*,¹²⁵ also says:

...aspect of enthusiasm upon observing virtuous objects of observation.

When divided, there are four types:

- (1) armor-like joyous effort,
- (2) joyous effort of application,
- (3) joyous effort of non-discouragement and being unperturbed, and
- (4) joyous effort of non-complacency.

¹²⁵ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 182, chapter on *The Perfection of Joyous Effort*

3B2B-2B3B-1B. How to undertake such joyous effort

1. Abandoning the discordant classes to joyous effort
2. Increasing the power of the antidote

3B2B-2B3B-1B1. Abandoning the discordant classes to joyous effort

- A. Identifying the discordant classes
- B. How to abandon them

3B2B-2B3B-1B1A. Identifying the discordant classes

7.2bcd Its discordant classes should be explained.
 They are laziness, adherence to what is negative,
 And despising oneself out of despondency.

The discordant classes of joyous effort should be explained.

QUESTION: What are they?

RESPONSE: They are: (1) laziness that adheres to the pleasure of indolence of physical and mental unserviceability, (2) adherence to negative activities and (3) despising oneself, thinking, "I cannot do it" out of despondency with regard to accomplishing virtue.

3B2B-2B3B-1B1B. How to abandon them

1. Abandoning the laziness of relishing the taste of laziness
2. Abandoning the laziness of adherence to negative activities
3. Abandoning the laziness of despondency towards virtue [260]

3B2B-2B3B-1B1B-1. Abandoning the laziness of relishing the taste of laziness

7.3 Because of relishing the pleasurable taste of indolence
 And craving based on sleep,
 From not being disillusioned with the suffering of cyclic existence,
 Laziness grows very strong.

7.4 Enmeshed in the snare of disturbing conceptions,
 You have entered the snare of birth.
 Why are you still not aware
 That you have gone into the mouth of the Lord of Death?

7.5 Do you not see
 That he is systematically slaughtering your species?
 Any craving based on sleep
 Is like a buffalo with a butcher.

7.6 While the Lord of Death is looking,
 Having blocked off every route,
 How can you enjoy eating?
 And thus how can you enjoy sleep?

7.7 For as long as death is quickly approaching,
 Then I shall accumulate the collections.

Even if I were to abandon laziness then,
At that improper time what will be the use?

7.8 When this has not been done, when this is initiated,
And when this is only half done,
Suddenly the Lord of Death will come.
And the thought will occur, “Oh no, I’m doomed!”

7.9 Their faces flowing with tears
And their eyes red and swollen with sorrow,
My relatives will finally lose hope
And I shall behold the faces of the messengers of Yama.

7.10 Tormented by the memory of my negativities
And hearing the sounds of hell,
In terror I shall clothe my body in excrement.
What is the use of such a delirious state?

7.11 If even in this life you shall be gripped with fear
Like that of a live fish being rolled,
What need even to mention the unbearable sufferings of hell
[Due to] the negativities you have committed? [261]

7.12 Why do you remain at ease like this
Having committed the actions of hell
Where your delicate flesh will burn
When touched by streams?

7.13 Much harm befalls those who want results without striving,
As well as those sensitive ones.
While clasped by death, I shall wail like the gods,
“Oh no, I shall be destroyed by suffering!”

7.14 Relying upon the human boat,
Free yourself from the great river of suffering!
As it is hard to find this boat later,
Do not sleep at this time, fool!

Because of having grasped at pleasure with respect to the indolence of not engaging in virtue and relishing the pleasurable taste adhering to it, and craving based on sleep, from not being disillusioned with the suffering of cyclic existence, laziness grows very strong. Thus having identified the cause, I should strive in stopping laziness. Hence, [Lama Tsongkhapa’s] *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*¹²⁶ also says:

¹²⁶ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 187, chapter on *The Perfection of Joyous Effort*

The causes of laziness are indolence, attachment to the taste of inferior pleasure, craving the pleasure of sleep, and a lack of disenchantment with cyclic existence.

Like a deer that has entered a snare and will not escape death, enmeshed in the snare, that is, having come under the influence of afflictions such as the hunter-like laziness, you have entered the snare of rebirth joining to future reincarnations. Why are you still not aware that many beings have gone and will go into the mouth of the Lord of Death? You should strive in virtue. [262]

Do you not directly see that the Lord of Death is systematically slaughtering your species – the old, the young, those in between, and the rest? Any craving based on sleep is inappropriate. It is just like, for example, a buffalo abiding at ease, without fear, with a butcher, although it sees other buffaloes being systematically slaughtered by the butcher. While the butcher-like Lord of Death is looking at his victims, having completely blocked off every route leading to the city of immortality, how can you enjoy eating like a careless buffalo? And thus how can you enjoy craving for sleep? Being careless is inappropriate.

OPINION: There is still a little time left.

RESPONSE: Death is quickly approaching, whereby for as long as the Lord of Death has not captured me, then I shall accumulate the collections. Even if I were to abandon laziness when the Lord of Death has captured me, since I will be making effort at the improper time, what will be the use? For the slightest purpose will not be accomplished.

Since death is quickly approaching, when this work has not been done, when this is initiated slightly, and when this is only half done, suddenly the Lord of Death will come. And with regret, the thought will occur, “Oh no, I’m doomed!” When I am petrified and regretful, what can be done then? Henceforth I should strive in virtue.

At the time of untimely death, their faces flowing with tears and their eyes red and swollen through the force of sorrow, [263] aware that I am dying, my relatives will finally lose hope. While afraid, I must behold the faces of the messengers of Yama, whereby I will regret.

Mentally tormented by the memory of the negativities I have committed in the past and hearing the sounds of hell such as burning, where great suffering in hell must be experienced, in terror, thinking, “I too will go there,” I shall clothe my body in excrement. What is the use of striving at an improper occasion when I am in such a delirious state? Henceforth I should strive in virtue.

If even at death in this life you shall be gripped with fear like that of a live fish being rolled in hot sand, what need is there to even mention the unbearable sufferings of hell that you will directly experience due to the result of the negativities you have committed?

Having examined the many negativities you have committed in the past and the many causes of hell that you are creating even now on a daily basis, it is inappropriate to be lazy. Having committed actions for being reborn in hell where the delicate flesh of your body must experience the suffering of extreme heat when touched by the streams of molten metal in hell, why do you remain at ease through the force of laziness like this? You should strive in virtue as though your head has caught on fire.

Much harm of suffering befalls those who want pleasurable results without making any effort in the virtue that is the cause of happiness, as well as those sensitive ones with little forbearance towards even slight suffering. [264] While clasped by death, those who hope to

live for a long time like the gods do not fulfill their wish, and since their wish is not fulfilled, they shall wail, “Oh no, I shall be destroyed by suffering!”

QUESTION: What should I do?

RESPONSE: If you make effort upon this support that has obtained the leisures and endowments, you will be able to free yourself from all suffering. Therefore, relying upon the boat of the human body, free yourself from the great river of suffering of cyclic existence! The leisures and endowments are of great purpose. The Foremost Tamche Khyenpa [Tsongkhapa] says:

In dependence on the support of a good migration as illustrated by being a human, you must cross the ocean of cyclic existence and proceed to omniscience.

Since the accomplishment of the causes of such leisures and endowments are very rare, it will be hard to find this boat later on. Hence, crying out, “Fool!” do not sleep at this time of having found the boat; you should free yourself from the great river of cyclic existence by means of practicing the path of the three beings of small, middle, and great capacities. This indicates the need to make effort at the time of having gained the leisures and endowments which are difficult to gain.

3B2B-2B3B-1B1B-2. Abandoning the laziness of adherence to negative activities

7.15 Having rejected the supreme joy of the sacred Dharma
 That is an infinite cause of joy,
 Why do you enjoy being distracted by the causes for suffering,
 Frivolous amusements and the like?

Having rejected the supreme joy of practicing the sacred Dharma, the method that is an infinite cause of joy all the time in this and future lives, why do you enjoy many improper activities – being distracted by negativities, the causes for resultant suffering, and much busyness, frivolous amusements, and the like? You should not take joy in them for they are the causes of suffering. The Great Jamgon Tsongkhapa says [in his *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*]¹²⁷:

Seeing that the sacred Dharma is the cause giving rise to infinite joy in this and future lives, that distractions such as meaningless idle chatter and frivolous amusements cause its great value to decline, and that they are a source generating much pointless suffering in the future, meditate and stop them.

3B2B-2B3B-1B1B-3. Abandoning the laziness of despondency regarding virtue

7.16 Without despondency, I should gather the masses of army
 And diligently take control of myself.
 Through equalizing self with others and
 Exchanging self for others,

¹²⁷ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 187, chapter on *The Perfection of Joyous Effort*

- 7.17 I should not be despondent by thinking,
“How can I ever attain enlightenment?”
Thus the tathagatas who speak what is true
Have uttered this truth:
- 7.18 “If they develop the strength of exertion,
Even those who are flies, mosquitoes, bees, and likewise worms
Will win the unsurpassable enlightenment
Which is hard to attain.”
- 7.19 Since I have been born human by race
And recognize what is beneficial and what is harmful,
If I do not forsake the deeds of enlightenment,
Why will I not attain enlightenment?
- 7.20 OPINION: Having to give away my legs, arms,
And so forth frightens me.
RESPONSE: Without analyzing what is heavy and what is light,
I am reduced to fear through confusion.
- 7.21 Over countless billions of eons
I will be cut, stabbed, burned,
And chopped up many times [266]
But I will not attain enlightenment.
- 7.22 Yet this suffering
For my accomplishing enlightenment will have a limit;
It is like the suffering of having an incision made
In order to eliminate the harm of pain destroying it inside.
- 7.23 Even all doctors eliminate illness
With unpleasant medical treatments,
So in order to overcome manifold sufferings
I should put up with a little discomfort.
- 7.24 But the Supreme Physician does not employ
Such ordinary remedies;
With a very gentle procedure
He remedies the boundless great ailments.
- 7.25 At the beginning, the Guide applies
The giving of such things as vegetables.
Later, having become accustomed to that,
One may progressively give away even one’s flesh.

- 7.26 At such a time when I have generated a mind
That regards my body as being like vegetables,
Then what hardship will there be
When it comes to giving away my flesh?
- 7.27 Due to having abandoned negativities there is no suffering
And due to skill there is no unhappiness.
Thus mind and body are harmed
By wrong conceptions and negativities.
- 7.28 If their bodies are happy due to their merits
And their minds are happy due to their skill,
Then, even if they remain in cyclic existence for the sake of others,
Why would the Compassionate Ones be disheartened?
- 7.29 Due to the strength of the mind of enlightenment,
He exhausts his previous negativities
And gathers oceans of merit.
Hence he is said to excel the hearers.
- 7.30 So, having mounted the horse of the mind of enlightenment
That dispels all disheartenment and weariness,
And proceeds from happiness to happiness,
Which ones who know of this mind would lapse into despondency?

[267] Just as a king gains victory over his enemies by means of the four properties (*chos*), (1) initially in order to uplift his mind and train in the path, a bodhisattva [generates] the armor-like joyous effort without despondent thoughts, (2) as preparation, he [generates] the joyous effort of application, gathering the masses of the army of the two accumulations, (3) as actual practice, he diligently practices with mindfulness and introspection, and (4) he takes control of himself by means of physical and mental serviceability. Having done that, he destroys [despondency] through equalizing self with others and exchanging self for others, which will be explained below. I should not be discouraged, becoming despondent by thinking, “Since I am not like him, how can I attain enlightenment?” Thus the tathagatas, who speak only what is true, have uttered this following truth because they are trustworthy due to not having the cause for teaching the erroneous.

QUESTION: What did they say?

RESPONSE: The *Sutra Requested by Subahu* (*Subahu Pariprccha Sutra*) says,

Furthermore, the bodhisattvas perfectly train in this way thinking, “Even those who are lions, tigers, dogs, jackals, vultures, cranes, crows, owls, [268] worms, bees, flies, and mosquitoes will become enlightened in unsurpassable enlightenment.

While a human being, why¹²⁸ do I degenerate the joyous effort that attains complete enlightenment even at the cost of my life?”

And the *Cloud of Jewels Sutra* (*Ratna-megha-sutra*) says so too. Thus, if even those who are flies, mosquitoes, bees, and likewise worms develop the strength of exertion and accumulate the collections, they will win the unsurpassable enlightenment that is hard to attain. If this has been taught, then if someone such as I, who has been born human, is highly distinguished by race, and has the special thought recognizing what is to be adopted that is beneficial and what is to be discarded that is harmful in order to accomplish enlightenment, adopts the deeds of enlightenment and does not forsake them, why will I not attain enlightenment? I should think, “Definitely I can attain it.”

The Foremost Great Being [Tsongkhapa] says [in his *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*]¹²⁹:

Uplift yourself, thinking, “If the Bhagavan, a valid being who speaks what is true and perfect and does not speak what is false and wrong, taught that even flies and the like will attain enlightenment, then since I have the strength of mind to analyze what is to be adopted and what is to be discarded upon this good support due to having been born human, if I do not give up striving, why will I not attain it?”

OPINION: Although I have the ability to accomplish it by striving, having to give away my legs, arms, head, and so forth frightens me since I cannot perform those deeds that are difficult to perform.

RESPONSE: Although it is necessary to perform those acts of generosity, [269] without analyzing well the distinctions between heavy and light sufferings, I am reduced to fear through confusion regarding what is to be adopted and what is to be discarded. However, I need not fear because when circling in cyclic existence since beginningless time over countless billions of eons in hell, my body will experience being cut, stabbed, burned with fire, and chopped up with weapons, not just once, but many times, but even though I experience just that, besides my bodies being wasted pointlessly, I will not attain unsurpassed enlightenment. Yet when I reflect upon the suffering of the bad migrations, if this suffering of austerities for my accomplishing enlightenment is compared with the former, it will be of short duration, has a tiny limit, and is easy to endure. It is like being able to endure the suffering of having a little incision made in my body in order to eliminate the harm of the pain of a disease destroying it inside.

In this way, while even all doctors eliminate illness with slightly unpleasant medical treatments, since the austerities for attaining enlightenment are tiny sufferings, in order to overcome the manifold sufferings of cyclic existence I should put up with the little discomfort of the austerities for this pacifies the boundless suffering of myself and others.

But the Lord of Subduers, the Supreme Physician does not employ austerities, such ordinary remedies to cure a disease; instead, with a comfortable path, the method for attaining the result of happiness, a very gentle procedure, [270] by way of abandoning the two

¹²⁸ *Ci'i phyir rdzogs pa'i* is added in accordance with p. 429 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa's commentary.

¹²⁹ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 188, chapter on *The Perfection of Joyous Effort*

extremes of toil cum exhaustion and sensual decadence, he remedies the boundless great ailments of the afflictions which compel wandering in cyclic existence. Thus how can it be appropriate to fear austerities?

For, at the beginning, when one is not yet accustomed to generosity, the Guide, the Buddha, initially applies the giving of such things as food and drink and vegetables. Later, having become accustomed to that in the absence of a mind of difficulty, later one may progressively give away even one's flesh.

At such a time when I have generated a mind that due to familiarization regards [giving] my body as being like giving vegetables, then what hardship will there be when it comes to giving away my flesh and the like? Since there will not be the slightest difficulty, fearing austerities is inappropriate. Thus the Foremost Tamche Khyenpa [Tsongkhapa] also says [in his *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*]¹³⁰:

When you are initially afraid of giving your body, do not give it. Reverse your attachment to your body through gradual training in generosity, and when the strength of your great compassion has been developed, then give it if there is great purpose. Hence, there will be no difficulty at the time of giving.

And:

Therefore, it seems that this text readily refutes some objector who says that the paramitayana is a path that produces torment and is difficult to perform since it requires the giving up of one's body and life, because as long as one gives rise to the discrimination of it as being difficult to perform, one does not give, whereas, as and when it becomes very easy as though giving vegetables and the like, then one gives.

A bodhisattva does not suffer physically in giving his body out of a pure attitude of compassion [271] because, due to having abandoned all negativities of the three doors, he is skillful when giving his body, whereupon there is not even mental unhappiness. For this reason, wrong conceptions adhering to I and mine of the person as well as negativities such as killing do harm the mind and body, but the great heroic-minded ones have reversed the causes of harm.

If, due to their merits of generosity and so forth, the bodies of the heroic-minded are happy as a result and due to their skill in what is to be adopted and what is to be discarded, as well as in the meaning of emptiness, their minds are happy just like Bodhisattva Sadaparudita, then even if they remain in cyclic existence for the sake of others why would the Compassionate Ones be disheartened? There is no reason for them to be disheartened. [Lama Tsongkhapa's] *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*¹³¹ says:

Since the bodhisattvas have abandoned negativities, they have reversed the causes, whereby resultant suffering feelings do not arise. Due to the stable realization of cyclic existence as lacking inherent nature like an illusion, they have no suffering

¹³⁰ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 191, chapter on *The Perfection of Joyous Effort*

¹³¹ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 191, chapter on *The Perfection of Joyous Effort*

in their mind. If their physical and mental happiness grows, then there is nothing to be disheartened about even if they dwell in cyclic existence. Thus think like this.

Due to the strength of the mind of enlightenment, the compassionate ones exhaust their previous negativities and gather oceans of collections of merit and exalted wisdom. Hence they are said to excel the hearers with regards to traversing the path.

So, having mounted the powerful horse of the mind of enlightenment that dispels all mental disheartenment and physical weariness, [272] they proceed upon the path of physical and mental happiness to resultant happiness. Which skillful ones who know of this mind would lapse into despondency? Do not be despondent to practice the deeds.

3B2B-2B3B-1B2. Increasing the power of the antidote – joyous effort

- A. Increasing the power of the concordant conditions of joyous effort
- B. Being diligent in deeds through mindfulness and introspection
- C. Oneself taking control in accomplishing the deeds

3B2B-2B3B-1B2A. Increasing the power of the concordant conditions of joyous effort

- 1. Brief indication by means of identifying the four powers
- 2. Extensive explanation

3B2B-2B3B-1B2A-1. Brief indication by means of identifying the four powers

- 7.31 The army for the sake of accomplishing the welfare of sentient beings
 Are interest, steadfastness, joy, and relinquishment.
 Interest is developed through fear of suffering
 And contemplating its benefits.
- 7.32 Thus I shall abandon its discordant classes
 And make effort in order to increase joyous effort
 Through the powers of interest, pride, joy, and relinquishment,
 Diligence and mastery.

I shall develop the masses of army to destroy the discordant class of joyous effort for the sake of accomplishing the welfare of sentient beings as follows. Just as a king gains victory over his antagonists by means of the four masses of army, the four concordant conditions of joyous effort are the four:

- (1) the power of interest – generating aspiration for adopting and discarding having contemplated actions and their results,
 - (2) the power of steadfastness – not embarking on anything without examining it, and having examined it, culminating what has been embarked upon,
 - (3) the power of joy – not discontinuing like a child engaging in play, and undertaking joyous effort without satiation, and [273]
 - (4) the power of relinquishment – resting if the body and mind becomes exhausted through undertaking joyous effort, and immediately making [joyous effort again] upon having rested.
- To illustrate and explain the power of interest, the power of interest should be developed through fear of the sufferings of cyclic existence and through contemplating the benefits of interest.

Thus I shall abandon its discordant classes – the discouragement that does not engage in accomplishing virtuous qualities although one sees that one is able to, thinking, “How can I

do it?” And I shall develop the concordant conditions – the four powers of (1) interest, (2) pride, that is, steadfastness, (3) joy, and (4) relinquishment. And for the actual [practice], I shall make effort in order to increase joyous effort more and more through the powers of diligent joyous effort through mindfulness and introspection and, following that, mastery over the body and mind.

3B2B-2B3B-1B2A-2. Extensive explanation

- A. The power of interest
- B. The power of steadfastness
- C. The power of joy
- D. The power of relinquishment

3B2B-2B3B-1B2A-2A. The power of interest

- 7.33 I shall destroy
The boundless misdeeds of others and myself.
At that time each of these misdeeds
Will be exhausted in an ocean of eons.
- 7.34 But if within myself I do not perceive
Even a fraction of the endeavor for exhausting these misdeeds,
Then I have become an abode for boundless suffering;
Why does my heart not burst?
- 7.35 I shall accomplish many
Excellent qualities for others and myself.
And I will acquaint myself
With each of these qualities through an ocean of eons,
- 7.36 But I have never developed acquaintance
With even a fraction of these excellences, [274]
How strange it is to make without purpose
This birth I have somehow found.
- 7.37 I have not made offerings to the Bhagavan,
I have not given the pleasure of great festivals,
I have not performed actions for the teachings,
I have not fulfilled the wishes of the poor,
- 7.38 I have not granted fearlessness to the frightened
And I have not given happiness to the wretched.
All I have given rise to are
The agonies in the mother’s womb and suffering.
- 7.39 If in the past and even now
Such deprivation arises
Because of my lack of interest in the Dharma,
Who would reject this interest in the Dharma?

- 7.40 The Muni himself has said
That interest is the root of every class of virtue;
Its root is constant acquaintance
With the ripening results.
- 7.41 Suffering, mental unhappiness,
The various kinds of fear,
As well as separation from what is desired
Will arise from negative deeds.
- 7.42 By performing virtues intended in the mind,
Wherever I go, due to those merits,
There I shall be honored with
The excellences that are their results.
- 7.43 Although one who commits misdeeds wishes for happiness,
Wherever he goes,
There those misdeeds
Will completely destroy him with the weapons of suffering.
- 7.44 As a result of virtue, I will become a spiritual child of the Sugatas dwelling in
the hearts of vast, fragrant, and cool lotuses,
The food of the Victors' pleasant speech will cause my splendor to grow,
My supreme body will emerge from a lotus that will unfold due to the light of
the Munis and
I will abide in the presence of the Victors.
- 7.45 As a result of many non-virtues, I will be very wretched due to all my skin
without exception being ripped off by the henchmen of Yama, [275]
Molten copper melted by tremendous heat will be poured into my body,
Pierced by flaming swords and daggers, my flesh will be cut into hundreds of
pieces,
And I shall plummet upon the fiercely blazing iron ground.
- 7.46ab Therefore, I should be interested in virtue
And with great respect acquaint myself with it.

I shall destroy the boundless misdeeds of others and myself because I made such a commitment when I generated the mind of enlightenment. At the time of destroying the misdeeds, each of these misdeeds will be exhausted through cultivating its antidote for an ocean of eons.

But if within myself I do not perceive even a fraction of the endeavor acting to exhaust these misdeeds, then if I cannot stand to cultivate merely that antidote I must experience the suffering of the bad migrations and thereby become an abode for boundless suffering; why does my heart not burst open? How solid my heart is!

I shall accomplish many excellent qualities for the liberation and omniscience of others and myself because I have made such a commitment. Let alone all the excellent qualities without exception, if I will have to acquaint myself with each of these qualities such as the signs and exemplifications for an ocean of eons, but I have never developed acquaintance with even a fraction of these excellences, and I have squandered without the purpose of this or future lives this birth of leisures and endowments, which I have found somehow for¹³² a long time. “How strange!” This is a rebuke¹³³ of despair. [276]

In the past I have not made offerings to the Three Jewels who are illustrated by the Bhagavan, I have not given the pleasure of great festivals to serve and honor sentient beings as well as the tathagatas, I have not performed actions for the teachings by accomplishing much proper adoption of antidotes and discarding of the objects of abandonment, I have not fulfilled the wishes of poor sentient beings, I have not granted fearlessness to those frightened by enemies, diseases, and the like. And I have not given satisfaction to those who are wretched due to suffering. If this is the case, then I have not done any excellent deed previously. All I have given rise to are the agonies in the mother’s womb and suffering; I regret that I have not enacted others’ welfare at all.

If in the past and even now such deprivation conjoined with the troubles of cyclic existence are still arising because of my lack of interest in the Dharma of virtue by way of ascertainment and belief, then which skillful one would reject this interest in the Dharma? Those who wish to be liberated from troubles should generate interest in the Dharma.

The Muni himself has said that interest that believes in the Dharma of virtue just as has been ascertained is the root of every class of virtue. The *Moon Lamp Sutra* (*Candra-pradipa-sutra*) also teaches so. The root of interest in the Dharma is constant acquaintance with the belief in virtuous and non-virtuous actions and the ripening results.

This is because concerning this, [Lama Tsongkhapa’s] *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*¹³⁴ says:

... explained to be meditation on the way in which pleasant and unpleasant results arise from wholesome and unwholesome karma [respectively] because faith is taught to act as the support for aspiration, [277] whereby the two faiths of conviction [regarding pleasant and unpleasant results] will produce the two desires to abandon [unwholesome karma] and to adopt [wholesome karma]. Further, you contemplate actions and their results in general, and in particular, the causes and results of the benefits of the deeds of a bodhisattva and the drawbacks of transgressing them. Understand them from the relevant chapters.

And:

Here, interest is aspiration.

Since you will not gain the certainty that pleases the Victors regarding any Dharma if you do not gain well the certainty regarding actions and their results, you should make effort in it.

¹³² *Zhes* is emended to read *nas* in accordance with p. 443 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

¹³³ *Gting* is emended to read *bsting* in accordance with p. 443 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

¹³⁴ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 195, chapter on *The Perfection of Joyous Effort*

Claiming to have gained ascertainment in emptiness, the statement of some that actions and their results are nullified is a case of an understanding of emptiness that has fallen into error.

In migrating beings, physical suffering, the mental feelings of unhappiness, the various kinds of fear of humans, non-humans, and so forth, as well as separation from what is desired such as friends, resources, and the like arise from causes that are negative deeds. Hence I should make effort to abandon negativities. Motivated by the mind of abandonment, by performing virtues intended in the mind, whichever birth-source I go to, due to those merits there I shall be honored with the **excellences that are the ripening results**.

These do not follow simply due to the wishes for happiness and suffering. Although one who commits misdeeds wishes for happiness, wherever he goes, [278] there those misdeeds will completely destroy him with the weapons of suffering. Hence, I should make effort to abandon negativities. The **excellences that are the results** refer to the way of the nature that are the results.

When the children of the Victors are born in the land of Sukhavati¹³⁵ and so forth as a result of having familiarized with the Dharma of virtue, the spiritual children of the Sugatas dwell in the hearts of lotuses, the attribute of their *birth-source* – a birth-source that is vast, fragrant, pleasing, cool, and generates bliss upon contact. Hearing the Victors' pleasant speech that possesses the sixty branches [of melodious qualities], which is distinguished from the sustenance by food of worldly beings, as well as the subject matter of that [speech], the food of the realization of suchness causes their magnificence and splendor to grow. Then, as the attribute of *birth*, they emerge from lotuses that open up and unfold due to the light of the Muni tathagatas. They have supreme bodies ornamented by the signs and exemplifications, the attribute of *body*. As the attribute of *tutor*, they abide in the presence of the Victors such as Amitabha and are nurtured with the Dharma. They will become the spiritual children of the Sugatas by means of having these attributes as a result of the single-pointed virtues of wholesome actions.

Due to actions such as killing, I will be very wretched due to suffering by way of all my skin without exception being ripped off by the henchmen of Yama in hell, and as an attribute of *resource*, the liquid of molten copper melted by tremendous heat will be poured into my body, whereby I will find it difficult to bear. [279] Not only that, but pierced by flaming swords and daggers, my flesh will be cut into hundreds of pieces and scattered around. As an attribute of *abode*, I shall plummet upon the fiercely blazing iron ground and become wretched. As a result of many non-virtuous actions, such as the actions of immediate retribution and abandoning the Dharma, I will experience them.

Therefore having properly reflected upon actions and their results, I should be interested in virtue and with great respect acquaint myself with it by means of belief.

3B2B-2B3B-1B2A-2B. The power of steadfastness

7.46cd Having undertaken through the procedure of *Vajradhwaja*,
I should cultivate pride.

7.47 At the beginning having examined the endowments,
I should either undertake it or not undertake it.

¹³⁵ This is the pure land of Amitabha Buddha.

It is best not to undertake it,
But once I have undertaken it I should not withdraw.

- 7.48 I will familiarize with that in other rebirths
And negativities and suffering will increase.
Also others and the time of the result
Will be inferior and will not be accomplished.
- 7.49 Apply pride to the three:
Actions, afflictions, and ability.
Thinking, "I alone shall do it,"
Is the pride of action.
- 7.50 Afflicted, powerless beings in this world
Are unable to accomplish their own welfare.
Migrating beings are not able like me,
Therefore I shall do this.
- 7.51 If others are doing inferior work,
Why do I sit around?
I do not perform it out of pride;
It would be best for me to have no pride. [280]
- 7.52 When encountering a dead snake,
Even crows will act as though they are garudas.
If I am weak
I shall be harmed by even a small downfall.
- 7.53 How do the faint-hearted who have given up exerting themselves
Find liberation from destitution?
By generating pride and exertion,
Even the great will find it hard to overcome me.
- 7.54ab Therefore with a steady mind
I shall overcome the downfalls.
If I am defeated by a downfall,
My wish to be victorious over the three realms will become a joke.
- 7.55 I will conquer everything
And nothing at all shall conquer me!
I, a son of the Lion-like Victor,
Shall dwell in this pride.
- 7.56 Any migrating being is destroyed by pride.
Afflicted, he has no pride.
Those with pride do not succumb to the power of the enemy.

They have come under the power of the enemy of pride.

- 7.57 Inflated by afflicted pride,
I shall be led by pride to the bad migrations.
It destroys the joyous festival of being human.
I shall become a slave, eating the food of others,
- 7.58 Stupid, ugly, feeble, and
Despised everywhere.
Tough people inflated by pride
Are also included among those having pride.
Tell me, what is the inferior like!
- 7.59 Whoever seizes pride in order to conquer the enemy of pride,
He is the one having pride, the victorious hero.
Whoever definitely destroys the rampage of this enemy of pride,
Completes the results of a Victor in accordance with the wishes of migrating
beings.
- 7.60 When amidst a class of afflictions,
I shall be persistent with them in a thousand ways;
Like a lion among foxes and the like, [281]
I will not be injured by the host of afflictions.
- 7.61 Just as men will guard their eyes
In the occurrence of great danger,
Likewise I shall not come under the power of the afflictions,
Even when danger occurs.
- 7.62¹³⁶ It would be better for me to be burned,
To be killed, or to have my head cut off,
Rather than bowing down
To the enemy of afflictions.
Likewise in all situations
I should do nothing other than what is fit.

The Sixth Chapter on dedication of the *Arya Vajradhwaja Sutra* from the *Avatamsaka* says:

For example, son of the lineage, just as the dawning sun illuminates worthy objects without being prevented by faults such as those who are blind and uneven mountains, bodhisattvas dawning for the sake of others are not prevented by various faults of sentient beings and ripen and liberate those worthy to be tamed.

¹³⁶ This stanza does not appear in the Sanskrit version according to Wallace's translation.

Having undertaken virtuous actions through the procedure taught above, I should cultivate the pride that acts to culminate them.

At the beginning of engaging in activities, having examined well whether the endowments of my mind are able or not, I should either undertake them if there is ability, or not undertake them if there is not. It is best not to undertake it [if I lack the ability], but once I have undertaken it I should not withdraw until I have completed it.

QUESTION: What misdeed is there to undertake something and then discard it? [282]

RESPONSE: Due to the [result] similar to the cause of that created previously, I will also discard [what is undertaken] and familiarize with that in other rebirths. And (1) negativities, the result created by a being who degenerates his promises, and (2) their ripening [results], suffering, will increase. Also regarding other activities that are undertaken later and the time of their result, they will be inferior and will take a long time, and other actions will also not be accomplished.

This is because [Lama Tsongkhapa's] *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*¹³⁷ also says:

At the beginning, without embarking on it, investigate well whether it is suitable. If you see that you are able to do it, then embark on it. If you are not able, then do not embark on it. Compared to embarking on it and then discarding it halfway through, it is better to not have undertaken it right from the start. The reason is as follows. If you become accustomed to discarding your promise in the middle, then due to the [result] similar to the cause of that, you will also discard the trainings you have committed to and the like in other rebirths, whereby your negativities will increase in that life and the suffering that is the result of it will increase in other rebirths. You will not accomplish other virtues due to thinking about doing the former task, and due to having turned away from that former task, the result of it will be weak and even that former task will not be accomplished completely since you did not bring it to fulfillment. In brief, not fulfilling your promise to do something will serve as an obstacle to your accomplishing other tasks. Due to the [result] similar to the cause, the promise of the vows that you have committed yourself to will not be stable.

Therefore, in order to fulfill your promises, apply the pride of non-discouragement and generate strength with respect to the three: (1) the action of performing it once an activity has been embarked upon, (2) the afflictions that are to be abandoned, and (3) the ability to engage [in the wholesome] and to turn away [from the unwholesome]. [283] When you see actions that are worthy to be done by others, to generate strength of mind, thinking, "I alone shall do it," is the pride of action. You should accomplish the activities of sentient beings by yourself without relying upon others.

Worldly beings who are powerless due to afflictions are unable to accomplish even their own welfare in this [life]. Hence migrating beings are not able, like me, to strive in virtue for others; even if I were to rely on them, there would be no benefit. Therefore I shall do all of these activities for others' welfare myself.

¹³⁷ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 196, chapter on *The Perfection of Joyous Effort*

Further, if others are doing inferior work such as farming, why do I myself who carry the great responsibility for sentient beings upon my head sit around leisurely? I should work. When others are doing inferior work, if I think, “I am performing it” out of the pride that thinks, “I am performing noble actions,” then it would be best to not perform it out of such pride and for me to have no afflicted pride. Thus I should abandon it because it will lead me to the bad migrations. Hence, [Lama Tsongkhapa’s] *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*¹³⁸ says:

However, when you accomplish these two [prides of action and ability], do not despise others and accomplish it out of conceit in regard to yourself, Rather, regarding them with the aspect of mercy, do not mix in pride.

In order to destroy the afflictions, you should generate the power of the antidotes. When encountering a dead snake, even crows will act as though they are garudas. Likewise, if I am weak in the antidotes, [284] I shall be harmed on the path by obstacles, even a small downfall. Therefore, how do those acting with a faint-hearted attitude, who have given up exerting themselves in accomplishing the two purposes ever find liberation from the states of destitution? For, due to being destroyed by laziness, their engagements of body and mind will degenerate.

Sharawa¹³⁹ said:

The happiness of those who cast aside the Dharma does not exceed their previous happiness. Consider the fact that if you give up the Dharma in this lifetime, you must hereafter undergo endless suffering. If you do not exert yourself, the afflictions will also not regard you with compassion. Further, the antidotes will not say, “You are unable to cultivate me, so I will complete the task for you.” Even the buddhas and bodhisattvas will not be able to protect you.

Contrary to this, by generating the pride that produces the strength of the antidote and exertion through application, even the great objects of abandonment will find it hard to overcome me. Therefore with a steady mind I shall overcome the downfalls, for, if I am defeated by a downfall, my wish to be victorious over all of the three realms will become a joke. Hence I shall dwell in this supreme pride, thinking, “I will conquer every fault and no object of abandonment at all in the three realms shall conquer me!”

QUESTION: Who will do it?

RESPONSE: I, a son of the lion-like Victors who frightens the deer-like maras, the Forders, and the like, will do it. [285] Thus, [Lama Tsongkhapa’s] *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*¹⁴⁰ also says:

¹³⁸ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 198, chapter on *The Perfection of Joyous Effort*

¹³⁹ Cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 198, chapter on *The Perfection of Joyous Effort*

¹⁴⁰ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 198, chapter on *The Perfection of Joyous Effort*

In order to destroy the discordant class, generate a courageous mind and make it firm, thinking with contempt for all types of afflictions, “I will conquer them, but none of them shall ever conquer me!”

I should condemn afflicted pride and abandon it by reflecting upon its drawbacks as follows. Any migrating being is destroyed by the pride of an inflated mind and is ruined. Due to having come under the influence of afflictions, he has no great pride because it should be the case that those with pride do not succumb to the power of the enemy, but those migrating beings whose minds are inflated have come under the power of the enemy that is afflicted pride.

Being inflated by afflicted pride has the following drawbacks. I shall be led by pride to the bad migrations, and even if I were to be reborn as a human being¹⁴¹, mental unhappiness and the like will destroy the joyous festival of being human. Lacking food, I will live by begging. Due to being controlled by others, I shall become a slave, eating the food of others. Stupid in mind, ugly in form, feeble, and physically and verbally despised everywhere by others even though I have done no explicit harm, I should therefore abandon the pride of an inflated mind.

If those whose minds are inflated and influenced by afflicted pride and those with hardships due to their minds being under the control of others were to be included among those having great pride [who are worthy of praise]¹⁴², [286] then tell me, what other inferior thing that is an object of compassion is there? It is inappropriate to have the pride that has come under the power of the enemy.¹⁴³

QUESTION: What is one having pride?

RESPONSE: Whoever seizes the pride that serves as the antidote in order to conquer the enemy of pride is called “one having pride” due to the greater strength of the antidote, and the hero who is victorious over the enemy is just him. This is because whoever definitely destroys from the root the rampage of this enemy of the pride of inflated mind completes the temporal and final results of a Victor along with the exalted activities in accordance with the wishes of migrating beings including the gods, whereby he is referred to as “victorious over the enemy.”

When amidst a class of afflictions such as anger, if they abide, I shall be persistent with them through the strength of antidotes of a thousand types of different methods. For example, like a lion not being injured by foxes and the like, similarly I will not be injured by the host of afflictions.

Just as men will guard their eyes with great care even in the occurrence of great danger, that is, of the great fears of the afflictions¹⁴⁴, likewise I shall not come under the power of the afflictions, even when the danger of being on the verge of coming under the influence of the afflictions occurs.

¹⁴¹ *Mer* is emended to read *mir* in accordance with p. 458 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

¹⁴² Annotated in accordance with p. 458 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary. In other words, these people with the hardship of various sufferings due to afflicted pride are inferior and worthy of compassion.

¹⁴³ JN: This paragraph has been changed from the original.

¹⁴⁴ This is rather abstruse; p. 460 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary mentions “harm by others and fears” as examples of the great danger that will cause men to guard their eyes.

The criterion for a stable antidote is as follows. It would be better for me to be burned by fire, to be killed, or to have my head cut off, rather than bowing down to the enemy of afflictions. [287] Likewise in all situations I should do nothing other than what is fit – acting to destroy the objects of abandonment and to rely upon the antidotes.

3B2B-2B3B-1B2A-2C. The power of joy

- 7.63 Just like those who desire the pleasurable result of play,
 This [bodhisattva] adheres
 To whatever task he may do.
 He is not satiated by it; it makes him happy.
- 7.64 Although people work in order to be happy,
 It is uncertain whether or not they will be happy;
 But how can those whose work itself is happiness
 Find happiness without doing the work?
- 7.65 If I am not satiated by desirable objects,
 Which are like honey smeared upon a razor's edge,
 Then why am I satiated by merit
 Which is ripening and pacification in happiness?
- 7.66 Thus in order to complete this task,
 I shall engage in it
 Just as an elephant tormented at midday
 Enters into a lake.

Just like children who desire the pleasurable result of play, this bodhisattva adheres to whatever task he may do for others' welfare, such as hearing, contemplating, and meditating on the mind of enlightenment. Doing it enthusiastically, he is not satiated by the task. Due to the wish that it does not discontinue, it makes him happy.

Although worldly beings work in the fields and so forth in order to be happy physically and mentally, it is uncertain whether or not the result of that will be happiness and it is not definite that they will obtain happiness. [288] But how can the bodhisattvas whose work itself is definitely happiness, temporally and finally, find happiness without doing such work? Such happiness will not arise.

Thus the Foremost Tamche Khyenpa [Tsongkhapa] also says [in his *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*]¹⁴⁵:

Further, while not being satiated by the result that is happiness, I must also not be satiated by the work that is its cause because if ordinary beings engage with effort even though they are plagued by doubt as to whether or not they will obtain the result of happiness, there is no need to mention work that, if performed, will definitely give rise to happiness as a result.

¹⁴⁵ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 200, chapter on *The Perfection of Joyous Effort*

If no matter how much of cyclic existence I utilize, I am not satiated by desirable objects such as forms and sounds, which are like the experience of experiencing with the tongue the slight taste of honey smeared upon a razor's edge followed by experiencing the suffering of getting one's tongue cut, then why am I satiated by merit such as generosity, the cause that acts to obtain the final happiness of the pacification of all suffering in happiness by way of obtaining the special high status of gods and humans, the temporal ripening result? I should cultivate myself in not being satiated [by merit]. I should engage in such a task. Thus in order to complete the¹⁴⁶ intended task that was undertaken, I shall engage in that task of the heroic-minded, just as an elephant tormented by heat and thirst at midday, when encountering a lake, enthusiastically enters into the lake.

3B2B-2B3B-1B2A-2D. The power of relinquishment

7.67 When my strength is related to degeneration,
 I should leave whatever I am doing in order to return to it.
 If something is finished well, I should put it aside [289]
 With the wish for more and more later.

When my strength is related to degeneration due to physical and mental fatigue through making effort in virtue, I should rest and leave whatever I am doing for the time being in order to return to it. Having rested, I should undertake it [once again]. If something is finished well, I should finish it with the wish for more and more later tasks, that is, more and more other tasks, and then put it aside. [Lama Tsongkhapa's] *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*¹⁴⁷ says:

The later task is important because if you are contented with each former excellent quality, then this will be a big obstacle to the attainment of many higher attributes. This shows the way to undertake joyous effort. Abandoning being both overly intense (that is, fervent exertion) and overly relaxed, you must be continuous like the flow of a river.

And the glorious Matriceta says [in his *Praise in One Hundred and Fifty Verses (Sata-pancasatka-nama-stotra)*]¹⁴⁸:

*In order to make yourself exalted,
Neither tightness nor looseness ever occurred in you.
Thus your attributes are indistinguishable
By former and later phases.*

¹⁴⁶ "Des" is emended to read "de" in accordance with p. 463 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa's commentary.

¹⁴⁷ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 201, chapter on *The Perfection of Joyous Effort*

¹⁴⁸ Cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 201, chapter on *The Perfection of Joyous Effort*

3B2B-2B3B-1B2B. Being diligent in deeds through mindfulness and introspection

- 7.68 Just as a seasoned soldier engages
In a fencing battle with the enemy,
So shall I avoid the weapons of the afflictions
And attack the enemies that are the afflictions.
- 7.69 If someone dropped his sword during a battle,
He would quickly pick it up out of fear.
Likewise if I lose the weapon of mindfulness,
Afraid of hell, I should quickly retrieve it.
- 7.70 Just as poison spreads throughout the body
In dependence upon the blood, [290]
Likewise if it finds an opportunity
Misdeeds will permeate my mind.
- 7.71 Just as a man carrying a jar full of mustard oil
In the presence of someone wielding a sword
Who is being threatened that he will be killed if he spills it will be frightened,
Likewise, those who have the modes of conduct should be attentive.
- 7.72 Therefore, just as I would hastily stand up
If a snake came into my lap,
Likewise if any sleep or indolence occur
I shall quickly turn them back.
- 7.73 Each time a misdeed occurs
I should deride myself,
And then contemplate for a long time
“No matter what, I shall not let this happen in the future.”
- 7.74 “Likewise in all situations
I shall acquaint myself with mindfulness.”
With this cause I shall wish for
Encounters or appropriate actions.

Just as when a seasoned soldier (someone who is skilled in tasks with weapons and in combat with the enemy) engages in a fencing battle with the enemy, he avoids the weapons and attacks the enemy with his own weapons, so shall I avoid the weapons of the afflictions, turn them away, and destroy the thoughts of afflictions, and attack the enemies that are the afflictions with the weapons of the antidotes and eradicate them from the root.

Thus the Foremost Tamche Khyenpa [Tsongkhapa] also says [in his *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*]¹⁴⁹:

¹⁴⁹ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 202, chapter on *The Perfection of Joyous Effort*

When a seasoned soldier, an expert who is accustomed to combat, engages in a battle with the enemy with swords and the like, he does not put value only on destroying the opponent. Rather, he must accomplish both tasks: being skilled in avoiding the harm of the weapons directed at himself as well as destroying the opponent. [291] Likewise, when a practitioner combats the afflictions, he must strive by being skilled in both: being cautious of and avoiding the mind being wounded by the afflictions, and destroying the opponent in reliance upon the antidotes. For otherwise, although he may use the antidote to stop an activity of one portion of the afflictions, he is either robbed of some part of virtue by the other afflictions, or else he develops a great misdeed in his mind, whereby both [the harm of the afflictions and the creation of virtue] are equal, in which case it will be hard to make progress in virtuous training.

For example, some people, thinking that knowledge regarding practicing Dharma is most important, hold mere knowledge as the essence, and seek it out. Although they dispel the confusion of unknowing by means of hearing [the Dharma], because they were not cautious about the other afflictions, their mind stream becomes utterly unruly due to being stained by much wrong behavior. Other people, thinking that taming the mind is more important than knowledge, take meditation as the principal. Casting away caution about the enemy of confusion, they neither hear nor learn about the Dharma, so they become greatly confused about what is to be engaged in and what is to be rejected under the stipulations of the vows they have committed themselves to, and are thus continually overcome by downfalls.

Therefore, when combating the afflictions, just as if someone's sword were to fall from his hands when fighting during a battle, he would quickly pick it up out of fear of being killed by others, [292] likewise if I lose the weapon of mindfulness that does not forget the virtuous object of observation, I will be destroyed by the afflictions and be reborn in hell. Hence I should quickly retrieve the antidote through mindfulness and introspection that remembers the fear of hell.

Just as when the body is shot by a poisonous arrow, the poison spreads throughout the body in dependence upon the blood in the blood vessels, likewise if the afflictions find an opportunity due to the degeneration of mindfulness and the like, misdeeds such as anger will permeate my mind. Thus, I should turn away even the slightest affliction.

QUESTION: How should I be attentive?

RESPONSE: Just as if a man were made to carry a jar full of mustard oil and to walk on a slippery road in the presence of someone wielding a sword while being threatened that he will be killed if he spills just one drop, frightened of being killed he will make an effort to be attentive, likewise, those who have the bodhisattva modes of conduct, holding antidotes such as the mind of enlightenment through mindfulness and introspection, should be attentive.

If my virtues are overcome by afflictions, then I will proceed to hell. Therefore, just as I would hastily stand up if a poisonous snake suddenly came into my lap, likewise if any sleep (a powerless withdrawing of the engaging [consciousnesses]) or indolence occurs, then I shall quickly turn it back out of fear of the hells.

QUESTION: How should I turn it back?

RESPONSE: Each time a misdeed occurs I should deride myself, saying, “Due to having acted like this in the past, I have obtained various undesirables and failed to obtain what I desire. Am I still acting like this?” [293] And then contemplate for a long time, “No matter what, I shall make effort to not let this misdeed happen in the future.” The Foremost Tamche Khyenpa [Tsongkhapa] says [in his *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*]¹⁵⁰:

Do not simply discontinue misdeeds, rather you must generate mental unhappiness at the arising of misdeeds. Exercise both of the following thoughts frequently: (1) think, “Since in the past I was like that too, until now have I circled in cyclic existence. In particular, having taken the bodhisattva vows, it is very despicable that I dwell in the discordant class of their trainings,” and (2) make the motivation to restrain from them from now on thinking, “Henceforth, I shall not allow this misdeed to occur at all.”

With this cause that is the motivation thinking, “Likewise in all situations of being diligent in conscientiousness and introspection for the sake of not allowing misdeeds to arise and of dispelling those that have arisen, I shall acquaint myself with mindfulness,” I shall wish for encounters with Mahayana spiritual teachers or, even if I cannot meet them immediately, I shall wish for the meaning of instructions and teachings and for appropriate and correct actions.

3B2B-2B3B-1B2C. Oneself taking control in accomplishing the deeds

7.75 In order to have strength for all
 I should recall before undertaking any action
 The advice on conscientiousness thus,
 And then rise with lightness.

7.76 Just as the wind blowing back and forth
 Controls a piece of cotton,
 So shall I be mastered by enthusiasm,
 And in this way I will accomplish all.

[294] In order to have the strength that is the power of joyous effort in all virtues, before undertaking any virtuous action I should recall the advice on how to rely on conscientiousness for the sake of acting thus, and then rise with lightness, that is, free from the fear of negative actions in doing the activity of virtue.

The Foremost Tamche Khyenpa [Tsongkhapa] says [in his *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*]¹⁵¹:

The method for making your body and mind serviceable is the power of mastery.
Meditate on the following before engaging in that task just as has been explained

¹⁵⁰ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 205, chapter on *The Perfection of Joyous Effort*

¹⁵¹ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 205, chapter on *The Perfection of Joyous Effort*

in the chapter on conscientiousness: how it is necessary to learn the bodhisattva trainings; how the drawbacks are extremely grave if you do not train in these once you have committed yourself to do so; how to regard the afflictions as the enemy; and at that time the ways to generate the courage that looks upon the hardships of battling the afflictions as ornaments rather than as burdens. Thus counteracting all the fears that prevent you from employing your body and mind in virtue, rise with lightness to train in the deeds of a bodhisattva.

QUESTION: What is the joyous effort generated with such effort like?

RESPONSE: For example, just as the wind blowing back and forth controls a piece of cotton, so shall my body and speech be mastered by enthusiasm in virtue, and in this way I will quickly accomplish all virtuous actions of the three doors. This is because [Lama Tsongkhapa's] *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*¹⁵² says:

Just as a piece of cotton's moving to and fro is controlled by wind, [295] a delighted energy that is enthusiastic about virtue masters your body and mind. If you take the lead from this energy, joyous effort will be well established. Once you produce this, you will then easily achieve all the collections.

And:

My children, although such tasks are difficult, it is wrong to give them up; you must make effort. The glorious Matriceta says [in his *Praise in One Hundred and Fifty Verses (Sata-pancasatka-nama-stotra)*]¹⁵³:

*"The sublime state, difficult to gain,
Is not attained without hardship."
Hence, you intensified your joyous effort
Without concern for yourself.*

In summary, it is just as has been said in the *Close Placement of Mindfulness (Saddharma-smṛtyupasthana)*:

*The one basis for afflictions
Is laziness. Who has it?
Wherever laziness is present,
All Dharma is absent.*

Thus you should make effort to generate the joyous effort that prevents laziness. You must make effort to dispel the adverse conditions to joyous effort and to generate the four powers that are the conducive conditions. Adverse conditions are:

¹⁵² *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 206, chapter on *The Perfection of Joyous Effort*

¹⁵³ Cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 206, chapter on *The Perfection of Joyous Effort*

(1) non-engagement in virtuous Dharma despite seeing that one has the ability to accomplish it, and

(2) discouragement thinking, “How can I do it?”

Also the first is of two types:

(1a) procrastination that thinks, “I still have time,” and

(1b) being overwhelmed by attachment to negative activities. [296]

The first (1a) should be abandoned with its antidote, contemplating that: (i) the body that has been obtained will quickly disintegrate, (ii) after dying I will fall into the bad migrations, and (iii) the leisures and endowments are difficult to gain.

The second (1b) should be abandoned with its antidote, contemplating¹⁵⁴ that: (i) the sacred Dharma is the cause of infinite joy in this and future lives, (ii) distractions such as meaningless chatter degenerate the great purpose in this life, and (iii) they are the sources that will generate much suffering in future lives.

Also discouragement (2) is of three types:

(2a) the discouragement thinking, “Since the objects to be attained, the excellent qualities of a buddha are infinite, I cannot attain them,”

(2b) the discouragement thinking, “I cannot accomplish the innumerable difficult deeds such as giving my hands and legs away,” and

(2c) the discouragement thinking, “Since I must take infinite rebirths in cyclic existence, at that time I cannot bear the sufferings of cyclic existence,”

As an antidote to the first (2a), think, “It is not that those who have become buddhas had already obtained the high paths in the past; they were just like me, then they went to highness and became buddhas. The Teacher even taught that those who are much more inferior to me will attain buddhahood. Thus why would I not attain it if I do not give up striving?”

As an antidote to the second (2b), think, “As long I generate the discrimination that giving my body and the like is difficult to perform, I will not give them away. When I give them away, similar to the giving of vegetables and the like, it will be not difficult.”

As an antidote to the third (2c), think, “Bodhisattvas have abandoned negativities, whereby sufferings that are the results of negativities will not arise. Due to the realization that the sufferings of cyclic existence lack inherent existence like illusions, there is no suffering in their mind. When the happiness of body and mind are developed, even though they stay in cyclic existence, there is nothing to be disheartened about.”

Thus abandon discouragement. [297]

Hence, reflecting on the drawbacks of laziness and the benefits of joyous effort through various means, I should make effort to undertake joyous effort. The Foremost Tamche Khyenpa [Tsongkhapa] says [in his *Prayer of the Virtuous Beginning, Middle, and End*] (stanza 20)¹⁵⁵:

*May I completely abandon the three types of laziness that cause the decline of
The attainment of wholesome qualities not yet attained and
Prevent the increase more and more of those already attained,*

¹⁵⁴ Bsags is emended to read bsams.

¹⁵⁵ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 205, chapter on *The Perfection of Joyous Effort*

And undertake joyous effort!

Gyeltshab Thamche Khyenpa says:

*Since the initial embarking and the culmination of that embarked upon
Are contingent upon undertaking joyous effort with endeavor,
Those who seek complete liberation and are diligent in the accomplishments
Should generate the joyous effort complete in the four powers.*

The Great Fifth Kunkhyen, [the Fifth Dalai Lama Losang Gyatso,] says:

*Understanding that there is no time left and what the appearances of this life are like,
Without frittering away your time, wield the whip of
Striving in the sacred Dharma that accomplishes everlasting happiness
And definitely proceed to the island of liberation.*

3B2B-2B3B-2. Title of the chapter

The Seventh Chapter on Teachings on Joyous Effort from *Engaging the Deeds of a Bodhisattva*.

This is easy to understand.

Chapter Eight

Teachings on Concentration

{297}

3B2B-2B3C. How to train in the concentration which is included in calm-abiding

3B2B-2B3C-1. Explanation of the text of the chapter

3B2B-2B3C-2. Title of the chapter

3B2B-2B3C-1. Explanation of the text of the chapter

3B2B-2B3C-1A. Advice on the necessity of cultivating concentration {298}

3B2B-2B3C-1B. Abandoning the discordant class of calm-abiding

3B2B-2B3C-1C. How to cultivate calm-abiding

3B2B-2B3C-1A. Advice on the necessity of cultivating concentration

8.1 Having developed joyous effort in that way,
 I should place my mind in meditative stabilization;
 The man whose mind is distracted
 Dwells between the fangs of afflictions.

8.2 Through isolation of body and mind
 No distractions will occur;
 Therefore, I should abandon the world
 And completely discard conceptualizations.

Having developed joyous effort that is enthusiastic about virtue in the way explained previously, I should place my mind in meditative stabilization; the man whose mind is distracted by laxity and excitement dwells between the fangs of afflictions which are like poisonous creatures, because he will be quickly destroyed by them.

QUESTION: How does one abandon distractions?

RESPONSE: Through isolation of body and mind from the busyness and the conceptualizations of desire and so forth, distractions – the discordant class of meditative stabilization – will not occur. Therefore, as the method for isolating the body, I should abandon the busyness of associating with friends, relatives and the like who are worldly beings, and as the method for isolating the mind, I should completely discard conceptualizations and the like in regard to the good qualities of desirable objects. If it is said in the sutras that it is rare for those whose minds are distracted to generate a mundane concentration, what need is there to mention about unsurpassed enlightenment? Therefore, until I achieve unsurpassed enlightenment, I shall not let my mind be distracted.

3B2B-2B3C-1B. Abandoning the discordant class of calm-abiding

3B2B-2B3C-1B1. Abandoning busyness of the world and so forth {299}

3B2B-2B3C-1B2. Abandoning erroneous conceptualizations

3B2B-2B3C-1B1. Abandoning busyness of the world and so forth

3B2B-2B3C-1B1A. Having identified the antidotes, the method for generating them

3B2B-2B3C-1B1B. Having contemplated the drawbacks of busyness, the benefits of relying upon isolation

3B2B-2B3C-1B1A. Having identified the antidotes, the method for generating them

- 8.3 Because of attachment and due to craving for material gain and the like,
 The world is not abandoned.
 Therefore, I shall entirely abandon these;
 The skilled analyze in this way.
- 8.4 Having understood that afflictions are completely destroyed
 By special insight endowed with calm abiding,
 First of all I should search for calm abiding.
 Further, this is achieved with joy by those unattached to the world.
- 8.5 Because of the attachment one impermanent being
 Has for impermanent beings,
 He will not see his beloved ones
 For thousands of lives.
- 8.6 Not seeing them I will not be happy.
 Also my mind will not be set in equipoise;
 Even if I see them there will be no satisfaction,
 Whereby, as before, I will be tormented by craving.
- 8.7 Through being attached to sentient beings,
 I will be completely obscured from the perfect reality.
 My mind of disillusion will also be destroyed.
 In the end I will be tormented by sorrow.
- 8.8 By only thinking of them,
 This life will pass without any meaning.
 Friends and relatives lacking permanence
 Will even destroy the everlasting Dharma.
- 8.9 If I behave in the same way as those equal in fortune to the childish
 I will certainly proceed to lower realms.
 If I am led there to those unequal in fortune, {300}
 What is the use of entrusting myself to the childish?
- 8.10 One moment they are friends
 And in a while they become enemies.
 Since they become angry even at the sources of joy,
 It is difficult to please ordinary people.
- 8.11 They are angry when something of benefit is said
 And they also turn me away from benefit.
 If I do not listen to what they say,
 Becoming angry, they will proceed to lower realms.

- 8.12 They are envious of superiors, competitive with equals,
And proud towards inferiors. They are conceited when praised,
And if anything unpleasant is said they get angry;
When is any benefit obtained from the childish?
- 8.13 Through associating with the childish,
Non-virtue will certainly ensue,
Such as praising myself and belittling others
And discussing the joys of cyclic existence.
- 8.14 Others and I relying [upon each other] in this way
Will bring about nothing but ruin.
They will not enact my purpose
And I too will not enact their purpose.
- 8.15 I should flee far away from childish people.
When they are encountered, I should please them joyfully.
I should behave well, merely ordinarily,
Without becoming greatly familiar.
- 8.16 In the same way a bee takes honey from a flower,
I should take merely the purpose of Dharma
And remain unfamiliar
As though I have never seen all of them before.
- 8.17 “I have many possessions as well as honor,
And many people like me,”
Nurturing conceit in this way
I shall be made terrified after death.
- 8.18 So, thoroughly confused mind,
By the combination of whatever attachments
To this and that, {301} multiplying into thousands,
Suffering will ensue and arise.
- 8.19 Hence, the wise should not be attached;
Fear is produced from attachment.
Firmly understand well
That it is the nature of these things to be discarded!
- 8.20 Although I may have many possessions,
Be famous and well spoken of,
I do not know where
The collection of possessions and renown will go.

8.21 If there is someone who derides me,
 What is there for me to be happy about in being praised?
 And if there is another who praises me,
 What is there for me to be unhappy about in being derided?

Because of attachment to inner sentient beings and due to craving for outer material gain, honor, verses [of praise], and the like, in dependence on adherence to I and mine, worldly adherence is not abandoned. Therefore, I shall entirely abandon these cravings in regard to the outer and the inner. Those skilled in the adoption [of the objects of cultivation] and the discarding [of the objects of abandonment] should analyze and contemplate in the way explained below.

Having understood that afflictions of the three realms along with their seeds are completely destroyed by the special insight realizing emptiness which is endowed with the mount of calm abiding free from laxity and excitement in which the bliss of physical and mental pliancy have been induced, in order to achieve the special insight in which the force of analyzing the meaning of reality is able to induce pliancy, {302} first of all I should search for calm abiding, because without first achieving calm-abiding, it is impossible to generate special insight.

Further, this is achieved with joy by those unattached to the worldly outer and inner body, resources and the like, because those attached to them come under the control of laxity and excitement.

The drawbacks of attachment are as follows. Because of the attachment to loved ones, one impermanent being (who himself will quickly die) has for impermanent beings such as friends and relatives, the fruitional result is that he will not see his beloved ones for thousands of lives, that is, he will not see them forever.

QUESTION: What will happen as a result of not seeing attractive things?

RESPONSE: Not seeing them I will not be happy. Due to mental unhappiness, my mind will be distracted, thus also my mind will not be set in equipoise with respect to meditative stabilization and I will not obtain happiness; even if I see beautiful things there will be no satisfaction due to craving, whereby, as before at the time of not seeing and desiring [to see it], I will be tormented by craving.

For that reason, through being attached to sentient beings, I will be completely obscured from the perfect reality, that is, I will be hindered from directly seeing ultimate truth. Due to my craving for contaminated things, my mind of disillusion towards cyclic existence also will be destroyed, whereby I will not attain liberation.

In the end due to separation from what is attractive, I will be tormented by sorrow. By only thinking repeatedly of the objects of desire, {303} this life will pass without any meaning, whereby my leisures and endowments will go to waste.

Friends and relatives lacking permanence due to quickly being separated from, will even destroy and degenerate everlasting liberation, which is immutable, and the excellent Dharma, the method for attaining it. If I behave in the same way as those equal in fortune to the childish, I will certainly proceed to lower realms. If I am led to those unequal in fortune to the superior beings and [to those unequal in fortune to] those who have obtained a human body presently, what is the use of entrusting myself to childish, ordinary beings? This is because I will not achieve my desired aims and what is undesirable will increase.

Due to their unstable mental continua, one moment they are friends and in a moment of uttering the slightest unpleasant words, they become enemies. Since they become angry even when involved in the sources of joy, virtue, it is difficult to please the childish, ordinary people.

They are angry when something of benefit is said and, besides that, through various means they also turn me away from virtue, the cause of benefit. If I do not listen to what they say, becoming angry with me, they will proceed to lower realms.

They are envious of those superior to them, competitive with equals, and, observing those inferior to them, become proud. They generate conceit when praised, and if anything unpleasant is said they get angry; when is any benefit obtained from the childish? It is not obtained. Not only that, in addition, {304} through associating with the childish, no matter what, non-virtue will certainly ensue, such as praising myself in [the presence of] other childish companions and belittling others and discussing the joys of cyclic existence – kings, citizens, and so forth. Hence, I should not associate with the childish.

Other childish beings and I relying upon each other in this way will bring about nothing but ruin since we will become companions in negativities. Those childish ordinary beings will not enact any purpose beneficial to me and I too will not enact their purpose. Therefore I should flee far away from childish people.

Sometimes when they are encountered, I should please them joyfully. I should behave well free from attachment and hatred merely in ordinary comportment¹⁵⁶ without become too greatly familiar.

Even when I go begging for alms in town and the like, in the same way a bee takes honey from a flower without getting attached to its color, I should take religious robes and alms merely for the purpose of Dharma – the body abiding and then practicing the Dharma – and remain unfamiliar with busyness as though I have never seen all of the beings before.

“I have many possessions, I have honor, and many people like me,” nurturing conceit and arrogance in this way, due to proceeding to hell because of the misdeeds of pride and attachment, I shall be made terrified after death.

So, you, mind which is thoroughly confused regarding beneficial actions, by the combination, that is, totaling up of as many attachments as there are objects, {305} multiplying into thousands, suffering results will ensue and arise. Hence, those who are wise regarding what is to be adopted and what is to be discarded should not be attached to possessions and honor, because fear in the bad migrations is produced from attachment. Although these objects of attachment arise, they are not trustworthy. With firm conviction, understand well that it is the nature of these things to be inevitably discarded!

Although I may have many possessions, be famous and well spoken of, at the time of death, I do not know where the collection of possessions and renown will go – meaning that they will not accompany me at the time of death.

Attachment and aversion to praise and derision is inappropriate. If there is someone who derides me behind my back, what is there for me to be happy about in being praised to my face by someone else? For, there is hindrance to that happiness. And if there is another who praises me, what is there for me to be unhappy about in being derided by someone else? I will not become exalted or lowly due to praise and derision. Hence I should not have attachment and aversion to them.

¹⁵⁶ Tibetan: *brda phrad pa*

3B2B-2B3C-1B1B. Having contemplated the drawbacks of busyness, meditating on the benefits of relying upon isolation

- 8.22 If even the Victor is unable to please
The beings of various inclinations,
Then what need to mention about a negative person such as I?
Therefore, I should give up worldly thought.
- 8.23 They deride sentient beings who have no possessions
And say bad things about those who do; {306}
How will they who are by nature difficult to get along with
Produce happiness?
- 8.24 It has been said by the tathagatas,
“Never befriend the childish,”
Because without their welfare,
These childish ones will not be happy.
- 8.25 When shall I come to dwell with these delights
Of deer, birds, and trees in the forests
That say nothing unpleasant
When associated with?
- 8.26 I shall dwell in caves,
In empty shrines or at the feet of trees.
When shall I not look back
And be without attachment?
- 8.27 When shall I come to dwell
In places not held to as “mine,”
Which are by nature spacious
And where I may behave¹⁵⁷ freely without attachment?
- 8.28 When shall I come to live without fear
Having slight things such as a begging bowl,
Wearing clothes not wanted by all
And not even hiding this body?
- 8.29 Having gone to the charnel grounds,
When shall I deduce
That this body of mine and the skeletons of others
Bear the property of disintegration?
- 8.30 This very body of mine will also become so.
Because of its odor, not even the foxes
Will come close to this body of mine;

¹⁵⁷ *Spod* is emended to read *spyod*.

There will come a time when such will happen.

- 8.31 Although this body arose as a unit,
The bones and flesh with which it was born
Will break up and separate.
What need is there to mention other friends?
- 8.32 At birth I was born alone,
And at death too I shall die alone; {307}
If the suffering doom cannot be taken on by others,
Of what use are hindering friends?
- 8.33 In the same way as those who have embarked on the road
Own a place of stay,
Likewise those who have embarked on the path of existence
Own an abode of birth.
- 8.34 Until the time comes for it
To be supported by four pall-bearers, from that,
While the world is completely stricken,
Till then I shall retire to the forest.
- 8.35 Befriending no one and begrudging no one,
This body will dwell alone in solitude.
If I am already counted as dead even before,
Even when I die there will be no mourners.
- 8.36 There will be no one around
To harm me with their mourning,
Thus there will be no one to distract me
From my recollections of the Buddha and the like.
- 8.37 Therefore I shall dwell alone,
Happy and contented due to insignificant difficulties,
In very delightful forests,
Pacifying all distractions.

If even the Victor who enacts purposes with diverse exalted activities is unable to please the beings of various inclinations, then what need to mention that a negative person such as I who does not know their mentality is unable to please them? Therefore, I should give up the thought to associate with worldly beings.

They admonish sentient beings who have no friends and possessions, saying, "In the past you failed to create merit," and deride them, and they say bad things about those who have possessions, "They practice wrong livelihood"; they are by nature difficult to get along. Hence, how will these childish ones produce happiness in me? They will not, thereby I should not associate with them. {308}

It has been said by the tathagatas, “Never befriend the childish ordinary beings,” because without their welfare excelling that of others, these childish ones will not be happy no matter what.

The *Moon Lamp Sutra* (*Candra-pradipa-sutra*) says:

*Do not make friends with ordinary beings.
Even if you speak words endowed with the Dharma,
They do not believe in them. This graphic display of
Aversion and anger is the action of the childish.*

And:

*Having understood the familiarity of the childish ones’ nature –
“Even if you devote well over a long period to the childish,
They will in return become hated enemies” –
The wise do not trust the childish.*

Thus the wise ones who have heard much [Dharma] and are weary of busyness abandon associating with the childish and make wishes in the following manner to abide in the Four Arya Lineages¹⁵⁸ in an isolated place, such as in an isolated forest of medicinal plants. I should make the wish, “When shall I come to dwell with these delights of deer, birds, and trees in the forests that say nothing unpleasant when associated with?” Dwelling in caves of rock and earth, in empty shrines or at the foot of trees for as long as I wish, I do not want to revert to the life of a householder and the like that I have previously given up. Therefore I should make the wish, “When shall I not look back? When shall I be without attachment to them?”

I should make the wish, “When shall I come to dwell in places not held to by others as “mine” which are by nature spacious {309} and where I may behave freely without attachment to any kind of enjoyment?” Again and again I should make the wish, “When shall I come to live without fear of robbers, thieves, and the like, having a few slight things such as a begging bowl fashioned from earth, a water vessel, and so forth, wearing clothes and the like not wanted by all other beings, and, since I have nothing to be stolen from, not even hiding this body in a location of demons?” Through application I should also put them into practice.

Take to mind that your body is impermanent as follows. I should make the wish, “Having gone to the charnel grounds, when shall I deduce that ‘The skeletons of others who have died and this body of mine are similar in bearing the property of disintegration; this body of mine also bears such a property?’” Generate discrimination of it being swollen and rotting and so forth just as it has been taught in the Victor’s Mothers [i.e., the Perfection of Wisdom Sutras].

Produce the awareness of unclean [nature] as follows. Equalize one’s body with a corpse in the charnel grounds, thinking, “This itself will also become rotten. Because of its odor, not even the foxes who crave for filth will come close to this body of mine due to the stench; there will come a time when I will become as though nothing.”

Although this body arose as a unit, the bones and flesh with which it was born will break up and separate. {310} If that is the case, what need is there to mention about separation from other friends who came forth through the force of individual unrelated karma? Contemplate that I shall be quickly separated from them.

¹⁵⁸ These are: (1) contentment with just mediocre religious robes, (2) contentment with just mediocre lodging and bedding, (3) contentment with just mediocre alms, and (4) joy in abandonment and cultivation.

Even though we may remain together for a little while, it is purposeless to adhere to them. At birth I was born alone, and at death too I shall die alone; if the eons¹⁵⁹ of the suffering of fruition of negativities accumulated in dependence on them cannot be taken on by others, of what use are friends who act as hindrances to virtue? Since there is not the slightest benefit, attachment is inappropriate.

In the same way as travelers who have embarked on the road own a place of stay for a day at some lodge, likewise those who have embarked on the path of [cyclic] existence through the force of karma own an abode of birth in some class [from among the six classes of beings], relatives who are blood relations and so forth, and some birth source. Since there is nothing more other than that, attachment is inappropriate.

The end of birth is none other than death. Until the time comes for my corpse to be supported by four pall-bearers from that bed from my dwelling while worldly people who are my friends and relatives are completely stricken by grief when I die, till then I shall retire to the forest and devote myself to isolation.

QUESTION: What are the benefits of dwelling in the forest?

RESPONSE: Befriending no one who will cause the arising of attachment and aversion, and begrudging no one who will cause me fear of being harmed, this body of mine will dwell alone in solitude. If, due to having discarded friends and relatives I am already counted as dead even before I die, {311} because of being free from attachment, even when I die there will be no mourners.

In the isolated forests there will be no friends, enemies, and so forth around to harm me with their mourning, thus there will be no one to distract this person dwelling in the forests from meditating on the paths to liberation and omniscience, such as the recollections of the Buddha. Hence the wise abandon busyness and abide in the forests.

Therefore I shall dwell alone, happy and contented due to insignificant difficulties (since one's sustenance is easily found) and freedom from harm from sickness and the like, in very delightful forests, that is, forests that enhance bliss in the body and mind, pacifying all distractions. For, harm will be small and virtue will increase.

3B2B-2B3C-1B2. Abandoning erroneous conceptualizations

3B2B-2B3C-1B2A. Cultivating despondency towards objects of desire

3B2B-2B3C-1B2B. Cultivating joy for solitude

3B2B-2B3C-1B2A. Cultivating despondency towards objects of desire

8.38 Having given up all other thoughts,
 With only one thought in me,
 I shall strive in order to set my mind in equipoise
 And in order to subdue it.

8.39 Both in this world and the next
 Desires give rise to great misfortune,
 Establishing in this one killing, bondage, and flaying,
 And hells and the like in the next.

¹⁵⁹ JN: "fortune" (*skal pa*) changed to "eon" (*skal pa*) in accordance with Geshe Jampa Gyatso's commentary.

- 8.40 For their sake many requests
Are first made through male and female messengers.
Negativities and notoriety too {312}
Are not shunned for their sake.
- 8.41 You even engage in fearful deeds for them
And will even exhaust your wealth.
You greatly enjoy
Completely embracing them.
- 8.42 If they are nothing other than skeletons,
Rather than being so desirous and completely obsessed
Towards that which neither is under your control nor belongs to you,
Why do you not go to the state beyond sorrow?
- 8.43 In the first place, making effort, you lifted [her face] and drew it [towards
you].
However she bashfully looked down.
Previously whether anyone looked or not,
Her face was covered with a veil.
- 8.44 But now why do you run away
Upon directly beholding
This face of afflictions
As it is being removed by the vultures?
- 8.45 You completely guarded it
Even when others cast their eyes upon it.
Why, miser, do you not guard it
While they are devouring it?
- 8.46 If, having seen this heap of flesh,
The vultures and others eat it,
Why do you make offerings of flower garlands, sandalwood, and ornaments
To the food of others?
- 8.47 If you are frightened by the skeletons you see
Even though they do not move,
Why are you not frightened by that similar to a zombie
Which is moved around by a few [intentions]?
- 8.48 You are attached to it even when it is covered.
Why do you not desire it when it is uncovered?
If you have no need for it,
Why do you embrace it when it is covered?

- 8.49 If both excrement and saliva
Arise solely from food,
Why do you dislike excrement
And find joy in saliva?
- 8.50 Cotton too is soft to the touch, {313}
But while you find no delight in a pillow,
You think, "It does not smell,"
Lustful One, you are confused as to what is unclean!
- 8.51 Thinking, "I cannot copulate with this cotton,"
Although it soft to the touch,
Confused, negative, and lustful people
Become angry towards it.
- 8.52 If you have no attachment to the unclean,
Then why do you copulate with another
Which is a cage of bone tied together with muscles,
Plastered over with the mud of flesh?
- 8.53 You yourself have many unclean things
That you constantly have to utilize;
Out of obsession for the unclean
Also in other bags of filth, [why do] you desire it?
- 8.54 "I delight in this flesh."
If this is what you wish to touch and behold,
Why do you not desire flesh in its natural state
Devoid of mind?
- 8.55 Any mind that you may desire
Cannot be touched or beheld,
And whatever you are able to [touch] will not be consciousness;
What is the use of embracing the meaningless?
- 8.56 It is not so strange that you do not realize
The bodies of others to be of an unclean nature,
But it is indeed strange that you do not realize
You yourself to be just unclean.
- 8.57 Having forsaken the young lotus flower
Unfolded by beams of sunlight free from cloud,
Why, with a mind adhering to the unclean,
Do you take joy in a cage of filth?

- 8.58 Since you do not desire to touch
A place that is sullied by filth,
Then why do you desire to touch the body
From which that arose?
- 8.59 If you are not attached to what is unclean,
Why do you copulate with others {314}
Which arise from the field of the unclean
And are produced by its seeds?
- 8.60 You have no desire for a small dirty maggot
Which has come from filth.
[Why] do you desire the body which is in the nature of many impurities,
And is also produced from filth?
- 8.61 Not only do you not disparage
The uncleanliness of you yourself,
But out of obsession for unclean bags of filth,
You desire others as well.
- 8.62 Even attractive things such as camphor,
Cooked rice, and vegetables,
Make the ground dirty and filthy
Should they be spat out after being put into the mouth.
- 8.63 Although such uncleanliness is obvious,
If I have doubt, then I should look at the unclean bodies
That have been disposed of
At the charnel grounds.
- 8.64 Although they understand that they will generate great fear
Of that from which the skin is rent open,
In any case they will again generate joy
Towards those themselves.
- 8.65 The scents which anointed the bodies
Are sandalwood and the like, not that of others.
Why are you attached to others
Because of scents of something else?
- 8.66 Since it has a naturally foul odor,
Isn't it good to be unattached to it?
Why do those who crave for the meaningless things of the world
Anoint it with pleasant scents?

- 8.67 However, if that pleasant scent is sandalwood,
 How can it arise here in the body?
 Why am I attached to others
 Because of scents of something else?
- 8.68 If the naked body in its natural state {315}
 Is very frightening due to its long hair and nails,
 And yellowish foul-smelling teeth
 Being coated with the odor of dirt,
- 8.69 Why do I clean it with effort,
 Like [cleaning] a weapon that will cause me harm?
 Hence this world is completely disturbed by insanity
 Due to the effort of those who are confused about themselves.
- 8.70 When my mind is despondent in the charnel grounds
 Through having beheld nothing but skeletons,
 Will there be any joy in the charnel grounds
 Which are cities filled with moving skeletons?
- 8.71 In this way, the unclean
 Is not found without paying a price;
 Through accomplishing their purpose I exhaust myself
 And will be harmed in the hells and the like.
- 8.72 A child is unable to increase his wealth,
 So with what can he be happy when he is in the prime of life?
 When life is spent due to accumulating wealth and the like,
 Having aged, what use will sex be?
- 8.73 Some lustful negative people
 Wear themselves out by working all day
 And when they return home
 Their exhausted bodies lie prostrate like corpses.
- 8.74 Some have the suffering of afflictions of long-distance travel,
 And of being faraway.
 Although they long for women,
 They will not see them for entire years.
- 8.75 Those who wish for benefit, out of confusion,
 Even sell for the sake of that,
 But not attaining that, they are driven
 By the winds of others' actions that lack purpose.

- 8.76 Some sell their own bodies
And without any power are exploited by others.
Even when their wives give birth
Their children fall at the foot of trees and in isolated places.
- 8.77 Fools who are deceived by desire,
Wishing for a livelihood, although afraid of losing their lives,
Go to war, thinking, "I shall make a living." {316}
They become slaves for the sake of profit.
- 8.78 Some lustful people even have their bodies cut,
Some are impaled on the points of sticks,
Some are stabbed with daggers,
And others are burnt- such things as these are seen.
- 8.79 Due to the torment of collecting, guarding, and losing it,
I should understand wealth to be infinite problems.
Those who are distracted by their attachment to wealth
Have no opportunity to attain freedom from the sufferings of [cyclic] existence.
- 8.80 Desirous people
Have many disadvantages such as these and little benefit,
In the same way ox and the like drawing carriages
Eat a few mouthfuls of grass.
- 8.81 Even ox and the like can achieve [this].
Those who are pained by their actions
Destroy the perfect pleasures and endowments so difficult to find
For the sake of something of little benefit which is not so rare.
- 8.82 The objects of desire will certainly disintegrate
And then I shall fall into the hells and the like.
The hardship of exhaustion arises
For the sake of what is not very great.
- 8.83 If buddhahood itself is achieved
With just one millionth of that difficulty,
The desirous have greater suffering than
Practitioners of enlightenment, but there is no enlightenment.
- 8.84 Having contemplated the sufferings of hell and the like,
For the desirous ones,
Weapons, poison, fire, ravines, and foes
Do not compare.

Having given up all other thoughts of desire, harmful intent, and so forth, {317} with only the one thought of cultivating the two minds of enlightenment in me, I shall strive in order to set my mind in equipoise single-pointedly in virtue and to subdue it, that is, to abandon the afflictions by way of meditating on the meaning of reality in dependence on that [single-pointed equipoise]. I should make effort.

Sutra Requested by the Householder Ugra (Arya grhapati ugrapariṣcch-nama-mahayanasutra) says:

Householder, furthermore, the ordained bodhisattva abides in isolation. Therefore, why do I abide in isolation in this way? Solely abiding in isolation does not constitute training in virtue... One should investigate, thinking, “On what account shall I thus fully complete the meaning of training in virtue through my abiding in isolation?”

Due to craving for [objects of] desire, both in this world [or this life] and the next, desires give rise to great misfortune, establishing in this one killing, bondage, and flaying, and the hells and the like in the next.

The *Sutra Requested by the Girl Candrottara*¹⁶⁰ (*Candrottadarikavyakarana-nama-mahayanasutra*) says:

Due to the cause that is desire, sentient beings fall into the hells;
Due to attachment, they become hungry ghosts and animals...

For the sake of obtaining a partner, requests “Make the person so-and-so stay together with me” are made many times to male and female messengers. For the sake of women, without shunning negativities and notoriety of bad talk too, you slight these, {318} even engage in harm and the like and even exhaust your wealth for them. You greatly enjoy completely embracing women’s bodies. If those very bodies which you are attached to are nothing other than skeletons, instead of being so desirous and completely obsessed, without even the slightest purpose, towards that which neither is under your control nor belongs to you from the start, why do you not go to the state beyond sorrow? Abandoning desire, you should strive in the path of liberation.

In the first place, when the woman was new, making effort, you lifted her face and drew it [towards you]. However she bashfully looked down. Prior to going to the charnel grounds, whether another looked or not, her face was covered with a veil. But now why do you flee and run away upon directly beholding this face of afflictions and attachment now as it is being made very clear, that is, with the veil removed by the vultures at the charnel grounds at the time of having died? At this time too attachment should be appropriate.

You completely guarded your woman from the corner of your eye even when other men cast their eyes upon her. Why, miser, do you not guard her body at that time while those vultures and the like are devouring it? You should guard it out of attachment.

If, having seen this heap of flesh in the charnel grounds, others such as the vultures and foxes eat it, {319} why do you make offerings of flower garlands, sandalwood, and ornaments of gold and the like to the food of others such as vultures? It is inappropriate to wear ornaments even when alive.

¹⁶⁰ Actual title is probably *bu mo zla mchog lung bstan pa'i mdo*, *Sutra Prophesizing the Girl Candrottara*.

If you are frightened by the skeletons you see when abiding in the charnel grounds (even though they do not move) and flee, why are you not frightened by thinking that in the present when alive she is similar to a zombie which is moved around by a few motivations that are intentions? You should be frightened of her just as you would a zombie; attachment is inappropriate.

You are attached to it even when her body is covered by clothes. Why do you not desire it when it is uncovered at the time of having been discarded in the charnel grounds? You must also be desirous towards it. If you have no need for that discarded in the charnel grounds, why do you embrace it when it is covered by clothes? For, they are similar in being unclean.

OPINION: I find joy in the saliva of women.

RESPONSE: If both the results of excrement and saliva arise solely from food, their cause, why do you dislike excrement from among them and find joy in saliva? For, they are similar in arising from an unclean cause and being unclean results.

Cotton too is soft to the touch, but while you find no delight in a pillow as you would with the object of touch with respect to a woman, although a woman's body emits a putrid odor, you think, "It does not smell," Lustful One, having confused what is unclean to be clean, you become attached to it!

Thinking, "I cannot copulate with this cotton," although it soft to the touch, confused, negative, and lustful people {320} become angry towards the cotton. Therefore, since that is just erroneous adherence, you should not be attached to objects of touch.

OPINION: I have no attachment to the unclean.

RESPONSE: Then why do you copulate with another that is a cage of bone tied together with a network of muscles, plastered over with the mud of flesh - the body of a woman? That is inappropriate.

Furthermore, the body of you yourself has many unclean things that you constantly have to utilize; out of craving and obsession for the unclean also in other bags of filth, why do you desire the bodies of women without being satisfied with your own body?

OPINION: "I do not like the object of touch with respect to cotton, but I delight in this flesh of others' bodies."

RESPONSE: If this is what you wish to touch and behold, why do you not desire dead flesh in its natural state devoid of mind? If you must become desirous, then you should not be attached to the body since you do not act thus [i.e., desiring dead flesh in its natural state devoid of mind].

OPINION: I am attached to the mind of another.

RESPONSE: Any mind that you may desire cannot be touched or seen, and whatever you are able to touch will not be consciousness; what is the use of embracing and being attached to the meaningless body? Since there is not the slightest benefit, attachment is inappropriate.

"It is not so strange that you do not realize the bodies of other beings to be of an unclean nature, but it is indeed strange that you do not realize you yourself who continuously emit filth to be just unclean" are words of reproach. {321} Understanding that it is unclean, stop your attachment.

OPINION: I am attached to shape.

RESPONSE: Having forsaken attachment¹⁶¹ to the young lotus flower unfolded by beams of sunlight free from cloud, why, with a mind adhering to the unclean, do you take joy in a cage of filth? Since joy is inappropriate, attachment to the shape too is inappropriate.

Furthermore, since you do not desire to touch a place that is sullied by filth such as vomit, then why do you desire to touch the body from which that filth arose? Desire is inappropriate.

If you are not attached to what is unclean, why do you copulate with others' bodies which arise from the field of the unclean – the mother's womb – and are produced by seeds of that womb – the semen and blood of the father and mother?

Furthermore, you have no desire for a small dirty maggot which has come from filth. Why do you desire the body which is in the nature of many impurities, and is also produced from the nature of thirty-six filthy substances?

Not only do you not disparage the uncleanliness of you yourself, but out of obsession for unclean bags of filth, you desire other heaps of filth as well. This is inappropriate.

Yongdzin Tamje Khyenpa says: {322}

*This cage of bone fabricated by the craftsman of the winds of karma,
Plastered over by the mud of unclean flesh,
Is a reeking filthy depository
Emitting impurities from the nine orifices –
Brain matter, cerebral membrane, pus, blood, excrement, and urine.
Is it a source to be joyful about and attached to?
If you cannot stand even a sprinkling of droplets of excrement and urine,
Why take joy in this great depository of excrement and urine?
If even the skeletons that have been disposed of at the charnel grounds
Are fearsome and also nauseating,
Why do you not generate fear and nausea
At this zombie-like skeleton machine
That continually emits pus from the nine orifices?
When this body is discarded at the charnel grounds,
It will turn blue-black, swollen, and rotten,
Become infested with maggots and stink.
Let alone touching it, even just beholding it and a waft of its odor are
Fearsome and nauseating. Do you not generate despondency?
Without becoming attached to the bodies of oneself and others
Which are unpleasant, unclean, and smelly,
With respect to these very suffering contaminated aggregates
Meditate strongly on reversing adherence and disheartenment.*

Even attractive medicine such as camphor, or food such as cooked rice and vegetables, make the ground dirty with filth should they be spat out after being put into the mouth due to having been consumed¹⁶². Therefore attachment is inappropriate.

¹⁶¹ Tsang na de emended to read chags pa in accordance with p. 509 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa's commentary.

¹⁶² The Tibetan text nas zos pas yis is slightly awkward here. Thubten Chokyi Dragpa's commentary reads ste bor ba yis (that is, discarded) instead at this point.

Although such uncleanliness of the present body is obvious, {323} if I have doubt wondering, "Perhaps it is clean," then I should look at the unclean bodies of others that have been disposed of at the charnel grounds.

Although they understand that they will generate great fear of the body from which the skin is rent open, in any case they will generate joy again and again towards their own and women's bodies. Since that is inappropriate, they should abandon attachment by contemplating that they are similar to the corpses in the charnel grounds.

If the scents which anointed the bodies are of camphor, sandalwood, and the like, not that of others' bodies, then why are you attached to others' bodies because of scents of something unrelated?

Since the body has a naturally foul odor, is it not good to be unattached to it? For, attachment to the body acts as the cause for multitudes of suffering. Why do those who crave for the meaningless things of the world anoint this body with pleasant scents such as that of sandalwood for the sake of becoming attached to the body?

However, if that pleasant scent is the quality of sandalwood, how can that quality of pleasant scent arise here in the body? Since it is never so, why am I attached to others because of scents of something else? It is inappropriate.

OPINION: By cleaning the hair, teeth, and so forth, it becomes beautiful and is an object to be desired.

RESPONSE: Since the naked body in its natural state is very frightening due to its long hair and nails, and yellowish foul-smelling teeth being coated with the odor of dirt, {324} why do I clean it with effort, like [cleaning] a weapon that will cause me harm, that will kill me? Hence this world is completely disturbed by, that is, pervaded by, the insanity of continua disturbed by afflictions due to the effort of those beings who are confused about themselves.

When my mind is despondent regarding the bodies in the charnel grounds through having beheld nothing but skeletons in the charnel grounds, will there be any joy in the charnel grounds that are cities filled with skeletons set in motion and moved by the force of motivations? Joy is inappropriate.

In this way, the unclean - bodies of women - are not found without paying the price of wealth and the like; through accomplishing the purpose of those and my own body, I exhaust myself with fatigue in this life and will be harmed in the hells and the like in future lives.

A child is unable to increase his wealth for the sake of obtaining a woman when he is young, so with what enjoyment can he be happy when he is in the prime of life, since he has not obtained that? When life is spent due to accumulating wealth and the like during the prime of life, the body having aged, what use will sex be? He will not be able to indulge in it.

Some lustful negative people such as slaves wear their bodies out by working all day and when they return home at night, their exhausted bodies lie prostrate like corpses, whereby they are unable to think of sex and indulge in it.

Some have the suffering of afflictions of long-distance travel, and of being far away from their own homeland. {325} Although they long to meet women, they will not see them for a long time in entire years. If that is the case, what need is there to mention about indulging in sex?

Those who wish benefit for themselves, out of confusion regarding its method, even sell their bodies for the sake of wealth and the like, but not attaining the wages, they are driven powerlessly by the winds of others' actions that lack the purpose of benefiting them. Hence,

they will experience suffering in both this and future lives and fail to obtain the purpose of desire.

Some people sell their own bodies as slaves and without any power are exploited by others. Even when their wives give birth, since they are homeless, their children fall at the foot of trees and in isolated places, and need to remain¹⁶³ there.

Fools who are deceived by desire, wishing for a livelihood, out of the wish to sustain their lives for a long time, although afraid of losing their lives, go to war for the sake of wealth, thinking, “I shall make a living through gain.” They become slaves for the sake of seeking profit for themselves, thereby experiencing various sufferings.

For the sake of desire, some lustful people even have their bodies cut, some are impaled on the points of sticks due to punishment by the king, some are stabbed with daggers, pierced by swords, and the like, and others are severely burnt in fire – such things as these are seen.

Due to the torment of collecting, guarding, and finally losing wealth, I should understand wealth to be the root of infinite problems at all times. {326} Those whose minds are distracted to various objects by their attachment to wealth have no opportunity to attain liberation through being free from the sufferings of [cyclic] existence due to being reborn in cyclic existence again and again by the force of karma.

Desirous people who have craving to objects of desire for the sake of merely this life have many disadvantages such as the sufferings explained above and little benefit of happiness in the same way as, for example, ox and the like drawing carriages eat a few mouthfuls of grass while on the move.

The accomplishing of happiness and the dispelling of suffering for the sake of merely this life is present in animals that are more powerful than human beings. Even though ox and the like can achieve such, the happiness of this life (which is not so rare) is something of very little benefit. For the sake of it, those who are pained by their actions of craving for erroneous objects destroy and waste the perfect leisures and endowments (that are of great value when found and so difficult to find). Contemplating these disadvantages, you should make effort in taking the essence upon the support of leisures and endowments.

The objects of desire such as the happiness of royal status will certainly disintegrate and then I shall fall into the hells and the like out of attachment to them. Therefore, due to my being enslaved to objects of desire since beginningless time for the sake of what is not very great, the hardship of exhaustion arises. If buddhahood itself is achieved easily with the difficulty of hardships just a millionth part of that, you should not act like those who are attached to bad things. {327} The suffering experienced by the desirous ones for the sake of obtaining objects of desire is greater suffering than that of practitioners who are accomplishing enlightenment, but the result of those objects of desire is not even enlightenment. If you have contemplated the resultant sufferings of hell and the like due to performing negativities for the sake of objects of desire, [you will see that] for the desirous ones, even the disadvantages of weapons, poison, fire, ravines, and foes do not compare to the harm of objects of desire. Hence you should not be attached to objects of desire.

¹⁶³ *Btsal* (that is, search) emended to read *bca'* in accordance with p. 517 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa's commentary.

3B2B-2B3C-1B2B. Cultivating joy for solitude

- 8.85 Having in this way developed disillusion to objects of desire,
 I should generate joy for solitude.
 Within pacified forests
 Devoid of disputes and afflictions,
- 8.86 The fortunate ones, at joyful mansions of vast flat stones
 Cooled by the sandalwood moonlight and
 By the stirring peaceful forest breeze free from noise,
 Think of what is of benefit for others and stroll there.
- 8.87 They dwell for as long as they wish
 In empty houses, at the foot of trees and in caves,
 Having abandoned the suffering of owning and guarding [possessions],
 They are carefree without concern.
- 8.88 Utilizing freely without attachment,
 Having no ties with anyone,
 Even lords have difficulty finding
 That which is the enjoyment of happy contentment.

Having in this way developed disillusionment to objects of desire as explained above, I should generate joy for solitude and accomplish concentration in isolation.

QUALM: How should I abide in a place of solitude? {328}

RESPONSE: Just as a wheel-turning king is free from rivals and enjoys happiness with regards to the objects of desire, within forests pacified of distractions that are devoid of outer disputes and afflictions such as the conditions of attachment and hatred of others, the fortunate ones who have behaved well in the past, at very vast flat joyful stones that are mansion-like, as though an abode anointed and cooled by the cool sandalwood moonlight, at a place that is beautified by the stirring soft peaceful forest breeze free from noise discordant with the mind, think of what is of benefit for others, such as meditating on bodhichitta and stroll there. Thus the yogis' reliance upon solitude is superior to any kind of happiness of worldly beings.

They dwell for as long as they wish in empty houses that are free from other beings, at the foot of trees and in mountain caves, having abandoned the suffering of owning many possessions and guarding them without deterioration, they abide carefree without the concern of worries. Utilizing freely the dwelling, resources, and so forth as they wish without attachment at places that have no ties with anyone, even lords of gods and humans have difficulty finding that which is the enjoyment of happiness of contentment with just mediocre food, clothes, and so forth. Hence the skillful should make effort in relying upon solitude. {329}

Yongdzin Tamje Khyenpa says:

*Mount Meru, bearing a bound top hair-knot of snow,
An upper garment of prairies bedecked with flowers,
A lower garment of forests and a waistband of fog –
A place of concentration as though created by the gods.*

Free from foes, friends, expectations and qualms,
An isolated forest with small difficulties; in happiness and comfort,
Enjoy the glory of the nectar of contentment;
You should experience the banquet of happiness of this life.
In order to obscure the robbers and thieves of busyness and distraction,
As though purposely fabricated by the craftsmen of the gods,
Neatly arranged rows of fine trees,
The pistils of the thousand-petal [lotuses] emitting fragrances everywhere,
When stirred by the force of the moving breeze,
The branches of the trees step into dance,
“Those cultivating single-pointed concentration, come here!”
As though beckoning due to having been moved by joy.
The youth of waterfall donning a necklace of pearls
Resounds a continuous streaming tinkle of melodious song.
Having resplendent petals like the bow of Lord [Indra],
The tinkling of little bells on the neck of Reborn [Brahma]
Is like a competition of the melodious songs of the smell-eaters,
Hands adorned with the balls of honey,
Along with dance of soaring youths of bees,
With the song of the many-stringed [lute], hearing, retaining, absorbing,
Accumulating, guarding, abandoning,
Looking for food temporarily,
Living suitably in moderation without harming others {330}
As though displaying contentment for concentration,
The relaxed deer turns its neck and looks.
In order not to fall into the extremes of [cyclic] existence and [solitary] peace,
Like an urging “Train too in dexterity in method and wisdom,”
Apes and monkeys train in dexterity
In jumping from one treetop to another, providing a huge spectacle,
Drinks of nectar possessing the eight branches¹⁶⁴,
Many types of special vegetables,
Variety of fruits that grow from non-confusion
Grow neatly around the places of repose.
“What is the use of seeking the city
While there are such foods that are very easy to find
By the hosts of birds who live on juniper berries?”
Resound the multitudes of noise gathered indirectly.
From the treetops some [reborn] birds repeatedly shout and urge,
“Hey, hey, do not be distracted, do not be distracted! Practice single-pointedly!
Such an occasion of leisure is difficult to find!”
The rush of the waterfall without remaining still for an instant,
Dance of the shifting billowing water-holder [clouds] and
Transformation of the leaves, flowers, and fruits

¹⁶⁴The eight branches or qualities of water are: (1) sweet, (2) cool, (3) soft, (4) light, (5) clear, (6) clean, (7) not harmful to the throat, and (8) beneficial to the abdomen.

Teach and urge: “Compounded phenomena are impermanent.”
Abiding happily in contentment at
A primordial overhanging rock-shelter or cave
Or a hut of my size
Which is like a stack of slabs of moon-gem stones,
Such is difficult to find even by the Lord of Gods.
At the peak held by the west Lord of seven horses,
Dressed in red, at the time embarking on a unseen path,
As though performed purposely by the wholesome gods,
Upon a canopy of blue vaidurya in the blue sky
A row of white dakinis are beautifully arranged.
Lamps of cool rays and blazing light illuminate exceptionally.
Ferocious creatures that dwell in the forests,
Fearing harm would occur to the practitioner of concentration,
Roam and patrol every direction in the night.
Thus, at a place of isolation resembling the pleasure groves of the gods
That possess infinite excellent qualities,
On a cushion of dra-wa¹⁶⁵ herbs, upon a concentration platform,
Sit in the posture of the Victor Vairochana
And cultivate concentration single-pointedly.
On certain occasions, at the foot of fine trees,
Upon a seat of leaves of blue and green grass,
Abiding like the King of Chest-travel [Snakes],
Sustain the yoga of daytime practice.
Sometimes, on delightful prairies, plateaus, and ridges,
While remembering disheartenment for existence, compassion for migrating beings,
And illusory appearance and emptiness,
Recite the scriptures and stroll there.
On some occasions, extensively proclaim
To the infinite landlords, gods, and nagas
The melody of the nectar of pleasant Dharma of the Muni’s speech –
The mode of impermanence, suffering, emptiness, and selflessness,
Delighting and satisfying them.

3B2B-2B3C-1C. How to cultivate calm-abiding {332}

3B2B-2B3C-1C1. How to meditate on the equality of self and others

3B2B-2B3C-1C2. How to exchange self and others

3B2B-2B3C-1C1. How to meditate on the equality of self and others

8.89 Having through such ways as these
Thought about the excellences of isolation,
I should completely pacify conceptualizations
And meditate on bodhichitta.

¹⁶⁵ Tibetan: *spra ba*

- 8.90 First of all I should make an effort
To meditate upon the equality between self and others:
I should protect all as I do myself
Because of equal happiness and suffering.
- 8.91 Although there are many different divisions and aspects such as the hands,
They are same in being the body that is to be thoroughly protected.
Likewise all the different migrating beings in their happiness and suffering
Are the same in wishing to be happy just as I do.
- 8.92 My suffering
Does not cause any harm to the bodies of others.
But that is my suffering.
Due to adhering as “I,” it becomes unbearable.
- 8.93 Likewise the suffering of others
Does not befall me.
Nevertheless, that suffering of me,
Due to adhering as “I,” will be hard to bear.
- 8.94 I should dispel the suffering of others
Because it is suffering, just like my own suffering,
And I should benefit others
Because they are sentient beings, just like my body.
- 8.95 When both others and I
Are similar in wishing to be happy,
What is the difference with me?
Why do I strive for my happiness alone?
- 8.96 And when both I and others
Are similar in not wishing to suffer,
What is the difference with me?
Why do I protect myself and not others?
- 8.97 OBJECTION: I do not protect them
Because their suffering does not cause me harm.
RESPONSE: Then why protect [myself] against future suffering
If it causes me no harm? {333}
- 8.98 The conceptualization thinking
That I shall experience that is wrong.
The person who died thus is one
And that reborn is another.

- 8.99 If whenever there is suffering
That itself must protect from that,
The suffering of the foot is not that of the hand,
Why then does it protect from that?
- 8.100 OBJECTION: Although this may not be reasonable,
It is engaged in due to apprehending a self.
RESPONSE: Whatever unreasonable self and others
Should at all costs be abandoned.
- 8.101 That called “continuum” and “collection”
Are like falsities such as a rosary and an army.
The possessor of suffering does not exist,
Who has control over this?
- 8.102 The owner of suffering being non-existent,
There can be no distinction in all.
Because it is suffering, I shall dispel it:
Therefore, what is the point in that?
- 8.103 OBJECTION: Why should I avert the suffering of all?
RESPONSE: There is no ground for argument;
If I avert it, I should avert all.
If not, I am just like sentient beings.
- 8.104 OBJECTION: Since compassion will multiply suffering greatly,
Why should I diligently develop it?
RESPONSE: If one were to contemplate the suffering of migrating beings,
How could the suffering of compassion be more?
- 8.105 If by one suffering
Much suffering would be destroyed,
Kind people would produce it
For themselves and others.
- 8.106 Thus Supusha-chandra,
Although aware of the harm the king would cause him,
Did not prevent his own suffering
Because it would eradicate the suffering of many. {334}
- 8.107 One whose continuum is familiarized in this way,
Since he takes joy in pacifying others’ sufferings,
Will enter even Relentless Torment
Just as a swan enters a lotus pool.

- 8.108 Will not the ocean of joy
If all beings are free
Satisfy me?
What is the use of desiring liberation?
- 8.109 Due to that, although working for the welfare of others,
There is no conceit or amazement.
Because of the joy in others' welfare unequivocally,
There is no hope for ripening effects.
- 8.110 Therefore just as I protect myself
From unpleasant things however small,
In the same way I should act towards others
With a mind of protection and a compassionate mind.
- 8.111 Although not [my] possessions,
Through familiarity
I have come to regard
The drops of sperm and blood of others as "I".
- 8.112 So in the same way, why should I be unable
To apprehend the bodies of others as "I"?
It is not difficult to posit
My body as also "other."

Having thought about the excellences of a location that is in the outskirts due to isolation from busyness and the like through many ways like those explained above, I should completely pacify conceptualizations seeking objects of desire and so forth and meditate on *bodhichitta*.

QUALM: By means of what method should I meditate?

RESPONSE: First of all I should make an effort to meditate upon the equality between self and others.

QUALM: How?

RESPONSE: Just as I purposely accomplish my happiness and purposely stop [my] suffering, {335} through also acting like that with respect to the discarding and adopting of others' happiness and suffering, I should protect all sentient beings by cherishing them as I do myself because of equally accomplishing others' happiness and dispelling [others'] suffering.

QUALM: Since the infinite sentient beings are many, it would not be appropriate to generate the mind thinking "I" with respect to them. Hence, how can it be appropriate that the discarding and adopting of others' happiness and suffering are similar to that of mine?

RESPONSE: Although there are many different divisions of my body and aspects such as the hands and legs, they are the same in being the body that is to be thoroughly protected by the one person thinking "I." Likewise, although all the migrating beings such as god and humans are different, there is no difference in their happiness and suffering. Observing this lack of difference, I should hold all as me just like myself and I should accomplish this happiness; I should dispel this suffering.

Thinking thus is the meaning¹⁶⁶ of meditating on all of these [sentient beings] to be like that [me].

OPINION: Others' suffering does not harm me. And my suffering is alike in that it does not harm others. Hence it is incorrect that dispelling [suffering] for their sake is similar to dispelling my suffering.

RESPONSE: There is no fault. Even if my suffering does not cause any harm to the bodies of others just as the suffering of others does not harm me, it is my suffering. Due to adhering to myself as "I," my suffering becomes an unbearable occurrence. Likewise due to familiarizing with holding even other sentient beings as me, although the suffering of other sentient beings does not befall me, {336} nevertheless, that suffering of sentient beings is suffering I should dispel; due to my adhering to sentient beings as "I," if suffering were to occur to them it will be hard to bear. To state a sign with respect to this: The subject - the suffering of others - I¹⁶⁷ should dispel [it], because it is suffering, just as in the case of my own suffering.

And I should benefit others and accomplish happiness for them, because other sentient beings are sentient beings, just as in the case of accomplishing happiness for my body. Having observed the happiness and suffering of others and me, it follows that I should take the discarding and adoption [with regards to the happiness and suffering of others and me] similarly, because when both others and I are similar in wishing to be happy, what is the difference between other persons and me? Why do I strive for my happiness alone and not strive for others' happiness? And when both others and I are similar in not wishing to suffer, what is the difference between others and me? For, there is none. Why do I, not protecting the happiness of others, act for the sake of my happiness and protect [my happiness and the happiness of others] unequally? I should accomplish both equally.

OBJECTION: I do not protect them because their suffering does not cause me harm since it arises with regards to them.

RESPONSE: That is very inappropriate. It follows that it is inappropriate to accumulate wealth when young out of fear of the arising of suffering when one is old, and likewise {337} to make effort in the methods to dispel suffering today and in the morning out of fear of the arising of suffering the next day or in the afternoon. If later suffering, future suffering, also causes the previous person no harm, then why guard against it out of fear of it arising? It follows that such guarding against it is inappropriate.

OBJECTION: If in this life I do not counteract the cause of suffering of future lives, then I must experience suffering in future rebirths. Thus I should make effort in the methods to counteract it.

RESPONSE: The conceptualization thinking that the "I" of this life shall experience that suffering at the time of future rebirths is wrong, because the person who died thus is one and that person of a future rebirth is another, whereby it is inappropriate to take the two as one. Since they are different individuals, it is unreasonable for the suffering of one to be dispelled by another. This is refuted by the parallel reasoning of former and later instants being different individuals, but a refutation in reliance on the ultimate is not the meaning of the passage.

¹⁶⁶ *Ton* to emended to read *don no*.

¹⁶⁷ *Gi* emended to read *gyi*.

Furthermore, if whenever there is suffering that part of the body itself must guard against and dispel it, since the suffering of the foot (that, for example, is pierced by a thorn) is not the suffering of the hand, why then does the hand guard against the suffering of the foot? It follows that this is unreasonable.

OBJECTION: Although the dispelling of an unrelated suffering by another may not be reasonable, the dispelling of the suffering of one by another is engaged in because of being accustomed to apprehending the bodies of former and later rebirths, of the morning and afternoon, and the like as mine, as being of a self of a single person due to apprehending a self here. {338}

RESPONSE: Any unreasonable apprehension of independent self and others should at all costs be abandoned, because the apprehension of a self of persons is mistaken with respect to its object of adherence and produces all misfortunes.

OBJECTION: These two cases are not similar. Individual persons are not related but the foot and hand of a person are one collection, and old and young, as well as former and later lives, are one continuum. Hence it is reasonable for one to dispel one's suffering in the latter case. That in the former case is unreasonable.

RESPONSE: It follows that a continuum and a collection that are independent also do not exist, because that called "continuum" and "collection" are falsities which are posited through imputation upon the possessor of the continuum, many former and later, and possessor of the collection, just like falsities which are imputed upon many of their parts, such as a rosary and an army.

OBJECTION: Those which are included within the "mine" of a person are objects of control of that person, whereby the suffering of one is dispelled by another although the place and time may be different.

RESPONSE: Because that which is a self of persons who is the possessor of suffering does not exist, who is that independent person who has control over this happiness and suffering? They are similar in not being objects of control of anyone.

Therefore, the independent owner of suffering who utilizes the suffering being non-existent, there can be no distinction in all the suffering of self and others. {339} However there is suffering of those self and others who are mutually reliant, whereby it is reasonable to make effort to dispel the suffering of others as with my own suffering. Hence, because that suffering of others is also suffering, I shall dispel it; therefore, what is the point here in the ascertainment of self and others in which one differentiates between them?

OBJECTION: Why must I dispel all others' sufferings? Why should I avert the suffering of all sentient beings since they do not harm me?

RESPONSE: There is no ground for argument; thus if I avert my own suffering since it is not something desirable, I should avert all suffering. If I do not dispel others' suffering, then my own suffering is not something to be dispelled, just like the suffering of other sentient beings. Hence, by cherishing others just as I cherish myself, I should increasingly dispel their suffering.

OBJECTION: Since if I were to take as mine all others' sufferings out of compassion, suffering will multiply greatly, why should I, not abandoning suffering, diligently develop it?

RESPONSE: If a bodhisattva were to contemplate the suffering of migrating beings, how could more suffering arise through the force of compassion? It follows that this is not the case, because it will dispel all ones' suffering feelings. {340} Although a little suffering may arise, if by one suffering much cyclic existence suffering of infinite migrating beings would be

destroyed, it is worthwhile for kind people to produce such suffering for themselves and others since it is very meaningful.

Thus, just as it has been taught in the *King of Meditative Stabilization Sutra* (*Samadhirajasutra*), the Bodhisattva Supushpa-chandra, although aware of the harm of being killed himself that the king would cause him, did not prevent his own suffering; having seen that accepting it would eradicate the suffering of many sentient beings, without listening to his retinue even though they tried to stop him, he thus proceeded [to go to the king's palace].

If one's continuum is familiarized with the meditation in equalizing self and other in this way as explained above, since he takes joy in pacifying others' sufferings and wishes to dispel them, disregarding suffering, he will enter even Relentless Torment enthusiastically¹⁶⁸ just as a swan¹⁶⁹ enters a lotus pool. Hence he engages in others' welfare but there is no mental suffering.

Will not the very mind that is excellently filled with an ocean of joy if all beings were to be free from [cyclic] existence gratify and satisfy me since all desired aims will have been accomplished? What is the use of desiring my liberation alone? Remembering that all sentient beings have been my mothers, I should strive for their welfare.

Due to that exceptional joy for others' welfare, although working for the welfare of others, {341} there is no mind of conceit thinking "I am taking care of them with kindness" or amazement regarding that. Because of the joy in solely accomplishing others' welfare unequivocally, there is no hope for ripening effects.

Therefore due to the appropriateness of cultivation on the equality of self and others, just as I would protect myself from mere unpleasant words however small, in the same way I should act towards others with a mind of protection (regarding undesirables and the sufferings of others) and a compassionate mind.

OBJECTION: Since I generate neither a mind thinking "I" with regards to another's body, nor a mind thinking "my eye" with regards to another's eye, how can I generate a mind of discarding and adopting identical to my own with regards to others' happiness and suffering?

RESPONSE: This is true if there is no familiarization. However, with familiarization, although not established as my possessions, through the force of familiarity I have come to regard and apprehend the drops of sperm and blood of others – one's parents – as "I". Likewise, if there is familiarization, why would I not apprehend even others' bodies as "I"? Apprehend so! If I were to act to familiarize with it, I will generate a mind identical to that for mine. Therefore I should make effort to dispel others' sufferings through contemplating the benefits of cherishing others.

In certain translations the line "Although not [my] possessions" (in stanza 111) does not appear.

So in the same way, having intentionally stopped the cherishing of this body of mine, it is not difficult to posit it as also "other" if I were to familiarize with it like that. It is identical to familiarizing with cherishing oneself. {342}

3B2B-2B3C-1C2. How to exchange self and others

3B2B-2B3C-1C2A. Brief indication

3B2B-2B3C-1C2B. Extensive explanation

¹⁶⁸ *Spo* emended to read *spro*.

¹⁶⁹ *Dang ba* emended to read *ngang pa*.

3B2B-2B3C-1C2A. Brief indication

8.113 Having understood myself to be faulty
And to be an ocean of excellences with respect to others,
I shall cultivate completely discarding cherishing myself
And adopting others.

8.114 In the same way as the hands and so forth
Are asserted as limbs of the body,
Likewise why are embodied creatures
Not asserted as limbs of migrating beings?

Having understood cherishing myself to be the source of all mistakes whereby it is faulty and hence to be increasingly deterred, and that cherishing others is the source of all collections of goodness whereby it is an ocean of excellences, I shall cultivate (i) completely discarding cherishing myself and (ii) cherishing and adopting others.

OBJECTION: Since sentient beings are infinite, how can they be apprehended as “I”?

RESPONSE: In the same way as one’s hands and so forth, although distinctly different, are asserted as to be protected since they are limbs of one’s body, likewise, although sentient beings are many, if one were to familiarize with cherishing them, why are embodied creatures not asserted as limbs of migrating beings that are to be cherished like one’s body – objects to be protected? They should be asserted so.

3B2B-2B3C-1C2B. Extensive explanation {343}

3B2B-2B3C-1C2B-1. Explaining how to exchange self and others

3B2B-2B3C-1C2B-2. Having exchanged, how to subsequently achieve through thought

3B2B-2B3C-1C2B-3. [Having exchanged,] how to subsequently achieve through application

3B2B-2B3C-1C2B-1. Explaining how to exchange self and others

8.115 Through familiarization a mind of “I” arises
Towards this body devoid of a self;
In a similar way, why would a mind of “I” not be produced
Towards other sentient beings also through familiarization?

8.116 Although I enact others’ welfare in this way,
Conceit or amazement will not arise.
It is just like not hoping for a return
Due to having fed myself.

8.117 Therefore, just as I protect myself
From unpleasantness however slight,
In the same way I should familiarize myself
With a mind of protection towards migrating beings and a compassionate mind.

8.118 Hence, out of his great exalted compassion
The Protector Avalokiteshvara even blessed his name
To dispel the fear
Of being among migrating beings.

- 8.119 I should not turn away from what is difficult;
By the power of familiarization in this way
I will become unhappy even when someone
Whose name when heard once frightened me is not around.
- 8.120 Whoever wishes to quickly protect
Himself and others
Should practice that holy secret –
The exchanging of self for others.
- 8.121 Because of attachment to my body,
Even a small object of fear frightens me;
Who would not abhor as an enemy
This body that gives rise to fear?
- 8.122 Wishing for a procedure to alleviate
The sicknesses of hunger, thirst, and the like of the body,
I kill birds, fish and deer
And ambush [travelers] at the roads. {344}
- 8.123 For the sake of profit and honor
I kill even my father and mother
And appropriate the property of the Three Jewels.
Thus I will burn in Relentless Torment.
- 8.124 What wise man would desire,
Protect and venerate this body?
Who would not scorn it
And regard it as an enemy?
- 8.125 “If I give them, what shall I enjoy?” –
Such thinking for my own purpose is the way of ghosts;
“If I enjoy them, what shall I give?” –
Such thinking for others’ purpose is a quality of the gods.
- 8.126 If, for myself, I cause harm to others,
I shall fall into the hells and the like;
If for the sake of others, I cause harm to myself,
I shall acquire all that is magnificent.
- 8.127 Desiring eminence for myself
I shall become of unfortunate migrations, bad and stupid;
If it is shifted to others
I shall acquire honor in good migrations.

- 8.128 If I employ others for my own purposes,
I myself shall experience servitude and the like;
If I use myself for the sake of others,
I shall experience lordliness and the like.
- 8.129 Whatever joy there is in this world
All comes from desiring others to be happy,
And whatever suffering there is in this world
All comes from desiring myself to be happy.
- 8.130 What need is there to say much?
The childish work for their own purpose;
The Muni worked for others' purpose.
Look at the difference between these two!
- 8.131 If I do not correctly exchange my happiness
And the sufferings of others,
I shall not accomplish the state of buddhahood
And even in cyclic existence shall have no happiness. {345}
- 8.132 Let alone what is beyond this world –
Because of servants not doing work
And because of masters not giving pay,
Even the purpose of this life will not be fulfilled.
- 8.133 [By rejecting the method that] establishes foreseeable and unforeseeable
happiness,
The happiness of success will be completely cast away.
And because of inflicting suffering on others,
The confused will take upon terrible suffering.
- 8.134 If whatever harms,
Fear and suffering in the worlds
All arise from grasping at a self,
Then of what use¹⁷⁰ is that great ghost to me?
- 8.135 If I do not completely forsake it
I shall not be able to abandon suffering,
Just as I cannot avoid being burnt
If I do not cast aside fire.
- 8.136 Therefore, in order to pacify the harms inflicted upon me
And in order to pacify the sufferings of others,
I shall give myself up to others

¹⁷⁰ Go emended to read *ko*.

And cherish them as I do myself.

8.137 “I am under the ownership of others,”
Of this, mind, you must know certainly;
Now, except for the purpose of all sentient beings,
You must not think of anything else.

8.138 I should not accomplish my purpose
With these eyes and so forth that are under the ownership of others.
I should not do anything with eyes and so forth for [others’] purpose
That is contrary to them.

8.139 Thus sentient beings should be taken as principal.
Whatever I behold upon my body,
I should appropriate and use
For the benefit of others.

{346} OBJECTION: I am unable to familiarize with the mind that exchanges self and others.
RESPONSE: Through familiarization, a mind holding “mine” arises towards this body devoid of a self of persons; in a similar way, why would a mind of “I” not be produced towards other sentient beings also through familiarization with cherishing [others]? It will definitely be produced through familiarization.

Although I enact others’ welfare in this way, familiarizing with holding all sentient beings as “I,” conceit or amazement will not arise. For example, it is just like not hoping for a return due to having fed myself.

There are infinite benefits. Therefore, just as I protect myself from unpleasant words however slight, in the same way I should familiarize myself with a mind protecting migrating beings from suffering and with a compassionate mind. There is need to guard against even slight sufferings of sentient beings. Hence, out of his great exalted compassion the Protector Avalokiteshvara even blessed his name to dispel the fear of nervousness of being among migrating beings, saying “May the person who retains my name be free from the fear of nervousness of being among people.” The *Array of Stalks Sutra (Gandavyuhasutra)* teaches recalling [Avalokiteshvara’s] name three times.

OBJECTION: Although there are many benefits, it is difficult to familiarize with exchanging self and others.

RESPONSE: I should not turn away from what is difficult to familiarize with; I will be able to produce it if I were to familiarize with it. It is just as by the power of familiarization in this way {347} I will become unhappy even when an enemy, whose name if heard once frightened me but later became a friend, is not around. The Foremost Lama [Tsongkhapa] says [in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*]¹⁷¹ :

I will become greatly unhappy when someone who previously acted as an enemy
(whose name if heard once frightened me) but later reconciled and became a

¹⁷¹ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 52, chapter on *Exchanging Self and Other*

friend is not around. Likewise, if I were to view me like others and others like me by placing emphasis on familiarizing my mind, then it will be generated.

Thus whoever wishes to quickly protect himself and others from the troubles of [cyclic] existence and [solitary] peace should practice that holy secret, the exchanging of self for others – a secret in regard to unsuitable vessels and the final essential point of the mahayana path. Regarding the so-called “holy secret,” Yongdzin Tamje Khyenpa says:

QUALM: How is it taught that exchanging of self for others is very secret?

RESPONSE: It is taught to be a secret since: (1) there is no room in the minds of trainees of small intelligence for the essential points of the instruction of this tremendous attitude which takes upon oneself all the suffering of others and gives to others one’s own happiness and virtues due to cherishing others, and (2) it is an essential point that is merely rejoiced in but difficult to perform. It is just as it has been said by the Foremost Lama [Tsongkhapa] {348}, “Merely rejoiced in from the heart but difficult to perform by the majority of other beings, it is a basis of advice that conflicts with all the mundane. In dependence on training in the mind of enlightenment which cherishes others more than oneself and the tremendous deeds of the Victors’ Children that are induced by it, one will gain the supreme marvelous state, whereby even that as little as the mere movement of inhalation and exhalation is the physician’s great treatment method for sentient beings.”

Not exchanging self and others, even a small object of fear such as a poisonous snake frightens me greatly because of attachment to my body; therefore which wise person would not abhor as an enemy this body that gives rise to fear? Cherishing it is inappropriate.

Wishing for a procedure to alleviate the sicknesses of hunger, thirst, and the like of the body due to self-cherishing, I kill birds, fish, and deer, ambush travelers at the roads, and rob others of their possessions. For the sake of profit and honor, my cherished body kills even my beneficial father and mother and appropriates the property of the Three Jewels. Thus due to these negativities I will burn in Relentless Torment. If that is the case, what wise man would desire, protect and venerate this body due to cherishing it? Who would not scorn this body of himself and regard it as an enemy? {349} All forms of cherishing should be stopped.

“If I give wealth and the like to others, what shall I enjoy?”— such thinking out of miserliness solely for my own purpose is the way of ghosts, for it generates fear; “If I enjoy them, what shall I give to others?”— such thinking solely for others’ purpose is a quality of the gods, for all that is magnificent will arise.

If, for my happiness, I cause harm to others, such as killing others, I shall fall into the hells and the like; if for the sake of others’ happiness, I cause harm to my body and enjoyments, that is, if I focus on their purpose, I shall acquire all that is magnificent.

Desiring eminence by way of praise and fame for myself, I shall become reborn in unfortunate migrations in future lives, and even when reborn as a human being, be born into a bad race and form and be mentally stupid; if this very desire for eminence is shifted to others and familiarized with, in future lives I shall acquire good migrations, reverence, honor, and magnificence.

If I employ others as servants without freedom for my own purpose, I myself shall experience bad race, servitude, and the like in future lives; if I use and employ myself for the

sake of others' benefit and happiness, {350} I shall experience lordliness, good race and form, and the like.

In brief, whatever joy there is in this world all comes from desiring others to be happy and enacting others' purpose, and whatever suffering there is in this world all comes from desiring myself to be happy – self-cherishing. Hence I should stop self-cherishing with effort.

What need is there to extensively explain much? The childish cherish their own purpose whereby all undesirables arise; the Muni worked for others' purpose whereby all success is completed. Look at the difference between these two and generate conviction!

If I do not correctly exchange my happiness and the sufferings of others, that is, if I do not cherish others by reversing the intentional accomplishment of my happiness and the intentional elimination of my suffering, and [engage in] the intentional accomplishment of their happiness and the intentional elimination of their suffering with effort, then I shall not accomplish the state of buddhahood. And in case I think, "Although I shall not accomplish that [buddhahood], I will be alright remaining in cyclic existence," even in cyclic existence I shall have no happiness of success.

If I do not discard self-cherishing and cultivate cherishing others, let alone the shortcomings of what is beyond this world – in this life because of servants not doing work and because of masters not giving pay to workers, even the purpose of this life will not be fulfilled. {351}

Not increasing the welfare of others, by rejecting exchanging self and others, the method that establishes the foreseeable and unforeseeable happiness of this and future lives, the happiness of success will be completely cast away, and because of inflicting suffering of harm on others, the childish who are confused regarding the methods of happiness and suffering will continuously take on terrible suffering which is difficult to bear.

If whatever human and non-human harms, mental fear, and bodily suffering in the worlds, all arise from observing a self and cherishing it, then what use is that great ghost of self-cherishing which generates all undesirables for me? I should fervently abandon it.

Yongdzin Tamje Khyenpa says:

All human and non-human harms and troubles arise from this self-cherishing. All fears such as demons and interferers, the eight great fears also arise from this self-cherishing. All the suffering of this and future lives arise from this self-cherishing too. Therefore the final source of all undesirables and suffering is only this self-cherishing.

And:

All this suffering of cyclic existence in the three realms arises in dependence on the force of self-cherishing. {352} That the root of cyclic existence is ignorance is taught in all the sutras and shastras and is as well known as the wind. The ignorance that is the root of cyclic existence is this conception of self. [Dharmakirti's] *Commentary on [Dignaga's] 'Compendium of Valid Cognition' (Pramanavarttika-karika)* says:

*All shortcomings have their root in
The view of the transitory collection.*

The root of all the shortcomings and faults of cyclic existence is the so-called “ignorance,” which is taught to be the view of the transitory collection or this conception of self. Furthermore this ignorance that is the conception of self accumulates karma. Through the force of karma one circles in cyclic existence, and this experience of uninterrupted suffering arises. Even so much as the environment that is the abode of cyclic existence only arises through the force of this ignorance.

Hence all these environments and inhabitants of cyclic existence that are the three realms do not pass beyond the twelve links of dependent-arising, starting from ignorance up to and including aging and death. For the sake of making us understand that “The root of all these environments and inhabitants of cyclic existence, the six classes that are subsumed within the twelve links of dependent-arising, is this ignorance that is the conception of self,” the Compassionate Teacher himself encircled the rim of the five-part wheel at the entrance of temples with the twelve links of dependent-arising.

At the center is ignorance taking the form of a pig. Attachment in the form of a pigeon, and hatred in the form of a snake emerges from its mouth. All of these are held by the five limbs¹⁷² of impermanence taking the form of a raksha (cannibal-demon). {353} It is just as he had instructed, “Draw it inserted in its mouth.”

Thus you should recall again and again how you have been deceived from beginningless time until now by self-cherishing and have been involved with only suffering and harm under its pretext of benefiting you. You should make effort with whatever ability you can muster to subdue this sorcerer of self-cherishing.

If I do not completely forsake cherishing myself, I shall not be able to abandon the suffering of all sentient beings. Why? It is, for example, just as I cannot avoid being burnt if I do not cast aside the fire held in my hand.

Neglecting others and cherishing myself is the source of all undesirables. Therefore, in order to pacify the harms inflicted upon me and in order to pacify the sufferings of others, I shall discard self-cherishing, give myself up to others for the sake of all sentient beings, and cherish others as I do myself.

“I am under the control of others.” Mind, you must know this certainly. Now, except for accomplishing the purpose of all sentient beings, you must not think of anything else, such as seeking your own purpose alone, from now onwards.

If I have dedicated myself as the servant of sentient beings, then I should not do anything contradictorily with my eyes and so forth with respect to them. {354} Hence, I should not glare at sentient beings and accomplish my purpose alone with these eyes and so forth that are under the ownership of others. I must accomplish [others’] purpose and should not do anything which is contrary to sentient beings with eyes and so forth which are under their ownership.

Therefore if I were to witness action contrary to sentient beings with the three doors, contemplating the drawbacks, I should repeatedly exercise a mind of restraint because Je Tamje Khyenpa says [in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*]¹⁷³:

Thus, not grasping to yourself and not backing your own side, disregarding your body, resources, and roots of virtue, you must train again and again in the mind of

¹⁷² The five limbs are its mouth, two hands and two legs.

¹⁷³ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 55, chapter on *Exchanging Self and Other*

giving towards sentient beings and enact the welfare of those to whom you give.
You should not act contrary to them, so stop the mind that observes your body
and so forth for your own welfare.

Thus the purpose of sentient beings should be taken as principal. Whatever I behold upon
my body, such as food and clothing, I should appropriate from myself and, dispelling grasping
to them as being mine, use for the benefit of other sentient beings, just as servants use the
food, clothing, and resources of their master. This I should remember without forgetting.

3B2B-2B3C-1C2B-2. Having exchanged, how to subsequently achieve through thought

- 8.140 Taking someone inferior and so forth to be himself,
And taking himself to be the other,
[A bodhisattva] should meditate upon envy, competitiveness, and pride,
With a mind free of conceptualization. {355}
- 8.141 He is honored, but we are not;
We have not found [possessions] as he has.
He is praised, but we are disparaged;
He is happy, but we suffer.
- 8.142 We do the work
While he abides in comfort.
He is renowned as great in this world,
But we as inferior with no good qualities.
- 8.143 We have no good qualities; what to do?
All of us are to be endowed with good qualities;
There are those in comparison to whom he is inferior,
And there are those in comparison to whom we are supreme.
- 8.144 The morality, views, and woes
Are not under our control but due to the force of afflictions.
He must heal us in whatever way he is able to, and
Willingly we must accept any harm involved.
- 8.145 However we are not his objects of healing,
So why does he belittle us?
What use are his good qualities to us?
He has good qualities.
- 8.146 With no compassion for the migrating beings
Who dwell in the mouth of poisonous bad migrations,
Externally he is proud of his good qualities
And wishes to harm the wise.

- 8.147 In order that we may surpass
He who is regarded as equal to us,
We shall definitely attain possessions and honor for ourselves,
Even through dispute.
- 8.148 By all means we shall make clear to the entire world
The good qualities we have,
But we shall not let anyone hear
Of any of his good qualities.
- 8.149 Also we shall hide our faults;
We will be venerated, not him; {356}
We will find a great deal of possessions today;
We will be honored, not him.
- 8.150 For a long time I shall look with pleasure
At his being made sinful;
He will become the laughing stock of all migrating beings,
And be derided among [all].
- 8.151 It is said that this afflicted one
Is competing with us,
But how can he be equal to us
In hearing, wisdom, form, class, or wealth?
- 8.152 Thus, upon hearing of our good qualities
That have been made known to all,
We shall thoroughly enjoy the delight
Of the excitement giving rise to goose pimples.
- 8.153 Even though he has some possessions,
If he is working for us,
We shall give him just enough to live on
And by force we will take [the rest].
- 8.154 His comfort will decline
And I shall involve him with harm.
For hundreds [of lifetimes] in cyclic existence
He caused harm to me.
- 8.155 Mind, because of desiring to enact your own purpose,
Such great weariness you have gone through
Over countless past eons
Has only achieved suffering.

- 8.156 Therefore I shall definitely engage myself
 In the purpose of others.
 Since the words of the Muni are infallible,
 I shall behold its good qualities in the future.
- 8.157 If in the past you had practiced
 This act, a situation dissimilar to
 The happiness of fulfillment of a Buddha
 Could not have been possible.
- 8.158 Therefore, just as
 You held as “I”
 These drops of sperm and blood of others, {357}
 Likewise familiarize with others.

Taking the objects of observation – sentient beings inferior, equal, superior, and so forth compared to him – to be himself, and taking himself to be the other, in other words, having swapped the positions of the minds apprehending self and others, a bodhisattva should induce an ascertaining consciousness and meditate upon exchanging self and others with a mind free of the conceptualizations of doubt.

Suppose the bodhisattva is Devadatta, then [having placed the awareness of himself as other sentient beings]¹⁷⁴ he meditates upon envy to Devadatta; suppose [that bodhisattva] is equal [to sentient beings], [then he meditates upon] competitiveness; suppose [that bodhisattva] is inferior [to sentient beings], [then he meditates upon] pride.

When the Bodhisattva Devadatta himself is meditating on exchanging self and others, [he thinks,] “This Devadatta is honored by others, but, holding sentient beings to be myself, I am not honored due to being inferior in qualities; I have not found possessions of happiness as this Devadatta has; this Bodhisattva Devadatta is praised, but we¹⁷⁵ sentient beings are disparaged; he is happy, but we suffer. We do the work of carrying burdens and so forth while this Devadatta abides in comfort. This Bodhisattva is renowned as great in this world due to his morality, hearing, and so forth, whereas we as inferior with no good qualities. {358}

“You have achieved good qualities with effort but we sentient beings have no good qualities; what to do? All of us sentient beings should make effort to be endowed with good qualities and achieve that. He is high while we are low, but this is posited in relative terms. Therefore there are those persons who are greatly superior in qualities in comparison to whom this bodhisattva is inferior, and there are those inferior sentient beings in comparison to whom we are supreme. Hence we should meditate by holding others to be ourselves, thinking, ‘We sentient beings need not be discouraged; we shall accomplish enlightenment with effort.’”

OPINION: You are inferior to the Bodhisattva Devadatta through the force of degeneration of morality and views.

RESPONSE: The degeneration of morality and views, and the degeneration of views and conduct such as woes due to livelihood, are due to the force of adventitious afflictions; the fault lies not with being under the control of our own desires.

¹⁷⁴ Annotated in accordance with p. 554 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

¹⁷⁵ *Can* emended to read *cag*.

Alternatively this line [in the response above] can mean “They are not due to afflictions adventitiously.”

“If you, Bodhisattva Devadatta are endowed with compassion, you must heal our woes in whatever way you are able to, and willingly we must accept any harm of hardship involved in accomplishing good qualities.

“However if we are not objects of healing of this Devadatta and he does not benefit us, so why does he belittle us sentient beings? What use are the good qualities of this bodhisattva to us? {359} For, this Bodhisattva Devadatta has good qualities but he does not benefit us sentient beings.

“Furthermore, with no compassion for the migrating beings who, due to degeneration of morality and views, dwell in the mouth of, for instance, poisonous creatures and snakes, and on the verge of bad migrations, and this Bodhisattva Devadatta does not benefit us sentient beings. Not only that, externally he is proud of his having good qualities and wishes to harm us wise sentient beings, that is, he wishes to outdo us and belittles us. This is not correct. By placing the mind of I with respect to sentient beings and taking I, the bodhisattva, to be the other, I think it is not correct that he [the bodhisattva] harms me [sentient beings], and the like.

[Holding ourselves as equal in good qualities to the bodhisattva, meditating on competitiveness:] “In order that we sentient beings may surpass through possessions and good qualities the bodhisattva who is regarded as equal with us sentient beings in class and so forth, we shall definitely attain possessions and honor for ourselves, even through dispute with this Bodhisattva Devadatta.

“By all means we shall proclaim well and make clear to the entire world the good qualities we have, but we shall not let anyone hear of any good qualities that this bodhisattva may have. Also we sentient beings shall hide our faults and clearly proclaim his faults, {360} whereby others will venerate us sentient beings, and we shall make effort that such is not done towards him; we will find a great deal of possessions such as food and clothes today; we will be honored by others, but these will not occur to him.

“For a long time I shall look with pleasure at this Bodhisattva Devadatta being made sinful and wasted; this Bodhisattva will become the laughing stock of all migrating beings, and be derided through criticism among all.” By way of exchanging self and others I shall praise sentient beings and put a stop to arrogance due to my own good qualities.

Holding ourselves as greatly superior in good qualities to the bodhisattva himself, I shall meditate on pride. I shall generate pride thinking, “It is said that this afflicted, that is, inferior, Bodhisattva Devadatta is competing with us sentient beings, but how can this Bodhisattva Devadatta be equal with us in hearing, wisdom, form, class, or wealth? Regardless of what, he cannot equal us.”

“Thus being unequal, upon hearing of our good qualities – such as hearing which is greatly superior to that of this person Devadatta – that have been made known to all, we shall thoroughly enjoy the delight which will generate the excitement giving rise to goose pimples.”

“Even though he has some possessions such as food and wealth, {361} if he is working for us sentient beings to dispel suffering and the like, we shall give him just the conditions such as food and clothing to live on and by force of power we will take the rest of the possessions.

“This bodhisattva’s comfort of indolence will decline and I shall always involve him with the harm of dispelling the suffering of us sentient beings through shouldering the burden of

our suffering. Desiring to make myself successful, I cherished myself and while circling in cyclic existence for hundreds of lifetimes it caused harm such as that of the hells to me. Mind, because of desiring to enact your own purpose alone, such great meaningless weariness you have gone through over countless past eons has only achieved the suffering of cyclic existence for me.” Contemplating thus, the Bodhisattva Devadatta thinks in this manner with respect to himself.

Therefore, cherishing others, I shall definitely engage myself in the purpose of others. Since the words of the Muni are infallible with respect to the meaning of that to be taught, viewing self-cherishing as the enemy, I shall behold the good quality of cherishing others – the attainment of resultant buddhahood in the future.

QUALM: Although I have enacted others’ purpose for a long time, I do not see such results. {362}

RESPONSE: If in the past you had practiced this act of exchanging self and others, a situation of experiencing suffering dissimilar to the happiness of fulfillment of the two purposes of a buddha could not have been possible. Generating regret for my past meaningless activities, I should make effort to cultivate the mind of enlightenment.

In case you think, “I am not able to familiarize with the cultivation of exchanging self and others,” there are such benefits in [enacting] others’ purpose. Therefore, just as you have familiarized with holding as “I” this body which is established from drops of semen and blood of¹⁷⁶ others – your parents, likewise familiarize with holding other sentient beings as “I” and cherishing them, and you shall culminate that familiarization.

3B2B-2B3C-1C2B-3. [Having exchanged,] how to subsequently achieve through application

8.159 Having thoroughly examined [the purpose] of others,
 You shall steal
 Whatever appears on your body
 And use it for the benefit of others.

8.160 “I am delighted but others are sad,
 I am high but others are low,
 I benefit myself but others do not.”
 Why am I not jealous of myself?

8.161 I must separate myself from happiness
 And involve myself with the sufferings of others.
 “Why am I doing this?”
 At that time I should examine my faults.

8.162 Although others may do something wrong,
 I shall transform it into a fault of my own;
 But should I do something even slightly wrong,
 I shall openly admit it to many people.

¹⁷⁶ Gis emended to read *gi*.

- 8.163 By further describing the renown of others,
I should make it outshine my own. {363}
Just like the lowest of servants,
I should employ myself for all purposes.
- 8.164 I am naturally fault-ridden.
I should not praise myself for a portion of an incidental good quality,
I shall never let even a few people know
Of my good qualities no matter how.
- 8.165 In brief, may the harms that
You have caused to others for my sake
Descend upon me myself
For the sake of sentient beings.
- 8.166 I should not be aggressive,
Acting in a brutal way;
Instead, like a newly married bride,
I should stay bashful, timid, and restrained.
- 8.167 Thus, you should [think] and abide in this way
And not act so.
If you transgress being under control,
You will be subjugated.
- 8.168 However, although having been advised,
If mind, you do not act in such a manner,
Then since all faults will base themselves in you,
You will only be destined to subjugation.
- 8.169 That previous time when you could overcome me
Is different;
I see it and now wherever you go
I shall destroy all your arrogance.
- 8.170 Even now may I cast aside the intention thinking about
“My own welfare.”
By having sold you to others,
Without becoming discouraged¹⁷⁷, may I offer sustenance.
- 8.171 If, having become non-conscientious,
I do not give you to all living beings,
Then it is certain that you will deliver me
To the guardians of the hells.

¹⁷⁷ *Sngon* emended to read *skyo*.

- 8.172 For ages have you delivered me like this
Whereby I have suffered lengthily;
Now, recalling all my grudges,
I shall overcome your intentions of self-purpose.
- 8.173 However, if I wish to be happy,
I should not be happy with myself.
However, if I wish to be protected,
I should constantly protect others.
- 8.174 To whatever degree
I take great care of this body,
To that degree I shall fall
Into a state of extreme anxiety.
- 8.175 Having fallen in this way, if desires
Are unable to be fulfilled
Even by everything upon this earth,
What else will be able to [fulfill] desires of that?
- 8.176 Being unable [to fulfill them, and craving for objects of] desire,
Afflictions and degeneration of attitude will arise.
One will not know the exhaustion of success
Of not depending on anything.
- 8.177 Therefore, I shall never allow an opportunity
For the desires of the body to increase.
Not holding to the attractive
Is a good possession.
- 8.178 In the end it will turn to dust.
Unable to move, it is propelled by another.
Why do I hold onto
This terrible unclean form as "self"?
- 8.179 Even when it is alive, it is better off dead.
Of what use is this machine to me?
How is it different from a clod of earth and the like?
Alas, why do I not dispel this pride!
- 8.180 Having accumulated suffering for no purpose
Because of honoring this body,
Of what use is attachment and anger
For this thing that is similar to a piece of wood?

- 8.181 Whether I am sustaining my body in this way,
Or whether it is being eaten by vultures and the like,
If it has no attachment or hatred, {365}
Why then am I so attached to it?
- 8.182 If it knows no anger when derided
And no pleasure when praised,
For what purpose
Am I wearing myself out like this?
- 8.183 OPINION: Anyone who desires this body
And I are friends.
RESPONSE: Since all desire their own bodies,
Why do I not find joy in theirs?
- 8.184 Therefore, in order to benefit migrating beings
I shall give away this body without any attachment.
Although this has many faults
I should uphold it like a worker's tool.
- 8.185 So enough of this childish behavior!
I shall follow in the footsteps of the skillful,
Having recalled the advice concerning conscientiousness,
I shall turn away sleep and lethargy.
- 8.186 Just like the compassionate Sons of the Victor,
I shall bear the rigors of what is appropriate;
If I do not make a constant effort day and night,
When will my suffering ever come to an end?
- 8.187 Therefore, in order to dispel the obscurations
I shall withdraw my mind from wrong paths
And constantly place it in equipoise
Upon the correct object of observation.

Advice is given to the bodhisattva himself, "Having trained in thought like that and performed what is called the 'thorough examination of the purpose of other sentient beings through application,' analyze whether or not you also harm sentient beings. Then steal whatever desirable object that appears on your body, that is, give up holding to it as 'mine,' and use it for the benefit of other sentient beings." {366}

Furthermore meditate on jealousy. "I am experiencing delight but others sadness, whereby I am high but others are low. I perform virtuous actions that benefit myself but others are not doing so, whereby I am happy but sentient beings unhappy. What is the use?" Why am I not jealous of myself being high? It is reasonable to do so.

I must separate myself from whatever happiness there is of food, clothing, and the like, send¹⁷⁸ them to others, involve myself with the sufferings of others and take them upon myself. “Why am I doing this?” Regarding wrongs committed by a bodhisattva, from time to time he should examine his own faults and destroy them.

Although others may do something wrong such as harming oneself, the bodhisattva shall transform it into a fault of his own and shoulder it, [thinking¹⁷⁹], “May I experience its result.” But should he do something even slightly wrong to sentient beings, he shall openly admit it to many people, that is, accept his wrong-doing.

If I were to hear about the renown and expressions of fame of others, I shall praise them by further describing them, make them outshine my own renown and make mine inconspicuous. Just like the lowest kind among servants who especially shoulder the burdens, I should employ myself for all purposes of sentient beings in the absence of pride.

I should think of this self as naturally fault-ridden. {367} In case I think, “Should I praise myself by means of the slight qualities such as having heard [Dharma]?” then without praising even a mere portion of some incidental good quality, observing that bodhisattva, I shall never let even a few people know of this [bodhisattva’s] good qualities no matter how, thus may they be secret. I should think of not proclaiming my good qualities.

In brief, may whatever harms that you, mind, have caused to others for my sake since beginningless time descend upon me for the sake of accomplishing the purpose of sentient beings.

In case I think, “I cannot bear to carry the burden of others’ suffering,” then I should not be aggressive, acting rashly in a brutal way.

QUALM: Well then, how should I abide?

RESPONSE: Instead, like a newly married bride, I should stay bashful, timid out of fear of being derided by others, and restrained in behavior.

The word “brutal” (*gnya’ drag*) appears in the translation of the *Great Commentary* as “rough.”

Thus, you should think of others’ purpose and abide in this way through application; you should employ it in virtue, just as in taming a horse. Mind, if you do not act so for others’ purpose and desire such, if you transgress the antidote of being under the control of mindfulness and introspection in this mind, you will be subjugated and subdued.

However, although having been advised by yourself, {368} if mind, through attributing the blame to coming under the influence of afflictions, you do not act in such a manner, then since all faults of this and future [lives] will base themselves in you, the mind of self-cherishing, you, mind will only be destined to subjugation.

That previous time of not knowing the root of all faults when you, self-cherishing could overcome me is a different time during which I did not know the root of faults; I see the root of faults and now wherever you go to produce faults I shall destroy from the root all arrogance of you, self-cherishing, without you having the power to proceed [anywhere].

Even now may I cast aside the intention thinking, “I have the power to act to accomplish solely my own welfare.” I should not engage in doing so even in the slightest.

¹⁷⁸ *Thongs* emended to read *thong*.

¹⁷⁹ Annotated in accordance with p. 564 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

[Tsongkhapa's] *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment* says¹⁸⁰ :

If it seems that the body and so forth have lost its observation upon others' purpose, that is, they observe one's purpose, or the body, speech, and mind acts as conditions of harm to others, then you should put a stop to them by thinking, "This connected me to endless harm in the past; if still I were to be mistaken about what is in the guise of benefit and come under its influence, then very terrible suffering will be produced."

By the knowledge that I have sold you to other sentient beings, without becoming discouraged may I offer whatever sustenance is desired by sentient beings.

If, having thought only of my welfare and become non-conscientious, I do not give you to sentient beings, then, due to accumulating actions of negativity, it is certain that you will deliver me to the guardians of the hells. {369} Hence I should destroy you, self-cherishing.

For ages have you delivered me to the hell guardians like this in the past, whereby I have experienced suffering lengthily; now, recalling all my past grudges, I shall overcome your intentions to perform solely self-purpose, the root of faults.

However if I wish to be happy, well, and prosperous for a long time, I should not be happy with cherishing myself. However if I wish to be protected from suffering I should constantly protect other sentient beings through cherishing them.

OPINION: Out of the wish to enact others' purpose, I should take care of this body with craving.

RESPONSE: That is inappropriate. To whatever degree I take great care of this body with food, clothes, and the like due to cherishing it with craving, to that degree great suffering will occur even though I will not accomplish the slightest desire and shall fall into a state of extreme anxiety in which I cannot bear even slight suffering, whereby it will be extremely difficult to take care of it.

QUALM: So what will happen?

RESPONSE: Having fallen in this way, if, out of desire due to a considerable increase of craving, desires are unable to be fulfilled even by every enjoyment upon this earth, what else will be able to fulfill desires of that craving? Craving for desirable objects cannot possibly be satisfied. {370} For example, it is just as it has been taught that King Mandhata was not satisfied by even having enjoyed the four continents and half of Indra's seat.

Being unable to fulfill them, out of excessive craving for [objects of]¹⁸¹ desire, afflictions such as attachment and hatred, degeneration of virtuous attitudes and only mental unhappiness will arise. A person will not know the exhaustion of the good qualities of success of having little desire and being satisfied without depending on any body or enjoyments; it will be impossible for him to be ever related to deprivation of resources.

Therefore, if I do not rely on the antidote, then the desire that is craving for enjoyments for the sake of the body will increase. So I shall never allow any opportunity for the craving towards objects of desire.

Not holding to attractive things which the mind will become attached to is a good possession, the best of wealth.

¹⁸⁰ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 2, page 56, chapter on *Exchanging Self and Other*

¹⁸¹ Annotated in accordance with p. 570 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa's commentary: '*dod yon*.'

In the end this body will turn to dust and finish there. Unable to move itself, it is propelled by another – the mind. Since the form of unclean aggregates such as flesh and blood is the source of many terrible fears, why do I hold onto this body as “self”?

If it were held as “self,” it must experience the sufferings of hell. Therefore, even when it is alive, it is better off dead. Of what use is this machine of the body to me? There is not the slightest purpose. How is this body different from a motionless clod of earth and the like? {371} O, since craving for the body is terrible, alas, why do I not dispel this pride of an inflated mind due to the body! I should abandon pride in every way.

Having accumulated much suffering for no purpose due to you, mind honoring and cherishing this body, it does not repay kindness even though this body (that produces much attachment and anger towards the agents of benefit and harm) is sustained; of what use is attachment to this body that is similar to a piece of wood? It is inappropriate.

Whether I am sustaining my body in this way with enjoyments, or whether it is being eaten by vultures and the like, if the body itself has no attachment or hatred towards the agents of benefit and harm, why then am I so attached to it? It is inappropriate.

If the body has no anger when derided due to some fault and no pleasure when praised due to some good quality, and the body itself knows no derision or praise – then mind, for what purpose am I wearing myself out by way of attachment and hatred? It is purposeless.

OPINION: Although the body itself does not know such, anyone who desires this body of mine and makes it attractive¹⁸² and I are friends, whereby I find joy in it.

RESPONSE: Since all sentient beings desire their own bodies, why do I not find joy in others’ bodies? Having attachment for my own body and despising others’ bodies is inappropriate. {372}

Attachment to the body is inappropriate. Therefore, in order to benefit migrating beings I shall give away this body without any attachment. It is just as it has been said in [Aryadeva’s] *Four Hundred Stanzas (Catuh Sataka)* [stanza 26] says:

*Although the body is seen like a foe,
Nevertheless it should be protected.
By long sustaining a disciplined [body],
Great merit is created.*

In dependence on the body, much of others’ purpose will be established. Hence, although this body has many faults I should uphold it for others’ welfare like a worker’s tool of worldly beings to hold a chariot for the purpose of [transporting] the load.

So enough of this childish behavior that exerts itself in the discordant classes of calm abiding, such as desirous craving, covetousness, and harmful intent! I shall follow in the footsteps of the buddhas and bodhisattvas who are skillful regarding what is to be adopted and what is to be discarded. Having recalled the advice concerning conscientiousness in regards to the qualities that are virtue, with effort I shall turn away and abandon the obstacles of calm abiding, such as sleep and lethargy, just as they have been taught in Nagarjuna’s *Letter to a Friend (Suhrllekha)* [stanza 44]:

¹⁸² According to p. 573 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary, “makes it attractive” means “desires to accomplish happiness and benefit for it.”

(1) Excitement and regret, (2) harmful intent,
(3) Lethargy and sleep, (4) aspiration for the desire realm, and (5) doubt
Are the five hindrances. Be aware that
They are thieves who steal away the wealth of virtue.

Just like the compassionate Sons of the Victor, I shall bear the rigors of what is appropriate in generating the power of the antidotes. If I do not always make a constant effort day and night, when will my suffering ever come to an end? {373} Contemplating thus, I shall make effort to cultivate common and uncommon calm abiding.

Therefore, in order to dispel all of the afflictive and knowledge obscurations, I need to generate special insight. Furthermore, since that needs to be preceded by the achievement of calm abiding I shall withdraw my mind from all the wrong paths that hinder the generation of calm abiding, the conceptualizations of desire and so forth, and by means of the eight applications of abandonment, constantly place it in equipoise upon the correct object of observation.

In brief, having understood the method for achieving common calm abiding just as it has been extensively taught in [Asanga's] *Hearers' Grounds (Sravakabhumi)* and the method for achieving uncommon calm abiding just as it has been taught in this text and Kamalashila's *Stages of Meditation (Bhavanakrama)*, and having contemplated the benefits of cultivating calm abiding and the drawbacks of not cultivating it, you should make effort in cultivating meditative stabilization by way of the nine methods of the mental abidings and so forth. You should know them extensively just as they have been taught in the two – the great and the small *Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*.

QUESTION: What is the purpose of relying upon an isolated place with little desire and contentment, and generating calm abiding by way of the nine mental abidings, the four beliefs, and the six powers?

RESPONSE: It is just as it has been said by the Foremost Tamche Khyenpa [Tsongkhapa in his *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*]¹⁸³:

There are very many purposes for generating the belief in such a meditative stabilization, calm abiding. {374} The main purpose is for the sake of generating the realization of special insight. Furthermore, regarding special insight, there are: (1) special insight having the aspect of peacefulness and coarseness which abandons merely the manifest afflictions, common to non-Buddhists and Buddhists, and even common to the Buddhist Mahayana and Hinayana, and (2) special insight having the aspect of suchness that is selflessness, which abandons forever the seeds of afflictions – a feature of only Buddhists. From among the two, the former is a branch of success and is not indispensable. The latter is an indispensable branch. Hence those seeking freedom should generate the special insight that understands the suchness that is selflessness.

In order to eradicate the seeds of the two obscurations of special insight possessing the aspect of suchness that is selflessness, one must definitely first generate immovable calm abiding. Gyeltshab Thamje Khyenpa says:

¹⁸³ *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 3, page 94, chapter on *Serenity as Part of the Path*

Since the complete destruction of the seeds of the two obscurations
By special insight in which the mode of abidance is manifest
Is contingent upon the state of immovable meditative stabilization,
At the outset, be skillful in achieving calm abiding.

3B2B-2B3C-2. Title of the chapter

The Eighth Chapter called “Teachings on Concentration” from *Engaging in the Deeds of a Bodhisattva*.

This is easy to understand.

Chapter Nine

The Perfection of Wisdom

3B2B-2B3D. How to train in wisdom, the entity of special insight {375}

3B2B-2B3D-1. Explanation of the text of the chapter

3B2B-2B3D-2. Title of the chapter

3B2B-2B3D-1. Explanation of the text of the chapter

3B2B-2B3D-1A. Teaching that those who desire liberation must generate the wisdom realizing suchness

3B2B-2B3D-1B. Method for generating wisdom

3B2B-2B3D-1C. Advice to make effort in generating wisdom

3B2B-2B3D-1A. Teaching that those who desire liberation must generate the wisdom realizing suchness

9.1 The Muni taught all these branches
 For the purpose of wisdom.
 Therefore, those who desire to pacify suffering
 Should generate wisdom.

Those who desire to pacify the suffering of cyclic existence of oneself and others should generate the wisdom that realizes suchness. This is because the Tathagata Buddha Muni taught all these branches, that is, the collections of causes – generosity and so forth which have been explained above – for the purpose of generating the wisdom that realizes suchness.

3B2B-2B3D-1B. Method for generating wisdom

3B2B-2B3D-1B1. Presentation of the two truths

3B2B-2B3D-1B2. Establishing that even those who desire to attain mere liberation need to realize emptiness

3B2B-2B3D-1B3. Extensive explanation of the reasonings that prove emptiness

3B2B-2B3D-1B1. Presentation of the two truths

3B2B-2B3D-1B1A. Actual

3B2B-2B3D-1B1B. Dispelling objections that there is no need and ability for emptiness

3B2B-2B3D-1B1A. Actual

9.2 The concealer (the conventional) and the ultimate
 Are asserted to be the two truths.
 The ultimate is not an object of utilization of the mind.
 The mind is said to be a concealer.

9.3 With respect to them, the supports of the transitory¹⁸⁴ are seen {376}
 To be of two types: yogis and common people.
 Among them, common supports of the transitory
 Are damaged by yogi supports of the transitory.

9.4ab Even yogis, due to differences in their minds,
 Are damaged by the successively higher.

The first line [9.2c] indicates the characteristics of ultimate truth while the second [9.2d] the characteristics of concealer truth. The two – the former and the latter minds – [mentioned in

¹⁸⁴ *Jigs rten* is translated as “support of the transitory.”

9.2cd] are minds that have dualistic appearances; they are not mere minds. Further, they are taken in terms of the mode of comprehension. Hence, correlating them in this way, the basis for characterization – the voidness of inherent existence of the person and the aggregates – characterizes ultimate truth.

With respect to the direct valid cognizer mind that explicitly realizes it, it [ultimate truth] is not an object of utilization of that by way of dualistic appearances and is an object to be known by the direct valid cognizer comprehending it. This is of identical meaning to [Chandrakirti's] explanation in the *Supplement to the Middle Way (Madhyamakavatara)* (stanza 6.29):

*Whatever wrong entity of falling hair and the like
Is conceptualized through the force of cataracts,
The real nature in which it is seen by correct eyesight
Is reality. Likewise it should be known here.*

The bases for characterization – the person and the aggregates – are said to be concealer truths. With respect to the direct valid cognizer mind that explicitly realizes them, they should be realized by way of dualistic appearances.

With respect to the persons who wish to determine the two truths, {377} the supports of the transitory are persons imputed in dependence on the aggregates and are seen to be of two types: (1) yogis possessing the meditative stabilization that is a union of calm abiding and special insight who realize all phenomena to be empty of inherent existence, and (2) common people who are Propounders of [Truly Existent] Things. This [categorization] is in terms of the main [groups]; even persons who have realized emptiness by way of hearing and contemplation and those have not transformed their minds with tenets¹⁸⁵ should be included in these categories too.

Common supports of the transitory who assert partless particles, partless instants of consciousness, and the true existence of mere things are yogis, but are also supports of the transitory. Hence, the person who is a yogi support of the transitory realizing the lack of inherent existence damages the Propounders of [Truly Existent] Things of a lower tenet system. Even higher yogis [possessing] a union of calm abiding and special insight damage the successively lower ones.

The Middle-Way proponents (Madhyamikas) refute through reasoning the Mind-Only proponents (Chittamatrins) who assert that the consciousness is truly existent. They [the Mind-Only proponents, in turn] refute through reasoning the Sutra-School proponents (Sautrantikas) who accept partless particles.

QUALM: Among the yogis who realize emptiness, do they not damage each other?

RESPONSE: Even among the yogis who realize emptiness, due to differences in their minds, those abiding on the higher grounds, such as the second ground, damage, that is, outshine, those abiding on the lower, such as¹⁸⁶ the first ground. {378} You should understand through inference that, in terms of a single continuum, due to differences in the enhancement of the

¹⁸⁵ P. 592 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa's commentary explains that persons who have realized emptiness by way of hearing and contemplation should be included in group (1) and those have not transformed their minds with tenets in group (2).

¹⁸⁶ *Pa*s emended to read *pa*.

mind, for example, that unable to damage seeds that are objects of abandonment of the path of meditation on a lower ground can damage them on a higher ground.

The purpose of composing these passages is as follows: having ascertained minds to be of two types – minds that realize the conventional and minds that realize the ultimate, if even a valid cognizer realizing the conventional does not damage a mind realizing the ultimate, then what need to mention about it being damaged by adherents of partless particles? This is for the sake of making known that the mind realizing the ultimate damages all that hold to extremes.

Furthermore, even [among] yogis, due to differences in minds:

- the reasonings of the Great-Exposition proponents (Vaibhashikas), the Sutra-School proponents, and so forth damage the assertions of permanence and [truly existent] things made by the Outsiders [i.e., non-Buddhists],
- the reasonings of the Mind-Only proponents and so forth damage the assertions of partless particles made by the two Propounders of [Truly Existent] Objects [i.e., the Great-Exposition proponents and the Sutra-School proponents],
- the reasonings of the Middle-Way proponents damage the assertions of the consciousness being truly established made by the Mind-Only proponents,

and so forth. You should understand that the counterfeit meanings in the theses of the lower tenet systems are damaged by the reasonings of the successively higher tenet systems. The above explanation is the assertion of the *Great Commentary*.

3B2B-2B3D-1B1B. Dispelling objections that there is no need and ability for emptiness

3B2B-2B3D-1B1B-1. Actual

3B2B-2B3D-1B1B-2. Dispelling damage with regards to that

3B2B-2B3D-1B1B-1. Actual

9.4cd By way of analogies that both assert,
Because one does not analyze for the sake of a result.

9.5 Mundane beings¹⁸⁷ see things and
Conceive them to be real,
Not illusory, therefore here {379}
Yogis and mundane beings debate.

OPINION: That the tenet systems of common beings are damaged by the reasoning of the yogis who realize that all phenomena are empty of inherent existence is untenable. For, there is nothing to prove the lack of inherent existence, and in the absence of inherent existence, it will be meaningless to train in generosity and so forth for the sake of the result buddhahood.

RESPONSE: It follows that it is not that there is nothing to prove the lack of inherent existence, because, by means of analogies such as dreams and illusions that are renowned to both the Middle-Way proponents and the Propounders of [Truly Existent] Things as false and that both assert, the lack of inherent existence is established in dependence on them. It follows that in the absence of inherent existence, it will not be meaningless to train in generosity and so forth, because, although generosity and the like (for the sake of attaining a result such as buddhahood) lack true existence, one engages in them by way of being

¹⁸⁷ *Jigs rten pa* is translated as “mundane being.”

conjoined with the wisdom realizing them as false and illusory without investigation and without analysis. For, if the wisdom realizing the lack of inherent existence is not conjoined, then the remaining perfections do not obtain the name “perfection,” and they must travel to the city of omniscience together with a guide of the blind.

OPINION: For instance, fire that is able to perform the function of boiling, burning, and so forth is established by a direct perceiver. If you also accept this, then we are saying “This is truly existent,” whereby we have no object to debate about. However, if you do not accept this, {380} then there will be much damage, such as contradiction by a direct perceiver.

RESPONSE: These are debates of those who hold the two truths as contradictory, thinking that “If things lack inherent existence, then they will be utterly non-existent, and if they exist, then they must exist inherently.” Although the [mundane]¹⁸⁸ Middle-Way proponents and the mundane Propounders of [Truly Existent] Things both see with valid cognition things such as fire and accept them, the Propounders of [Truly Existent] Things conceive and accept them to be established as real, but do not understand them to be empty of true existence and illusory. On the other hand, the Middle-Way proponents understand this, therefore here the Middle-Way yogis and the mundane Propounders of [Truly Existent] Things debate. Alternatively, apply the former “mundane beings” [in 9.5a] only to the Propounders of [Truly Existent] Things [and not to the Middle-Way proponents].

3B2B-2B3D-1B1B-2. Dispelling damage with regards to that

3B2B-2B3D-1B1B-2A. General refutation of the Propounders of [Truly Existent] Things

3B2B-2B3D-1B1B-2B. Specific refutation of the Mind-Only proponents

3B2B-2B3D-1B1B-2C. Dispelling the consequence that the Middle-Way proponents lack the need and ability for a mind that realizes emptiness

3B2B-2B3D-1B1B-2A. General refutation of the Propounders of [Truly Existent] Things

9.6 Forms and so forth, although [established by] direct perceivers,
 Are so by renown, not by a valid cognizer.
 They are false, just like the unclean and so forth
 That are renowned to be clean and so forth.

9.7 For the sake of engaging mundane beings,
 The Protector taught things. In thusness
 They are not momentary.
 “There is contradiction even conventionally.”

9.8 There is not the fault in yogis’ conventionalities.
 That is seeing of thusness relative to mundane beings;
 Otherwise, their definite understanding of women as unclean
 Would be damaged by mundane beings. {381}

9.9 Merit [arises] with respect to illusory victors,
 Just as with respect to things.
 “If sentient beings are illusory,

¹⁸⁸ There is a little ambiguity in the Tibetan as to whether the word “mundane” applies also to the “Middle-Way proponents,” but from the overall context it is seen that it should.

Having died, how are they reborn?"

- 9.10 For as long as those conditions aggregate,
For that long will illusions also arise.
Why should sentient beings be truly existent
Due merely to long continuity?
- 9.11 An illusion being who kills and the like,
Has no negativity because it has no mind.
With respect to those who possess illusion minds,
Merit and negativity arise.
- 9.12 Because mantras and so forth lack the ability,
Mind does not occur.
The illusions that arise from
Various conditions are also various.
- 9.13 Nowhere is there
A single condition that is able [to give rise] to all.
If ultimate is nirvana and
Samsara is conventional, in that case,
- 9.14 Since even a buddha would be circling,
What use would bodhisattva conduct be?
If the conditions are not severed,
Also illusions are not averted.
- 9.15ab Since the conditions are severed,
There is no arising even conventionally.

OPINION: The lack of inherent existence contradicts the seeing by a direct perceiver of the five objects, forms and so forth.

RESPONSE: There is no contradiction. Forms and so forth, although established by a valid direct perceiver, have become valid with respect to mere conventionalities which are established by renown. It is not that the suchness of forms and so forth are established by that valid cognizer and have become valid with respect to it. {382} If that were the case, since even ordinary beings see suchness, it would [absurdly follow that] there is no need to generate superiors' paths. And you should understand that the *King of Meditative Stabilization Sutra* (*Samadhirajasutra*) refutes [the sense consciousnesses in the continuum of ordinary beings]¹⁸⁹ to be valid cognizers with respect to suchness, saying: "The eye, ear, and also nose are not valid..."

OBJECTION: If forms and so forth do not exist by way of their own character, why are they renowned? And if they are renowned, why are they false?

¹⁸⁹ Annotated in accordance with p. 596 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa's commentary.

RESPONSE: Things are false, just like the unclean female body and so forth that are renowned to be clean and so forth.

OBJECTION: If forms and so forth do not exist inherently, this contradicts the teaching in the sutras that they are impermanent and so forth.

RESPONSE: There is no contradiction. For the sake of engaging mundane beings in suchness gradually, the Protector taught that things are impermanent. In suchness things are not established as being momentary, because they are not established as being either one or many.

OBJECTION: This contradicts that the compounded are established as being impermanent even conventionally, because things of the morning existing in the evening and so on are renowned as being permanent in the world.

RESPONSE: Although forms and so forth are renowned as permanent in the world, there is not the fault that impermanence is not established by a valid cognizer, because impermanence and the like are established by the yogis' valid cognizer of conventionalities.

OBJECTION: This contradicts the explanation that the seeing of impermanence is the seeing of thusness. {383}

RESPONSE: There is no contradiction, because that [seeing of impermanence] is merely accepted as the seeing of thusness relative to the mundane beings' adherence to cleanliness, happiness, and permanence; otherwise, if all that is renowned in the world were to be valid, then it would [absurdly] follow that the yogis' meditation on ugliness that definitely understands women as unclean would be damaged by mundane beings who adhere to women as clean.

OBJECTION: If [phenomena] do not exist inherently, this contradicts the explanation that merit arises with respect to making offerings and the like to the victors.

RESPONSE: There is no contradiction; merit arises with respect to making offerings to illusory victors lacking true existence, just as you would assert that merit arises with respect to your assertion that the victors exist as true things. Merit arises in concordance with things – whether true or untrue.

QUALM: If sentient beings are illusory, lacking true existence, then, just like an illusion sentient being will not arise again after having disintegrated, having died, how are sentient beings reborn?

RESPONSE: We are not claiming that illusions and sentient beings are identical in every way; rather, we are asserting that they are alike in being truly existent or not truly existent. In case you attribute fault to merely that, then it is tantamount to you yourself saying: "Since dreams and illusions are asserted to be false, if the basis of [a magician's] emanation appears as a horse, why does it not appear as a donkey?" Therefore, also with respect to falsities, for as long as those conditions aggregate, for that long will illusions also arise. {384} Likewise, if the conditions for ignorance and the like aggregate, then minds will also join [to future rebirths].

OBJECTION: It is not similar, because sentient beings are of long continuity since beginningless time.

RESPONSE: Why should sentient beings be truly existent due merely to long continuity? It follows that the distinction of falsity due to illusions being of short continuity is untenable, because, in that case one would have to assert distinctions of truth and falsity since even illusions and dreams are of varying durations. For, one can recall an eon, a day, and so forth in dreams.

OBJECTION: If [phenomena] do not exist inherently and are illusory, this contradicts the explanation that killing sentient beings and the like gives rise to negativity.

RESPONSE: With respect to killing an illusion being and the like, if there is discrimination as a human being and penetration of the weapon and the like out of the desire to kill, then there is the negativity of the preparation, but no negativity of the actual [deed], because [an illusion being] has no mind. By benefiting and harming humans and so forth – sentient beings who possess illusion minds – merit and negativity respectively arise.

QUALM: Similar in being without inherent existence, why are there productions with and without minds?

RESPONSE: Because illusion substances, medicine, and mantras lack the ability to produce an illusion possessing mind, mind does not occur in illusion horses and elephants. The illusions that arise from various conditions **also** appear in varieties. The term “also” [in 9.12d indicates that illusions] are not limited to sentient beings. {385}

Various causes are necessary to give rise to various results, because nowhere is there a single condition that is able [to give rise] to all results. The Middle-Way proponents assert that ultimately there is no birth, aging, and so forth, that emptiness of inherent existence is natural nirvana, and that the birth, aging, and so forth established through the force of karma and afflictions are samsara.

SUTRA-SCHOOL PROPONENTS: If it is ultimate or natural¹⁹⁰ nirvana, it is nirvana. Samsara’s being empty of inherent existence is ultimate nirvana, but samsara is circling by way of the continuity of birth and death conventionally, whereby it [absurdly follows that] there is a common locus between samsara and nirvana. In that case, since even a buddha would be circling in samsara, what use would the bodhisattva conduct of the bodhisattvas for the sake of attaining buddhahood be? It [absurdly] follows that it is meaningless.

RESPONSE: There is no fault, because there is a difference between natural nirvana and the nirvana that is purity of adventitious [stains]. Natural nirvana does not rely upon familiarization on the path, because it is the dharmata of all regardless of the presence or absence of familiarization on the path. The nirvana that is a separation from adventitious stains must be attained from severing the circling in samsara by way of the continuity of birth and death. Hence, although lacking inherent existence, if the continuity of the conditions is not severed, not only samsara, but also illusions are not averted. {386} If the conditions such as ignorance are severed, then there is no samsara even conventionally.

One must respond to the debate above through differentiating between ultimate nirvana and nirvana, not with something else, because the opponent accepts that a buddha does not circle [in samsara] whereas sentient beings do.

3B2B-2B3D-1B1B-2B. Specific refutation of the assertions of the Mind-Only proponents¹⁹¹

9.15cd [Mind-Only proponent]: If even a mistaken [consciousness] does not exist,
Then what will observe the illusion?

9.16 [Middle-Way proponent]: If the illusion itself does not exist for you,
Then what is observed at that time?

[Mind-Only proponent]: If the other exists as those,
Those aspects are just mind.

¹⁹⁰ Gyi emended to read *gyis*.

¹⁹¹ Appeared previously as “Specific refutation of the Mind-Only proponents.”

- 9.17 [Middle-Way proponent]: If mind itself is an illusion,
Then what is seen by what at that time?
The Protector of the World also
Taught “Mind does not see mind.”
- 9.18 Just as the blade of a sword
Does not cut itself, the mind is similar.
[Mind-Only proponent]: It is just like a butter lamp
That perfectly illuminates the thing that is itself.
- 9.19 [Middle-Way proponent]: A butter lamp is not an object to be illuminated
Because it is not obscured by darkness.
[Mind-Only proponent]: There is blue, like glass, that relies on
Other for its blueness and that which does not.
- 9.20 Likewise, some [things] are seen in reliance
On other and [some] are even seen without reliance.
[Middle-Way proponent]: It is not the case that the blueness in that which was not
blue
Made itself into the nature by itself.
- 9.21 “A butter lamp illuminates.”
When it is said that consciousness knows,
Through being known by what
Is it said that “Awareness illuminates”?
- 9.22 If it is not seen by any,
Whether it illuminates or does not illuminate {387}
Is like the gracefulness of the daughter of a barren woman;
It is meaningless even to express it.
- 9.23 [Mind-Only proponent]: If a self-cognizer does not exist
How would a primary consciousness be remembered?
[Middle-Way proponent]: It is remembered through relation
When experiencing another, like the poison of a rat.
- 9.24 [Mind-Only proponent]: Because those possessing other conditions see it,
It is clear to itself.
[Middle-Way proponent]: Through applying the eye medicine of attainment
Vases are seen, but the eye medicine is not.
- 9.25 [Middle-Way proponent]: Seeing, hearing, and knowing
Are not what are refuted here.
Here that which is the cause of suffering –
The conception of them as truly existent – is that to be averted.

- 9.26 [Mind-Only proponent]: Illusions are not other than the mind;
Yet they are also not considered to be other.
[Middle-Way proponent]: If they are things, how could they not be other?
Stating “They are not other,” they would not exist as things.
- 9.27 Just as illusions are not truly existent but are objects of view,
Likewise [the consciousnesses] are viewers.
[Mind-Only proponent]: Cyclic existence has as its support things,
Other [than] that it would be like space.
- 9.28 [Middle-Way proponent]: If non-things depended on things,
Then how can they have functions?
Your mind would be alone
Without companions.
- 9.29 If the mind were free from apprehendeds,
At that time all would be tathagatas.
If so, what excellence would there be
In considering mere mind?

[Mind-Only proponent]: In case all phenomena lack inherent existence, if even a mistaken consciousness holding to an illusion does not exist, then what mind will observe the illusion? {388} Since there will not be any, even the illusion will not exist.

[Middle-Way proponent]: This is a dispute in which one thinks that if this even exists, then it must exist inherently. If the appearance of the apprehended object as an external object is established just as it appears for you, Mind-Only proponent, then since external objects exist, the illusory and the observer of it will not exist. If it is not established just as it appears, then since it lacks inherent existence, according to you it must be utterly non-existent. If even the illusion-like appearance as the apprehended object itself does not exist, then what apprehended object is observed at that time? Even apprehenders of forms, sounds, and so forth will not exist.

[Mind-Only proponent]: Even if the objects that are just as they appear – appearing as external objects – do not exist as those, that other than them exists; those aspects of forms and so forth are just of the substance of mind.

[Middle-Way proponent]: If mind itself appears as an illusory object but there is no external object, then what consciousness that is free of an object is seen by what valid cognizer at that time? There will be no seer. It is untenable that the consciousness itself experiences and cognizes itself in a manner of vanished dualistic appearances.

The Protector of the World also taught in the *Sutra Requested by Crown Jewel* (*Ratnachudapariṣiccha-sutra*) that “Mind does not see mind,” by positing analogies such as the blade of a sword cannot cut the blade of the sword itself. For example, just as the blade of a sword does not cut itself no matter how, similarly the mind does not see mind. {389} Since proponents of self-cognizers accept that an aspect of the apprehender cognizes itself, with respect to its object of cognition and the cognizer, there is not even a mere atom which dawns in dissimilar aspect, whereby they are asserted to be the same such that not even the isolates are different. Hence if such self-cognizers are asserted, then one must assert that the blade of a

sword cuts itself and the like, and one must assert that a valid cognizer comprehends its object of comprehension without relying on its object of comprehension.

The refutation of the analogy of the butter lamp is as follows:

[Mind-Only proponent]: For example, it is just like a butter lamp that perfectly illuminates the two – the thing that is itself and things that are other. Likewise, the consciousness cognizes both itself and other.

[Middle-Way proponent]: The analogy is not established. A butter lamp does not illuminate itself¹⁹², for a butter lamp is not an object to be illuminated by the butter lamp itself, because it does not need to and is not able to illuminate itself. In that case, if darkness also obscures both itself and other, then this is incorrect, because darkness is not obscured by darkness; if it is, then just like a vase that is obscured by a piece of cloth, darkness will not be seen.

The refutation of the analogy of glass is as follows:

[Mind-Only proponent]: There is blue, as in glass, which is produced through the force of the basis – white glass – relying on other, not by way of its own entitiness, and with respect to *vaidurya*, blueness is produced by way of its own entitiness, {390} not relying on others. Likewise, some such as forms are seen in reliance on other cognizers, that is, consciousnesses, and since consciousness cognizes itself by itself, [some] are even seen without reliance on other cognizers.

[Middle-Way proponent]: It follows that the analogy of the blueness of *vaidurya* not being produced as blue from other causes is incorrect, because it is not the case that the blueness in that which was not produced as blue from causes made itself into the nature of blue by itself.

Although a butter lamp does not illuminate itself, it is said that “A butter lamp illuminates.” When it is said that consciousness knows, it is not that consciousness illuminates itself. In that case, through being known by what consciousness of other substance is it said that “Awareness illuminates”? It is inappropriate. If it is known by another substance, then [it will absurdly follow that] there will be no contact. Thus, when [being illuminated] by itself is inappropriate and [being illuminated] by another is also inappropriate, if it is not known, that is, seen, even by any cognizer, then even to express the difference of whether it illuminates or does not illuminate is meaningless, because the basis of difference cannot be established by all, just like, when the daughter of a barren woman does not exist, it is meaningless to describe her gracefulness.

[Mind-Only proponent]: If a self-cognizer does not exist, how would a primary consciousness that is the object-possessor be remembered? Since it would not, if one were to be able to infer the experience through the sign of remembrance, at the time of remembering “I previously saw blue,” due to emphasis of the experience of remembrance, the experience of the object is established from the sign of remembering the object, “I saw blue”; that very experience of the object is the apprehender of blue. {391} The existence of the experience of the object-possessor is established from the sign of remembering the object-possessor, “I saw”; that is the self-cognizer. The self-cognizer is also established by the reasoning that refutes other alternatives as to what the experiencer of the apprehender of blue is.

[Middle-Way proponent]: Remembering the object-possessor does not establish the self-cognizer. When the apprehender of blue experiences another object, blue, the remembrance of the object-possessor will be generated in relation, that is, from the relationship between the

¹⁹² *Mar me rang gis mar me rang gis* emended to read *mar me rang gis rang* in accordance with p. 604 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa's commentary.

object and the object-possessor, “I previously saw this blue”, just like the poison of a rat not being experienced at the time of lethargy but remembered subsequently. For example, during winter, although the rat injected the rat poison into the body when in lethargy, the lethargy is experienced but not the poison.

The injection of the poison occurring simultaneously with the lethargy is analogous to the experience of the object-possessor existing simultaneously with the apprehended object.

The object-possessor not being experienced by itself at that time is analogous to the poison not being experienced at the time of the lethargy.

Remembering the lethargy subsequently is analogous to remembering the experience of the object.

Remembering the previous object-possessor, although it did not experience itself, through the very remembrance of the experience of the object {392} is analogous to remembering the previously injected poison that was not experienced through the very remembrance of the lethargy.

This appears to be a marvelous reasoning of the production of remembrance (in the absence of a self-cognizer) that is composed by the Lord of Scholars.

In response to “It follows that it is incorrect that in general a subsequent primary consciousness remembers, because that previous primary consciousness did not experience itself by itself” the reply is that the pervasion is not established. Hence the intention of *Engaging in the Deeds of a Bodhisattva* is taught to be “‘Self-cognizers are not refuted conventionally’ is utterly not the assertion of the great Victor’s Child.”

The refutation of another reasoning proving self-cognizers:

[Mind-Only proponent]: Because others – those possessing other conditions¹⁹³ such as having trained in pervasiveness though the practice of calm-abiding – see the mind and so forth, one’s own mind (which is very near) is clear as its own object, just as, for example, if one can see a faraway needle then one can see a nearby mountain.

[Middle-Way proponent]: Through applying the eye medicine where the eye medicine, a substance of attainment is anointed on the eye, treasures such as vases under the ground are seen, but the eye medicine itself is not. Likewise, the existence of the self-cognizer is damaged; the probans¹⁹⁴ is not appropriate.

Alternatively, not only does such an explanation not prove that the object to be illuminated and the illuminator are one (due to being similarly produced from the single cause of the illuminator), it follows that they are not definitely established as being one entity, {393} because at the time of seeing a vase under the ground due to application in which an eye medicine (which is established by secret mantra for seeing a great treasure vase under the ground) is anointed to the eyes, not only does it not [follow that] the object to be illuminated, the vase, is one with the illuminator, the eye medicine, it also does not [follow that] they are

¹⁹³ The following example is given on p. 607 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary. When one practices calm-abiding and attains an absorption of an actual concentration, in dependence on that, one trains by taking to mind the pervasiveness of a clairvoyance that knows the minds of others: “My mind is like this and my body is like that; also others’ mind is like this and their body is like that.”

¹⁹⁴ This, in Tibetan, is *sgrub byed*, that which acts to prove the probandum (that which is to be proved, *sgrub bya*). For example, in the statement “Sound is impermanent because of being a product,” the probans is “Being a product” and the probandum is “Sound is impermanent.”

of one entity. Hence, not only is it inappropriate as the probans of the self-cognizer, it also damages the existence of the self-cognizer.

[Mind-Only proponent]: However if there is no self-cognizer, then since there is no memory, there will be no experiencing of objects, seeing, hearing, and the like.

[Middle-Way proponent]: Conventionalities – seeing by the eye consciousness, hearing by the ear consciousness, and knowing by the mental [consciousness] – are not what are refuted here, because there is no need to refute them, since just these do not produce suffering and even foe-destroyers have them conventionally. Further, they cannot be refuted, because if they must be refuted through scripture and reasoning in refutation, scripture and reasoning are similar [to them in being objects to be refuted since they are also mere appearances]¹⁹⁵ in refutation. There will be a fault if they are refuted, because one will become a holder of the view of annihilation. Thus here that which is the cause of suffering – the conception of these objects as truly existent – is that to be averted, because that itself is the root of cyclic existence. For, Yongdzin Tamje Khyenpa says:

Therefore this innate apprehension of I apprehends the I as being established from the object's own side. That very object of the mode of apprehension of this mind – the I being established from the object's own side – is the final object of refutation here. Further, there are three modes of apprehension of the mind: {394} apprehension of I as really established, apprehension of a I lacking true existence, and apprehension of a mere I without making a distinction through either of the two [modes above].

With respect to those, the apprehension as a mere I is not the apprehension of the I, and not all appearances thinking “I” in the mind are to be refuted. If you were to hold that all minds thinking “I” are apprehensions of the I and refute them, then you will annihilate the support of actions and their effects. Hence, it is important to make hair-splitting distinctions of the mind.

And Gyeltshab Rinpoche says: “The statement ‘Mere appearances to the sense consciousnesses, such as the keeping of silence are not to be refuted; the apprehensions of them as either permanent or impermanent, existent or non-existent, and the like are to be refuted’ is a later saying of Chinese abbots.”

Therefore if the root of cyclic existence is not countered, cyclic existence will not be averted. Since the apprehenders of forms, sounds, and so forth as truly existent have been taught to be the root of cyclic existence, it is clearly asserted that hearers and solitary realizers have the realization of the selflessness of phenomena.

Mind-Only proponent: Since there are no external objects, illusions, that is, forms and so forth are not other substance than the mind; yet, since previously there was the criticism, “By what is it seen?” these two [i.e., mind and forms and so forth] are also not considered¹⁹⁶ to be other.

[Middle-Way proponent]: If forms and so forth are truly existent, then they must be true in just the way they appear. In that case, since they appear as external objects, they must be

¹⁹⁵ Annotated in accordance with p. 608 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa's commentary.

¹⁹⁶ Spelt as *bntag* on p. 607 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa's commentary.

established as external objects. But if they are external things, how could they not be other substance than the mind? It follows that they are other substance [than the mind]. Stating “They are not other substance,” it follows that they would not exist as truly existent things, {395} because, asserting appearances as false, they are not other than it [mind].

Just as illusions – forms and so forth which appear as objects – are not truly existent but are objects of observation that are objects of view of the mind, likewise the six consciousnesses are similar in not being truly existent although they are viewers. Hence, the Middle-Way proponents do not incur the previously stated fault “If even a mistaken [consciousness] does not exist” [in 9.15]. If you, the Mind-Only proponents were to also rely on that mode, it would be wonderful.

[Mind-Only proponent]: Falsities and imputed existents, such as cyclic existence and the like, have as their support or have as their basis some truly existent thing, because all mistakes have some truly existent basis. For example, even though a log may be mistaken as a human being, the log is established as true. Similarly, if cyclic existence does not depend on anything other than depending on the basis of truth, then it would lack things, like space.

[Middle-Way proponent]: The meaning of this argument has been taught in [Shantideva’s] *Compendium of Trainings (Sikṣasamuccaya)*; explanations elsewhere are not its meaning.

[Middle-Way proponent]: If falsities, non-things such as cyclic existence, depended on things that are truly existent mistaken bases, then how will they have functions of producing effects such as bondage and freedom? It follows that they will not, because the bases that are depended upon, truly existent things, do not exist. This reason is taught in [Shantideva’s] *Compendium of Trainings (Sikṣasamuccaya)*.

By way of your system, Mind-Only proponents, {396} it follows that mind would be alone, self-cognizing and self-illuminating without companions such as mistaking the apprehendeds and apprehenders as dual. For, since you assert that this appearance of the object and the object-possessor as being faraway and cut-off is not established as it appears, external objects do not exist, and since the appearances of forms and so forth being consciousnesses has been refuted above, they are not consciousnesses. In this case, since they would be other objects unrelated to consciousness, although the appearances of forms and so forth would be corrupted, the substance of consciousness would be uncorrupted. If you assert this, then it follows that the mind would be free from the appearances of dual apprehendeds and apprehenders, at that time all sentient beings would be tathagatas and be freed effortlessly, because all sentient beings would be free from the appearances of dual apprehendeds and apprehenders.

If asserted so, what excellence, that is, purpose would there be in considering, that is, determining mere mind in which apprehendeds and apprehenders are empty of being different substances for the sake of attaining omniscience? It follows that there is not the slightest [purpose], because of that assertion.

3B2B-2B3D-1B1B-2C. Dispelling the consequence that the Middle-Way proponents lack the need and ability for a mind (path) that realizes emptiness

9.30 [Mind-Only proponents and so forth]¹⁹⁷: Even if one knows them to be like illusions,
How will the afflictions be averted?

¹⁹⁷ Annotated in accordance with p. 611 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

Even the very creator of an illusion woman
Will produce attachment.

- 9.31 [Middle-Way proponents]: That creator has not abandoned
the latencies of the afflictions
With respect to objects of knowledge.
Therefore when he sees it
His latencies of emptiness are weak.
- 9.32 Through cultivating the latencies of emptiness {397}
The latencies of things will be abandoned, and
Through familiarizing with “Nothing whatsoever exists,”
Later on that too will be abandoned.
- 9.33 When it is said “Nothing exists,”
The thing that is investigated is not observed.
At that time, how does a non-thing separated from the support
Abide in front of the mind?
- 9.34 When neither thing nor non-thing
Abides in front of the mind,
Since there is no other aspect at that time,
In the absence of objects of observation, [elaborations] are utterly pacified.
- 9.35 Just as wish-fulfilling jewels and wish-granting trees
Completely fulfill hopes,
Likewise through the force of their prayers for those to be subdued,
The exalted bodies of victors appear.
- 9.36 For example, having accomplished
The Garuda Shrine, he passed away.
Yet, even though he passed away a long time ago,
It still pacifies poisons and the like.
- 9.37 Likewise, the shrine of a victor is also accomplished
In accordance with the enlightened conduct, and,
Although the bodhisattva has attained nirvana,
He enacts all welfares.
- 9.38 [Hearers’ school:] How will results come to be possessed
By making offerings to one without mind?
[Middle-Way proponent:] Because it has been explained that
Abiding and having attained nirvana are similar.
- 9.39 Either conventionally or in thusness it is suitable;
That there is a result is found in the scriptures.

For example, it is just like how there is a result
With respect to truly existent buddhas.

[Mind-Only proponents and so forth]: Even if you have determined that all phenomena lack inherent existence like illusions, and know thus, {398} in the absence of a purpose such as the abandonment of afflictive obscurations by it, having determined such is nothing but fatigue. Even if you were to assert that there is a purpose, how will the afflictions be averted by it? It follows that that they will not [be averted by it], because even the very magician, the creator of an illusion woman, although realizing the emptiness of an external woman, thinking, “What if this illusion woman could be enjoyed?” it is seen that the magician will produce attachment. Besides the mere realization of emptiness by¹⁹⁸ you through initial hearing and contemplation, there is nothing.

[Middle-Way proponents]: That magician, the creator of the illusion, has not abandoned even slightly the latencies of the afflictions, the apprehension of true existence with respect to the object of knowledge, that is, to the illusion woman, and apprehends it as truly existent. Therefore when he sees it his latencies of realization of emptiness are weak, whereby afflictions are produced.

It is incorrect to reply saying, “The realization by the previous ones that the illusion woman is empty of being a woman does not abandon afflictions since [that emptiness] is merely a trifling emptiness. They are abandoned by the realization of emptiness which pervades our [Middle-Way] system,” because the realization that the illusion woman is empty of being a woman is not a trifling realization of emptiness that relies on the subtle object of refutation [since that realization must realize the illusion woman as lacking true existence]¹⁹⁹; from explanations elsewhere you should understand: (1) the identification of the object of refutation, (2) that if one realizes the absence upon one phenomenon, then understanding comes with respect to other [phenomena], and so forth.

Hence, in general, with respect to mistakes, as in the case of the seeing of falling hairs due to cataracts, a non-conceptual mistake, {399} that mistake will not be averted through the mental [consciousness] understanding that there are no falling hairs; in order to avert that, one must try to eliminate the cataracts of the eyes. Also, with respect to conceptual mistakes, mistakes that arise from temporary incidental causes are averted by merely realizing, for example, that the striped rope that has been apprehended as a snake is a rope; in order to avert that, prolonged familiarization with that understanding and the like are not necessary. The apprehension of true existence in the continua of all migrating beings has been greatly habituated with in their continua since time without a beginning which cannot be perceived even by the buddhas. It is as though it has thoroughly cooked the continuum.

Therefore, let alone its seeds, how can even the manifest coarse [apprehension of true existence] be averted by the mere realization of lack of true existence? Not only just that, even though the direct realization of the lack of true existence abandons the acquired afflictions along with their seeds, it does not abandon the innate afflictions. For this reason, the presentation of paths such as the path of meditation which is to be familiarized for a long time has been frequently taught. It has been asserted that the realization of emptiness will extinguish afflictions eventually, and that is sufficient; it has not been and is not being

¹⁹⁸ *Kyi* emended to read *kyis* in accordance with p. 611 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

¹⁹⁹ Annotated in accordance with p. 612 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

asserted that “It is necessary for the realization of emptiness to abandon them immediately.” The condensed reply is “How can that be necessary?”

That magician who created the illusion woman has not abandoned the latencies of the afflictions, the apprehension of true existence of the object of knowledge that is the observed object, the illusion woman, and apprehends it as truly existent. Therefore when he sees that the illusion woman is empty of being a woman, those latencies of emptiness are weak and lack the ability to harm the apprehension of true existence, {400} because they do not contradict its mode of apprehension. “Latencies” in “latencies of the afflictions” can refer to the apprehension of true existence, and can refer to its seeds and knowledge obscurations. However here it is taken to be the former.

If one cultivates the latencies of emptiness and realizes things to be empty of inherent existence, the latencies of apprehending things as truly existent will be abandoned, and through familiarizing with “Nothing whatsoever exists,” that is, the realization of lack of true existence, later on the apprehension of the lack of true existence as truly existent too will be abandoned. If merely the coarse object of refutation is refuted, then true existence must be refuted later on. However, a refutation in which the subtle object of refutation (which is existence not merely posited by convention of name taken as the measure of true existence) has been refuted refutes the apprehension of true existence from that very time, and it will immediately be severed.

When it is said “No thing exists truly,” if the thing that is investigated truly exists, then it is suitable to be observed, but it is not observed to truly exist. Hence at that time of realizing that it does not exist truly, a truly existent non-thing is refuted because its support that is the property-possessor is separated from true existence; how does the truly existent abide in front of the mind?

Since there is no property that is separated from a property-possessor, if the emptiness of true existence is truly existent, then the property-possessor must be established in the nature of [the property]. Since its [the property-possessor’s] being established in the nature of true existence has been refuted earlier on, when neither a truly existent thing nor non-thing abides in front of the mind, since there is no other truly existent aspect at that time {401} and all focal points that are the objects of observation of the effect apprehension of true existence are absent, all elaborations are utterly pacified. For, in the perspective of a person who directly realizes emptiness, even dualistic elaborations regarding emptiness are pacified, but for a realization by way of a meaning-generality, even though dualistic appearances have not been stopped, in its perspective, the elaborations of true existence have been stopped. This stanza and the following five stanzas [9.34-9.39] extensively reveal the mode of abidance of the effect. According to the To-lung Gya-mar²⁰⁰, having taken ‘the non-existence of knower consciousness and the non-existence of objects of knowledge at the time when the mode of abidance is manifest’ to be assertions of this treatise [Shantideva’s *Engaging in the Deeds of a Bodhisattva*] and of the Abbot Den-nyi, they claimed that ‘the knower consciousness of no objects of knowledge and the valid cognizer of no objects of comprehension are ignorance.’ It is obvious from their assertions of the emptiness of true existence as being truly existent that they have not understood even slightly the assertion of the great trail-blazers. Even as they have come under the influence of the view of permanence, they pride themselves in having realized the meaning of the Middle-Way. This is seriously inappropriate.

²⁰⁰ The expression literally refers to the Chinese communists of the region Tolung near Lhasa.

OBJECTION: If the buddhas have pacified all conceptions, then, since they also do not think “I shall reveal the Dharma to those to be subdued,” it is untenable for them to enact the deeds of revealing the Dharma to sentient beings.

RESPONSE: There is no fault. Even they do not have conceptions, just as making supplications to wish-fulfilling jewels and wish-granting trees completely fulfills hopes as desired, {402} likewise through (1) the strength of those to be subdued having collected the merit to meet the buddhas and the like, and, (2) the force of previous prayers for those to be subdued, “May I enact the welfare of sentient beings effortlessly and spontaneously” (even though the buddhas do not conceptualize), the exalted form bodies of the victors appear and reveal the Dharma. This is very much tenable.

OBJECTION: Since a long time has passed since the prayers have been made, their production of effects is not tenable. And since the prayers were made by bodhisattvas, it is not feasible for their effects to be deeds of victors.

RESPONSE: There is no fault. For example, having accomplished the Garuda Shrine for pacifying poisons, the brahmin passed away. Yet, even though he passed away²⁰¹ a long time ago, the Garuda Shrine still is able to pacify poisons and the like now. Likewise, the shrine of a victor is also accomplished by way of the two accumulations in accordance with the enlightened conduct by the bodhisattva, and, although the bodhisattva has attained non-abiding nirvana, unsurpassable manifest [enlightenment], there is no contradiction that he enacts all temporal and final welfares of those to be subdued. This is an argument that fails to understand the positing of continuity.

Hearers’ school: How will results of merit come to be possessed by making offerings to buddhas without a conceptual mind? For, there is no conception of accepting the offerings.

[Middle-Way proponent:] Even though buddhas do not have conceptions, it follows that it has been explained that merit will arise through making offerings, {403} because it has been explained in the *Sutra Requested by Maitri Simhanada* that the two – making offerings to the Buddha when his exalted body is actually abiding and to the relics after he has attained nirvana – are similar in merit.

It has been taught also in the [*Sutra of*]²⁰² *the Benefits of Circumambulating a Stupa*:

*Making offerings to one abiding and
An equally faithful mind towards
The relics of one who has attained nirvana
Do not differ in merit.*

Either conventionally or in thusness it is suitable to make offerings to buddhas and the like; that a result will arise from making offerings to them is taught in the scriptures by the buddhas. For example, it is just like how you have asserted that there is a result with respect to truly existent buddhas.

The meaning is as follows: Paying no heed to analyzing the meaning of suchness for the time being, it is sufficient for me that results arise in accordance with things, be they real or false.

²⁰¹ Dis emended to read ‘das.

²⁰² Annotated in accordance with p. 616 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

3B2B-2B3D-1B2. Establishing that even those who desire to attain mere liberation need to realize emptiness

3B2B-2B3D-1B2A. Argument

3B2B-2B3D-1B2B. Response

3B2B-2B3D-1B2A. Argument

9.40ab [Hearers' school:] By²⁰³ seeing the truths, one will be freed;
What is the use of seeing emptiness?

Hearers' school: By familiarizing with the direct seeing of the aspects of the Four [Noble] Truths, such as impermanence, one will attain freedom, the result of foe-destroyer; what is the use of seeing the emptiness of true existence of all phenomena? {404} It is purposeless and inappropriate.

According to the hearers' school:

- not only is the realization of emptiness not necessary for the attainment of buddhahood, even the mere name "selflessness of phenomena" is not accepted, and
- the mahayana sutra sets are not accepted as the words of the Buddha.

These are their main contentions. As an ancillary topic, we also refute the assertion that, even though the mahayana sutra sets are accepted to be valid, the realization of the selflessness of phenomena is not necessary for the attainment of the result of foe-destroyer. Asserting the proof that the very wisdom realizing emptiness is the path that liberates from [cyclic] existence, we state these passages.

3B2B-2B3D-1B2B. Response

3B2B-2B3D-1B2B-1. Establishing that the wisdom realizing emptiness is the path that liberates from cyclic existence

3B2B-2B3D-1B2B-2. Establishing [that the wisdom realizing emptiness] is the path for attaining non-abiding nirvana

3B2B-2B3D-1B2B-3. Advice that it is hence appropriate for those seeking liberation to meditate on emptiness

3B2B-2B3D-1B2B-1. Establishing that the wisdom realizing emptiness is the path that liberates from cyclic existence

9.40cd [Middle-Way proponent:] It is because in the scriptures it is taught that
Without this path there is no enlightenment.

9.41 [Middle-Way proponent:] If the Mahayana is not established,
How are your own scriptures established?
[Great-Exposition proponent:] Because these are established for both of us.
[Middle-Way proponent:] Initially they were not established for you.

9.42 Your conviction in them due to conditions
Is also identical for the Mahayana.
If something were true due to being accepted by two others,
Then the Vedas and the rest would also be true.

9.43 [Great-Exposition proponent:] Because the Mahayana is disputable.
[Middle-Way proponent:] Because there is dispute with the Tirthikas regarding the
scriptures and

²⁰³ *Ba'i* emended to read *pas*.

Also between you and others regarding other scriptures,
You should discard them. {405}

- 9.44 While the root of the teachings is fully-ordained monks,
Even those fully-ordained monks themselves abide with difficulty.
Those whose minds are together with observed objects
Abide in nirvana also with difficulty.
- 9.45 [Great-Exposition proponent:] The afflictions are abandoned, whereby they
are freed.
[Middle-Way proponent: It follows that] as soon as that happens they become [foe-
destroyers].
Although lacking afflictions,
The potencies of actions are seen in them.
- 9.46 [Great-Exposition proponent:] It is definitely said that
“There is no temporariness and craving for appropriation.”
[Middle-Way proponent:] That craving, although unafflicted,
Is still thorough obscuration. Why would there not be it?
- 9.47 Due to the condition of feeling, there is craving.
Feelings also exist in them.
A mind that is together with observation
Abides in some.
- 9.48 Having ceased [in] a mind that is separated from emptiness,
[They] will be produced once again,
As in the case of the absorption without discrimination.
Therefore, one should meditate on emptiness.
- 9.49 If any speech engaging the sutra sets
Is asserted to be the speech of the Buddha,
Why do you not assert that regarding most of the Mahayana
Since they are similar to your sutras?
- 9.50 If due to not being realized,
All become faulty,
Why, due to one sutra being similar,
Were not all spoken by the Victor?
- 9.51 Mahakashyapa and the others
Did not manage to fathom that speech.
Who would consider they as not to be held
Due to your not realizing it?

[Middle-Way proponent:] It follows that the realization of emptiness is definitely necessary even for the attainment of the result of hearer foe-destroyer, {406} because in the *Perfection of Wisdom Sutras (Prajnaparamita Sutras)* scriptures it is taught that without cultivating this path that realizes emptiness there is no attainment of the three enlightenments²⁰⁴. It is taught in the *Mother Sutras*,²⁰⁵ just as it has been cited in the *Great Commentary to [Shantideva's] Engaging in the Deeds of a Bodhisattva*, that there is no liberation for those having discrimination of things, and [the states of] perfect complete buddhas, and [the states] ranging from stream-enterers to solitary-realizers of all three times are attained in dependence on this very perfection of wisdom; it is not the meaning of the passage that only unsurpassable enlightenment is being referred to.

Furthermore, not all of the countless passages from the class of sutra indicating that hearers have the realization of the selflessness of phenomena have been cited.

These two lines of the text [9.40cd] state this probans having accepted that the mahayana is established to be the words of the Buddha in the mental perspective of someone from the hearers' school.

QUALM: If they do not assert that the mahayana scriptures are valid, will it not be illogical to state that as the probans?

RESPONSE: There is no fault, because it is not necessary for the three modes of all stated probans to be established by the opponent right from the beginning. Here the pervasion of this probans will also be established by genuine parallel reasoning below. Acharya [Shantideva] also posited the refutation of the wrong conception that refuses to accept that the mahayana sutra sets are the words of the Buddha and then stated these [following] passages. He proved the probandum²⁰⁶ of this reason, that the wisdom realizing emptiness is the paths of all three enlightenments; {407} although the mahayana is not established to be the words of the Buddha by means of establishing its pervasion, with respect to establishing by scripture that the mahayana is the words of the Buddha, there is no misdeed in its application.

OBJECTION: The mahayana sutra sets are not established to be the words of the Buddha for me and I do not accept them to be valid. Hence, when establishing the path, proving that the realization of emptiness is also the path of the hearers through stating that as the probans is a case of the probans being identical to the probandum.

[Hearers' school:] If asked, "How are your scriptures – these Hinayana sutra sets that you assert to be valid – established to be the words of the Buddha?" then [I say that] they are words of the Buddha because these Hinayana sutra sets are established to be the words of the Buddha for both of us.

[Middle-Way proponent:] The reasons are identical. For, initially when you were just born and had not determined them through scriptures, meaning, and reasoning, these Hinayana sutra sets were also not established as valid for you. Later, due to conditions for asserting the scriptures as valid, methods for determining them through scriptures, meaning, and reasoning – methods such as teachings on the greatness of engagement in (1) illuminating the vinaya, (2) engaging the sutra sets, and (3) not contradicting the abhidharma – then you developed the

²⁰⁴ These are the enlightenment of the hearers, the enlightenment of the solitary-realizers and the enlightenment of buddhahood.

²⁰⁵ These refer to the *Perfection of Wisdom Sutras*.

²⁰⁶ This, in Tibetan, is *sgrub bya*, that which is to be proved.

conviction in these valid scriptures. The probans that established such is identical also for the mahayana sutra sets.

Otherwise, if something were true as valid due to being accepted by any two other persons, then it follows that the Vedas texts and the rest would also be true, {408} because they are accepted as valid by two persons.

[Great-Exposition proponent:] Since the Hinayana sutra sets accepted by me are also accepted by you to be the words of the Buddha, there is no dispute. However, since I do not accept the mahayana sutra sets, they are disputable.

[Middle-Way proponent:] (1) Because there is dispute between the Tirthikas and the hearers' schools regarding the Hinayana scriptures, and (2) because, although all eighteen sub-schools assert the Hinayana scriptures as valid, regarding other internal divisions of the scriptures, such as the teachings on the existence of the intermediate state²⁰⁷ existence, since some in the Hearers' school accept them as words of the Buddha while some do not accept them, there is also dispute within the Hearers' school, between you and others, it follows that you should discard even the Hinayana sutra sets as being valid.

The foe-destroyers, having heard [teachings] from the Buddha directly, condensed them in scriptures which were subsequently taught. Thus from among the many fully-ordained monks explained [such as nominal fully-ordained monks]²⁰⁸, the root of the teachings of the Buddha Bhagavan is the foe-destroyer fully-ordained monks. While that is so, **even** foe-destroyer fully-ordained monks themselves abide with difficulty:

The subject –hearer superiors – it follows that they do not attain the state of foe-destroyer, because they do not take the wisdom realizing emptiness as the path.

This also indicates the flinging of the consequence that the state of foe-destroyer is not possible for those who do not accept the emptiness that is the phenomena's emptiness of inherent existence. The term “even” [in 9.44b signifies] “not only will they not attain buddhahood if they are separated from the realization of emptiness, [they will also not attain the mere state of foe-destroyer]²⁰⁹.” {409}

The subject – hearer foe-destroyers – it follows that they abide in nirvana also with difficulty, that is, even the nirvana of their continua is untenable, because their minds are together with observed objects of the apprehension of true existence, that is, their minds adhere to things as truly existent without repudiating the adhered objects of [the apprehension of true existence]. Alternatively, by taking the first two lines [of 9.44] to be the thesis, the later two lines refer to the sign, explaining that “As long as one has the apprehension of true existence, one will not attain nirvana.”

[Hearers' school:] The realization of emptiness is not necessary for the attainment of [the state of] foe-destroyer. Instead, by cultivating the path that realizes the sixteen [attributes of the Four Noble Truths] such as impermanence, the afflictions are abandoned exhaustively, whereby they are freed and attain the result of foe-destroyer.

[Middle-Way proponent:] It follows that as soon as the manifest afflictions have been abandoned by persons who abandon merely the manifest afflictions for the time being, they

²⁰⁷ *Bor* emended to read *bar* in accordance with p. 619 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa's commentary.

²⁰⁸ Annotated in accordance with p. 620 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa's commentary. “Nominal fully-ordained monks” seems to refer to those who are involved with impure rites of vows or impure motivations.

²⁰⁹ Annotated in accordance with p. 620 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa's commentary.

become foe-destroyers, because having exhausted the afflictions by cultivating the path of the sixteen [attributes of the Four Noble Truths] such as impermanence, [the state of] foe-destroyer is attained. Those two are taken to be similar in every way. That cannot be asserted, because although lacking manifest afflictions temporarily, the potencies of actions that connect to future rebirths are seen in those persons who have abandoned merely the manifest afflictions.

“The afflictions are abandoned, whereby they are freed” [9.45a] expresses the system of the previous side. In accordance with the explanation that “By seeing the truths, one will be freed,” [9.40a] it is to be explained that {410} “When by cultivating the path of the sixteen [attributes of the Four Noble Truths] such as impermanence, afflictions are abandoned and freedom will be attained.” For, in this context this is an argument regarding whether or not freedom from afflictions will be attained by way of merely the path of the sixteen [attributes of the Four Noble Truths], and this is very clear from the argument “By seeing the truths” and so forth.

Therefore, the explanation that “Having asserted that the path of the sixteen [attributes of the Four Noble Truths] such as impermanence is able to exhaust afflictions, it is not that one will be freed from all suffering by it” is utterly not its meaning. Hence if it is posited that one attains the freedom that is the exhaustion of afflictions by the path at the time of the temporary absence of the manifest fluctuation of that posited as afflictions common to the two hearers’ schools due to having generated in one’s continuum the path as explained earlier, then the following assertion must be refuted: “Due to merely the manifest afflictions having been abandoned temporarily, as soon as that happens, the freedom that is the exhaustion of all contaminations will be attained.”

This cannot be asserted, because “Although lacking afflictions, / The potencies of actions are seen in them” [9.45cd] indicates that “Although lacking manifest afflictions temporarily, the potency²¹⁰ to project future rebirths by the force of actions is seen.”

Also, Gyeltshab Rinpoche says:

These passages must be explained in this manner; it should not be taken as [asserted by] some commentaries and Tibetans: “On account of seeing the issuing forth of suffering, the result of actions that were accumulated at the time of being ordinary beings previously, in Maudgalyana, Arya Angulimala, and so forth, they did not become freed immediately.” {411} This is not the potency which will generate suffering of this life; rather, it indicates that “Since the ability to project future rebirths due to karma (actions) has not been overcome, they are not freed.”

[Great-Exposition proponent:] It is definitely said that “The abandonment in those who have attained the state of foe-destroyer is not just temporary; since craving, the cooperative condition for appropriating existence, has been exhaustively abandoned there are no seeds, whereby one does not take a future rebirth.”

[Middle-Way proponent:] Although this craving in the continuum of the person whom you asserted to be a foe-destroyer is unafflicted in the way it has been explained in the Abhidharma, it still is thorough obscuration according to the Abhidharma. Just as ignorance is asserted to be of two types, afflicted and unafflicted, why would there also not be a craving

²¹⁰ The Tibetan text says *mi* here, meaning “inability,” which may be a scribing error.

that is afflicted and one that is not, in the way it has been explained in the Abhidharma? This must be asserted.

This passage indicates that there is unafflicted craving in the way it is renowned in common for the two [hearers'] schools and the mahayana; you should understand that it is utterly not that the craving in our system are asserted to be of two types, afflicted and unafflicted.

Thus although one has temporarily abandoned the manifest craving that is induced by the apprehension of a self in which a person is apprehended as self-sufficient substantially-existent, why would there not be craving that is induced by the view of the transitory collection in which a person is apprehended as being established by way of its own entity? {412} This being the case, the abandonment of manifest afflictions explained earlier does not avert even the manifest view of the transitory collection and craving that have just been explained. If, when one has abandoned the manifest afflictions in both these systems, the seeds in both systems are alike in not being abandoned, and the difference in whether the manifest afflictions are present or absent does not occur, then it is meaningless to make distinctions with respect to craving.

Since those persons who have not realized emptiness do not abandon even slightly the ignorance that apprehends feelings as truly existent, due to the condition of feeling, there is definitely production of the craving not to be separated from happiness feelings and the craving that desires to be separated from suffering. For, the adherence to feelings as existing by way of their own character exists in those whom you assert to be foe-destroyers. A mind that is together with the observation of things as truly existent abides manifestly in the continua of some persons. As long as that is the case, it is impossible to avert even the manifest craving that is induced by it.

Although it is recognized that manifest afflictions can be ceased temporarily in a mind that is separated from the realization of persons and aggregates as being empty of being established by way of their own character, but they will be produced once again manifestly, as in the case of one abiding in the absorption without discrimination. Therefore, definitely assert that those who desire to attain not only omniscience but even the mere result of foe-destroyer should meditate on the emptiness that refutes the subtle object of negation.

(1) Taking hearers and solitary-realizers such as Tseg Wang-chug Seng-ge to lack the realization of selflessness of phenomena as the thought of [Shantideva's] *Engaging in the Deeds of a Bodhisattva*, and {413} (2) holding faults saying, "With respect to 'Due to the condition of feeling' [in 9.47a], inferring the result by way of the cause is indefinite pervasion" are cases of [opponents of] the previous side's dawn not yet breaking and talk that is unsuitable to be released in a gathering. The assertion that the apprehension of persons and aggregates as truly existent is an affliction is accepted also by this Acharya [Shantideva]. If you wish to understand this extensively, you should know it from the great explanation of [Chandrakirti's] *Supplement to the Middle Way (Madhyamakavatara)* composed by the Foremost Tamche Khyenpa [Tsongkhapa].

At the end of this passage are three stanzas, "If any speech..." [9.49–9.51], that are asserted to indicate the reasonings that prove that the mahayana is the words of the Buddha. But prior to "While the root of the teachings is fully-ordained monks..." [in 9.44a], there was material [proving that the mahayana is the words of the Buddha in 9.40ab–9.43]. The context of their inclusion [at a later point again] is not known and the Abbot explained in the great commentary that "[These three stanzas] are not the text of Acharya [Shantideva]."

In any case, their meaning is as follows. If any speech – (1) engaging the sutra sets (since the higher training in mind [meditative stabilization] is taught), (2) illuminating the vinaya (since the higher training in ethics is taught), and (3) not contradicting the Abhidharma (since the higher training in wisdom is taught) – is asserted to be the speech of the Buddha, why do you not assert that most of the Mahayana sutra sets are the words of the Buddha since they teach the three trainings?

If you assert that, due to one sutra not being realized as fulfilling the characteristics of being words of the Buddha posited by you, and all Mahayana sutra sets are faulty, {414} then why do you not assert that, due to seeing one Mahayana sutra that fulfills the characteristics of being words of the Buddha asserted by you, since it is similar in characteristics to what you assert as sutra sets, that all Mahayana sutra sets were spoken by the Victor?

OBJECTION: If the *Extensive Mother* [the *Hundred Thousand Stanza Perfection of Wisdom Sutra*] and the like are the words [of the Buddha], then it would be reasonable that Mahakashyapa and the others understood their subject matter. But they did not. Hence they are not the words [of the Buddha].

RESPONSE: Who would consider them as not to be held as the words [of the Buddha] due to your taking as the reason that Mahakashyapa and the others did not realize the very profound which is asserted to be difficult to fathom? Such consideration is inappropriate.

3B2B-2B3D-1B2B-2. Establishing that the path realizing emptiness is [the path for attaining] non-abiding nirvana²¹¹

9.52 The accomplishment of dwelling in cyclic existence
 Free from the extremes of attachment and fear
 For the welfare of those suffering out of confusion
 Is the result of emptiness.

The achievement of non-abiding nirvana is definitely contingent upon the realization of emptiness. The arya bodhisattvas' accomplishment of dwelling in cyclic existence through the force of compassion, free from both the extremes of: (1) falling into the extreme of permanence of cyclic existence – circling through the force of karma and afflictions out of attachment to the aggregates as truly existent as in the case of ordinary beings – and (2) falling into the extreme of annihilation in which one acts to attain the nirvana that arises from severing merely rebirth in cyclic existence out of fear of the suffering of cyclic existence as in the case of hearer and solitary-realizers, for the welfare of suffering sentient beings who are circling in cyclic existence out of confusion regarding the person and the aggregates as truly existent {415} is the result of realizing emptiness. For, if one is separated from the realization of emptiness, then although one is already abiding in cyclic existence, when one experiences the suffering of cyclic existence as existing in and of itself²¹² and becomes disillusioned, one will fall into the extreme of annihilation.

3B2B-2B3D-1B2B-3. Advice that it is hence appropriate for those seeking liberation to meditate on emptiness

9.53 In that case, it is not correct to
 Repudiate the side of emptiness.

²¹¹ This outline appears previously as “3B2B-2B3D-1B2B-2. Establishing [that the wisdom realizing emptiness] is the path for attaining non-abiding nirvana.”

²¹² *Rang tshan pa* is translated as “existing in and of itself.”

Therefore, without entertaining any doubts,
One should meditate on emptiness.

- 9.54 The antidote to the darkness of the afflictive obscurations and
Obscurations to knowledge is emptiness.
Why do those who wish for omniscience quickly
Not meditate on it?
- 9.55 If terror will be generated from
The thing which produces suffering,
Then why generate fear with respect to
That which pacifies suffering – emptiness?
- 9.56 If some self existed,
Then one will fear anything whatsoever.
But since no such self exists
Who becomes afraid?

Therefore, in the case of what was earlier explained, it is not correct to repudiate the side of emptiness, because the reasoning that will be explained below will also damage that. Therefore, without entertaining any doubts, even those who wish to attain the enlightenment of the hearers and solitary-realizers should meditate on emptiness. For, the apprehension of true existence is the afflicted ignorance that is the root of cyclic existence, and without repudiating its adhered object, the attainment of liberation is impossible. {416}

The antidote to the darkness of the afflictive obscurations and obscurations to knowledge is the wisdom realizing emptiness. Hence why do those who wish for omniscience in which the two obscurations have been extinguished quickly not meditate on that emptiness? Separated from it, one will not be able to even abandon the seeds of the afflictive obscurations. The seeds of the obscurations to knowledge are the final imprints of afflictions, whereas manifest obscurations to knowledge are the factors of appearance in which things appear truly existent and so forth. However, it is inappropriate to take [the following stand]: whatever appears as truly existent is necessarily an obscuration to knowledge and so forth.

In summary:

OBJECTION: Due to terror for the meaning of emptiness, one should not meditate on it.

RESPONSE: If it is appropriate to generate fear and terror with respect to the principal producer of the suffering of cyclic existence – the apprehension of true existence, then why generate fear with respect to that which pacifies the suffering of cyclic existence – the wisdom realizing emptiness? This fear is inappropriate, because that [wisdom realizing emptiness] extinguishes fear.

If some inherently established self existed, then, due to adhering to it, it is reasonable that one will generate fear towards any object whatsoever. But since no such inherently established self exists even in the slightest, who is it who becomes afraid? Turn inwards with a mind that contemplates inherent existence and think about it! One will become freed from all fears by understanding selflessness.

3B2B-2B3D-1B3. Extensive explanation of the reasonings that prove emptiness {417}

3B2B-2B3D-1B3A. Extensive explanation of the reasonings that prove selflessness of persons

3B2B-2B3D-1B3B. Extensive explanation of the reasonings that prove selflessness of phenomena

3B2B-2B3D-1B3A. Extensive explanation of the reasonings that prove selflessness of persons

3B2B-2B3D-1B3A-1. Refuting the adhered object of the innate apprehension of the self of persons

3B2B-2B3D-1B3A-2. Refuting the adhered object of the acquired apprehension of the self of persons

3B2B-2B3D-1B3A-3. Dispelling objections regarding the refutation

3B2B-2B3D-1B3A-1. Refuting the adhered object of the innate apprehension of the self of persons

9.57 Teeth, hair, and nails are not the self.
 The self is not the bones or blood.
 The mucus is not it, nor is the phlegm,
 Neither is the lymph or pus.

9.58 The self is not the fat or sweat.
 The lungs and liver are also not the self,
 Nor are the other inner organs the self.
 The self is not the excrement or urine.

9.59 The flesh and skin are not the self.
 The warmth and winds are also not the self.
 The cavities are not the self. In all ways
 The six primary consciousnesses are also not the self.

With respect to this, the difference between the acquired and innate apprehension of the self is as follows. An awareness generated spontaneously (without relying on having engaged in the analysis of reasoning) that apprehends inherent existence and existence by way of its own character (regardless of whether one observes person or aggregates) which exists in all – those whose minds have been transformed by tenets and those who have not – is called “the innate apprehension of true existence.” The [conception] thinking, “True existence is tenable” and “It is truly existent” in reliance on having engaged in the analysis of reasoning, although also an apprehension of true existence, is the acquired.

Although the apprehension of the self of persons can be included within the innate apprehension of self-sufficient substantial existence, {418} the apprehension of the person and the aggregates as being like a master and his servants should be known as being solely the acquired. In the same vein, the apprehension of particles as partless and consciousness as partless is solely the acquired apprehension of a self of phenomena.

In brief, the two apprehensions of the self that are generated spontaneously without relying on the analysis of tenets are the innate, whereas apprehensions of the self other than them are the acquired. Although the adhered objects of the former are the main objects of refutation, understand that the refutation of the objects of refutation of the latter is a branch of the refutation of the former.

OBJECTION: If this refutation of the teeth, nails, and so forth not being the self is for the sake of becoming liberated from cyclic existence, then it is inappropriate that sentient beings have the apprehension of them as mine but do not have the apprehension [of them] as I.

RESPONSE: It has the same meaning as the teaching that form is not the self. Therefore the object of observation from the pair – the object of observation and the subjective aspect of the innate view of the transitory collection – is the mere I that is the support of cause and effect and the mere self-isolate of the mine. With respect to that, the view of the transitory

collection is the adherence to the I and the mine as being established by way of their own character. Therefore it is explained that “If they are established by way of their own character, then we must be able to prove either: (1) the collection of the aggregates, their continuity, a division of them, or a part of them discuss a basis for characterization of the I, or (2) an entity different from them to be a basis for characterization of the I, but they are not established as such.”

The refutation that a division of the aggregates is the basis for characterization of the self is as follows. {419} The teeth and nails are not the self. A basis for characterization of the self is not the bones or blood. The mucus is not it, nor is the phlegm, because they are but merely imputed as the self, nothing more. Neither the lymph or pus is a basis for characterization of the I. A basis for characterization of the self is not the fat or sweat; the reason is as before. The lungs and liver are also not a basis for characterization of the self; nor are the other inner organs such as the intestines the self; the self is not the excrement or urine, and the flesh and skin are not the self, because [the self] is merely imputed to them, nothing more. The warmth and winds are also not the self. The cavities and so forth within the body are not the self. Understand this; that is all.

To summarize their meaning, the Propounders of Things of our [Buddhist] schools hold that the aggregates are the basis for characterization of the person, while the Outsiders [non-Buddhists] assert a self that is an object other than the aggregates, with the person being like a master and the aggregates being like [his] servants.

These teachings here bear the same meaning as the refutation of the six constituents as being the person in [Nagarjuna’s] *Precious Garland (Rajaparikatharatnavali)* (stanza 1.80-1.81):

*A person²¹³ is not earth, not water,
Not fire, not wind, not space,
Not consciousness, and not all of them.
What person is there other than these?*

*Just as a person is not real
Due to being a composite of six constituents,
So each of the constituents also
Is not real due to being a composite.*

“The cavities are not” [in 9.59c] is a refutation of the space constituent as being the person. {420}

Therefore, it is inappropriate to hold even conventionally that the collection of the aggregates, their continuity, a division of them, or a part of them is a basis for characterization of the person. There is also no different entity other than them to be posited as the person. The person is merely imputed in dependence on them; that is all. For, Yongdzin Tamje Khyenpa also says:

If there exists an I that is established from its own side in just the way it is held by the innate apprehension of the I, then it either: (1) exists in terms of these two – my body and mind, or (2) exists apart from these two.

²¹³ *Skyes bu*

If it were to exist apart [from my body and mind], then after individually eliminating the two, the body and the mind, there must be something to be demonstrated, “The I is this.” Since there is no such thing to be demonstrated, we conclude that it does not exist apart [from my body and mind].

If it were to exist in terms of these two, the body and the mind, then it should either: (i) exist in terms of this body, or (ii) exist in terms of this mind. If it were to exist in terms of this body, then search for it: Are factors of the earth constituent, such as the teeth, nails, and the like of this body it [the I]? Are the water constituents, such as the blood, lymph, mucus, and the like the I? Is the fire constituent included within the warmth the I? Are factors of the winds of the body the I? Are factors of the space constituent, the cavities, the hollows, of the body the I? It is easy to understand that each of these is not the I. Since we do not find the I when searching each of the parts of the body, we conclude that such an I does not exist in terms of the parts of the body. {421}

Does it exist in terms of the mind? If we were to search each of the six primary consciousnesses, such as the eye primary consciousness to see whether or not it is the I, we will conclude that they are not the I.

Even though it does not exist in terms of either the body or the mind, perhaps it exists upon the mere collection? Since it cannot be found through searching each of them, it is certain that it also does not exist in terms of the collection. Since the collection of the two, body and mind, is the basis of imputation, that the basis of imputation is the imputed phenomena is taught to be untenable.

Therefore, the so-called “I” is nothing but a mere imputation by the mind, whereby we conclude: that as held by the innate apprehension of I does not exist.

Thus, analyzing whether the I and the two – body and mind – are established as one or different, it is explained that in the case that they are established as different, then there must be something that can be identified apart from the two, the body and mind. Furthermore, one must do so through contacting the object of refutation that appears and is adhered to as existing from its own side; in general such is not necessarily the case for those merely established as different in other circumstances. Although the two – product and the impermanent – are different, there is nothing that can be identified saying, “The impermanent is this” as being apart from product.

If they are truly existent different, then, since the mode of abidance and the mode of appearance must agree, just as they individually appear to the mind as being unrelated, in actuality they must also individually abide as being unrelated. In case the mode of abidance and the mode of appearance do not agree, then they are false. {422} With respect to those merely established as different conventionally, there is no need for the mode of abidance and the mode of appearance to agree.

It is very important to understand these points on all occasions of the view. If they are not understood in this way, then at the time of analyzing the view, one will destroy conventionalities and not know how to posit them, and at the time of positing them conventionally, nothing else other than some truly existent will come about. Hence it is very important to understand how to identify the object of refutation well and the subtle essential points of the reasoning to refute it.

OBJECTION: Well then, there will be nothing even in the slightest to posit as the person.

RESPONSE: Is it not sufficient to engage Devadatta and Dharmadatta²¹⁴ without analysis? If you assert that the basis engaging the convention “person” is a person that is established by way of its own character, then you will fall into the extremes of permanence and annihilation. Thus you should understand that not even a mere atom of that exists.

3B2B-2B3D-1B3A-2. Refuting the acquired self²¹⁵

3B2B-2B3D-1B3A-2A. Refuting the assertion of the self as knower by²¹⁶ the Samkhyas

3B2B-2B3D-1B3A-2B. Refuting the assertion of the self as matter by²¹⁷ the Vaisheshikas

3B2B-2B3D-1B3A-2A. Refuting the assertion of the self as knower by the Samkhyas

9.60 If a knower of sound were permanent,
Then at all times there would be the apprehension of sound.
If there is no object of knowing,
Then due to cognizing what is it said to be a “knower”?

9.61 If there is a knower without [an object of] knowing,
Then it follows that wood is also a knower.
Therefore, without a closely abiding object of knowledge,
It is definitely to be stated “There is no knower.”

9.62 “That very one knows form.”
At that time, why does he also not hear?
“Because there is no sound nearby.” {423}
Therefore, a knower of that also does not exist.

9.63 How can that which is the nature of
Apprehending sound apprehend form?
That a single one is considered to be
Father and son is not absolute.

9.64 Thus, the lightness, motility, and darkness
Are not a son, and also not a father.
That is not seen to be in the nature
Of possessing the apprehension of sound.

9.65 If that itself, like an actor, is seen by way of another mode,
Then it would not be permanent.

²¹⁴ JN: “in making offerings to the deities, performing generosity of the Dharma” changed to Devadatta and Dharmadatta” in accordance with Geshe Jampa Gyatso’s oral commentary.

²¹⁵ This outline appears previously as “3B2B-2B3D-1B3A-2. Refuting the adhered object of the acquired apprehension of the selflessness of persons.”

²¹⁶ Gyi emended to read *gyis* in accordance with p. 631 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

²¹⁷ Gyi emended to read *gyis*.

“That itself has other modes.”
The oneness is something that does not exist before.

9.66 “The other modes are not true.”
Tell us, what is its nature?
“The consciousness itself.” In that case,
It would follow that all persons are one.

9.67 Also that with mind and that without mind
Would become one because they are similar in existing.
When particularities are erroneous,
How can they have a similar support?

If a knower-cognizer person who utilizes sound and the like were a permanent thing, then at all times, regardless of whether or not there is sound, it follows that the knower-cognizer person would apprehend sound by taking it as the apprehended object, because it is a permanent which apprehends it by taking it as the apprehended object.

It follows that the assertion is inappropriate, because if there is no object of knowing, then due to cognizing what is it said to be a “knower,” an object-possessor of that object? Saying that is inappropriate.

OBJECTION: The reason is not established. Even though sound is not established, there is permanently a knower apprehending it.

RESPONSE: It follows that wood is also a knower, {424} because the assertion of a knower without an object of knowing is permissible.

Therefore, without a closely abiding object of knowledge such as sound, it is definitely to be stated “There is no knower.” Otherwise, since there is nothing that acts to posit a knower, one must assert that there is no time at which sound is not apprehended by a person.

OPINION: There is no fault that it will follow that there will be a knower without an object of knowing. At that time when there is no sound, that very permanent person knows form by taking it as the apprehended object.”

RESPONSE: The subject – the person – at that time of apprehending form by taking it as the apprehended object, why does he also not hear sound? It follows that he hears sound, because he is a permanent who utilizes just those five²¹⁸ without bias.

OPINION: At that time of knowing form, because there is no sound abiding nearby, he does not know sound. {423}

RESPONSE: If you assert that “There is no object sound; therefore, a knower, an object-possessor, of that sound also does not exist,” then the assertion of the person as necessarily permanent degenerates. Furthermore, how will that which is in the nature of a knower apprehending sound become a knower apprehending form? It follows that it will not, because the aspects of those two will contradict.

OPINION: Just as a single person is posited to be a father and a son relative to different objects of relation, when apprehending form, relative to manifestations and nature, even though there is no manifestation of sound, there is the nature of sound, because form and sound are of the same nature. At that time, the object-possessor of sound is posited.

²¹⁸ The five sense object are forms, sounds, odors, tastes and tactile objects.

RESPONSE: It follows that that those two are not similar in analogy and meaning. {425} For, a single person is imputed as a father and a son relative to different objects of relation, not established absolutely²¹⁹ [upon the objects]²²⁰; you assert that their natures are established ultimately.

Thus, you assert that the three – lightness (mental potency), motility (motion), and darkness – in equilibrium is the principal, the nature, and ultimate truth. The very nature of the occasion of son is not the son; the very nature of the occasion of father²²¹ is not the father²²². For, the Samkhyas assert the following:

*The supreme nature of the qualities*²²³
Do not proceed to the path of seeing.
What is the path of seeing?
Strongly accumulating the illusory.

The nature never proceeds to the path of seeing. The father, son, and so forth that are actually seen are false.

In that case, that very father becomes the son, and that very son becomes the father, because the natures of the two, father and son, are one.

Hence, since you assert that the natures of the father and son are one, even though [they are imputed so] relative to different objects of relation, the occasions are not posited individually.

Furthermore, the subject – that apprehender of form – is not in the nature of possessing the apprehender of sound, because, if it is, then it must be seen by a valid cognizer, but it is not seen.

If that apprehender of sound itself, like an actor who relinquishes his earlier dressing such as clothes and puts on a subsequent set, is seen by way of another mode, that is, another manifestation of apprehending form, then it follows that the knower-cognizer would not be a permanent thing, {426} because it relinquishes another mode and takes on another.

OBJECTION: That apprehender of form itself has a mode other than apprehending sound. Since it is of one nature with the apprehender of sound, there is no fault.

RESPONSE: The oneness of nature of that is something that does not exist before, because they abide solely as different individuals. Alternatively, it follows that it is inappropriate to assert the later mode itself to be the previous mode itself, because the later unique one did not exist before. The *Great Commentary* explains that "If that unique one itself at the time of producing another later one is that unique one itself, then one similar to it and something that did not exist before are mutually contradictory, because you assert them to be one."

OBJECTION: The appearance in other modes are not true in accordance with how they appear, thereby there is no fault.

RESPONSE: Tell us, what is true in the same nature of that knower itself? It follows that you have nothing to say, because you assert that the mode in which they appear is not true in accordance with how they appear.

²¹⁹ *Yang dag nyid du grub pa*

²²⁰ Annotated in accordance with p. 633 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa's commentary.

²²¹ *Pa* emended to read *pha* in accordance with p. 633 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa's commentary.

²²² *Pa* emended to read *pha* in accordance with p. 633 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa's commentary.

²²³ Line break in accordance with p. 633 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa's commentary.

OBJECTION: The knower-cognizer person is just established to be true.

RESPONSE: In that case, it follows that all persons of different continua are one, because you asserted that all persons are necessarily partless permanents. Also it follows that that with mind, the knower-cognizers, and that without mind, matter, [such as]²²⁴ the Principal would become one, because they are similar in necessarily existing as partless permanents. Alternatively, apply the answer “It is true in the nature of existence itself.” {427}

When dissimilar particularities of manifestations are false errors, what is their similar, that is, identical, support – the truly existent general-principal? It follows that it does not exist because manifestations are falsities.

3B2B-2B3D-1B3A-2B. Refuting the assertion of the self as matter by the Vaisheshikas

9.68 Also that lacking mind is not the self
 Because it is without mind, like a vase and so forth.
 “Nonetheless, because it possesses mind, it knows.”
 It follows that the unknowing disintegrates.

9.69 If the self does not change,
 Then what is the use of intention acting on the self?
 Thus, that which is unknowing and free from activity –
 Space – would also act as the self.

Although the Naiyayikas and Vaisheshikas assert that the self is matter lacking mind, that is not the self because it is without mind, like a vase and so forth.

OPINION: Nonetheless, although the self itself is matter, because it is possesses mind by way of establishing coming together and separation²²⁵ it is posited as knowing objects.

RESPONSE: It follows that the self existing truly in the nature of previously not knowing objects disintegrates, because it knows objects through the strength of other later conditions.

If you assert that the self does not change in the slightest, then what is the use of intention acting on the self and its coming to know objects? It follows that it will not [know objects], because you assert that the self is changeless. In brief, it is because you assert that the self is unknowing and free from activity in this way, {428} whereby space would also act as the self. Asserting such a self is purposeless, because it does not benefit in even the slightest way.

3B2B-2B3D-1B3A-3. Dispelling objections regarding the refutation

9.70 “If a self does not exist,
 A relationship between action and result would not be appropriate.
 Having done an action, one would disintegrate,
 Whereby whose action would it be?”

9.71 Since it is established for both of us
 That the basis of the action and of the result are different
 And that there is no self that does it then,

²²⁴ Annotated in accordance with p. 634 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

²²⁵ For more explanation on the Vaisheshika’s assertions, refer to page 155 of J. Hopkins’ *Maps of the Profound*, Snow Lion Publications, 2003.

Is it not meaningless to argue about this?

- 9.72 It is impossible to see
'That possessing the cause as well as the result.'
In dependence on being one continuum,
He taught 'The doer [and] the utilizer.'
- 9.73 The minds of the past and of the future
Are not the self because they do not exist.
If the mind that has been produced is the self,
Then when that disintegrates, there would no longer be a self.
- 9.74 For example, when the trunk of a banana tree
Is split into parts, there is nothing at all.
Likewise, when sought with thorough analysis,
The self is also not real.
- 9.75 "Well then, if sentient beings do not exist,
For whom is compassion [cultivated]?"
[They] are those who are imputed by confusion
Asserted for the sake of the result.
- 9.76 "If sentient beings do not exist, who [obtains] the results?"
That they are true, nonetheless, is asserted from confusion.
In order to totally pacify suffering,
One should not reject the confusion of results.
- 9.77 The pride that is the cause of suffering
Is confusion regarding the self, whereby it will increase [suffering].
"Apart from that, there is no turning away."
Meditation on selflessness is the best. {429}

OPINION: If all things are produced and cease instant by instant in the absence of a self that is the basis of all bondage and liberation, then, since a relationship between virtuous or non-virtuous actions and their results would not be appropriate, and, having done a virtuous or non-virtuous action, one would disintegrate in the second instant, whereby whose action would it be? For, at the time of experiencing the result, the doer of the action does not exist. According to us, the person exists permanently.

RESPONSE: Since it is established for both of us that the persons, the bases (1) at the time of doing the action, the cause, and (2) at the time of utilizing the result are different, and that there is no self, the doer of the action, at the time of experiencing the result, is it not meaningless for you to argue about this on this occasion of teaching the relationship between actions and their results? For, you also assert that (a) there is no experience of the result at the time of doing the action, the cause, and (b) there is no doer of the action at the time of experiencing [the result]. This is because, in case [my above argument] is faulty, then it is also

similar for you, and because this seeing of the so-called “result along with the experience” is impossible at the time of possessing, that is, accumulating,²²⁶ the cause.

QUALM: Well then, how is it in your system?

RESPONSE: In dependence on being a single continuity of the aggregates, he taught, that is, imputed, ‘The doer of the action and the utilizer of the result.’ The so-called ‘continuity’ is the appropriator, the whole, that has as its object of appropriation the three – the previous, middle, and later instants – that are the parts. {430} In brief, there is no one who can posit tenable concurrent cause and [its] effect: ‘Although doing the action, this person is also experiencing [its] result.’

The minds of the past and of the future are not the self because, since they [respectively] have disintegrated and have not been produced, they do not exist as the self.

If the mind that has been produced is the self now, then when that disintegrates in the second instant there would no longer be a self as you asserted. For example, when the trunk of a banana tree is split into parts, there is nothing at all that is established inherently. Likewise, when sought with thorough analysis as to whether or not it is established inherently through reasoning, the self is also not established to be real, because it is damaged by the reasoning proving selflessness which will be explained below.

QUALM: Well then, if sentient beings do not exist inherently at all, for whom is compassion cultivated? For, the observed object of compassion does not exist.

RESPONSE: It follows that there is no fault that the observed object of compassion is untenable if sentient beings do not exist inherently, because conventionally existing sentient beings asserted for the sake of attaining the result of liberation who are imputed by confusion are tenable as the observed object of compassion. Imputation by confusion, when [“confusion” is] taken to refer to the apprehension of the self of persons and of phenomena, is the imputation of sentient beings as truly existent by it. Hence, the existence as imputed by it is refuted, whereby sentient beings are not refuted. For, through refuting it, sentient beings are established in mere name as imputed existents. Alternatively, taking confusion to refer to mere ignorance, {431} it is said that “sentient beings imputed by it exist as the observed object of compassion.”

QUALM: If sentient beings do not exist, which person obtains the results of familiarizing with compassion? Cultivating compassion will have no result.

RESPONSE: It is true that those causes and results lack true existence; nonetheless, it is asserted that there is no contradiction with familiarizing with compassion from [mere imputation by]²²⁷ confusion with respect to phenomena conventionally.

In order to totally pacify the suffering of sentient beings, one should not reject the non-afflictive confusion on the occasion of subsequent attainment [for the sake of] oneself attaining the result of buddhahood; one is not able to reject it for the time being. Although one does not reject it, this branch of method for attaining omniscience, when applied to the confusion regarding the meaning of suchness, is confusion regarding true existence. It is nevertheless appropriate to apply also the teaching that the compassions that observe sentient beings and observe phenomena (in which one cultivates compassion by way of observing mere sentient beings without qualifying them as lacking true existence) becomes the cause of

²²⁶ *Sogs* emended to read *gsog* in accordance with p. 637 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

²²⁷ Annotated in accordance with p. 638 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

buddhahood. Besides that, it means that conventionalities such as the observation of mere sentient beings which is not a realization of thusness are not to be rejected.

OBJECTION: Well then, why was confusion along with its objects refuted earlier on?

RESPONSE: The pride that is the cause of suffering of cyclic existence, that is, afflicted ignorance, just as taught earlier on in the context of “[Pride] that is the cause of suffering” [in 9.77a] is confusion regarding the self, {432} whereby it will increase the suffering of cyclic existence. Hence it must be rejected. And since one is able to reject it, there is no contradiction.

OBJECTION: Apart from turning away such confusion, there is no turning away of the apprehension of true existence; one cannot do so, because even though it may be turned away once, it will arise again just like the aggregates of cyclic existence. Hence it will not be utterly extinguished.

RESPONSE: It is not that the apprehension of true existence cannot be turned away, because, being an erroneous engagement regarding the mode of abidance of things, it is very weak and inferior, and reliance upon meditation on selflessness is the best. Since it realizes the suchness of things unerroneously, it can eradicate the other [i.e., the apprehension of true existence] from the root.²²⁸

3B2B-2B3D-1B3B. Extensive explanation of the reasonings that prove the selflessness of phenomena

3B2B-2B3D-1B3B-1. Explaining the selflessness of phenomena by way of the four close placements of mindfulness

3B2B-2B3D-1B3B-2. Dispelling quarrels that the two truths are incorrect

3B2B-2B3D-1B3B-3. Stating the reason that proves selflessness

3B2B-2B3D-1B3B-1. Explaining the selflessness of phenomena by way of the four close placements of mindfulness

- 9.78 The body is not the feet or calves.
 The thighs and loins are also not the body.
 Neither are the abdomen and back the body.
 The chest and shoulders are not the body either.
 The ribs and hands are also not the body.
- 9.79 The armpits and upper arms are also not the body.
 Even the inner organs are not it.
 The head and neck are also not the body.
 With regard to them, what is the body?
- 9.80 If this body were to abide
 Partially in all of them,
 Although indeed the parts abide in the parts,
 In what does it itself abide? {433}
- 9.81 If the body in its entirety
 Were to abide in the hands and so forth,
 Then however many hands there are and so forth,

²²⁸ JN: “Since it realizes the suchness of things erroneously, the other [i.e., meditation on selflessness] is able to eradicate it from the root” changed to “Since it realizes the suchness of things unerroneously, it can eradicate the other [i.e., the apprehension of true existence] from the root.”

That many bodies would there be.

- 9.82 If the body does not exist outside and inside them,
How could the body exist in the hands and so forth?
If that different from the hands and so forth does not exist,
How could it exist?
- 9.83 Therefore, [although] the body does not exist, due to confusion
Regarding the arms and so forth, there will be a mind [thinking of] the body;
Like, due to the feature of it being arranged in that shape,
An awareness of a human being [is generated] with respect to a cairn.
- 9.84 As long as the conditions are assembled,
For that long the body will appear as though it were a person.
Likewise, as long as the hands and so forth exist,
For that long will a body appear there.
- 9.85 Similarly, because they are a collection of fingers,
Also what are the hands?
Because they too are a collection of segments,
By dividing the segments also into their parts,
- 9.86 The parts are also divided into particles;
Those particles are also divided into directional parts;
Because the directions too, divided, are free from parts;
Like space, therefore, particles also do not exist.
- 9.87 Hence, which discerning one
Would be attached to dream-like form?
When, like that, the body does not exist,
What are men? What are women?
- 9.88 If suffering exists in reality,
Why would it not damage intense joy?
If there is happiness, why do those tormented by sorrow and so on
Not find joy in the delicious and so forth?
- 9.89 “Because it is overwhelmed by the strong,
It is not experienced.”
How can that which is not
The nature of experience be feeling? {434}
- 9.90 “The suffering exists subtly.
Is not the gross²²⁹ [aspect] of it dispelled?

²²⁹ Rigs emended to read *rags*.

It is mere joy distinct from it.”
The subtle is also that.

- 9.91 “The conditions contradictory to it are produced,
Thereby suffering is not produced.”
Conceiving it to be feeling,
Is it not established as ‘strongly adhered to?’
- 9.92 Because of that, as an antidote,
This thorough analysis is to be meditated on.
The concentration that arises from the field
Of thorough investigation is the food of a yogi.
- 9.93 If there were a gap between the sense power and the object,
Where would they meet?
Also if there were no gap, being a unit
What would meet with what?
- 9.94 A subtle particle does not enter a subtle particle.
They are without an interval and equal.
They do not enter, do not mix, and
Those that do not mix do not meet.
- 9.95 How could it be right to say
‘Even though the partless meet?’
If you have seen that which meets
But yet is partless, demonstrate it.
- 9.96 It is not correct for there to be a meeting
With primary consciousness, which is without body.
Because even a collection is not a thing,
Just as was thoroughly analyzed before.
- 9.97 Thus, if contact does not exist,
From what do feelings arise?
For the sake of what is there this fatigue?
What is it that damages what?
- 9.98 When there is no one who feels and
Feelings also do not exist,
Having seen this situation,
Why do you not turn away from craving?
- 9.99 Even though they are seen or touched,
Due to a nature similar to a dream or illusion, {435}
Because they are generated simultaneously with the mind,

Feelings are not seen by it.

- 9.100 Also, due to being generated before or after them,
It remembers them but does not experience them.
They do not experience their own natures,
Nor are they experienced by others.
- 9.101 There is no one who feels,
Hence feelings are not reality.
Thus, due to this what damage is there
To this selfless collection?
- 9.102 The mentality does not abide in the powers,
Not in forms and so forth, nor amidst them.
A mind is not inside, outside there is none, and
Is also not found somewhere else.
- 9.103 It is not the body, it is not other,
It is not mixed with it, nor is it at all separate from it.
It is not in the slightest; therefore,
A sentient being is a natural nirvana.
- 9.104 If the consciousness existed before the object of knowing,
Through observing what would it be produced?
If the consciousness and the object of knowing are simultaneous,
Through observing what would it be produced?
- 9.105 Well then, if it exists after the object of knowing,
From what is consciousness produced at that time?
In this way, the production of all phenomena
Is not to be realized.

It follows that the body is not inherently existent, because if it were inherently existent, one of the following – the individual branches of the body, the collection that is the summation of them, something different in entity from them – must be found to be the basis for characterization of the body, but it cannot be found. {436}

QUALM: Why is there doubt as to whether the collection that is the summation of all the branches is indeed the body?

RESPONSE: Since the body is imputed in dependence on the collection, it is inappropriate for the collection of all the branches of the body to be the body, because, otherwise, one would have to eventually assert final partless particles.

Therefore, at the time of searching to see how the body – the basis for engaging the convention “body” – exists from its side, [we see that] the feet or calves of the person are not the body of the person. The thighs and loins are also not the body. Neither are the abdomen and back the body. For, the body of the person is imputed in dependence on the person.

The chest and shoulders are not the body either. The ribs and hands are also not the body. The armpits and upper arms are also not the body. Even the inner organs are not the body of the person. The head and neck are also not the body of the person. That being the case, with regard to these branches, what is the body of the person? It is not any [of these branches]. Since the collection of them or something different in entity from them is also not the body of the person, the body does not exist inherently.

OPINION: There exists a gross body that is a different object from the branches.

RESPONSE: Either (1) this body that is the whole (possessing branches) that is a different object from the branches abides partially in all the branches, that is, with one part in the hands, one part in the calves, and so forth, or else, (2) the entire whole (part-possessor) without anything missing abides in each part. {437} In the first case, although indeed the parts of it abide in the parts such as the hands (such that the hands and so forth are pervaded by the whole), in what part does, for instance, the part that is the hand itself abide? There will be infinite [regression], because the hand, for instance, abides in its parts such as the fingers, and the fingers and so forth also abides in its parts.

If the branches are partless, whereby the individual parts do not abide in the individual branches, but the body, the complete branch-possessor in its entirety, were to abide in each part, the hands and so forth, as in the later investigation²³⁰, then however many hands there are and so forth, that many bodies would there be, whereby the parts will be infinite. It is only false; it is not truly established in the slightest.

In summary, when investigated through reasoning in this way, the body does not exist inherently outside the person that is asserted by the Buddhists, nor in the inner doer that is asserted by the Forders (Tirthikas, non-Buddhists). If it does not exist [inherently], how could an inherently existent body exist in the hands and so forth? It does not. If a body different in entity from the hands and so forth does not exist, how could the body exist inherently? It does not.

Although the body does not exist inherently, the cause for mistake is as follows. Therefore, although the body does not exist inherently, there is thus the reason for mistake. Although the body does not exist inherently, due to confusion regarding the arms and so forth as truly existent, the mind thinking “The body exists inherently” will be produced. {438} Like, due to the feature of it being arranged in the shape of likeness to a human being, an awareness of a human being is generated with respect to a cairn.

As long as the conditions for mistakes, such as a cairn and unclear illumination, are assembled, for that long the body will appear as though it were a person, that is, a human being. Likewise, as long as the assemblage of the conditions, one’s causes, the hands and so forth exist, for that long will a body appear where the branches are present. And an awareness apprehending the body as inherently existent will be generated.

For, Yongdzin Tamje Khyenpa says:

Regarding this mode of meditation on the close placement of mindfulness, from among the two modes of meditation – (1) on the body as unattractive through contemplating that the body is impermanent, suffering, and a conglomeration that gathers thirty-two unclean substances, and (2) on the body as empty of inherent existence, it is taught in terms of the latter here. The former mode of meditation

²³⁰ *Rtag pa* emended to read *brtags pa* in accordance with p. 640 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

appears in (i) the context of the beings of small and middling capacities [small and middle scopes of the *lam-rim*] and (ii) the context of teaching the mode of meditation of the body as being in the nature of uncleanness where one meditates on unattractiveness as an antidote to attachment as a branch of accomplishing calm-abiding.

However, with respect to the close placement of mindfulness of this context, although the mode of meditation is complete by implication, at the time of performing analysis on the body here, [Shantideva] analyzed by way of taking the collection that gathers many unclean substances, such as the teeth, nails, and mucus as the basis of imputation of the body. At that time, since the basis of imputation or the substratum [property-possessor] appears as an unclean conglomeration when it appears to the mind, the mode of meditation on unattractiveness is complete by implication. Understand them from [Shantideva's] *Compendium of Trainings (Sikṣasamuccaya)* which also teaches by way of sutra citations both the mode of meditation on unattractiveness and the mode of meditation on lack of inherent existence.

Its meaning is as follows. {439} If this so-called “body” were to exist from its own side without being merely imputed by the mind, then it would either (a) exist apart from the parts of the body, such as the head, legs and hands, or (b) be one with those parts.

If it exists apart [from the parts of the body], then, after eliminating the head, legs and hands, and so forth one by one, there must be something to be demonstrated: “The body is this.” But since there is nothing that can be demonstrated, the body that is established from its own side is utterly non-existent. Meditate by contemplating as explained above.

It is also not established as one with the parts of the body; the head is not body, the legs are not body, and the hands are not body. If one searches the parts one by one in this way, there is no such body that can be demonstrated. Furthermore, just as the branches – the head, the hands, and so forth – exist as many, the body that is the collection of all the branches also must be same in number.

When one searches through reasoning in this manner, since one utterly cannot find the body, that expressed as “body” and this appearance to the mind is nothing but merely imputed by conception, like a cairn imputed as a human being. Hence meditate on the body as lacking existence from its own side.

Thus the body of a man is imputed in dependence on the collection of branches but it lacks true existence. Similarly, because of being imputed upon the collection of portions²³¹ and fingers, also what is the hand established inherently? It is not possible. Because the fingers too are imputed in dependence on a collection of segments, they are not established inherently. {440} When the segments are also analyzed by dividing into their various parts, they are not established inherently.

When the parts of the segments are also divided into particles, they are not established inherently. When those particles are also divided into directional parts, such as the eastern [part] and so forth, since they are imputed in dependence on many directional parts, they are

²³¹ *Lha* emended to read *lhu* in accordance with p. 641 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa's commentary.

not established inherently. The division into directions too are not established inherently, because they are free from inherently established parts, like space. Therefore, particles also do not exist inherently. For, if they do, one must assert partless particles and that is damaged by reasonings such as “Due to simultaneous conjunction with six...”²³² Yongdzin Tamje Khyenpa says:

In just the way analysis has been performed on the body above, analyze the branches similarly and meditate on the lack of inherent existence. The so-called “hand” is merely imputed in dependence on the collection of the thumb, the forefinger, the little finger, and so forth; there is not even a mere atom of hand that is established inherently. Likewise the fingers are merely imputed in dependence on the collection of their own segments; there is no finger established from its own side. Even a segment is merely imputed upon the aggregation of its fine parts; it is utterly not inherently established from its own side. Thus contemplate that the body and all the branches of the body, besides being merely imputed upon their own basis of imputation, lack even a mere atom of true existence. {441}

Hence, when dream-like form is not analyzed, it appears as though self-instituting²³³; and when analyzed, it lacks inherent existence. Which discerning one would be attached to it? Attachment is inappropriate, because nobody has a competent focal object of the apprehension of true existence.

When, like that, the body of a man does not exist inherently, what are inherently existent men? What are inherently existent women? There is no inherently existent person.

Merely the refutation of a self-sufficient person by this text is not a fully qualified realization of selflessness of persons. Rather, one must realize the non-existence of a person who is not merely imputed by nominal convention. The two selflessnesses do not differ in ease or difficulty of realization, since the bases – persons and aggregates – do not differ in coarseness and subtlety of being substantially-existent or imputedly-existent, nor do they differ also in the attribute of coarseness and subtlety with respect to phenomena and the self that

²³² This line comes from a stanza in Vasubandhu’s *The Twenty*, which states that:

Due to simultaneous conjunction with six [particles]
A particle has six parts.
Also, if the six were in the same place,
Even a mass would be of the size of a particle.

Page 642 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary explains that:

If such a center minute particle were to be surrounded simultaneously by six particles on the six [directions] – the four cardinal directions, above and below – then the center particle would either have parts touching all six directional particles or it would not. In the first case, since it would have six parts touching the six directional particles, this contradicts it being partless. In the second case, since all the particles would be in the same place, it follows that even a conglomeration that is the aggregation of many particles would be [the size of] a minute particle.

For more details, refer to pages 402 & 403 of J. Hopkins’ *Maps of the Profound*, Snow Lion Publications, 2003.

²³³ *tshugs thub pa*

are the objects of refutation. You should understand that the dispute regarding whether or not hearer and solitary-realizer superiors realize the selflessness of phenomena by taking the system of the infeasibility of them having the realization of the selflessness of persons to be just talk of those who have not fathomed it.

Thus, the teaching that feelings also lack inherent existence just like the body is as follows. If the object of experience, suffering, and the experiencer, feeling, exist in reality, {442} then, why would [a suffering feeling] not damage the feelings of intense joy and happiness, (since, if the suffering feeling that exists in terms of a single mental consciousness were to exist inherently, then it would be inappropriate for it to transform into something else)? It [should] damage [the feelings of intense joy and happiness]. Therefore, if it must transform in the absence of the opportunity for generating happiness, then, since the generation [of happiness] is seen, the former [suffering feeling] does not exist inherently.

If happiness exists inherently, why do the minds of those tormented by the sorrow of a child having died and so on not find joy in eating delicious food and so forth? It follows that they [should] take joy [in eating delicious food and so forth], because the happiness due to [consuming] delicious food and drinks is generated inherently.

OPINION: Although there is the generation of happiness when one is tormented by sorrow, because it is overwhelmed by the strong suffering, the happiness is not experienced.

RESPONSE: How can that which is not the nature of experience be a happiness feeling? It follows that [such a happiness] is not [a happiness feeling], because [a feeling] is experienced. Likewise this can be applied to the reply with respect to inherently existent suffering being overwhelmed by the strong happiness.

OPINION: When strong happiness is generated, the suffering feeling exists subtly. Since it is experienced, it is not that it is not even slightly experienced.

RESPONSE: If the suffering feeling is subtle, what is the use of this strong happiness damaging the suffering? In that case, posit that strong happiness is experienced.

OPINION: Is not the gross [aspect] of this suffering dispelled by that strong happiness? {443} In asserting that it is dispelled, the subtle suffering is mere subtle joy in contrast to that great happiness.

RESPONSE: Since the subtle happiness also does not pass beyond the definition of that happiness, if it is subtle happiness, then it must be happiness.

Wishing to abandon the faults of saying “If there is happiness, why do those tormented by sorrow and so on...” [9.88c] the following is stated.

OPINION: The conditions of happiness contradictory to suffering are produced at the time of generating happiness from [consuming] delicious food and drinks, thereby suffering is not produced at that time.

RESPONSE: Conceiving it to be the feeling of happiness or suffering, is it not established as “strongly adhered to” and “being merely imputed”? It follows that it is established so, because it is imputed as the cause of both happiness and suffering through the force of conception [although]²³⁴ the food and drink are just the same.

Because of that lack of inherent existence of feelings, as an antidote to this apprehension of feelings as truly existent, this thorough analysis that realizes the lack of inherent existence of feelings is to be meditated on. Cultivating (1) the special insight observing the modes that arise from thorough investigation and analysis, and (2) the concentration that meditates on

²³⁴ Annotated in accordance with p. 644 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary by adding *kyang*.

special insight in dependence on calm-abiding, the body of realizations of a yogi will increase more and more and develop, whereby it is called “food,” just as ordinary food develops the body. This concentration also develops ordinary bodies. Hence one should make effort in realizing emptiness and setting [one’s mind] in single-pointed equipoise on it. {444}

The refutation of subtle particles meeting is as follows. If the minute particles of the two – sense power and object – were to meet, is there a gap between those two particles?

OPINION: There is a gap.

RESPONSE: Where would those particles meet? It follows that they would not meet, because there is a gap. There are particles of either illumination or darkness in that gap. Since there is even a gap there, there will not be contact.

OPINION: There is no gap.

RESPONSE: When two partless particles meet, since there are no two sides that meet or do not meet, all of them must meet all. In that case, since the location is mixed into one, they become a unit. That being so, what meeter would meet with what is to be met? It follows that this would not be so, because those two do not exist there.

Their reasons are as follows. A subtle particle does not enter, that is, absorb in, another subtle particle, because they are without an empty interval and because they are equal in dimensions. This is the statement of the reason for all of them meeting all [presented above]. There is pervasion because subtle particles do not enter each other and do not absorb. They do not mix, and partless [particles] that do not mix do not meet. How could it be right to say ‘Even though the partless meet?’ Since it is not possible, if you have seen that which meets and is partless, demonstrate it. You are not able to demonstrate it.

It is not correct for there to be an inherently existing meeting [of partless particles]²³⁵ with the primary consciousness which is without form or body, because [the primary consciousness] is without form. {445} The refutation of meeting a gross [object] is as follows. There is no inherently existing meeting with a gross [object] that is a collection of many particles, because even that is not a truly existent thing, just as the collection of segments was thoroughly analyzed before and refuted to be inherently existent.

Thus, if contact among the three – object, sense power, and primary consciousness – does not exist inherently as explained above, then from what cause do truly existent feelings arise if contact does not exist inherently? For, a false cause has no ability to generate a truly existent result. If feelings do not exist inherently, then for the sake of what is there this fatigue or effort for their purpose? For, it is meaningless.

OPINION: It is fatigue for the sake of abandoning inherently existent suffering feelings.

RESPONSE: That is incorrect; what object is it that damages what person? For, suffering feelings are not inherently existent.

In this world, there is a mere happiness that remedies suffering, but there is no specifically-characterized happiness like there is specifically-characterized suffering. For example, when pained by cold and abiding in the sun, on the occasion of the suffering of cold having become slightly weaker, that experiencer that experiences pleasure is happiness feeling. However, at that time the suffering of being pained by cold exists, because as soon as that suffering extinguishes, without interruption²³⁶ the suffering of heat comes to rear its head. {446} Therefore, suffering is necessary as a basis for imputing happiness, but happiness is not

²³⁵ Annotated in accordance with p. 646 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

²³⁶ *Par* emended to read *bar* in accordance with p. 647 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

needed as a basis for generating a mind of suffering, just like, for example, blue, and long and short.

That one turns away from craving if one realizes that feelings are not inherently existent is taught as follows. When it is realized that there is no inherently existing person who feels, and that the objects of experience and feelings also do not exist inherently, having seen this situation where neither the objects of feeling nor the feelers exist inherently, why do you not turn away from craving? For, craving that desires to obtain happiness and craving that desires to separate from suffering are induced by the strength of the apprehension of true existence.

Even though they are seen by the eye consciousness or touched by the body consciousness, due to the objects that generate feelings being empty of inherent existence and being of a nature similar to a dream or illusion, feelings also lack inherent existence. Because feelings are generated simultaneously with the mind, feelings are not seen by the mind, because different substances that are concurrent are not related.

Also, due to being generated from feelings either before or after them, it remembers them but does not experience them, because at that time it either has ceased or has not been generated. In summary, feelings do not experience their own natures, because they are refuted by the refutation of self-cognizers. Nor are they experienced by inherently existent others, {447} because the object of experience and the experiencer are not related.

Not only is the feeler not inherently existent, there is also no inherently existing person who feels, because it has been refuted on the occasion of refuting the self of persons. Hence feelings are not established in reality. Thus, due to this benefit on account of happiness and suffering, what damage is there to this inherently existent selfless collection of aggregates? Since even suffering does not exist inherently, it is appropriate to make effort in meditating on the close placement of mindfulness on feelings where feelings are also not inherently existent. Thus, the great Yongdzin Tamje Khyenpa says:

If suffering feelings were to exist inherently, then, just as it has been taught: “If it exists inherently, it contradicts reliance on causes and conditions,” they must abide without relying on causes and conditions and never relying on them. Happiness is generated by suffering transforming due to adventitious conditions, and, on an occasion of experiencing happiness feeling, suffering is generated adventitiously due to the condition of, for instance, hearing news of the death of a dear parent or relative. Thus, happiness and suffering feelings proceed by transforming adventitiously. Due to being established through experience itself, feelings do not have the power to abide independently at all. Hence, contemplate that apart from being merely imputed in dependence on causes and conditions, they are not established by way of their own entity at all. {448}

Even when the causes of feelings are investigated, they [are seen] also to lack inherent existence; that the cause of feeling is contact has been taught in the sutras which state “Due to the condition of contact, feeling.” Since the aggregation or meeting of the three – object, sense power and primary consciousness – is called “contact,” the so-called “meeting of the three” is merely imputed by mind. Since primary consciousness is without form, there is no meeting as in the particles meeting each other. If all the parts of the two – object and sense power – were to meet all, then since they mix with each other, they become one. If they do not

meet, then, since “meeting” is incorrect, when analyzed by reasoning, they are nothing but merely imputed by mind.

Similarly, one should meditate by investigating the object and object-possessor of feeling. Taking, for instance, suffering feeling as an illustration, if the experience of suffering feeling is established from its own side in the way it appears to the mind that is an apprehension of true existence, then the “suffering experience” is either: (1) an experience of itself by itself, or (2) an experience by a mind that is other than the suffering feeling itself.

It is inappropriate for it to experience itself, because (a) there will entirely be no differentiation “This is the object of experience” and “This is the experiencer” with respect to that, and (b) “It experiences itself” become irrelevant words even in the world, as in saying “Devadatta meets himself.”

If it is experienced by a mind that is other than itself, then: (i) it is experienced by a mind that precedes itself, (ii) it is experienced by a mind that arises later than itself, or (iii) it is experienced by a mind that is generated concurrently with itself. {449}

It is inappropriate for it to be experienced by a mind that arises before itself; since the mind that arises before itself has already ceased and does not exist at the time when the suffering feeling itself is generated, experience by it is incorrect.

Experience by a mind that arises later than itself is also not correct, because the suffering feeling itself has already ceased and does not exist at the time when the mind that arises later is generated.

Further, with respect to the expression “This experiences that,” the two – the object of experience and the experiencer – must exist concurrently, just as with respect to the expression “This man eats that food,” the two – the man and the food that he is eating – must exist concurrently. Experience by another mind that arises concurrently with itself is also inappropriate, because, although in general mere differentials need not be unrelated differentials, inherently existent differentials must be utterly unrelated. Hence if something were to be experienced by another unrelated mind, then the happiness and suffering that arose in the continuum of Devadatta would be able to be experienced by the mind of Yajña. Not only that, there is no generation of two discordant types of conceptualization in the continuum of one person, just as it has been taught in sutra that “The continua of primary consciousnesses of sentient beings are distinct.” The mode is explained in detail in the great texts such as [Dharmakīrti's] *Commentary on [Dignaga's] 'Compendium of Valid Cognition' (Pramanavarttikakarika)*.

Having analyzed in this way, contemplate that “the experience of suffering feeling” is merely imputed by the mind; it is utterly not established by way of its entity.

Likewise, contemplate that happiness and equanimity feelings also lack inherent existence through such analysis. {450}

Thus this meditation on the lack of inherent existence through detailed investigation regarding the causes and conditions of feelings, the entity of feelings, the object of experience, and the experiencer in this manner is very important. Due to happiness feelings appearing as inherently existent, attachment is generated. Similarly, it has been taught that aversion is generated from suffering,

and ignorance from equanimity. Therefore those wishing to sever the root of cyclic existence should meditate on the lack of inherent existence by stopping the appearance of and adherence to the causes of the three poisons – the three: happiness, suffering, and equanimity feelings – as truly existent. This is a very great essential point.

In this way, one investigates and then analyzes the entity of feelings and the causes of feelings. This refers to taking as the basis the mode of appearance that is the object of refutation in which feeling appears to exist by way of its own entity and is adhered to as so, and analyzing through reasoning. It is inappropriate to perform such analysis as to whether the object, sense power, and primary consciousness meet or not without the mode of appearance that is the object of refutation dawning as an object of the mind. For, if one were to analyze in this manner, mere conventionalities would be harmed, whereby not only will ascertainment of the view not be produced, even dependently-arising appearances would be damaged. Hence it is very important to know thus the mode of analysis through reasoning by having contacted the object of refutation.

The close placement of mindfulness on minds is as follows.

The mentality²³⁷ lacking inherent existence does not abide inherently in the six powers; it does not abide inherently in the six objects, forms and so forth; it also does not abide amidst them, that is, in the collection of those two [powers and objects]. Recall the sevenfold analysis of the chariot just as it has been taught in [Chandrakirti's] *Supplement to the Middle Way* (*Madhyamakavatara*). {451 } A mind which is imputed by the Folders to be the inner doer being does not inherently exist inside; mind does not exist outside in the hands and so forth; it is also not found inherently somewhere other than inside and outside.

It is not the body; it is not a truly existent other-than-that. The mind is not mixed with the body, nor is it inherently separate, or apart from it. It is not inherently existent in the slightest; therefore, that very emptiness of inherent existence of the mind [of all sentient beings]²³⁸ is a natural nirvana.

If the sense consciousness existed before the object of knowing, through observing what would it be produced? For, the observed object condition did not precede it.

If the consciousness and the object of knowing are simultaneous, through observing what would it be produced? For, (1) if the sense consciousness has not been produced, then it cannot be produced since the observed object condition has not been produced, and (2) if the observed object condition has been produced, then since the consciousness has already been produced, there is no need for it to be produced.

Well then, if the sense consciousness exists after the object of knowing, from what is the sense consciousness inherently produced at that time? For, this is incorrect.

If it is produced from a disintegrated previous instant, then a sprout would be produced from a burnt seed. If it is produced from an undisintegrated previous [instant], then it can either be interrupted or not be interrupted by another time. From among these two

²³⁷ Note that the “mentality” (*gid*) here does not refer to a mindset or frame of mind, as in the usual connotations of the English word. It is the sixth among the 6 powers, eye and so forth.

²³⁸ Annotated in accordance with p. 650 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa's commentary.

possibilities, in the first case, actual production would not be possible. In the latter case, if all of itself does not interrupt all, then [the times of the former and later instants]²³⁹ would be mixed simultaneously. {452} True existence degenerates if there are two factors – interruption and non-interruption [by time]. Hence there is no true existence. Thus, Yongdzin Tamje Khyenpa says:

If the so-called “mind” were to exist inherently, then it either: (1) exists in the six sense powers, eye and so forth, and the six objects, forms and so forth, or (2) exists apart from them. It does not exist in terms of these sense powers and objects; it is easy to realize that the mind is not each of them. Further, if it were to exist in terms of them like a fruit dwelling inside a metal bowl²⁴⁰, then just as the metal bowl can be demonstrated after removing the fruit, one must be able to demonstrate “The eye primary consciousness is this” in the wake of eliminating the eye sense power. This is not the case. If there is no eye, there is also no eye primary consciousness. Likewise, extend the reasoning to the other sense powers. When one investigates in this way, contemplate that besides being merely imputed by mind, the so-called “mind” does not exist inherently.

As explained above, having identified well the mode of appearance that is the object of refutation in which the mind appears to exist truly and is adhered to as so, place it on the mind. By way of analyzing through those reasonings explained above, the lack of true existence is proved. When one, following mere words without ascertaining what the object of refutation is, analyzes, “Does the mind exist inside or outside the body?” and “Does it exist in terms of the objects and the sense powers or not?” and fails to find it, one thinks, “The mind does not exist.” Such apprehension is utterly inappropriate. If one were to hold this, then this would be a view of annihilation since the mind is held as utterly non-existent. {453}.

Furthermore, analysis of the view with regards to the mode of appearance of conventionalities without having identified the object of refutation is analysis of the foolish who are not skilled in the essential points of both of the two truths, and damages dependently-arising appearances. This is taught again and again by Acharya Chandrakirti in his root text and commentary of *Supplement to the Middle Way (Madhyamakavatara)*. As cited earlier, Acharya Shantideva also emphatically taught that refuting this mere conventional appearance is inappropriate.

The All-Knower of Definitive Meanings, Venerable Konchog Tenpe Dronme, said:

*It is easy for some, failing to aim at the target of
The demarcation of the object of refutation,
To cut it in a limited way, whereby emptiness is mistaken but appears
And dependent-arising destroyed; they become objects of reproach.*

²³⁹ Annotated in accordance with p. 651 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

²⁴⁰ *Mkhar* emended to read *’khar*.

Regarding the meditation on the close placement of mindfulness on phenomena, in the way explained above, the inherent production of all phenomena will not be realized; one should realize the lack of inherent existence of all phenomena included in the compounded and un-compounded as taught in the *Teachings of Akshayamati Sutra (Akshayamatiniṛdeshasutra)*. Yongdzin Tamje Khyenpa says:

Just as the body, feelings, and minds lack inherent existence by having analyzed with reasoning as explained, when investigating the mental factors other than feelings, other compounded phenomena such as time, and all un-compounded phenomena being none other than mere names, mere nomenclature, and appearances to the mind, meditate on the lack of any inherent existence. {454}

3B2B-2B3D-1B3B-2. Dispelling quarrels that the two truths are incorrect

- 9.106 In that case, conventionalities would not exist.
How could there be two truths with respect to them?
Moreover, they are also conventional due to another.
How could sentient beings pass beyond sorrow?
- 9.107 This is a conceptualization that is another mind,
It is not our conventionality.
After that, if ascertained, it exists;
If not, conventional existence would be non-existence.
- 9.108 The conception and that which is conceived,
The two, are mutually dependent.
In dependence on how they are renowned,
All of the analyzed are expressed.
- 9.109 When one analyzes by way of analysis
That analyzes,
Because that analyzer also
Would be analyzed, it would be endless.
- 9.110 When the object of analysis is analyzed,
The support for the analysis does not exist.
Because the support does not exist, they are not produced.
That also is expressed as nirvana.
- 9.111 The two as truly existent from their point of view
Abides with great difficulty.
“An object is established from the power of a consciousness.”
What can be supported on an existent consciousness?

- 9.112 “Nevertheless, the consciousness is established from the object of knowing²⁴¹.”
What can be supported on an existent object of knowing?
Existing by the force of one another,
Both are also not existent.
- 9.113 If he is without a son, he is not a father.
From where would that son arise?
Without a son, there is no father;
Likewise the two do not exist.
- 9.114 “Just as²⁴² a sprout is produced from a seed and
The seed is realized by just that, likewise,
Due to a consciousness that is produced from an object of knowing,
Why is its existence not realized?”
- 9.115 If, by a consciousness that is different from the sprout,
“The seed exists” is realized, {455}
Then by what is the existence of a consciousness
Realizing the object of knowing realized?

OPINION: Previously, through investigating the object and object-possessor, and the former and later, existence by way of its own character was refuted. In that case, the faults with respect to the assertion of conventional existence are also similar. If existence by way of its own character is not possible, then no phenomenon whatsoever can be posited, whereby conventionalities would not exist. How could there be two truths with respect to them? Both of them would not exist. In the perspective of an all-obscuring mind that adheres to existence by way of its own character, forms, sounds, and so forth exist truly. But you asserted that since objects lack true existence from their own side, they exist conventionally. In that case, the conventionalities of yours, like the existence as a snake in the perspective of adherence to a snake although there is no snake from the side of the rope, are also posited to exist conventionally by way of mere clinging (*rloms pa*) to exist due to another mind. Thus, how could sentient beings pass beyond sorrow even conventionally? It follows that the attainment of liberation is impossible, because all existents are nothing but confusion due to error. It follows that determining the view for the sake of attaining liberation is meaningless.

RESPONSE: That – this “conventional existence asserted by the Middle-Way proponents” is mere clinging to existence by a conceptualization that is a mind of apprehension of true existence, another mind that is mistaken with respect to the object of adherence – is not the meaning of a conventional existence in our system of the Middle-Way proponents. In our system, after²⁴³ all phenomena asserted to be the objects of the view which realizes the mode of abidance are realized to be empty of inherent existence, if one is able to posit the existence of ascertainment of the conventional existence of object and agent such as the object of

²⁴¹ *Pa* emended to read *bya*.

²⁴² *Bzhan* emended to read *bzhin*.

²⁴³ *Phyir* emended to read *phyis* in accordance with p. 652 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

production and the producer, by way of the mode of establishment by a valid cognizer without muddle, then that is the meaning of conventional existence. {456} Otherwise, if one does not know how to posit the establishment of object and agent by a valid cognizer, then even conventional existence would degenerate to non-existence.

The way of positing conventionality in our system is just as it has been taught in [Nagarjuna's] *Fundamental Wisdom (Treatise on the Middle Way, Mulamahyamakavrtti-prasannapada*, stanza 8.12a):

An agent depends on acts...

The two – the object-possessor, the conception, and the object, that which is conceived – are posited through mutual dependence, that is, reliance; there is not the slightest existence by way of its own entity. All of the analyzed, that is, presentations, are expressed in dependence on mere name according to how they are renowned to a valid cognizer of worldly conventionalities.

OPINION: When one analyzes the emptiness of inherent existence by way of analysis that analyzes whether or not phenomena exist truly, since the mind of the one analyzing is not included within the objects of analysis at that time, is it necessary or unnecessary that it be analyzed as lacking true existence? If it is unnecessary, then, since others are similar, [the position of] all phenomena lacking true existence would degenerate. If it is necessary, then, because that analyzer also needs to be analyzed as lacking true existence by another analysis, the analyses would be endless.

RESPONSE: It follows that the valid cognizer that realizes all phenomena to lack true existence does not need another valid cognizer to analyze it as lacking true existence, because, (i) having analyzed that the object of analysis – all phenomena – lack true existence, as long as the mode of apprehension of that valid cognizer that analyzed them as lacking true existence does not fade, {457} a truly existent property-possessor [or substratum] – the support that requires analysis as lacking true existence – does not exist as the entity of that mind, and (ii) until the act of having already realized that all phenomena are empty of true existence in the person who realized that weakens, a property-possessor [or substratum], the basis that is distinguished by analysis wondering “Is this truly existent or not?”, is not possible. For, as soon as a mind wondering so is generated, the mindfulness thinking “It lacks true existence” will be generated.

This is because [if]²⁴⁴, although all phenomena are realized as lacking true existence, another valid cognizer is necessary to analyze that very mind as lacking true existence, then you will accrue the fault of infinite [regression], and if another analysis is necessary there would be remaining acquired apprehension of true existence left, [but] all manifest acquired apprehensions of true existence would already have been overcome by that very earlier valid cognizer.

Because the support, the property-possessor, does not exist truly, both the object of refutation and the refutation are not produced truly. That also is expressed as natural nirvana. It is also described as attaining nirvana by way of separation from adventitious stains from having realized that meaning and familiarizing with it.

²⁴⁴ Annotated in accordance with p. 655 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa's commentary.

The establishment of the two – the object and consciousness – as truly existent from the point of view of the Propounders of Things abides with great difficulty, because there is no proof.

OPINION: The establishment of a truly existent object is posited from the power²⁴⁵ of truly existent consciousness, that is, valid cognizer.

RESPONSE: What valid cognizer can be backed and supported on a truly existent consciousness? There is none. {458} This is because self-cognizers do not exist, and because if a consciousness is known by another, it would be endless.

OPINION: Nevertheless, the consciousness is established from this object of knowing and object of comprehension that are directly established to be truly existent.

RESPONSE: What can be backed and supported on an existent object of knowing? For, if posited by a valid cognizer, then they²⁴⁶, the two – object and consciousness, would exist by the force of relying on one another. Both would also be clearly established as not inherently existent, just like long and short, and that side and this side.

If he is without a son, he is not a father, for there is nothing there to posit. If there is no father, from where would that son arise? For, there is no cause. Without a son, there is no father, whereby the two are mutually reliant; likewise the two – object and consciousness – do not exist truly.

OPINION: Just as a sprout is produced from an inherently existent seed, and the seed is realized, that is, it can be inferred, from the correct sign which is just that sprout, likewise, due to a truly existent consciousness that is produced from an object of knowing, why is the existence of an ultimate truly existent object of knowing not realized? It must be realized.

RESPONSE: That is incorrect. If, a sprout is seen by a valid cognizer consciousness that is a different substance from the sprout, and “The seed exists” is realized, then by what valid cognizer is the existence of a consciousness, due to its realizing the object of knowing, realized? For, self-cognizers have already been refuted and you also do not accept other knowers.

3B2B-2B3D-1B3B-3. Stating the reason that proves selflessness

3B2B-2B3D-1B3B-3A. Reason of diamond fragments {459}

3B2B-2B3D-1B3B-3B. Reason of dependent-arising

3B2B-2B3D-1B3B-3C. Reason of existence and non-existence, production and cessation

3B2B-2B3D-1B3B-3A. Reason of diamond fragments

9.116 Sometimes by a direct perceiver of
 Worldly beings, all causes are seen.
 The divisions of the stems of lotuses and so forth
 Are produced by divisions of causes.

9.117 “By what are the divisions of causes made?”
 It comes from the divisions of previous causes.
 “Why are causes able to produce results?”
 They come from the very strength of previous causes.

²⁴⁵ *Dpe* emended to read *dbang* in accordance with p. 655 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

²⁴⁶ *Des te* emended to read *de ste* in accordance with p. 656 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

- 9.118 “Ishvara is the cause of migrating beings.”
For the time being, what is Ishvara? Say it!
“He is the elements.” It is indeed like that;
Why tire yourself out even for a mere name?
- 9.119 Nevertheless, since earth and so forth are many,
Impermanent, without movement, not a god,
To be walked on, and unclean,
They are not Ishvara himself.
- 9.120 Ishvara is not space because it is without movement.
He is not the self because that has already been refuted before.
“He is also a creator who is not an object of thought.”
What is the point of talking about that which is not an object of thought?
- 9.121 Also what is he asserted to produce?
Are not the entity of the self,
Earth and so forth, and Ishvara permanent?
Consciousness is produced from an object of knowing and
- 9.122 Beginningless happiness and suffering come from karma.
What is produced by him? Say it!
If the cause does not have a beginning,
How could there be a beginning of results?
- 9.123 Why would it not always create?
If he does not rely on others and²⁴⁷
There does not exist other that is not created by him,
On what would that [produced] by him rely?
- 9.124 If there is reliance, then the very collection
Would be the cause, not Ishvara.
When assembled, he lacks the power to not produce them, and
When they are absent, he lacks the power to produce them. {460}
- 9.125 If they are created without Ishvara desiring them,
It would follow that it is under the control of another.
Even if they are desired, if they are created
In dependence on desire, what would become of Ishvara?
- 9.126 Those propounding permanent subtle particles,
Also were already overcome before.
The Samkyas assert that a permanent Principal
Is the cause of migrating beings.

²⁴⁷ One line “*de ni gzhan la ltos pa min*” is missing in this edition of the Tibetan text.

- 9.127 The abiding in equilibrium of qualities
Called “lightness, motility, and darkness”
Is finely expressed to be that called “Principal.”
The non-equilibrium is said to be going.
- 9.128 It is inappropriate for the three natures [to exist]
Unitarily. Therefore it does not exist.
Likewise, the qualities do not exist
Because they too have three aspects individually.
- 9.129 If the qualities do not exist, also the existence of
Sound and so forth becomes extremely farfetched.
In mindless cloth and so forth,
It is not possible for happiness and so forth to exist.
- 9.130 If things exist in the nature of their causes.
Have things not already been analyzed?
Your causes are also happiness and so forth themselves.
Woolen blankets and so forth also do not arise from it.
- 9.131 From woolen blankets there is happiness and so forth.
Because they do not exist, happiness and so forth do not exist.
Happiness and so forth have never
Been observed to be permanent.
- 9.132 If the manifestation happiness and so forth exist,
Why is the experience not apprehended?
If it becomes subtle,
Then how is it gross and also subtle?
- 9.133 Since having given up being gross, they become subtle,
Those gross and subtle ones are just impermanent.
Likewise, why do you not assert
All things to be impermanent?
- 9.134 If a gross [object] is not other than happiness,
Happiness is just an impermanent manifestation.
When asserting “That which does not exist whatsoever
Is not produced because it does not exist,” {461}
- 9.135 Although you do not assert that
The non-manifest are produced, they abide.
If the result abides in the cause,
To eat food would be to eat excrement.

- 9.136 You should buy cotton seeds
With the price of cotton cloth²⁴⁸ and wear them.
“Due to confusion the worldly do not see.”
But those who know reality posit it.
- 9.137 Why do those knowing reality,
Who exist among the worldly, also not see it?
“The worldly is not a valid cognizer.”
Also seen manifestations would not be true.
- 9.138 “If valid cognizers are not valid,
Would that comprehended by them not be false?
Meditation on emptiness in view of that
Would, because of that, be incorrect.”
- 9.139 Without contacting the thing that is imputed
The lack of things which are that is not apprehended.
Therefore, what is the thing that is false?
The lack of thing which is that is clearly false.
- 9.140 Therefore, regarding the death of a son in a dream,
The conceptualization thinking “He does not exist,”
Blocks the conceptualization that he exists;
But that too is false.
- 9.141 Therefore, by thorough analysis in this way,
Nothing exists without a cause.
They also do not abide individually,
Nor in conditions that are an aggregation of all.
- 9.142ab Also, not coming from something else,
They do not abide, they do not go.

Ayatas (Those Who are Flung Afar): We do not see anyone creating the variegated feathers of peacocks and so forth. The roughness and smoothness of lotus petals, the sharpness of thorns, and so forth are not created by any creator. Therefore, they arise from [their own] entity.

RESPONSE: That is incorrect, because (i) sometimes by a direct perceiver of worldly beings, {462} all causes that are producers with respect to most outer and inner things such as harvests are seen, and (ii) the divisions of results such as colors of the stems and number of petals of lotuses and so forth are produced by a diversity of divisions of causes.

[Ayatas]: By what is the diversity of divisions of causes made?

RESPONSE: It comes from the diverse divisions of previous causes.

²⁴⁸ *Zas* emended to read *ras*.

[Ayatas]: Why are diverse²⁴⁹ causes able to produce diverse results?

RESPONSE: There is no fault of inability, because they come from the very strength of the previous causes; since the causes are diverse, they are able to produce individual diverse results.

Therefore, the subject – these things – are not causeless because they are observed to be produced at certain places and times.

The Naiyayikas, the Vaisheshikas, and one faction of the Samkhyas who assert Ishvara to be a god²⁵⁰: The all-knowing self-arisen Ishvara created all abodes, bodies, and enjoyments by first making an idea in mind. Hence he is the cause of migrating beings

RESPONSE: For the time being, what is the meaning of Ishvara? Say it!

[The Naiyayikas, the Vaisheshikas and one faction of the Samkhyas who assert Ishvara as a god²⁵¹]: He is the elements since results increase and decrease due to the increase and decrease of the elements such as earth.

RESPONSE: It is indeed like that; even you assert that results increase and decrease due to the increase and decrease of the elements. However, why exhaust yourself with great hardship to prove Ishvara even for a mere different name that has no different meaning? It follows that such exhaustion is inappropriate.

If there are great differences in meaning such as [one] being permanent and [the other] being impermanent and so forth, then this is inappropriate as Ishvara. Such inappropriateness is reflected in the word “Nevertheless” [in 9.119a]. {463} Since the substances – the earth element and so forth – are in the nature of being many, impermanent in that they are produced and disintegrate, and without movement in the sense of first making an idea in the mind to create a result, and the elements are not a god, are to be walked on by²⁵² feet and so forth, and are unclean, they are not Ishvara himself. For, [you] asserted that he is permanent, is unitary, first makes an idea in mind to produce a result, and is a god, and asserted that he is clean²⁵³ and not to be walked²⁵⁴ on.

OPINION: Space is Ishvara.

RESPONSE: The subject – space – is not Ishvara, because it is without movement for the sake of results. He is also not the permanent self because both matter and knower have already been refuted before.

OPINION: Since Ishvara is a creator who is not an object of thought, there are not those faults.

RESPONSE: What is the point of talking about an agent and acts that are not objects of thought? For, you also do not know who Ishvara is and cannot think about it.

²⁴⁹ *Na* emended to read *ba* in accordance with p. 657 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

²⁵⁰ This one faction of the Samkhyas who assert Ishvara as a god refers to the theistic Samkhyas. The non-theistic Samkhyas do not take Ishvara to be a god.

²⁵¹ This one faction of the Samkhyas who assert Ishvara as a god refers to the theistic Samkhyas. The non-theistic Samkhyas do not take Ishvara to be a god.

²⁵² *Kyi bsgom* emended to read *kyis ‘gom* in accordance with p. 659 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

²⁵³ *Mi* is deleted in accordance with p. 659 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

²⁵⁴ *Bsgom* emended to read *‘gom*.

OPINION: To the question, ‘If happiness and suffering feelings are produced from past karma and so forth, what result is that Ishvara accepted by you asserted to produce?’ [I would answer] “The self”.’

RESPONSE: It follows that it is incorrect. It follows that neither of the entities of later similar-in-types to the self, earth and so forth, nor Ishvara are created by Ishvara. For, are not the self, subtle particles of the four elements, Ishvara, and so forth permanent? Since you asserted that they are permanent, it is not correct that they be objects of production and producers. Therefore, it is because past nose sense consciousness and so forth are produced from previous objects of knowing and {464} because since beginningless time happiness and suffering feelings come from virtuous and non-virtuous karma. What result is produced by that Ishvara? Say it! Results produced by him are not possible. If the cause Ishvara does not have a beginning since it is a permanent thing, how could there be a beginning of results such as present feelings? For, even the cause, the potential, the thing that produced today’s feeling since beginningless time is beginningless.

Why would that Ishvara not always create all results? He does not do so, because he relies on some other condition to create all results, because if there does not exist some other result that is not created by him, on what condition would this result produced by that Ishvara rely? For, that which is asserted to be the cooperative condition must also be created by Ishvara, and creation by him is sufficient.

If the production of the result by Ishvara relies on cooperative conditions, then it follows that the very collection of substantial and cooperative conditions would be the cause; Ishvara is not a cause with self-power. For, when the collection of causes and conditions are assembled, Ishvara lacks the power to not produce the result, and when that collection is absent, even Ishvara lacks the power to produce them.

If the result of hell sufferings and the like are created by karma without Ishvara desiring them, it would follow that that Ishvara is under the control of another, whereby [the position] that it is the self-powered creator of all would degenerate. {465} Even if the results are created through Ishvara desiring to create results, the result would be contingent on mere desire. If results are created through desire, what would become of Ishvara? For, desire is impermanent.

Those Vaisheshikas propounding permanent subtle particles as the creator of various migrating beings also were already overcome before through reasoning refuting partless particles. Hence there is no need to stomp on that already dead.

According to the Samkyas, the nature that is the Principal is not a transformation. The seven – the great one and so forth²⁵⁵ – are natures and transformations.²⁵⁶ The sixteen²⁵⁷ are transformations. The person is neither a nature nor a transformation. From among these twenty-five objects of knowing, the Principal possesses five characteristics – being permanent, being unitary, and so forth. The Samkyas assert that it is the cause of migrating beings who are the various transformations.

²⁵⁵ The seven refer to the great one, I-principle and the five subtle objects (sounds, tangible objects, odors, visible forms and tastes).

²⁵⁶ JN: “and transformations” has been added in accordance with the Tibetan.

²⁵⁷ The sixteen refers to the 11 faculties (speech, arms, legs, anus, genitalia, ear, body or skin, tongue, eye, nose and intellectual faculty) and the 5 elements (space, wind, fire, water and earth).

The state²⁵⁸ of equilibrium of all three qualities called “lightness, motility, and darkness” – the synonyms of the three: happiness, suffering and equanimity – is finely expressed as the “Principal.” The non-equilibrium of the three is said to be going, that is, transformation. It is repudiated as follows.

The subject – objects of knowing – it follows that it is inappropriate for the three natures – happiness and so forth – to exist in a unitary visual form and the like, and in a partless Principal, because being unitary would be impossible. Since many would also be impossible if being unitary were to be impossible, there would be utter non-existence. Therefore a partless Principal which is in the nature of the three qualities does not exist. {466} Likewise, the qualities themselves do not exist truly unitarily because they too each have three aspects individually.

Analyzing in this manner, if the Principal which is the three qualities in equilibrium does not exist, also the existence of sound and so forth becomes extremely farfetched, because [the Samkhyas] asserted just those five to be the transformations of the Principal. That in turn is because they are mindless matter. The subject – cloth and so forth – it follows that it is not possible for them to exist as a nature that is one substantial entity of establishment and abiding²⁵⁹ of happiness and so forth. If things that are transformations such as cloth exist truly in the nature of their causes, happiness and so forth, then it is not that things are analyzed to be truly existent, because true existence has already been refuted. If, according to you, the causes of woolen blankets and so forth are also the Principal himself which is happiness and so forth in equilibrium, then woolen blankets and so forth also do not arise from the Principal, because the Principal is impossible.

If from woolen blankets and the like happiness and so forth are generated, then because woolen blankets and the like do not exist afterwards, even the Principal which is happiness and so forth in equilibrium would not exist, because a causeless result is impossible. Asserting that is inappropriate, because [you] asserted that the Principal is a permanent thing. It follows that the natures of happiness and so forth have never been permanent, because such is not observed by a valid cognizer.

If the thing that is the manifestation happiness exists, then why is the experience of happiness not apprehended at the time of generating suffering? It follows that it is apprehended. If that happiness becomes subtle at that time, {467} then how is it gross and, through discarding that, also subtle? It follows that it is not, because it is permanent. Since through discarding being subtle, happiness and so forth become gross, and through discarding being gross, they become subtle, it follows that those gross and subtle ones are just impermanent. Likewise, why do you not assert all things to be impermanent property-possessors? It follows that asserting that is appropriate, because natures transform variously into others.

Is a gross [object] established other than happiness, that is, is it a substance other than happiness, or not? In the first case, happiness would be experienced even if the gross [object] is averted, whereby [your position] that the experience of manifestation happiness is a gross [object] would degenerate. If it is not other substance [than happiness], then even happiness would be just an impermanent manifestation, because when the gross [object] stops,

²⁵⁸ Na emended to read *ni* in accordance with p. 661 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

²⁵⁹ *Grub bde rdzas gcig*

happiness also stops. If you assert that, [your position] that the nature of happiness and the like is permanent would degenerate.

OPINION: When asserting “Since something that is produced must exist at the time of the cause, that which does not exist whatsoever at the time of the cause is not produced because it does not exist in the nature of the cause,” what is your meaning of production? Even though the nature exists previously, its state is a manifestation of what is not previously manifest as an object of the mind.

RESPONSE: Since you assert that a manifestation is produced without being existent at the time of the cause, although you do not assert a result that is previously non-existent and newly produced, it abides. This is merely accepting the meaning but not asserting the convention. Alternatively, it is explained “Although you do not assert that a previously non-existent manifestation, that is, transformation, is newly produced, you must assert that it abides.” {468}

If the result abides in the manner of a non-different nature in the cause, it follows that to eat food would be to eat excrement, because the nature of the food and the nature of the excrement are a partless unit. In asserting that that very Principal is the nature of all phenomena, mode of abidance, the ultimate, and a partless permanent, [you] asserted that the nature of the food and the nature of the excrement are one.

Furthermore, you should buy cotton seeds with the price of cotton cloth and wear them. It follows that wearing that is acceptable, because the nature of cotton garments and the nature of cotton seeds are a partless unit.

OPINION: Although those two are one nature, due to confusion the worldly do not see that the result exists at the time of the cause, thereby they do not wear cotton seeds.

RESPONSE: Since you Samkhyas assert that your teachers, the Sage Ling-gye²⁶⁰ and so forth, are all-knowing, due to knowing the reality of results existing at the time of the causes, they would posit it. Since you also know reality, when you eat food, you would be eating excrement and so forth.

According to your system, why do those knowing reality, who also exist among the worldly, also not see that the result exists at the time of the cause? It follows that they see it, because they know that the result exists at the time of the cause posited by the Samkhyas. Further, your teachers whom you assert to know reality in the lines above are also seen persistently to wear cotton garments instead of cotton seeds. Hence, it is obvious that the result does not exist at the time of the cause. {469}

OPINION: The seeing of the worldly is not a valid cognizer. Therefore it is a misconception.

RESPONSE: It follows that also manifestations, transformations, natures that are manifestly seen by the worldly would not be true, because the seeing of the worldly is not a valid cognizer.

OPINION: If, according to you, valid cognizers are not ultimately valid, then would the object of comprehension comprehended by those false valid cognizers not be false, errors that are not established in the way they are comprehended? It follows that they would be [false], because the comprehenders are false valid cognizers. Meditation on emptiness asserted by you in view of that reason would be erroneous, incorrect, because the valid cognizers that comprehended them are false.

²⁶⁰ P. 664 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary reads “*drang srong ser skya*” which refers to the Sage Kapila.

RESPONSE: The subject – objects of knowing – it is very correct for us [Middle-Way proponents]²⁶¹ that the valid cognizer comprehending emptiness is false, and also that the emptiness posited by that is false, because the ascertainment of the refutation in which the thing that is true existence is refuted by conception is contingent upon the dawning of the object of refutation. That follows, because without contacting through conception the thing that is imputed, true existence, that is, without the dawning of true existence, the lack of true existence in things²⁶² which are empty of true existence is not apprehended through conception. Therefore, what is the thing that is the false object of refutation? Since it is not possible, the lack of the thing which is that²⁶³ object of refutation having been refuted is clearly false.²⁶⁴

The analogy above is like: without the aspect of the son of a barren woman dawning to conception, the aspect of the death of the son of a barren woman does not dawn. If the emptiness of true existence (which is the object of refutation having been refuted) is truly existent, then to an inferential knower consciousness, the appearances that are empty of true existence must be truly existent. {470} In that case, a collection in which one of them has been refuted is not possible. Due to the object of refutation appearing truly existent to it, even the appearance of true existence must be truly existent. For, in that case, if true existence must exist, then it is non-existent. This teaches the meaning of [Nagarjuna’s] *Fundamental Wisdom* (*Treatise on the Middle Way, Mulamahyamakavrttiprasannapada*, stanza 13.7a):

*If a bit of the non-empty existed,
[A bit of the empty would also exist.
If there did not exist a bit of the non-empty,
How could the empty exist?]*²⁶⁵

Since, without the generality of true existence dawning, one does not ascertain well the emptiness of true existence, one must be skillful in the apprehension of the measure of the object of refutation. Therefore, for example, regarding the observation of the death of a son in a dream, the conceptualization thinking “The son does not exist,” blocks the conceptualization thinking “The son exists.” But the two – the object of abandonment [the conceptualization thinking “The son exists,”] and the antidote [the conceptualization thinking “The son does not exist,”] – are also false. Likewise, there is no contradiction that a false object of abandonment is demolished by a false antidote, and a false object of comprehension is comprehended by a false valid cognizer. However, since the Samkhyas assert all objects of knowing to be truly existent, they do not know how to posit a false valid cognizer. Hence, they are not similar.

Therefore, by analysis through reasoning in the way explained above, we have the concluding summary that refutes causeless production: “Not only is production from a

²⁶¹ Annotated in accordance with p. 665 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

²⁶² Note that “thing” refers to any existent here, whereas it refers to true existence later in the same stanza according to this commentary.

²⁶³ *Te ‘di yis* emended to read *te yi* in accordance with p. 666 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

²⁶⁴ P. 666 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary says “The emptiness that is a lack of the thing which is that true existence is clearly false.”

²⁶⁵ *stong pa’ang cung zad yod par ‘gyur / mi stong cung zad yod min na / stong pa yod par ga la ‘gyur*

discordant cause such as Ishvara and the Principal impossible, no result whatsoever is produced and exists without a cause.” These four lines of the text [9.141] can also be applied to concluding summaries that refute production from the three possibilities. Apply them also to the reasoning that refutes production from both self and others. {471}

(i) Results such as sprouts also do not abide individually in water, manure, heat, and moisture, and the like, nor abide inherently in conditions that are an aggregation of all [of them, water and the like]²⁶⁶ in the manner of juniper fruits supported in a metal bowl, because if they do, such should be observable, but they are not observed to be so, and (ii) they do not even exist at that time, because without the conditions changing in aspect, sprouts are not produced. Also, not coming from something else other than those conditions, they do not abide already established in a manner of inherent existence; they do not go somewhere else having ceased. Thus there is not the slightest inherent existence. Therefore there is no production from self, production from others, and production from both self and others.

In short, the property of the subject in the following is proven: “The subject – the aggregates and the person – are not inherently produced, because they are not produced from self, not produced from others, not produced from both self and others, nor produced causelessly.” Thus, Yongdzin Tamje Khyenpa also says:

Compounded phenomena, such as the I and the aggregates of I, are not produced inherently, because they are not produced from self, not produced from something that is a different substance from self, not produced from both, nor produced causelessly.

They are not produced from self; something produced from itself is impossible, and if that were the case, production would be meaningless.

If they are produced from others, and if it is an other that is established by its own entity, {472} then they would be mutually unrelated, and in that case, even a vase would be produced from a pillar and so forth, whereby production from others is incorrect.

If you thus ascertain the non-existence of production from self and others, you will be able to ascertain that there is no production from both.

If they are produced causelessly, then it must be the case that even flowers would be produced in the sky. Thus it is easy to realize that there is no causeless production.

This reasoning is very extensive, because this is carried in most of the infinite reasonings such as investigation of production and cessation, investigation of going and coming, and so forth in [Nagarjuna’s] *Fundamental Wisdom (Treatise on the Middle Way, Mulamahyamakavrṭti-prasannapada)* and must be known.

Do not think: “Since the refutations of production from self and the like here are associated with the Forders, we do not need them now.” Regardless of whether Forders exist or not in reality, we must prevent these easy bad views from developing in our continua. Hence, without knowing these reasonings, we will have no way to stop them.

The reason why this reasoning is called “The Diamond Fragments” is that just as even a tiny part of a diamond gem is able to perform any of the functions such as penetrating, cutting, polishing all other types of gems such as turquoise, pearl and gold, like a stone doing

²⁶⁶ Annotated in accordance with p. 667 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

that to mud, likewise this reasoning is able to cut through all the masses of bad views, whereby it is called such.

This reasoning is also explained in Jowo [Atisha]’s *Lamp on the Path to Enlightenment (Bodhipatha-pradipa)*; it is taught clearly [in stanza 49]:

*Since an entity does not arise from itself,
And is not from another, or even from both,
Nor is it yet without cause; therefore it has
No intrinsic nature by way of own-existence. {473}*

Furthermore, there are a great many who hold these bad views although they do not claim to be followers of Forders such as the Samkhyas. There are also a lot of people who assert that, since all these outer appearances are mistaken appearances, nothing exists in reality, and who assert that one’s mind is truly existent. There are assertions that even though both apprehended [objects] and apprehender [object-possessors] do not exist truly, the exalted wisdom that is the antidote is a truly existent thing. Many also seriously mistake the teaching in the scriptures that one must achieve the resultant buddhahood by purifying the stains of one’s present mind, and assert that the resultant exalted body and exalted wisdom exist in the continua of ordinary beings. Such assertions that the result is present at the time of the cause are exactly the Samkhya system, and such is called “production from self.”

Regarding this mode, Dharmakirti’s [Commentary on [Dignaga’s] ‘Compendium of Valid Cognition’ (Pramanavarttikakarika)] says:

*Other than the cows, the Samkhyas,
[Who would attempt to express with amazement,
Saying, “A hundred elephants exist upon the tip of the grass and the like,
Not being seen at an earlier time”?²⁶⁷*

And the Venerable Protector Maitreya says:

*Not seeing the existence of something is the seeing of its non-existence –
What is such a type of darkness?*

3B2B-2B3D-1B3B-3B. Reason of dependent-arising

9.142cd How does that which is considered to be true
By confusion differ from an illusion?

²⁶⁷ The First Dalai Lama Gyalwa Gendun Drup says in his commentary to Dharmakirti’s work (Tibetan page 131):

The subject – object of knowing – other than the cow-like Samkhyas, who would attempt to express with amazement, saying, “The results of a hundred elephants exist upon the tip of the grass and the like, the causes, in a manner of not being seen at an earlier time”? (The root text here corresponds to the ACIP text page 113B. The additional line of the root text translated here reads “ngo mtsar bcas pa su brjod rtzol.”) It follows that it is unreasonable. For, how can the results exist in the entity of the causes? They will not, because, even if the causes were to be divided a hundred times, the entity of the result, the entity that will appear does not appear earlier at the time of the cause.

- 9.143 Whatever is emanated by an illusionist and
 Whatever is emanated by causes
 Should be investigated as to
 Where they come from and also where they go to. {474}
- 9.144 Whatever [results] seen due to proximity,
 But not if they are absent,
 Are fabrications, similar to reflections.
 How can they be truly existent?

How does this thing which is considered and imputed to be true by ignorance, afflicted confusion, differ from an illusion, a dream, a reflection, and so forth? For, while it is empty of being inherently existent, it appears inherently existent. Whatever illusion horse, elephant, and so forth that are emanated by an illusionist and whatever thing that is emanated by causes and conditions should be investigated. If they are inherently existent, and if they must come from another at the time of production and must go somewhere at the time of cessation, then where do they come from and also where do they go to? Since there is no inherent existence, it is said: “The subject – the person and the aggregates – do not exist inherently because they are dependent-arisings, just as in the case of reflections.”

Whatever results such as compositional [action], sprouts, and so forth seen to be produced due to proximity to the causes such as ignorance, seeds, and so forth, but are not produced if those causes are absent, are fabrications, thereby they are similar to reflections. How can they be truly existent? They are not. The four [lines] “illusion” [and so forth in 9.143] prove the pervasion of the sign of dependent-arisings. Then, two and a half lines [in 9.144abc] indicate the reason, then half a line [in 9.144c] the analogy, and the last [9.144d] the thesis. For, Yongdzin Tamje Khyenpa’s *Great Mind Training* also says {475}:

Since all outer and inner things only arise in dependence on their own causes and conditions, contemplate that there is not even an atom of true existence. Further, it is taught that one must reflect upon this by applying various analogies such as illusions, dreams, and reflections. Also from among these, the Foremost Tamche Khyenpa [Tsongkhapa] repeatedly taught that this contemplation in according with the analogy of the reflection is easy to realize, and would make a big difference in the generation of ascertainment with respect to dependent-arising.

And:

From among the infinite reasonings taught in order to seek the profound Middle-Way view, this reasoning is the supreme. All existing reasonings of the view take this as their basis and must only do so.

The glorious Chandrakirti’s says [in his *Supplement to the Middle Way (Madhyamakavatara)* 6.115]:

*Because things strongly arise dependently,
These conceptions cannot [bear] investigation.*

*Therefore this reasoning of dependent arising
Cuts all nets of bad views.*

The *Sutra Requested by Anavatapta (Anavatap Tanagara Japariprccha Sutra)* says:

*That produced from conditions is not produced.
It does not have the nature of production.
Whatever is contingent on conditions is explained to be empty.
One who understands emptiness is conscientious.*

[Nagarjuna's] *Commentary on the Mind of Enlightenment (Bodhicitta-vivaraṇa)* says:

*Having understood the emptiness of phenomena,
Action and results are dependents.
This is more amazing than the amazing;
This is more marvelous than the marvelous. {476}*

3B2B-2B3D-1B3B-3C. Reason of existence and non-existence, production and cessation

- 9.145 With respect to things that exist,
What need is there for a cause?
Yet even if it does not exist,
What need is there for a cause?
- 9.146 Even by billions of causes,
A non-thing is not transformed.
How could that state be a thing?
Also what else is that transformed into a thing?
- 9.147 If, when non-existent, it is not possible for a thing to exist,
Then at what point does a thing become existent?
Without a thing becoming produced,
It will not become free from being non-thing.
- 9.148 If it does not become free from being non-thing,
The state of existent thing is impossible.
A thing also does not become a non-[thing]
Because it would follow as being in two natures.
- 9.149 In this way, there is no cessation and
Also things do not exist. Therefore,
All these migrating beings are
Always not produced and not ceased.
- 9.150 Migrating beings are like a dream;
When analyzed, they resemble a plantain tree.
Also having passed and not having passed beyond sorrow,

Are not different in thusness.

With respect to things that exist inherently, what need is there for a cause? For, the inherently existent does not need production. Yet even if the result does not exist, what need is there for a cause? For, it cannot be produced. Since all results do not exist at the time of their cause and are only produced, they are not refuted; rather the production of the utterly non-existent is refuted. The production of an existent result is refuted. Also, (i) the assertion that it exists at the time of the cause, and (ii) the assertion of the Samkhyas that most [objects] exist inherently are refuted. Saying “Because it has already been produced, it does not need production” transcends the path of reasoning. {477} Therefore causes and results which are empty of inherent existence are asserted to be illusory and like reflections.

The proof that a non-thing is unsuitable as an object that is a causal agent is as follows.

OPINION: Since the existent is already established, it does not need to be produced. However, why would the non-existent not arise?

RESPONSE: Even by billions of causes, a non-thing is not transformed into a thing, because nothing whatsoever can make a non-thing into a thing. If it is transformed, then the state of a non-thing is either forsaken or not forsaken. In the first case, how could the state of a non-thing be a thing? For, the states of being able and being unable to perform a function are contradictory. In the second case, it would transform into a thing from a thing and a non-thing; also what is it other than the two causes? For, this is impossible.

Furthermore, in the case of the state of non-thing not being forsaken, if, when the thing is non-existent, it is not possible for a thing to exist, then at what point does a thing become existent? For, a thing is not produced at the time of being non-existent. Furthermore, if it becomes so having forsaken the state of being non-thing, without a thing becoming produced, it will not become free from being non-thing. And if it does not become free from non-thing, the state of existent thing is impossible, because the two states are contradictory. A non-thing does not become a thing, and likewise, a thing also does not become a non-thing, because if it were half thing and half non-thing, then a singularity would follow as being established in two natures. {478} These reasonings refute the production of all – the utterly non-existent and the non-things. The subject – a sprout – is not inherently produced because an existent is neither inherently not produced nor inherently produced, just as in the case of the son of a barren woman.

Even though the production of what is non-existent at the time of its cause is [not] refuted, inherent production of that non-existent (at the time of its cause) when it is produced is refuted. Thus qualifications are applied to the object of refutation.

In the manner explained above previously, production does not exist inherently. In this way, there is no inherent cessation and also things do not exist inherently. Therefore, all these migrating beings are always not inherently produced and inherently ceased. Pacified from the very beginning, they are just natural nirvana.

Migrating beings of [cyclic] existence are like a dream, because, even though they do not exist inherently, they abide individually without the actions and the agents being mixed. When analyzed with the reasoning analyzing suchness, they resemble a plantain tree, because, even though they appear like they are self-instituting, they lack even the slightest inherently existent essence.

As to whether or not a position constitutes analysis of suchness: (i) without being satisfied with mere imputations of name conventions, due to desiring to search for the manner in

which the basis (upon which the convention operates) exists, the analysis constitutes an analysis of suchness, (ii) otherwise, being satisfied with mere imputation of conventions, the analysis of whether or not Devadatta has come or not, and the like constitutes analysis of conventions. {479} Also (a) having passed beyond sorrow – where one has been released from the bondage of attachment and so forth – and (b) not having passed beyond sorrow – where one is incarcerated in the prison of cyclic existence – are not different in suchness.

It is just as it has been said in the *King of Meditative Stabilization Sutra (Samadhirajasutra)*²⁶⁸:

*The migrating beings of cyclic existence are like dreams.
In this, there is no birth; nobody dies...*

And the *Superior Requested by Nye-wa-khor [Sutra]*²⁶⁹ says:

*If one has comprehended the natures of phenomena,
Then all results do not exist; there is also no attainment of results...*

Yongdzin Rinpoche's *Great Mind-Training* also clearly says:

If these outer and inner things exist inherently, then they either exist at the time of their cause, or they do not. If they exist at the time of their cause, then, since they are already established, there is no need for them to be produced²⁷⁰. If they do not, then, like the horns of a rabbit, nobody will be able to produce them. Hence, when analyzing with reasoning, contemplate that this so-called “production,” besides merely imputed by conception, is not established by way of its own entity.

This reasoning is also clearly taught in [Atisha]'s *Lamp on the Path to Enlightenment (Bodhi-patha-pradipa)* [in stanza 48]:

*An existent's arising is impossible;
A non-existent's is like flowers in the sky;
For a thing to be both is absurd fallacy;
So neither do they originate together.*

Thus, just as in all of the stated reasonings to search for the view that have been previously explained above, having first identified well the object of refutation, {480} place that as an object of the mind and refute it with the reasonings. Without contacting the object of refutation, if one posits that the I does not exist since one's hands, head, legs, and so forth are not the I, then this becomes a deprecation of conventionalities; calling the emptiness in which [the I] is not found after having analyzed in this manner “the emptiness that is created by the mind” and “the emptiness that demolishes conventionalities,” the Great Trailblazers considered this extremely contemptuous. Something like that is not

²⁶⁸ Source cited in *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment*, Vol. 1, page 398: n. 411

²⁶⁹ This seems to be a section of the longer sutra *Piles of Jewels (Ratna-kuta)*.

²⁷⁰ *Rgyus* emended to read *skyed*.

difficult at all. Anyone can understand that “The overhanging lip, the neck, and so forth of the vase are not the vase,” “The hands, legs, and so forth are not the body,” and the like.

However, it has been taught that, let alone generating the profound Middle-Way view in the continuum of a being with little merit, it is very difficult to even to gain a mere understanding, because [Nagarjuna’s] *Precious Garland* (*Rajaparikatharatnavali*) (stanza 1.25):

*The doctrines of definite goodness
Are said by the Conquerors
To be deep, subtle and frightening
To the childish, who are not learned.*

[Chandrakirti’s] *Supplement to the Middle Way* (*Madhyamakavatara*) (13.4ab in the conclusion) also says:

*This profound and frightening thusness that has been explained will be certainly
realized by beings with previous familiarity;
It will not be comprehended by others, even though they may have listened extensively.*

3B2B-2B3D-1C. Advice that it is appropriate to make effort in realizing emptiness²⁷¹

- 9.151 In things which are empty in this way,
What attainment is there? What loss is there?
Who will be honored or
Despised by whom?
- 9.152 Where does happiness or suffering come from?
What is there to be displeased about? What is there to be pleased about?
When searched for in thusness, {481}
What craves and what does it crave for?
- 9.153 Upon analysis, what is this transitory support of the living
That will die here?
Who will arise, and who has arisen?
Who is an associate? Also who is a friend?
- 9.154 May those who are like me
Apprehend all as being like space.
Those who desire happiness themselves,
By means of the causes of conflict and delight,
- 9.155 Are agitated and joyful.
They live miserably
Through sorrow, struggles, disputes,

²⁷¹ It previously appears as “3B2B-2B3D-1C. Advice to make effort in generating wisdom.”

Cutting and stabbing each other and negativities.

- 9.156 After repeatedly going to the good migrations and
Enjoying much happiness again and again,
They die and fall into the sufferings of the bad migrations
Which are unbearable for a long time.
- 9.157 There are many pitfalls in [cyclic] existence.
Without reality there, like this,
There is mutual contradiction.
Therefore there is no such thusness in [cyclic] existence.
- 9.158 Transcend the limits of the ocean of suffering
Which is incomparable and unbearable also there.
Strength is weak there;
And the life span is short there as well.
- 9.159 There, too, in activities for long life and health,
In hunger and fatigue,
In sleep and detriment, and likewise
In meaningless associations with the childish,
- 9.160 Life passes by swiftly without purpose.
Discrimination is very difficult to gain there.
How could there be a method to overcome
Habitual distractions there?
- 9.161 There, too, maras strive in order that
One falls into the great bad migrations.
There, wrong paths are abundant,
And doubt is difficult to overcome. {482}
- 9.162 Leisure is hard to gain again.
The arising of a buddha is extremely rare.
The river of afflictions will be difficult to abandon.
Alas, suffering flows!
- 9.163 These abiding in the river of suffering,
Who, although suffering immensely in this way,
Do not see their own suffering.
Woe, they are pitiful.
- 9.164 It is just like one who repeatedly washes himself
And then enters fire again and again,
So he prides himself in being happy,
Although he abides in immense suffering.

- 9.165 Those abiding like this, behaving as though
 There is no aging and death,
 First they are killed
 And then go to the unbearable bad migrations.
- 9.166 Thus, when might I pacify
 Those tormented by the fire of suffering,
 With the rain of accumulations of happiness
 Springing forth excellently from the clouds of my merit?
- 9.167 When shall I respectfully collect the accumulation of merit
 In a manner of non-objectification
 And teach emptiness
 To those ruined by objectification?

In things which are empty of inherent existence in the way previously explained above, if one were to evaluate from the side of inherent existence, due to what gain will one become attached? What attainment is there? What gain is lost? Will one generate anger? What loss is there? There is not the slightest. Who will be benefited or also harmed in being either honored or despised by whom?

For the sake of obtaining and abandoning why does one make effort? Where does the true cause of happiness or suffering come from? {483} What undesirable object is there to be displeased about? What desirable object is there to be pleased about²⁷²? When searched for in thusness with the reasoning that analyzes the meaning of the mode of abidance, what craver craves for what basis that generates craving, and what object of observation does it crave for? For, the three wheels of craving are not inherently existent.

Upon analysis regarding karma, the accumulator of karma, and so forth in this way, what is this sentient being [that is imputed by taking the aggregates that are the transitory collection as the basis of imputation]²⁷³, the transitory support of the living, that will die here in this [cyclic] existence? For, dying is not inherently existent.

Who will arise in a future life, and who has arisen in a past life? Who is a helpful associate? Also who is an affectionate friend? For, nothing is even slightly inherently existent. Thus by realizing the meaning of the mode of abidance, make effort to neutralize the eight worldly concerns, because Yongdzin Tamje Khyenpa says:

When one analyzes the profound meaning of the mode of abidance with the wisdom of individual investigation, and reflects upon it, by contemplating how all of endowment, deprivation, happiness, suffering, fame, disrepute, praise and blame, besides being mere names and mere appearances to the mind, do not have even an atom of true existence, neutralize the eight concerns and meditate on love and compassion for the sentient beings who have not realized such a meaning.

²⁷² *Dgar ci yod* added according to the root text.

²⁷³ Annotated in accordance with p. 673 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa's commentary.

May those who are like me, the author of the text, apprehend all phenomena as being like space, {484} because doing that cuts the root of [cyclic] existence and is the *principal* path for proceeding to omniscience. “Those who are like me” [expresses] the humility of the author. “Principal” [signifies] that it is advice for ordinary beings who have not realized suchness.

Although desiring happiness themselves also in this life, they do not transcend the force of suffering. They themselves and others are agitated and take joy by means of the causes of conflict with enemies and delight in associates. It seems that they must live miserably by way of great fruitless hardship through sorrow when desires are not fulfilled, struggles for the sake of desires, disputes with others, oneself and others cutting and stabbing each other’s bodies, and in addition, accumulating infinite negativities, such as those of speech and mind. Hence the wise ones do not crave the marvels of this life.

Through the force of meeting just this time with the spiritual teacher, after repeatedly going to the good migrations briefly like a flash of lightning and enjoying much happiness again and again, they die and fall into the rough, hot, and unpleasant sufferings of the bad migrations – the unbearable great hells for long infinite eons. Since one must experience infinite sufferings there, one should contemplate the drawbacks of the bad migrations.

Reflect upon the general drawbacks of [cyclic] existence as follows. There are many pitfalls that are the harms of suffering in [cyclic] existence of the desire, form and formless realms. {485} The causes of not transcending them are as follows. Without understanding the method for becoming freed from the suffering of [cyclic] existence as it really is, on the occasion of being bound like this by the noose of [cyclic] existence, there is mutual contradiction. Therefore there is nothing but solely circling in cyclic existence due to superimposition of things (that contradict the causes of liberation) as true when one does not understand suchness. When circling in [cyclic] existence, there is no such understanding of thusness, whereby one should make effort to realize emptiness since one will experience the transcendence of the limits of the ocean of the incomparable unbearable suffering also in [cyclic] existence. Even though one may be born into a good migration in [cyclic] existence, the strength for accomplishing virtue is weak there; and the life span of the leisures and endowments of the support for accomplishing virtue is short there as well.

On the occasion of abiding slightly there, too, in activities for the methods in the hope of a long life, cleansing, massage²⁷⁴, and the like, and the causes of health, such as relying on medicine, in hunger and sudden fatigue, in sleep and detriment of various outer and inner harms, and likewise in meaningless associations with childish negative companions and so forth, without time to practice the Dharma, this life is discarded quickly, that is, it passes by swiftly without purpose and disintegrates. Discrimination regarding the meaning of suchness, the cause of transcending [cyclic] existence, is very difficult to gain there, thereby one should make effort in the methods for reversing cyclic existence. {486}

OPINION: It would be sufficient to reverse cyclic existence by meditating on the meaning of emptiness when one is reborn in a good migration.

RESPONSE: The habituation since beginningless lives in cyclic existence with adhering to things as truly existent and distractions such as busyness in cyclic existence is very difficult to reverse, whereby how could there be a method to overcome it? For, the concordant conditions for reversing it are very few, and the adverse detrimental conditions are very plentiful. Even at the time of practicing slightly the excellent Dharma, there, too, maras such as Devaputra

²⁷⁴ *Skū mnye* emended to read *bku mnye* in accordance with p. 675 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

strive in order that one falls into the great bad migrations. Hence the adverse conditions to becoming freed from cyclic existence are many and are difficult to reverse.

OPINION: When one is reborn in a good migration, due to cultivating faith in the truths, the Three Jewels, and so forth, one will be freed from [cyclic] existence, whereby it is not difficult to gain.

RESPONSE: Even there, when born in a good migration, wrong paths that fall into the extremes of permanence and annihilation (which are discordant classes to the correct views) are abundant, one is led to them by wrong spiritual guides, and doubt in which one has misgivings about the correct path is difficult to overcome since the outer and inner conditions for eliminating doubt are difficult to gain.

OPINION: Even though I may not gain it in this life, it is sufficient that I search out a spiritual teacher and practice in the next life.

RESPONSE: If one does not make effort well when one has gained a spiritual teacher in this life, leisure is hard to gain again from the next life onwards. The arising of a buddha in the world is extremely rare. Hence it is very difficult to also meet a spiritual teacher.

Even though one has already met a spiritual teacher and obtained a good support of leisures and endowments, if one does not make effort well with conscientiousness, {487} the river of afflictions will be difficult to cross, because one should make effort continuously until liberation is attained.

“Alas” has the meaning of discouragement and disheartenment; suffering flows one after another, hence there is great suffering. For, although one may become free from one suffering, one falls into another suffering again. Hence, at the time of having obtained the leisures and endowments, one should make effort in reflecting upon the drawbacks of cyclic existence.

These sentient beings abiding in the river of suffering, who, although suffering immensely in this way, hold suffering as happiness, do not see that they are sinking²⁷⁵ in their own suffering. Out of compassion, by means of thinking, “Woe, how wonderful it would be if they were free from suffering!” one should make effort in cultivating great compassion since sentient beings sunk in the mud of suffering are pitiful.

It is just like some non-Buddhist, deceived by wrong teachers, who repeatedly washes himself and then enters fire again and again, so he prides himself in being happy by holding that itself to be the method for attaining liberation, although he abides in immense suffering due to being tormented by austerities of the body.

Those sentient beings abiding like this, behaving as though they are foe-destroyers with no aging and death, in stages, first they are killed by the unpretentious Lord of Death who is not one to be hated, and then go to the unbearable suffering of falling into the three bad migrations. {488}

Thus in the manner previously explained above, having contemplated well the way in which those who have come into the stream of unbearable suffering are tortured by suffering, through observing those sentient beings tormented by the fire of suffering in this way, I wonder, when might I pacify the suffering of their bad migrations, with necessities of happiness, such as medicine and food, springing forth excellently from the clouds of my merit of generosity and so forth? Meditate on great compassion, thinking, “If only sentient beings

²⁷⁵ *Byid* emended to read *bying* in accordance with p. 677 of Thubten Chokyi Dragpa’s commentary.

can be liberated from the suffering of the bad migrations! May they be liberated! I shall liberate them!”

Make wishes in the following way to be the causes of freedom from the suffering of cyclic existence. When shall I respectfully collect the accumulation of merit of generosity and so forth, the methods for that, in a manner of possessing the wisdom of non-objectification, the realization of emptiness of inherent existence of all phenomena, and teach emptiness for the sake of pacifying the suffering of cyclic existence to those sentient beings ruined in cyclic existence by objectification that adheres to true existence? Wondering like this, meditate on great compassion, thinking, “If only sentient beings can be free from the suffering of cyclic existence! I shall liberate them!”

A fully qualified great love and compassion included within the mahayana path must wish to place [sentient beings] in the perfect complete buddhahood that possesses every happiness and is free from all suffering. {489}

In brief, one should meditate on the meaning of the mode of abidance in dependence on calm abiding. Further, the I, when one thinks of “I,” is nothing but posited as a mere imputation upon the aggregates; it is not established inherently, by way of its own character, in a manner of independent abidance even in the slightest. Thus the existence of a person is merely imputed by convention of name. Having been imputed, it exists. It is only existent in a manner of reliance. That is all. Thus it lacks inherent existence. Thinking like this, take it to mind. You should likewise contemplate by applying this to all phenomena such as the aggregates.

Thus on this occasion of having obtained just once a support in which the pleasures and endowments are complete, you must make effort in the methods for generating in your continuum the profound Middle-Way view. As long as one has not gained the good fortune of relying by way of thought and application upon an excellent spiritual teacher who gives proper instructions on the mode of profound suchness, it will be difficult to realize even a portion of the Middle-Way path of dependent-arising which is free from the extremes. And through proper reliance upon [such a spiritual teacher], all excellent accumulations will arise. Gyeltshab Tamche Khyenpa Rinpoche²⁷⁶ says:

*Until I found the excellent venerable [Tsongkhapa],
I had not realized even a portion of
Dependent-arising, the middle free from extremes,
The path that severs the root of [cyclic] existence.*

*All of whatever good explanations are present in me
Is the kindness of the guru.
May this virtue become the cause
For all my mothers to meet the mahayana [spiritual] friend! {490}*

Following this passage he advises that one must strive quickly to properly accomplish with effort by relying on the spiritual teacher:

²⁷⁶ From [Gyeltshab’s] *Explanation of (Shantideva’s) “Engaging in the Bodhisattva Deeds”*: Entrance of Victors’ Children.

A Precious Garland

*Without realizing the principle of the middle free from extremes,
One will not be able to contact the state of the supreme aryas.
Hence, having decisively analyzed that emptiness means dependent-arising,
Strive to properly accomplish with effort.*

*Proponents of the two truths of Nagarjuna's excellent system,
Difficult to find even in billions of eons,
Will vanish from this land before too long.
Therefore, discriminating ones, quickly generate joyous effort!*

3B2B-2B3D-2. Title of the chapter

*The Ninth Chapter on The Perfection of Wisdom from Engaging in the Deeds of a
Bodhisattva.*

This is easy to understand.

Chapter Ten Dedication

3B2B-2B4. Explanation on how to train in generosity in which one gives away one's body, resources and roots of virtue for the sake of others by way of the branch of dedication²⁷⁷

3B2B-2B4A. Explanation of the text of the chapter

3B2B-2B4B. Title of the chapter

3B2B-2B4A. Explanation of the text of the chapter

3B2B-2B4A-1. Brief indication through dedication for all migrating beings to engage in the deeds of a bodhisattva

3B2B-2B4A-2. Extensive explanation on dedication

3B2B-2B4A-3. Paying homage due to subsequent recollection of kindness

3B2B-2B4A-1. Brief indication through dedication for all migrating beings to engage in the deeds of a bodhisattva

10.1 By whatever virtue there is due to my having composed
Engaging in the Deeds of a Bodhisattva,
May all migrating beings
Engage in the deeds of the bodhisattvas.

{491} By whatever virtue obtained by me, the composer of the treatise, having composed in detail *Engaging in the Deeds of a Bodhisattva* in the manner of a single person practicing the stages of the path of the three beings [of the three scopes of capabilities] in their entirety, encompassing the meaning of the content of all the scriptures along with the result of the path of attaining buddhahood, and whatever virtue of explaining this treatise, hearing, and thinking about the meaning, may all migrating beings engage properly in the deeds of the bodhisattvas.

The *Sutra requested by Sagara Mati (Sagaramatiparipriccha-sutra)* says:

*Just as a drop of water that falls into the great ocean
Is not exhausted until the ocean dries up,
Likewise virtue thoroughly dedicated to enlightenment
Is not exhausted until one attains enlightenment.*

Just as explained above, virtues that will [otherwise] yield little results will yield extensive ones, and also those that, if not dedicated, will become exhausted at some point will never exhaust and will increase. Having contemplated these benefits, even those who have created a little virtue should strive to dedicate it to unsurpassable enlightenment for the sake of all sentient beings.

It is just as it has been said in the *Perfection of Wisdom Sutra*:

Besides the state of omniscience, do not engage in thoroughly dedicating all your roots of virtue to the grounds of hearers and solitary realizers.

And [Asanga's] *Bodhisattva Grounds (Bodhisattvabhumi)* also says:

²⁷⁷ It previously appears as "Extensive explanation on how to train in generosity by way of the branch of dedication."

Bodhisattvas go into isolation, purify their thoughts by gathering their mind inwards, visualize from the bottom of their hearts boundless extensive various types of phenomena that are objects of generosity by conceptualization with faith, and practice generosity to sentient beings. {492} Thus bodhisattvas will increase their collections boundlessly with slight hardship. That is the generosity of bodhisattvas possessing great wisdom. This should be performed from the state of being conjoined with the wisdom that realizes that the three wheels of the virtue are not truly existent, just as has been explained in the ninth chapter. There is no great distinction between dedication and prayers. Nevertheless, those distinguished by the aspiration that seeks the desired result are prayers, whereas those distinguished by the aspiration that the virtues which are causes will become the cause of that result are dedications.

3B2B-2B4A-2. Extensive explanation on dedication

3B2B-2B4A-2A. Dedication for others' purpose

3B2B-2B4A-2B. Dedication for self-purpose

3B2B-2B4A-2C. Dedication for the flourishing of the teachings, the source of happiness

3B2B-2B4A-2A. Dedication for others' purpose

3B2B-2B4A-2A1. Dedication for mundane beings

3B2B-2B4A-2A2. Dedication for supramundane beings

3B2B-2B4A-2A1. Dedication for mundane beings

3B2B-2B4A-2A1A. Dedication for pacifying sickness and the sufferings of the bad migrations

3B2B-2B4A-2A1B. Dedication for good migrations and sentient beings

3B2B-2B4A-2A1A. Dedication for pacifying sickness and the sufferings of the bad migrations

- 10.2 However many sick people there are
 Suffering in body and mind in all directions,
 Due to my merit may they obtain
 An ocean of happiness and joy.
- 10.3 For as long as they remain in cyclic existence
 May their happiness never decline.
 May migrating beings obtain
 An uninterrupted flow of unsurpassable²⁷⁸ happiness.
- 10.4 However many hell beings there are
 Throughout the realms of the worlds, {493}
 May those embodied beings
 Be delighted by the happiness of Sukhavati.
- 10.5 May those wretched due to cold obtain warmth.
 May those wretched due to heat be cooled
 By the infinite rivers arising from

²⁷⁸ *Byang chub sems dpa'* emended to read *bla na med pa*.

The great clouds of the bodhisattvas.

- 10.6 May the forest of sword-like leaves
Also become a pleasant grove.
May the shalmali trees too
Grow into wish-fulfilling trees.
- 10.7 May they be beautified by the melodious calls of
Wild duck, geese, and swans.
May the regions of hell become charming
Due to pools of large and sweetly fragrant lotuses.
- 10.8 May the heaps of coals also become piles of jewels.
May the burning iron ground be revealed²⁷⁹ as crystal floors.
May the mountains of Mass Destruction [Hell] become
Celestial mansions of offerings filled with sugatas.
- 10.9 May the rain of glowing cinders, burning rocks, and weapons
From now on become a rain of flowers.
May the striking of each other with weapons
From now on be a playful tossing of flowers.
- 10.10 May those drowning in the fire-like River Without Ford
Their flesh entirely disintegrated and their bones the color of kunda flowers,
Attain bodies of gods by the force of my virtue, and
Then dwell with goddesses in gently flowing streams.
- 10.11 Wondering “Why are the henchmen of Yama and the terrible ravens and
vultures afraid?
Whose strength is the fine strength that utterly dispels darkness and generates
happiness and joy?”, {494}
Upon looking upward they behold Vajrapani abiding blazing in the midst of space.
By the force of their strong joy, may they be freed from negativities and be in his
company.
- 10.12 Having seen the fire of the hells splattered and extinguished
By a falling rain of flowers mixed with scented water,
Immediately satiated with bliss and wondering what [had caused] this,
May the hell beings behold Padmapani.
- 10.13 Friends, discarding fear, come from the distance! Why flee when directly in
front of us
Is the one by whose strength we are freed from suffering and the force of joy
emerges,

²⁷⁹ *Bstar* emended to read *bstan*.

The one who thoroughly protects all migrating beings, and has generated
bodhichitta and mercy,
The youthful one with a blazing topknot who removes all fears?

- 10.14 “Behold him in an attractive mansion resounding with the melodious
eulogies of thousands of goddesses
With hundreds of gods paying homage at his lotus feet with their crowns and,
His eyes moist with compassion, a rain of clusters of many flowers falling upon his
head.”
Upon seeing Manjugosha in this way, may the hell beings exclaim!
- 10.15 Thus, by my roots of virtue,
Having seen the comfortable, cool, and fragrant rain falling
From the unobscured clouds of bodhisattvas such as Samantabhadra,
May the sentient beings of hell become joyful.
- 10.16 May the animals be freed from
The fear of being eaten by one another.
May the hungry ghosts be as happy
As the human beings of Unpleasant Sound. {495}
- 10.17 May the hungry ghosts be satiated
By the flow of milk descending from
The hand of Arya Lord Avalokiteshvara, and
By washing in it may they always be refreshed.

However many sick people there are caught in suffering feelings of body and mind in all directions, due to my merit of however many virtues, may they be freed from sickness and obtain what is like an ocean filled with bodily happiness and mental joy.

For as long as these migrating beings remain in cyclic existence may their happiness never decline. May migrating beings obtain an uninterrupted flow of unsurpassable happiness. For, Yong-dzin Tam-je Khyen-pa says:

Emanating boundless quantities of my body, resources, and roots of virtue, they are simultaneously given to all sentient beings, whereby all the individual sicknesses of the body and the suffering of the mind are pacified, and they are filled with bodily and mental happiness. Contemplate that, having completed the accumulations [of merit and wisdom], they attain unsurpassable enlightenment. When such a transformation has taken place, think with forceful aspiration of joy and certainty, “May this be so!”

However many beings of the hot and cold hells there are throughout the realms of the worlds which reach the ends of space, may those embodied beings, having pacified the hell sufferings, be mentally delighted by the happiness of the land of Sukhavati.

May those wretched due to cold in the eight cold hells such as the Blistering {496} obtain warmth that generates happiness. May those wretched due to heat be cooled by the infinite

rivers arising from the great clouds of exalted compassion which are the bodhisattvas' collections of the two accumulations.

May the forest of sword-like leaves in the surrounding [hells bordering] the hot hells also become a pleasant grove of Indra's gardens for the sentient beings of the hells. May the iron shalmali trees with thorns of length measuring sixteen finger-widths pointing downwards also grow into wish-fulfilling trees that give rise to all that is needed and desired. May these trees be beautified by the melodious calls of wild duck, geese, and swans. May the regions of hell become charming due to pools of large and sweetly fragrant lotuses.

May the heaps of blazing coals of the hot hells also become piles of various kinds of jewels. May the burning iron ground be revealed as attractive crystal floors. May the mountains of Mass Destruction [Hell] – in which mountains resembling the faces of goats and the like move towards each other and crush what is between – become celestial mansions of offerings to the buddhas and then become filled with sugatas.

May the rain of glowing cinders, burning rocks, and weapons from now on become a rain of flowers. May the striking of each other with weapons in Reviving and so forth²⁸⁰ from now on be a playful tossing of flowers.

May those drowning in the fire-like River Without Ford of boiling molten metal, their flesh entirely disintegrated and their bones similar in color to kunda flowers, attain the excellent bodies of gods by the force of my virtue, and then dwell and play with goddesses in streams that gently flow into bathing pools.²⁸¹

Also, Yong-dzin Tam-je Khyen-pa says:

First of all, imagine that by simultaneously giving to all the hell beings, the sufferings of hells are instantaneously pacified. Next, one's body, resources along with roots of virtue are given to all of the eight hot hells, the eight cold hells, the four surrounding hells and however many occasional hells there are. Give by transforming [one's body, resources along with roots of virtue] into the means for pacifying the suffering and terror of the individual hell beings, such as sun, fire, light for the beings of the cold hells and streams of cool water for the beings of the hot hells.

Wondering "If the sentient beings who abide in the hells are free from immediate suffering, then why are the henchmen of Yama and the terrible ravens and vultures who act to harm me in this abode of the hells afraid? Whose fine strength utterly dispels all darkness and generates bodily happiness and mental joy?", {498} upon looking upward they behold Vajrapani abiding blazing with resplendence in the midst of space and go for refuge to him. By the force of their strong joy, may they be freed from negativities and be in his company.

Furthermore, having seen the fire of the hells splattered and extinguished by a falling rain of flowers mixed with scented water, immediately satiated with bliss and wondering and looking for what [had caused] this, may the hell beings behold Avalokiteshvara, the holder of lotus in hand [Padmapani].

Summoning friends, one calls out, "Friends, come! Come! Discarding fear of the hells, come from the distance! Who will flee when directly in front of us is the one by whose

²⁸⁰ JN: "in Reviving and so forth" missing in the original translation.

²⁸¹ JN: This phrase is missing in the original translation.

strength we are freed from bodily suffering and the force of joy emerges due to removing²⁸² mental fears, the one who has generated the light that protects all migrating beings and the fire²⁸³ of mercy, the youthful one with a topknot blazing with light who removes all our mental fears?” and they come.

To friends, one says, “Behold him in an attractive mansion resounding with the eulogies and songs of thousands of goddesses, with hundreds of gods paying homage at his lotus feet with their crowns and, his eyes moist with compassion, a rain of clusters of many flowers falling upon his head.” Upon seeing Manjugosha, the granter of relief in this way, may the hell beings shout out with joy! {499}

Thus, by my roots of virtue, having seen the comfortable, cool, and fragrant rain falling from the unobscured clouds possessing the strength of prayers of bodhisattvas such as Samantabhadra, Maitreya, Ksitigarbha, Akashagarbha, may the sentient beings of hell become joyful. Thus, Yong-dzin Tam-je Khyen-pa also says:

Imagine that, due to the exalted compassion of the great bodhisattvas abiding in the lands of the ten directions being stirred, instantaneously their inconceivable magical emanations pacify all the sufferings, fear, and terror of the hell abodes.

May animals be freed from the fear of being eaten by one another and so forth in dependence on the strength of whatever virtue there is of myself and others. May the hungry ghosts be as happy as the human beings of the northern [continent] Unpleasant Sound where food, clothes, and resources arise by mere thought.

May the hungry ghosts be satiated by food and drinks due to the flow of nectar milk descending from the hand of Arya Lord Avalokiteshvara, and by washing in it may they always feel fresh. Yong-dzin Tam-je Khyen-pa’s *Great Mind Training* also says:

From one’s body in the aspect of a wish-fulfilling body, countless bodies equal in number to sentient beings are emanated {500} and sent out to however many sentient beings there are in the hells – the eight hot hells such as the Reviving, the eight cold hells such as the Blistering, the surrounding hells, and the occasional hells. Contemplate that, thereby, like iron being made into gold by gold-making elixir, instantaneously the bodies of the hell beings transform and they obtain only bodies of leisure and endowments that possess the seven good qualities of high status and are enriched with the seven arya gems.

Just as whatever desired such as food and clothes arises from the precious wish-fulfilling gem, from the wish-fulfilling body, one obtains with respect to those objects of observation, food of a hundred flavors, hundreds of thousands of garments, mansions of five-hundred storeys, ideal companions who make same prayers – the support through which one utilizes resources, as well as the ideal retinue with whom one utilizes whatever objects of resources together. Contemplate that all of these also become conducive conditions for accomplishing the excellent Mahayana Dharma.

²⁸² *Byad* emended to read *byed*.

²⁸³ *Ma* emended to read *me*.

Likewise the outer conditions – such as the principal outer condition of coming under the delighted care of a fully-qualified mahayana spiritual teacher, and the sutra and tantra teachings which are the bases that are to be heard and contemplated – are produced. The inner conditions – the seven arya gems such as faith, the five powers, the five strengths, the four legs of magical manifestation, the seven branches of enlightenment, the eightfold path of superiors, the three precious trainings of the path, {501} and bodhichitta which has as its root love and compassion – are generated in one's continuum. The two accumulations are culminated by practicing the deeds of the six perfections. Contemplate that, having attained buddhahood, all come to possess the happiness of a buddha's truth body (dharmakaya) in their mental continuums.

Similarly, bodies are sent out to as many sentient beings as there are included within the thirty-six types of hungry ghosts in the infinite boundless realms of the worlds in the ten directions. Just like before, their faults and misery of body and mind are pacified, the two obscurations are purified and, having attained buddhahood, they come to possess the happiness of a buddha's truth body.

3B2B-2B4A-2A1B. Dedication for good migrations and sentient beings

- 10.18 May the blind see and
 The deaf always hear sounds.
 Just as it was for Mayadevi,
 May pregnant women give birth without being harmed.
- 10.19 May the naked obtain clothing,
 The hungry obtain food, and
 The thirsty obtain water and
 Delicious drinks.
- 10.20 May the destitute obtain wealth.
 May the wretched with sorrow find joy.
 May the depressed be comforted and
 Attain perfect steadfastness. {502}
- 10.21 However many sick sentient beings there are,
 May they quickly be freed from their illnesses.
 May all the diseases without exception
 Of migrating beings never occur again.
- 10.22 May the frightened be fearless.
 May those bound be released.
 May the weak be strong. And
 May their minds be mutually friendly.
- 10.23 May all travelers be happy
 In every direction whatsoever.
 May their aims for which they travel

Be effortlessly accomplished.

- 10.24 May those who sail in boats and ships
Fulfill their wishes.
Having happily returned to shore,
May they be joyfully united with their relatives.
- 10.25 May anguished wanderers who have gone astray in deserts
Meet with other travelers, and,
Without fear of robbers, thieves, tigers, and others,
May they proceed²⁸⁴ easily without fatigue.
- 10.26 May the unprotected children and elderly,
Lost and anxious in desolate [places] and the like,
Those intoxicated with sleep and the insane,
Be watched over by the gods.
- 10.27 May [beings] be liberated from the non-leisures and
Be endowed with faith, wisdom, and mercy, and
Through food and conduct becoming perfect,
May they always recollect their lives.
- 10.28 May everyone, just like Space Treasury,
Have uninterrupted resources.
Without conflict and without harm,
May they enjoy themselves in freedom.
- 10.29 May the sentient beings with little splendor
Become greatly magnificent.
May the poor forms of ascetics
Become fine and perfect forms. {503}
- 10.30 However many women there are in the world,
May they all become men.
May the lowly attain high [status] and
May the proud be subdued.
- 10.31 Due to this merit of mine,
May all sentient beings without exception
Abandon all negativities and
Always create virtue.
- 10.32 May they never be parted from the mind of enlightenment,
Exert themselves in the bodhisattva conduct,

²⁸⁴ *Dod* emended to read 'gro.

Be cared for by the buddhas, and
Abandon the actions of the maras.

- 10.33 May all these sentient beings
Have immeasurably long lives.
May they always live in happiness and
Not even know the term “death.”
- 10.34 May gardens of wish-fulfilling trees
Be full in all directions
With buddhas and the buddha’s children
Filled with the hearing²⁸⁵ and the proclaiming of the Dharma.
- 10.35 May the ground everywhere be pure,
Without pebbles and so forth,
As even as the palm of the hand,
The nature of vaidurya, and soft.
- 10.36 For all the circles of retinues that exist,
May many bodhisattvas
Abide, adorning the surface of the earth
With their excellence.
- 10.37 May all embodied beings
Continually hear the sound of the Dharma
Coming from the birds and the trees,
From every ray of light, as well as from the sky.
- 10.38 May they always meet
Buddhas and the buddhas’ children. {504}
May they present offerings to the gurus of migrating beings
With infinite clouds of offerings.
- 10.39 May the gods also send down timely rain and
May crops be plentiful.
May kings act in accordance with the Dharma.
May worldly beings also prosper.
- 10.40 May medicines be potent and
The recitation of secret mantras be effective.
May dakinis, rakshasas, and so forth
Be endowed with minds of compassion.

²⁸⁵ *Snyan* emended to read *nyan* in accordance with commentary below.

- 10.41 May sentient beings never suffer,
[Commit negativities, or become ill.]
May they not be afraid or despised, and
May they never have unhappy minds.
- 10.42 May the monasteries flourish and excellently remain
Due to reading and recitation.
May the sangha always be concordant and
May the aims of the sangha also be accomplished.
- 10.43 May monks who wish to train
Also find solitude.
Having abandoned all distractions,
May they meditate with serviceable minds.
- 10.44 May nuns have material things and
Abandon quarrelling and afflicting harm.
Likewise, may all the ordained
Not degenerate their morality.
- 10.45 Through being disenchanted by corrupt morality,
May negativities forever be exhausted.
Also having attained good migrations,
May disciplined conduct not decline even there.
- 10.46 May the wise be honored and
May they also receive alms.
May their continua be completely pure and
May they be renowned in all directions.
- 10.47 May [beings] not experience the suffering of the bad migrations and
Also not undergo any austerities. {505}
With bodies superior to those of gods,
May they quickly achieve buddhahood.
- 10.48 May all sentient beings many times
Make offerings to all the buddhas.
Due to the infinite²⁸⁶ bliss of the buddhas,
May they always be endowed with happiness.

May the blind see forms with their eyes and the deaf always hear sounds. Just as it was for Mayadevi, may pregnant women give birth without being harmed.

May the naked who are without clothes obtain clothing, the hungry obtain food with perfect colors, aroma and tastes, and the thirsty obtain water and delicious drinks.

²⁸⁶ *Bsam* emended to read *mtha'* in accordance with commentary below.

May the destitute who are deprived of things obtain wealth. May the wretched with sorrow who are separated from what they desire find joy. May those depressed due to deterioration of their success and the like be comforted and attain the perfect steadfastness which cannot be oppressed by suffering and mental unhappiness.

Through the force of the virtues of others and myself, however many sick sentient beings there are, may they quickly be freed from their illnesses. May all the diseases of body and mind without exception of migrating beings never occur again.

May those frightened out of the fear of opponent enemies be fearless. May those bound by others without freedom be released from bondage. {506} May those weak due to being of little power be strong. And may their minds be endowed with the attitude of mutually benefiting friends.

May all travelers such as merchants who are traveling to the ten directions be happy in every direction whatsoever. May their aims for which they travel be effortlessly accomplished.

May those who sail in boats and ships across oceans for the sake of [obtaining] jewels and the like fulfill their wishes accordingly. Having happily returned to shore, may they be joyfully united with their relatives.

May anguished wanderers who have gone astray in vast deserts and so forth meet with other travelers who will grant relief, and, without fear of robbers, thieves, tigers, and others, may they proceed easily without fatigue.

May the unprotected children and elderly, lost and anxious in desolate [places] and the like, those intoxicated with sleep and the insane, be watched over by the wholesome gods.

May [beings] be liberated from all the eight states of non-leisures with regards to practicing the Dharma, and be endowed with faith, wisdom, and mercy, a heart of concern about others' welfare, and through food and conduct becoming perfect, may they always recollect their lives.

May everyone deprived of resources have uninterrupted resources, as though they have obtained the meditative stabilization of the Space Treasury. {507} Without conflict with each other, and without harm from others, may they enjoy themselves in freedom.

May the sentient beings with little splendor who are objects of contempt by others become greatly magnificent. May the poor forms of ascetics whose bodies are tormented by heat and cold become fine and perfect forms.

However many women there are in the world, may they all become men. May the lowly of inferior caste attain high caste and, by their attaining that, may even the proud be subdued. It is just as it has been said in [Yong-dzin Tam-je Khyen-pa's] *Great Mind-Training*:

Imagine your body and resources along with your roots of virtue as objects desired, and give them to the gods and humans of the good migrations. Contemplate that all the individual sufferings of the body and the afflictions become pacified and all the outer and inner conducive conditions for practicing the Dharma become complete.

Due to this merit of mine from cultivating the mind of enlightenment and so forth, may the objects of intent – all sentient beings without exception – abandon all negativities that are unfavorable conditions, such as killing, and always create virtue.

May they never be parted from the mind of enlightenment, and exert themselves in the bodhisattva conduct such as generosity. May they be cared for by the buddhas and spiritual teachers [who serve as] the dominant conditions, and abandon actions of the maras which obstruct virtue. {508}

May all these sentient beings be reborn into good migrations and have immeasurably long lives. May they, besides living long, also always live in happiness and not even know the term “death.” Thus, Yong-dzin Tam-je Khyen-pa also says:

Then, also my body and resources along with my roots of virtue are all given to all sentient beings, whereby all the karma and afflictions of their individual continua are purified. Contemplate that all paths, such as the faith of conviction in actions and their results, renunciation, and bodhichitta are instantaneously generated in their continua. Think that, also from the temporal point of view, long life and freedom from sickness also become perfect.

May gardens of wish-fulfilling trees be full in all directions with buddhas and buddha children filled with the hearing and the proclaiming of the Dharma.

May the ground everywhere be pure, without harsh inarable land²⁸⁷, rocks, thorns, pebbles, and so forth, as even as the palm of the hand, the nature of vaidurya, and soft.

For all the circles of retinues that exist, may many bodhisattvas abide, adorning the surface of the earth with their excellence of ideal good qualities.

May all embodied beings, just like bodhisattvas who have attained mastery, continually hear the sound of the Dharma coming from the birds and the trees, from every ray of light, as well as from the sky. {509}

May sentient beings always meet buddhas and the buddha’s children. May they present offerings to buddhas, the gurus of migrating beings, with infinite oceans of clouds of offerings.

As conditions for practicing the Dharma, may the gods also send down timely rain and may crops be plentiful. May the lords of humans, the kings, rule their kingdoms in accordance with the Dharma. May worldly beings also prosper by way of being adorned with happiness.

May medicines be potent in the pacification of sickness, and the recitation of secret mantras for the accomplishment of pacification, increase, and so forth that are said in accordance with their purposes be effective. May dakinis [sky-goers], rakshasas [cannibal demons], wild animals and so forth be endowed with minds of love.

Dedicate for separation from the undesired as follows. May sentient beings never suffer physically, [commit negativities, or become ill.] May they not be afraid mentally or despised by others, and may they never have unhappy minds.

Yong-dzin Tam-je Khyen-pa also says:

Emanate countless numbers of your body in the aspect of wish-fulfilling jewels and give them to the environmental world. Having sent them to the lands that are the environment of boundless infinite realms of the worlds of the ten directions, all

²⁸⁷ *Tshwa spo can* emended to read *tshwa sgo can*. The Nitartha Dictionary explains that it is “soil that owing to an admixture of soda or magnesia is not suited for any kind of vegetable produce.”

the faults of the impure environment, such as filth, logs, thorns, gravel, pebbles, ravines, and cliffs in the environmental world become purified and remain so.

{510} Also all the realms of the world become as even as the palm of the hand, in the nature of various gems, extensive and vast. They are soft and comfortable to touch. Free from odors, they are luminous and possess the sweet fragrance of snake-heart sandalwood. Various divine flowers are loosely strewn about. From the ends of the layers of jewel cornices, strings of gold, silver, and pearl spread out. Lovely graceful utpala, kumuda, and lotus flowers cover [the ground]. [The environment] is beautified by lakes, ponds, and pools possessing the eight branches, which are ornamented by various water fowls soaring in the air and making pleasant sounds, joyful and dispersed out. In ways such as these, [the environment] transforms into an ideal pure land. Think that great inconceivable masses of clouds of offerings for the assemblies of buddhas and arya bodhisattvas arise.

Contemplate also that, for the sentient beings who are inhabitants dwelling in these lands, such ideal endowments do not become the conditions for pride, conceit, and arrogance even for an instant; instead they become only conducive conditions for the accomplishment of enlightenment. This is of great importance for it constitutes the purifying of [one's future] buddha land.

May the sangha abiding in temples spread, flourish and excellently remain due to the reading and recitation of the scriptures and commentaries. May the virtuous activities of the sangha always be concordant with their minds, {511} and may the aims of the sangha to benefit sentient beings and the like also be accomplished in accordance with their wishes.

May the monks who wish to guard their trainings without degeneration also find solitude free from busyness of the body which serves as hindrances to morality. Having abandoned all distractions of mind, may they meditate on virtue with serviceable minds by means of being endowed with the bliss of pliancy of body and mind.

May nuns have material things endowed with Dharma, and abandon quarrelling and harm such as being oppressed by others. Likewise, may all the ordained culminate their morality without degeneration.

Through being disenchanted by corrupt morality in case it ever occurs, may negativities be forever exhausted through the generation of regret. Then, also having attained good migrations in future lives, may disciplined conduct not decline even there.

May the wise be honored by the world and may they also receive alms. May their continua be completely pure, being free of pride and the like, and may they be renowned in all directions.

May [beings] not experience the suffering of the bad migrations and also not undergo any austerities of harsh actions of the three doors. With bodies that are fruitional results superior to those of gods, may these wise ones with bodies endowed with the seven excellent qualities of high status for accomplishing omniscience quickly achieve buddhahood. {512}

Through the strength of whatever virtue exists, may all sentient beings respectfully make offerings to all the buddhas many times with all kinds of activities. By training in the bodhisattva's deeds in dependence on this, due to the infinite bliss of the buddhas, may they always be endowed with happiness.

It is just as it has been said also by Yong-dzin Tam-je Khyen-pa:

Then give your body and resources along with your roots of virtue to the sangha of the ten directions. Imagine that due to this offering, all the good qualities of hearing, reflection, and meditation, and so forth of all the sangha increase, and all the wishes in their hearts are fulfilled.

3B2B-2B4A-2A2. Dedication for supramundane beings

10. 49 May bodhisattvas accomplish
 The welfare of migrating beings as intended.
 May sentient beings also acquire
 Whatever the protectors intended.

10.50 Likewise, may solitary realizers
 As well as hearers be happy.

In dependence on the virtues of composing this treatise and so forth, may the bodhisattvas accomplish the temporal and final welfare of all migrating beings exactly as intended. May all sentient beings also acquire whatever happiness the Victors – the protectors of sentient beings – intended, possessing every happiness. {513}

Likewise, may solitary realizers as well as hearers attain the happiness of pacification. It is just as it has also been said in [Yong-dzin Tam-je Khyen-pa's] *Great Mind-Training*:

Then offer your body, resources, and roots of virtue by emanating boundless articles of offering to the buddhas, bodhisattvas, and arya hearers and solitary realizers. Contemplate that whatever wished for in their minds is spontaneously fulfilled.

3B2B-2B4A-2B. Dedication for self-purpose

10.51 May I too, until I attain the Very Joyous Ground
 By the kindness of Manjugosha,
 Always recollect my former lives and
 Always receive ordination.

10.52 May I be robust,
 Even though the food may be simple, and live.
 In all my lives may I find
 Ideal isolated places.

10.53 Whenever I desire to look or
 Even if I wish to ask the slightest question,
 May I behold without any hindrance
 The protector Manjugosha himself.

10.54 In order to accomplish the welfare of all sentient beings
 Who extend to the ends of space in the ten directions,
 May my deeds also be just like
 The deeds of Manjugosha.

- 10.55 For as long as space endures and
For as long as sentient beings remain,
For that long may I abide and
Eliminate the sufferings of migrating beings.
- 10.56 May the sufferings of migrating beings,
No matter how many there are, all ripen upon me. {514}
Due to the bodhisattva sangha,
May migrating beings enjoy happiness.

Through the force of these virtues, may I too, until I attain the Very Joyous Ground by the kindness of Manjugosha, always recollect my former lives and always receive ordination, the vessel of good qualities.

May I be robust in body even though the food may be simple and mediocre, and live happily. In all my lives may I find ideal places isolated from the unrest of the body and mind.

Whenever I desire to look at the teachings of the Muni and the like, or even if I wish to ask a question regarding the slightest meaningful syllable, may I directly behold without any obscuring hindrance the protector Manjugosha himself immediately.

In order to accomplish the temporal and final welfare of all sentient beings who extend to the ends of space in the ten directions, may my deeds also be just like the deeds of Manjugosha.

For as long as space endures and for as long as sentient beings circling in cyclic existence remain, for that long may I abide and eliminate all the sufferings of migrating beings.

May the sufferings of migrating beings, no matter how many there are, all ripen upon me. Due to the power of the bodhisattva sangha, may all migrating beings enjoy happiness naturally.{515}

3B2B-2B4A-2C. Dedication for the flourishing of the teachings, the source of happiness

- 10.57 May the sole medicine for the sufferings of migrating beings,
The source of all happiness –
The teachings – together with gain and honor
Remain for a very long time.

In dependence on the power of whatever virtue there is, may the sole peerless medicine for dispelling all the sufferings of migrating beings, the excellent source of all happiness of migrating beings – the teachings of the Buddha Bhagavan – together with gain and honor remain for a very long time, as long as cyclic existence remains. Also, Je Thamje Khyenpa says:

*Since it has been taught that the prayers of the Victors' Children [as numerous as the
grains of sand on] the banks of the Ganges River
Can be subsumed within the prayer to [be able to] uphold the excellent Dharma,
Whatever roots of virtues that have been accumulated
Are all dedicated as causes for the flourishing of the Muni's teachings.
Having contemplated this mode, and being in excellent arrangement,
What great kindness, the treasure of Jetsun Khyenpa!*

Yong-dzin Rinpoche also says:

In brief, since the sole cause which dispels the sufferings and gives rise to the happiness of migrating beings is only the precious teachings of the Victor, I dedicate all my roots of virtue to and pray for the flourishing of the teachings.

3B2B-2B4A-3. Paying homage due to subsequent recollection of kindness

10.58 I prostrate to Manjughosha
By whose kindness virtuous minds arise. {516}
I prostrate also to my virtuous friends
By whose kindness I develop.

By the kindness of the special virtuous friend, the dominant condition, I cultivated the mind of enlightenment and trained in the [bodhisattva's] deeds. I prostrate to Manjughosha, the dominant condition, who gave rise to the virtuous mind of composing this treatise by taking these as the subject matter. I prostrate also to my virtuous friends who, by their kindness, developed the classes of virtue in my continuum through having set me in the trainings and engendered the realizations of hearing, contemplation and meditation and the like.

Thus, when all the roots of virtue of having composed the treatise and so forth which have been created are dedicated as causes for supreme enlightenment, the virtues that will [otherwise] yield simply a slight result will yield extensive results, will never be exhausted, and will increase, just as said in the *Sutra Requested by Sagara Mati* (*Sagaramatiparipriccha-sutra*) cited above [in the commentary to stanza 10.1].

Having seen the force of this meaning, Chandrakirti says [at the end of his *Supplement to the Middle Way* (*Madhyamakavatara*)] (stanza 9.56):

*Through the merit pervading the limits of the directions that I have obtained from
approaching the excellent system of Acharya Nagarjuna,
That is as white as autumn stars in the sky of my mind darkened by afflictions,
Or that is like a jewel on the hood of the snake of my mind,
May the entire world without exception realize thusness, and quickly proceed to the
ground of the Sugatas.*

The Foremost Lama [Tsongkhapa] says:

At beginning, I sought much hearing extensively.
At the middle, all the scriptural systems dawned as instructions. {517}
At the end, I practiced all day and night.
All of these I dedicated for the sake of the flourishing of the teachings.

Gyeltshab Rinpoche also says:

Whatever virtues there are from hearing, contemplation and meditation, and
Also the virtues from mere prostrations and making offerings,
In order that these virtues never become exhausted and are increased,

Ornamenting them through dedication, I hold them dear.

3B2B-2B4B. Title of the chapter

This is the tenth chapter called “Dedication” from *Engaging in the Deeds of a Bodhisattva*.

This is easy to understand.

4. Meaning of the conclusion

4A. By whom the treatise is composed

4B. By whom the treatise is translated

4A. By whom the treatise is composed

The great Acharya called Shantideva was directly taken care of by the Venerable Manjugosha, and having discarded royal affairs as if they were spit in the dirt, was endowed with many amazing deeds. He thus completed the bodhisattvas’ deeds and, in particular, practiced the deeds of annutarayoga [highest yoga tantra] that are very devoid of elaborations, and definitely accomplished the state of Vajradhara. A good explanation of the meaning of his words is completed.

4B. By whom the treatise is translated

It was edited and settled upon by the Indian abbot Sarvajñadeva and the editor-translator pandit Pel Tseg based upon the Kashmiri edition. {518} After that it was well translated and revised, then settled upon, by the Indian abbot Dharmashribhadra and the editor-translator Rinchen Zangpo. Later, the Indian abbot Shakya Lodro and the translator Rinchen Zangpo translated and corrected, then settled upon it, in accordance with the Central Land edition and commentary. Again later on, it was well corrected and retranslated, then settled upon through being explained and heard by the pandit of Nepal, the Nepali Bhatanatapa, reputed as the Small Omniscient One, Sumatikirti and the Tibetan translator, the Buddhist bhikshu Loden Sherab, in accordance with the Kashmiri edition.

I say:

*Drawing out the essence of the exalted minds of all the Victors,
The meaning of the Victor’s Child Shantideva’s Engaging in the Deeds of a
Bodhisattva,
The instructions of the Second Victor,
Just as it has been clearly commentated upon by the excellent Gyeltshab,
This commentary Tika elucidates the deeds of the Victor’s Children.
Because my training in the texts of the Victors is little and
The deeds of the Victor’s Children are infinite,
Who is more able than the great Victor’s Children bodhisattvas
In providing supreme good explanations that will please the wise Victor’s Children?
Nevertheless, in my all lifetimes,
Having taken the three vows
From the excellent spiritual guides in many lands
To definitely emerge from the two actions and afflictions,*

*I have properly guarded what is to be adopted and what is to be discarded, as well as
the stipulated precepts.*

*Due to the virtue of having explained in accordance with the ability of my mind,
Whatever slight virtue I have obtained, {519}*

May all the deeds of the Victor's Children, without exception,

Merging with all [beings], others and myself, without exception, be culminated!

*In order for these to be accomplished, [may] the hosts of viras and dakinis of the three
places*

Such as the quick-acting protectors

Guard and protect us watchfully without separation, and

Let fall a rain of favorable conditions and desired attainments!

In dependence on having been repeatedly urged with gifts of offering scarves and so forth by many seekers, such as (i) Choje who has trained in the five texts, (ii) Tenzin Gyatso, the spiritual guide who enacts the essence of practice, and (iii) the Bhikshu Losang Chopel who strives in practice, due to the condition of hearing from the mouth of the manifestation of all the victors of the three times, the refuge protector Vajradhara whose name I mention meaningfully, my abbot Jetsun Konchog Jigme Wangpo say again and again, “The principal and essence among all mind training texts of India and Tibet is this very text *Bodhisattvacharyavatara*,” in accordance with (i) the foremost of the spiritual children of the Foremost Being, Konchog Tenpa Dronme Palzangpo, who said that “If the words of the text can be memorized, it will be good” at the time of receiving an explanation on the words and meaning of this text before him, and (ii) Longdol Rinpoche, {520} who taught that “Since the past Tibetan scholars also perform recitations of the entire text, or at least the five chapters – the four up to and including that on conscientiousness, as well as the dedication chapter – it will be good fortune if you can recite also just that” when receiving the oral transmission of this text before him, whereby this text was memorized, Gyal Khenpo Dragpa Gyaltzen, who also obtained the blessings of oral transmission from Gyalse Rinpoche Kelsang Thubten Jigme Gyatso and Jetsun Lama Sonam Wanggyal, having condensed slightly the outlines of Gyeltshab Rinpoche’s *Dar Great Tika*, and supplemented it slightly with [Tsongkhapa’s] *The Great Stages of the Path of Enlightenment* and *The Great Mind Training* exactly in accordance with the word commentary, composed this tikka entitled “A Precious Garland” on [Shantideva’s] ‘*Engaging in the Deeds of a Bodhisattva*’ (*Bodhisattvacharyavatara*), at Ganden Rabgye Ling at the foot of the mountain of Lha-nyen Gu-la, near the gently flowing Ma River. The scribe is the motivator Bhikshu Chopel.

OM SVASTI

Pacifying (zhi ba) forever the attachment of attention to one’s purpose,

For migrating beings, the fortunate gods (lha)²⁸⁸ of six types and the humans,

*Countless emanations equaling the number of atoms of the lands of the world of the
ten directions*

Enact the welfare of migrating beings.

²⁸⁸ Shantideva’s name in Tibetan is *zhi ba lha*.

*The teachings of this protector, a grove of white lotuses,
Opened by the rays of sun of the Gyeltshab Khyenpa,
Is a container of scriptures condensing the one essence
Of the pitcher of nectar of profound and extensive good explanations. {521}*

*Due to the virtue of Jang-lung Pan-chen accomplishing
All the requisite implements of the printing mould which bestows uninterruptedly
A stream of nectar giving Dharma to fortunate migrating beings,
Held firmly by whose fingers of exalted compassion,*

*May you, Protector, abide stably upon this Dharma throne immutably,
And let fall a great rain of nectar of holy Dharma
Which bestows benefit and happiness
To infinite migrating beings in all lifetimes.*

*Your speech of Brahma's melodious voice, serving as the basis of benefit and
happiness,
At the very instant of entering the ears of the fortunate ones,
Free them from all coarse and subtle sufferings and hundreds of faults.
May they quickly attain the good qualities of the completely pure [true] cessations and
[true] paths.*

*Without being separated from you in all lifetimes,
May we engage without regard for body and life
In pure thought, generation of the mind [of enlightenment], and view,
And in the practice of the deeds of the six perfections and the four means of gathering
disciples.*

*Due to the power of truth of the victors living and abiding in the three times, their
children [bodhisattvas],
Solitary-realizers as well as the learners [hearers], and
God and human sages accomplishing the words of truth,
And exceptional resolve and faith, may all prayers and aspirations be fulfilled.*

Written by Gyal Khenpo.

SARVA MANGALAM.

[A Brief Biography of the Author

Gyal-Khen-Chen Dragpa Gyaltzen was born in the Water-Horse year in the thirteenth Tibetan sexagenary cycle (1762) as the son of his father Kyab and his mother Lha-mo-tsho in a village known as Bor in the region of Do-me Lho-gyu (in Amdo).

When he reached the age of seven he learnt the applications of the alphabet as well as reading from the Bhikshu Tshul-trim Gya-tsho. At eleven, he was ordained by the Sera Geshe

Lo-sang Cho-phel and came to be called “Lo-sang Don-drub.” When he was twelve he went to the Labrang Tashi Khyil and entered Dharma school together with Gun-tang Rinpoche. He took novice monk vows from Je So-nam Wang-gyel at sixteen. At that time, Jam-she Kon-chog Jig-me Wang-po identified him as the reincarnation of Go-mang Lama Sang-gye Do-je and enthroned him. By relying upon Lha-shi Ka-ju-pa and Kha-gya Dar-gye as his masters, he studied the five texts systematically. At twenty-one, he took the vows of full ordination from Je Jam-she and received the name “Dragpa Gyaltzen.” From Geshe Lo-sang Jig-me, he learnt grammar.

When he was twenty-two, on the 6th day of the 6th month of the Water-Female-Hare year (1783), he went to U (central Tibet) and arrived in Lhasa in the 9th month. He went on pilgrimage to all the temples and monasteries, and in particular, met the [8th Dalai Lama] Gyel-wa Jam-pel Gya-tsho at the Potala Palace. From there he entered Dre-pung Go-mang monastery, relied upon Hor Kal-sang Don-drub and Gun-tang Rinpoche as his teachers, and at the age of twenty-five, went to U together with Jam-yang She-pa. Passing through and visiting Ganden Monastery and so forth, he arrived at Tsang. At Tashi Lhungpo he met Pan-chen Lo-sang Pal-den Ten-pe Nyi-ma. Then he returned to Dre-pung Go-mang and engaged in studies. At that time, by the condition of Jam-yang She-pa assigning him to the monastery of Gyal, he ascended the throne of Cho-khor Gyal. Before long there, passing through Ol-kha and so forth, he went to Dre-pung Go-mang and continued with the listening and contemplation of the texts. After that, at the Lhasa Great Prayer Festival he obtained the first position Lha-ram at the Geshe examinations.

As instructed by Jam-she Kon-chog Jig-me Wang-po, he returned to the monastery Labrang when he was twenty-seven. Jam-yang She-pa placed him as the Abbot of the Labrang and he performed the various activities of teaching, debating, and composing, construction of new buildings at the monastery, and so forth. When he turned thirty, Je Jig-me Wang-po gave him the gold and copper Buddha Shakyamuni statue, the alms bowl, the water filter, and action rite texts which he himself had always used, and, corresponding to that, announced, “When I am no longer around, there is no need to wait for me [regarding] all the great and subtle meaning of the texts; you may come to a conclusion by consulting the Abbot.” From then onwards, he bore the full responsibility for all the religious and secular activities of Tashi Khyil.

In the 10th month of that year, while on the road to solicit donations in the nearby regions, he heard the bad news of the demise of Jam-yang She-pa. On the 29th he went to see the relics of Je at the Labrang.

He began the construction of new living quarters at the Labrang when he was thirty-three. For the purpose of collecting offerings, he went to Tsho Ngon-po and spent about two years there. Then in the second year after having returned to the Labrang, he completed an excellent statue of Maitreya as well as the temple. At forty he ascended the throne of the Great Assembly of the Labrang. He requested permission from the Throne Holder when he was forty-three and invited the reincarnation of the Jam-yang She-pa to the midst of the assembly.

From the following year, he went to the retreat place Tashi Gephel and performed retreat. When he was about fifty-six, fighting broke out between Lha-bag-kha-gya and Ngul-ra-tsho. He came out of retreat and left for Par-dum. After that he was again placed on the throne of the Great Assembly.

In brief, in his entire life he was placed thrice on the throne of the Great Assembly and made excellent achievements in religious and secular activities. At the end of his life he passed his time by making effort solely in practice. He passed away in the Wood-Sheep year (1835) at the age of seventy-four.]

Translated from the Tibetan by Toh Sze Gee with the kind help of the precious teacher
Venerable Geshe Jampa Gyatso during the period December 2005 to May 2007.
May all sentient beings benefit from it and very quickly attain the state of highest happiness.